

The Senate

---

Rural and Regional Affairs and  
Transport Legislation Committee

---

Administration of Biosecurity Australia –  
Revised draft import risk analysis for  
apples from New Zealand

March 2005

© Commonwealth of Australia

ISBN 0 642 71499 1

This document was prepared by the Senate Rural and Regional Affairs and Transport Legislation Committee, and printed by the Senate Printing Unit, Department of the Senate, Parliament House, Canberra.

## Membership of the Committee

### *Members*

Senator the Hon. Bill Heffernan	LP, New South Wales	Chair
Senator Geoffrey Buckland	ALP, South Australia	Deputy Chair
Senator John Cherry	AD, Queensland	
Senator Jeannie Ferris	LP, South Australia	
Senator Kerry O'Brien	ALP, Tasmania	
Senator Julian McGauran*	LP, Tasmania	

### *Participating Members*

---

Senator Abetz	Senator Ferguson	Senator McLucas
Senator Bishop	Senator Harradine	Senator Murphy
Senator Boswell	Senator Harris	Senator Payne
Senator Brown	Senator Hutchins	Senator Ray
Senator Carr	Senator Knowles	Senator Santoro
Senator Chapman	Senator Lightfoot	Senator Stephens
Senator Coonan	Senator Mason	Senator Tchen
Senator Eggleston	Senator S MacDonald	Senator Tierney
Senator Evans	Senator Mackay	Senator Watson
Senator Faulkner	Senator McGauran	

\*Senator McGauran replaced Senator Colbeck 18.11.04

### *Committee Secretariat*

Ms Maureen Weeks, Secretary  
Ms Trish Carling, Senior Research Officer  
Mr Andrew Bomm, Research Officer  
Ms Rosalind McMahon, Executive Assistant

Parliament House, Canberra  
Telephone: (02) 6277 3511  
Facsimile (02) 6277 5811

**Internet:** [www.aph.gov.au/senate](http://www.aph.gov.au/senate)  
**Email:** [rrat.sen@aph.gov.au](mailto:rrat.sen@aph.gov.au)



# TABLE OF CONTENTS

<a href="#"><u>Membership of the Committee</u></a> .....	iii
<a href="#"><u>TABLE OF CONTENTS</u></a> .....	v
<a href="#"><u>Recommendations</u></a> .....	vii
<b>CHAPTER ONE</b> .....	<b>1</b>
The inquiry .....	1
Background.....	1
Australia's WTO rights and obligations .....	1
Biosecurity Australia's IRA process.....	2
The IRA for New Zealand apples.....	3
Scope of the report.....	6
Acknowledgements .....	7
<b>CHAPTER TWO</b> .....	<b>9</b>
<b>The WTO Case</b> .....	<b>9</b>
Introduction .....	9
Japan – US dispute and WTO determination .....	10
Appropriate level of protection (ALOP) .....	11
Industry response.....	12
New Zealand.....	12
Australia .....	14
Qualitative vs quantitative.....	15
The precautionary principle.....	17
<b>CHAPTER THREE</b> .....	<b>19</b>
<b>THE REVISED DRAFT IRA</b> .....	<b>19</b>
Introduction .....	19
The revised draft IRA .....	19
Fire blight .....	20
Assessment Issues .....	21
Trash free imports.....	21
Impact of fire blight on Australian growers .....	23
Risk Unit in modelling .....	27
Risk Mitigation Protocols.....	28

Fire blight protocols: changes from the previous draft IRA .....	28
Lack of detail in risk mitigation protocols .....	29
Inadequacy of risk mitigation protocols .....	31
Pre harvest inspection determining disease-free status .....	31
Chlorine dip .....	34
Cold storage .....	35
Biosecurity Australia's response .....	36
Apple Scab and Codling Moth .....	37
<b>CHAPTER FOUR.....</b>	<b>39</b>
<b>Administration of Process by Biosecurity Australia.....</b>	<b>39</b>
Communication .....	39
Errors in Revised Draft IRA.....	41
Biosecurity Australia's evidence .....	44
Open and transparent process.....	46
Biosecurity Australia - Defensive to criticism .....	47
Availability of evidence .....	49
Accountability – the Appeals Process .....	51
IRA Handbook – appeals process.....	51
Criticism of the appeals process .....	52
Criticism of IRA handbook .....	54
<b>CHAPTER FIVE.....</b>	<b>57</b>
<b>Conclusion .....</b>	<b>57</b>
Risk Assessment and Mitigation strategies .....	57
Administration of process.....	57
<b>Appendix 1 .....</b>	<b>59</b>
<b>List of Submissions .....</b>	<b>59</b>
<b>Appendix 2 .....</b>	<b>61</b>
<b>Witnesses who appeared before the Committee at the Public Hearings.....</b>	<b>61</b>
<i>Wednesday, 31 March 2004</i> .....	61