
CONTENTS

<i>Membership of the Committee</i>	<i>iii</i>
<i>Terms of reference</i>	<i>v</i>
<i>Table of contents</i>	<i>ix</i>
<i>Abbreviations</i>	<i>xvii</i>
<i>Executive summary with recommendations</i>	<i>xxi</i>

CHAPTER ONE

INTRODUCTION	1
Establishment of the inquiry	1
Conduct of the inquiry	2
Structure of the report	3
Acknowledgments	3

CHAPTER TWO

HIFAR AND THE REPLACEMENT RESEARCH REACTOR PROJECT	5
Research reactors	5
The High Flux Australian Reactor (HIFAR)	6
Review of the Australian Atomic Energy Commission Research Establishment—1979	8
Report by the Australian Science and Technology Council (ASTECC)—1985	9
Legislation establishes the Australian Nuclear Science and Technology Organisation (ANSTO)	10
The Australian Science and Technology Council—1992	11
The Research Reactor Review—1993 (the McKinnon Review)	12
Decision to replace HIFAR	17
The Replacement Research Reactor Project	19
The scope of the project	19
Inquiries into the Government's decision to build a new research reactor	20

PART I

THE NEED FOR A NEW RESEARCH REACTOR 23

CHAPTER THREE

THE NEW RESEARCH REACTOR – SCIENCE AND INDUSTRY 25

Introduction	25
The validity of science and industry enhancement claims	25
Nuclear reactor as a research tool	27
HIFAR's contribution to research and development	27
An ageing HIFAR	27
The growing demand for neutron scattering sources	29
Production of radioisotopes	31
The new research reactor and its role in Australian industry	32
Old science, new science	35
Suitcase science	38
First class or second class facility	40
Alternative technologies	42
Establishing priorities	46
Conclusion	50

CHAPTER FOUR

THE NEW RESEARCH REACTOR—MEDICAL ISOTOPES 53

Introduction	53
The supply of radioisotopes in Australia	54
Radioactive sources and nuclear medicines used in diagnosis and treatment	55
Diagnostic use	55
Therapeutic use	56
Alternative modalities to reactor produced radioisotopes for diagnosis	57
Computerised Tomography (CT), Magnetic Resonance Imaging (MRI) and Positron Emission Tomography (PET)	57
Substitutes for medical radioisotopes produced in nuclear reactors	61
Cyclotrons	61

Importation of radioisotopes	67
The market place and importation	68
The logistics of importing radioisotopes	70
Medical research and development	71
CHAPTER FIVE	
THE NEW RESEARCH REACTOR — THE NATIONAL INTEREST	77
Australia’s involvement in nuclear non-proliferation	77
A research reactor and political credibility	78
Expertise in nuclear science and technology and non-proliferation and nuclear safeguards systems	79
Nuclear science expertise, political skills and international diplomacy	81
International Atomic Energy Agency	84
Australia’s role in the region	87
National interests extend beyond security issues	89
Conclusion	90
SUMMARY—PART I	91
PART II	93
THE TENDERING PROCESS AND CONTRACT	93
Replacement Research Reactor Project Chronology	94
CHAPTER SIX	
THE TENDERING PROCESS	97
The announcement of INVAP as the preferred tender	97
Overview—the quality and accuracy of information relied on in assessing the tenders	98
Pre-Qualification	99
Preparation of tender documentation	100
Site visits	100
Site visits cost	102
Purpose and outcome of the visits	103
Drafting the tender documents— consultants and advisers	106

Formal tender phase	107
Preparing and submitting tenders	107
The evaluation stage	109
Compliance Review	109
Qualitative evaluation	109
Clarification process	111
Comparative review	112
Final recommendation	113
Overall assessment of the tendering process	113
The probity of the tendering process	113
Evaluating the evaluation	115
Functional performance specifications and risk	117
Criticism of the outcome	119
Computer modelling	121
Checks of INVAP's record	123
Reference reactor	126
Financial standing	130
Safety record	130
Overview of the tendering process	131
Public access to information	132

