

Supplementary Submission to Senate Committee into Wheat Export Marketing Bill 2008

Reply to Remarks of Mr D.N. Clarke as recorded in the Hansard account of Committee Proceedings, 4th April, 2008

Mr Clarke spoke of the 2007 Federal election result of O'Connor as evidence that wheat growers in Western Australia supported dismantling of the single desk/single seller system for marketing bulk export wheat. Putting aside the superficial analysis used by Mr Clarke, his last comment where he said that "the issues may not have been as clear cut as that." is the only true element of his remarks made in this regard.

I was The Nationals candidate for the seat of O'Connor in the 2007 election and offer some deeper analysis to place Mr Clarke's remarks in a more balanced context.

The results of a polling booth by polling booth analysis which I made around 29th November, 2007 which was prior to all votes being counted are outlined below. This analysis is made respecting that other issues are likely to have clouded conclusions in relation to voting in this election result. It is also likely that some wheat grower interested voters may not have appreciated the distinction between AWB Limited as the single desk/single seller entity and that being proposed by the Wheat Export Marketing Association ("WEMA") which was a not for profit corporation being the single desk/single seller entity.

O'Connor includes two cities, Albany and Geraldton, which would comprise over 50% of the electors, and is an electorate distinguished by having more small towns, by a significant margin, than any other electorate in the country. Both Albany and Geraldton would not be greatly influenced by the wheat marketing issue.

Voters, as we all know, also take into account many other factors when deciding to cast their vote. Nonetheless, the power of incumbency is strong, as partly seen by Mr Tuckey retaining the seat.

Close polling booth analysis of voter swings in the Federal seat of O'Connor points to strong grower support for the single desk/single seller bulk export wheat model as proposed by WEMA, even in the context of all the other issues which were being circulated prior to the election.

Taking the Australian Electoral Commission's primary votes of those polling booths located in towns of less than 300 voters in the wheatbelt of Western Australia, there was a swing to Philip Gardiner of The Nationals of 17.1% , (contrary to the national swing to Labor of 6.0%) and a swing against Mr Tuckey (Liberal), the long time incumbent member of 14.3%. (see the attachment)

Even large towns in the wheatbelt, with their larger community grouping and proportionately less wheat grower electors, shows a swing to Mr Gardiner of 12.8% and a swing against Mr Tuckey of 10.2%

Each of these swings to Mr Gardiner, and against Mr Tuckey are particularly instructive, especially given the absolute majority with which Mr Tuckey claimed the seat in the last election in 2004.

The reason for taking towns of 300 voters or less is done to gauge the voting of wheatgrowers rather than townspeople not as involved in the wheat industry, who would vote at the same booth.

It points, quite strongly, to wheatgrower preference for the single desk/single seller bulk export wheat selling, given that, in this election, Mr Gardiner and Mr Tuckey held diametrically opposed views on the WEMA model.

The same trend is understood to have applied in the electorates of Pearce and Kalgoorlie, where the Liberal sitting members received much larger swings in the polling booths of towns most dependent on producing for the bulk export wheat market.

While it remains that Mr Tuckey won the electorate (though by a significantly reduced majority), I contend that it is unwise for Mr Clarke to draw the conclusion that wheat growers in the seat of O'Connor voted against the single desk/single seller structure for the marketing of export bulk wheat. A separate, specific plebiscite is required.

I make this submission to provide better balance to the remarks which Mr Clarke made at the Committee's hearings, as recorded in Hansard.

