

The Senate

Rural and Regional Affairs
and Transport
References Committee

Aviation accident investigations

May 2013

© Commonwealth of Australia 2013

ISBN 978-1-74229-832-0

This document was prepared by the Senate Standing Committee on Rural and Regional Affairs and Transport and printed by the Senate Printing Unit, Department of the Senate, Parliament House, Canberra.

Membership of the committee

Members

Senator the Hon. Bill Heffernan, Chair	New South Wales, LP
Senator Glenn Sterle, Deputy Chair	Western Australia, ALP
Senator Sean Edwards	South Australia, LP
Senator Fiona Nash	New South Wales, NATS
Senator the Hon. Lin Thorp	Tasmania, ALP
Senator Peter Whish-Wilson	Tasmania, AG

Substitute members for this inquiry

Senator David Fawcett	South Australia, LP
to replace Senator Fiona Nash on 15 February, 18 and 21 March 2013	

Participating members participating in this inquiry

Senator David Fawcett	South Australia, LP
Senator Fiona Nash	New South Wales, NATS
Senator Nick Xenophon	South Australia, IND

Secretariat

Mr Stephen Palethorpe, Secretary

Ms Lyn Beverley, Inquiry Secretary (from 13 September 2012)

Dr Chris Curran, Principal Research Officer

Mr Terry Brown, Principal Research Officer (from 14 January 2013)

Ms Natasha Rusjakovski, Principal Research Officer (from 3 December 2012)

Ms Meg Banfield, Principal Research Officer (from 13 September to 21 December 2012)

Ms Trish Carling, Senior Research Officer

Mr Nick Craft, Senior Research Officer (from 26 November 2012)

Ms Kirsty Cattanach, Research Officer (from 7 January 2013)

Ms Cassimah Mackay, Research Officer (to 12 December 2012)

Ms Lauren Carnevale, Administrative Officer (from 24 September 2012)

Ms Carol Stewart, Administrative Officer (from 13 March to 21 September 2012)

PO Box 6100

Parliament House

Canberra ACT 2600

Ph: 02 6277 3511

Fax: 02 6277 5811

E-mail: rrat.sen@aph.gov.au

Internet: www.aph.gov.au/senate_rrat

Table of Contents

Membership of committee.....	iii
Acronyms and Abbreviations	ix
List of Recommendations	xiii
Executive Summary	xix
Chapter 1.....	1
Introduction	1
Inquiry terms of reference	1
Conduct of the inquiry	1
Order for the production of documents	1
Acknowledgements	2
Scope and structure of this report.....	3
Chapter 2.....	5
Background	5
Aviation safety.....	5
Role of the ATSB	5
Role of CASA.....	9
The Miller Review and the MoU between the ATSB and CASA	12
Airservices Australia	13
Bureau of Meteorology.....	14
Chapter 3.....	17
The ATSB investigation and methodology	17
Background.....	17
Accident investigation analysis model	17
Compliance with ICAO guidelines/structure	21

How the ATSB report falls short.....	23
The CASA special audit	26
The Chambers Report.....	27
Retrieval of the flight data and cockpit voice recorders.....	28
Time taken to produce the ATSB report	31
Chapter 4.....	35
The ATSB's accident investigation processes	35
Overview of the investigation process	35
The ATSB risk matrix	39
Downgrading of the critical safety issue	45
Information withheld from the ATSB	47
How the issue was downgraded	48
Did CASA and the ATSB collude?.....	48
The way forward.....	50
Effect of change from BASI to ATSB	50
Expertise of Commissioners.....	51
Industry experience and risk-based aviation support	53
Chapter 5.....	57
System failures	57
Introduction	57
Scope of the investigation	58
Organisational/operator deficiencies	58
Operational control	61
Fatigue management.....	65
Conclusions of the Special Audit	67
Other operator issues	70

Chapter 6.....	75
Regulatory issues	75
Surveillance by CASA of Pel-Air	75
The Chambers Report.....	76
Comparison with overseas reports.....	81
Conclusion.....	84
Other issues	86
Chapter 7.....	89
Communication between CASA and the ATSB	89
Background.....	89
Withholding of key information.....	89
Breaching the Memorandum of Understanding	89
Breach of the Transport Safety Investigation Act?	90
Chapter 8.....	93
Human factors.....	93
Importance of human factors.....	93
Lack of human factors information in the ATSB report	94
Factors influencing decision making.....	94
Changing weather reports.....	96
Fatigue	99
Retrieval of the CVR/FDR	103
Chapter 9.....	107
Key issues around recommendations and ensuring action.....	107
Fulfilling legislative requirements.....	107
Minister's requirements	107
Why are there no formal recommendations included in the ATSB report?.....	107
Ability to track action taken in relation to safety issues.....	109

Safety issues only relevant to specific operators.....	111
Significant delays implementing ATSB recommendations	112
Areas where recommendations are necessary to ensure actions are taken	117
Passing on relevant weather	118
Critical weather information not passed on.....	118
Known difficulties in forecasting weather on Norfolk Island.....	125
Conclusion.....	131
Chapter 10	133
Changes to mandatory and confidential reporting	133
Mandatory reporting	133
Confidential reporting	134
Issues raised with the committee.....	134
Response from CASA	137
Response from the ATSB.....	138
Additional Comments by Senator Nick Xenophon.....	141
APPENDIX 1	147
Submissions Received.....	147
APPENDIX 2	151
Public Hearings and Witnesses	151