CHAPTER SEVEN

THE CONTRACT	135
The signing of the contract	135
Accuracy of cost assessments	136
Outline of the project under contract	137
The timeframe and process to be followed by the Australian Radiation Protection and Nuclear Safety Agency	139
Other requirements for approvals from the Commonwealth, state or local governments	144
Preconditions set in the Environmental Impact Statement (EIS) and other previous inquiries	145
The nature of any provisions in the contract related to the ability of either party to terminate the contract prior to completion and the provisions in relation to compensation for termination.	146

Termination for Convenience (Clause 60, Conditions of Contract)	146
Default or Bankruptcy of INVAP (Clause 51)	147
Default of ANSTO (Clause 51A)	148
Summary	148
Whether all or part of the contract and other documents created during its consideration and approval should now be made public	148
Accountability to Parliament	149
Reasons for documents withheld	150
PART III	157
PRECONDITIONS SET BY PREVIOUS INQUIRIES, PUBLIC HEALTH AND SAFETY, AND SPENT FUEL AND WASTE MANAGEMENT	157
CHAPTER EIGHT	
PREVIOUS INQUIRIES, CONSULTATION AND PUBLIC HEALTH AND SAFETY	159
Introduction	159
Senate Economics References Committee Report	159
Environmental Impact Statement (EIS)	162
Community consultation	165
Avenues for public consultation and information provision	167
What information should be in the public domain	169
Community Right to Know Charter – matters in dispute	170
The tone of communications from ANSTO	175
The conditions of genuine communication	177
Site emissions and their impact on public health	181
Reference accident	184
Emergency management procedures	188
CHAPTER NINE	
FUEL AND WASTE MANAGEMENT	191
Introduction	191
The adequacy of fuel and waste management provisions in the contract	191
Fuel type and source	191
Criticisms of proposed fuel types	192

Fuel source	194
Spent fuel management arrangements during operation	194
Arrangements for safe reprocessing, storage and disposal of spent fuel	195
ANSTO's arrangements with COGEMA for reprocessing silicide fuel	197
INVAP's technical capacity to reprocess spent fuel	200
Alleged constitutional impediments	201
Fuel and waste management provisions outside the contract	204
Timing of storage facilities for waste arising from spent fuel rods	204
Potential difficulties in guaranteeing provision of a store	205
CHAPTER TEN	
THE ROLE OF ARPANSA	211
Introduction	211
History of ARPANSA	211
Structure of ARPANSA	212
Licensing of nuclear facilities	213
Provisions for public consultation	214
Public hearing and full public consultation	218
Conclusion	220
CHAPTER ELEVEN	
CONCLUSION AND RECOMMENDATIONS	223
The need for a new reactor	223
The tendering process and the contract	225
Request to Auditor General for consideration	226
Accountability to Parliament	228
Safety, public health and public consultation	228
Safety—Radioactive Waste	229

LIBERAL AND NATIONAL GOVERNMENT

SENATORS' MINORITY REPORT	231
Introduction	231
The need for a new reactor	232
The replacement research reactor and medical isotopes	238
The replacement research reactor and national interest	241
The tendering process and the contract	244
Public health, safety and nuclear waste management	250
Overall conclusions	254
SUPPLEMENTARY REPORT—THE AUSTRALIAN DEMOCRATS	257
Introduction	257
The need for a new reactor	258
Tendering process and the contract	262
Health, safety and the management of nuclear waste	262
APPENDIX 1	
List of Submissions	267
APPENDIX II	
List of witnesses who appeared before the Committee at public hearings	275
APPENDIX III	
Summary of ANSTO Commitments and Undertakings	281
APPENDIX IV	
Environment Assessment Report, February 1999	
Conclusion and Recommendations	297
APPENDIX V	
Answers to questions on notice - Industry, Science and Resources Portfolio Additional Estimates 2000-2001, 21 February 2001	303

APPENDIX VI

Order for Production of Documents, Tuesday, 6 February 2001

311