Yours faithfully,

Philip Gardiner

Cc Mr DN Clarke

Analysis: Swings in Booths Located in the Wheatbelt of Western Australia

Booth	Total Formal Votes	Absolute Primary votes			Gardiner % Vote	% Swing
		Tuckey % Vote	% Swing	% Swing		
Small Wheatbelt Towns						
Ardath	56	44.64	4.21	42.86	-3.95	
Ballidu	137	43.07	-14.31	45.99	26.32	
Beacon	123	26.02	-17.73	65.04	23.08	
Bencubbin	138	35.51	-23.22	46.38	28.13	
Cadoux	118	33.9	-20.65	59.32	26.37	
Carnamah	227	49.78	-19.3	25.99	20.68	
Coorow	194	47.42	-18.32	30.41	14.11	
Dalwallinu	294	40.48	-22.45	33.67	24.02	
Doodlakine	68	45.59	-10.74	39.71	4.86	
Dudinin	67	47.76	2.43	37.31	3.98	
Dumbleyung	260	42.69	-16.03	40.77	18.22	
Fitzgerald	34	44.12	-8.05	41.18	15.09	
Gairdner	101	66.34	-5.54	29.7	18.76	
Hyden	237	48.52	-10.91	36.29	12.52	
Jennacubine	67	47.06	-1.59	38.24	13.92	
Kalannie	130	37.69	-36.22	54.62	40.71	
Jerdacuttup	76	51.32	8.46	17.11	-15.03	
Karlgarin	55	50.91	-4.16	38.18	6.3	
Kondinin	204	43.14	-8.35	30.88	6.13	
Koorda	230	39.57	-12.66	38.26	15.49	
Kukerin	127	42.52	-1.28	42.52	4.5	
Kununoppin	60	31.67	-20.33	41.67	21.67	
Lake King	110	42.73	-22.44	49.09	33.36	
Latham	52	42.31	-32.69	48.08	40.94	
Miling	123	43.09	-17.03	47.97	23.24	
Minginew	266	47.37	-17.08	31.58	21.42	
Moonyoonooka	259	54.83	-6.92	23.94	13.56	
Munglinup	67	56.72	-27.28	19.4	19.4	
Newdegate	225	46.67	-9.77	36	13.23	
Nungarin	108	31.48	-14.84	41.67	6.93	
Nyabing	222	53.6	-19.07	29.28	21.72	
Ongerup	149	38.26	-6.93	38.26	17.92	
Perenjori	142	40.14	-22.06	36.05	23.45	
Pingaring	62	29.03	-0.97	66.13	7.38	
Pingrup	145	48.97	-12.05	36.55	13.67	
Pithara	72	62.5	0.43	25	12.93	
Shackleton	56	37.5	-20.9	41.07	16.07	
Tammin	158	32.28	-6.13	29.75	1.09	
Three Springs	287	51.22	-9.97	22.3	9.01	
Trayning	153	45.1	-15.74	36.6	15.62	
Varley	80	48.75	-22.22	43.75	29.23	
Watheroo	151	34.44	-31.33	56.95	44.34	
Wubin	103	36.89	-32.34	43.69	23.81	
Wyalkatchem	289	44.64	-4.82	26.99	6.92	
Yealering	108	32.41	-9.43	39.81	7.16	
Yerecoin	106	53.77	-20.42	33.02	23.34	
Yorkrakine	42	24.43	-15.16	71.43	27.53	

Straight Averages	139.1	43.4	-13.9	39.4	17.0
Weighted Averages		44.1	-14.3	37.0	17.1
Large Wheatbelt Towns					
Bruce Rock	382	47.12	0.01	29.58	2.22
Corrigin	551	42.65	-8.1	42.11	6.29
Cunderdin	446	50	-7.38	27.58	12.36
Dowerin	346	42.49	-10.69	35.55	9.25
Jerramungup	301	61.13	-8.64	25.58	11.16
Kellerberrin	545	45.87	-8.03	22.94	9.74
Kulin	304	43.75	-10.36	37.5	10.57
Lake Grace	421	51.78	-3.46	21.98	4.63
Moora	937	37.46	-19.71	38.74	27.48
Morawa	343	38.78	-20.3	33.82	24.25
Mukinbudin	304	44.08	-1.96	26.32	2.92
Narembeen	341	39.59	-17.34	41.64	19.35
Quairading	552	43.48	-16.36	33.51	17.01
Ravensthorpe	328	48.85	-1.48	29.31	14.28
Walkaway	359	48.19	-6.75	16.16	6.9
Wongan Hills	601	67.9	-8.77	22.63	9.56
Straight Averages	441.3	47.1	-9.3	30.3	11.7
Weighted Averages		46.8	-10.2	30.8	12.8
Mixed Farming Towns					
Bolgart	106	59.43	-7.24	17.92	9.84
Borden	142	42.25	-6.9	38.73	11.61
Calingiri	159	60.38	-5.44	22.01	7.45
Cranbrook	338	44.08	-2.91	19.53	5.67
Darkan	248	55.24	-11.15	26.61	9.18
Dandaragan	262	51.15	-11.89	29.77	11.94
Duranillin	139	56.12	-11.91	26.62	13.69
Eneabba	177	43.5	-19.81	19.77	15.45
Frankland	153	40.52	-15.45	36.6	17.73
Katanning	1561	47.73	-2.24	12.36	4.3
Kendenup					
Kojonup	910	50.66	-11.49	27.69	11.87
Meckering	143	51.75	-10.09	18.18	8.31
Mogumber	61	60.66	-13.48	21.31	21.31
New Norcia	116	50	-15.38	28.45	11.14
Tambellup	312	51.6	-5.79	22.76	4.2
Wagin	928	57.44	-0.35	18.86	5.2
Wickepin	257	52.14	-2.13	33.07	1.45
Woodanilling	145	44.83	-8.11	28.28	17.19
Straight Averages	342.1	51.1	-9.0	24.9	10.4
Weighted Averages		50.7	-6.3	21.7	7.9

Wtd Primary votes				
Tuckey		Gardiner		
Population 300 or less	Wtd Vote	Wtd Swing	Wtd Vote	Wtd Swing
	2499.84	235.76	2400.16	-221.2
	5900.59	-1960.47	6300.63	3605.84
	3200.46	-2180.79	7999.92	2838.84
	4900.38	-3204.36	6400.44	3881.94
	4000.2	-2436.7	6999.76	3111.66
	11300.06	-4381.1	5899.73	4694.36
	9199.48	-3554.08	5899.54	2737.34
	11901.12	-6600.3	9898.98	7061.88
	3100.12	-730.32	2700.28	330.48
	3199.92	162.81	2499.77	266.66
	11099.4	-4167.8	10600.2	4737.2
	1500.08	-273.7	1400.12	513.06
	6700.34	-559.54	2999.7	1894.76
	11499.24	-2585.67	8600.73	2967.24
	3153.02	-106.53	2562.08	932.64
	4899.7	-4708.6	7100.6	5292.3
	3900.32	642.96	1300.36	-1142.28
	2800.05	-228.8	2099.9	346.5
	8800.56	-1703.4	6299.52	1250.52
	9101.1	-2911.8	8799.8	3562.7
	5400.04	-162.56	5400.04	571.5
	1900.2	-1219.8	2500.2	1300.2
	4700.3	-2468.4	5399.9	3669.6
	2200.12	-1699.88	2500.16	2128.88
	5300.07	-2094.69	5900.31	2858.52
	12600.42	-4543.28	8400.28	5697.72
	14200.97	-1792.28	6200.46	3512.04
	3800.24	-1827.76	1299.8	1299.8
	10500.75	-2198.25	8100	2976.75
	3399.84	-1602.72	4500.36	748.44
	11899.2	-4233.54	6500.16	4821.84
	5700.74	-1032.57	5700.74	2670.08
	5699.88	-3132.52	5119.1	3329.9
	1799.86	-60.14	4100.06	457.56
	7100.65	-1747.25	5299.75	1982.15
	4500	30.96	1800	930.96
	2100	-1170.4	2299.92	899.92
	5100.24	-968.54	4700.5	172.22
	14700.14	-2861.39	6400.1	2585.87
	6900.3	-2408.22	5599.8	2389.86
	3900	-1777.6	3500	2338.4
	5200.44	-4730.83	8599.45	6695.34
	3799.67	-3331.02	4500.07	2452.43
	12900.96	-1392.98	7800.11	1999.88
	3500.28	-1018.44	4299.48	773.28
	5699.62	-2164.52	3500.12	2474.04
	1026.06	-636.72	3000.06	1156.26

44.1 -14.3 37.0 17.1

Population 301 or more

17999.84	3.82	11299.56	848.04
23500.15	-4463.1	23202.61	3465.79
22300	-3291.48	12300.68	5512.56
14701.54	-3698.74	12300.3	3200.5
18400.13	-2600.64	7699.58	3359.16
24999.15	-4376.35	12502.3	5308.3
13300	-3149.44	11400	3213.28
21799.38	-1456.66	9253.58	1949.23
35100.02	-18468.27	36299.38	25748.76
13301.54	-6962.9	11600.26	8317.75
13400.32	-595.84	8001.28	887.68
13500.19	-5912.94	14199.24	6598.35
24000.96	-9030.72	18497.52	9389.52
16022.8	-485.44	9613.68	4683.84
17300.21	-2423.25	5801.44	2477.1
40807.9	-5270.77	13600.63	5745.56
46.8	-10.2	30.8	12.8

6299.58	-767.44	1899.52	1043.04
5999.5	-979.8	5499.66	1648.62
9600.42	-864.96	3499.59	1184.55
14899.04	-983.58	6601.14	1916.46
13699.52	-2765.2	6599.28	2276.64
13401.3	-3115.18	7799.74	3128.28
7800.68	-1655.49	3700.18	1902.91
7699.5	-3506.37	3499.29	2734.65
6199.56	-2363.85	5599.8	2712.69
74506.53	-3496.64	19293.96	6712.3
0	0	0	0
46100.6	-10455.9	25197.9	10801.7
7400.25	-1442.87	2599.74	1188.33
3700.26	-822.28	1299.91	1299.91
5800	-1784.08	3300.2	1292.24
16099.2	-1806.48	7101.12	1310.4
53304.32	-324.8	17502.08	4825.6
13399.98	-547.41	8498.99	372.65
6500.35	-1175.95	4100.6	2492.55
50.7	-6.3	21.7	7.9