

The Senate

---

Legal and Constitutional  
References Committee

---

Administration and operation  
of the *Migration Act 1958*

March 2006

© Commonwealth of Australia 2006

ISBN 0 642 71547 5

This document was printed by the Senate Printing Unit, Department of the Senate,  
Parliament House, Canberra

## MEMBERS OF THE REFERENCES COMMITTEE

### Members

Senator Patricia Crossin, **Chair**, ALP, NT  
Senator Concetta Fierravanti-Wells, **Deputy Chair**, LP, NSW  
Senator Andrew Bartlett, AD, QLD  
Senator Barnaby Joyce, NATS, QLD  
Senator Linda Kirk, ALP, SA  
Senator Joseph Ludwig, ALP, QLD

### Participating Members

Senator the Hon Eric Abetz, LP, TAS	Senator Annette Hurley, ALP, SA
Senator G. Barnett, LP, TAS	Senator Ross Lightfoot, LP, WA
Senator Mark Bishop, ALP, WA	Senator Kate Lundy, ALP, ACT
Senator George Brandis, LP, Qld	Senator the Hon Ian MacDonald, LP, QLD
Senator Bob Brown, AG, TAS	Senator Brett Mason, LP, QLD
Senator George Campbell, ALP, NSW	Senator Julian McGauran, NATS, VIC
Senator Kim Carr, ALP, VIC	Senator Christine Milne, AG, TAS
Senator Grant Chapman, LP, SA	Senator Andrew Murray, AD, WA
Senator the Hon R. Colbeck, LP, TAS	Senator Kerry Nettle, AG, NSW
Senator Stephen Conroy, ALP, VIC	Senator Stephen Parry, LP, TAS
Senator Alan Eggleston, LP, WA	Senator Marise Payne, LP, NSW
Senator Chris Evans, ALP, WA	Senator Robert Ray, ALP, VIC
Senator the Hon John Faulkner, ALP, NSW	Senator the Hon Nick Sherry, ALP, TAS
Senator Alan Ferguson, LP, SA	Senator Rachel Siewert, AG, WA
Senator Jeannie Ferris, LP, SA	Senator Ursula Stephens, ALP, NSW
Senator Steve Fielding, FFP, VIC	Senator Natasha Stott Despoja, AD, SA
Senator the Hon Bill Heffernan, LP, NSW	Senator Russell Trood, LP, QLD
Senator Gary Humphries, LP, ACT	Senator John Watson, LP, TAS

### Secretariat

Suite S1.61  
Parliament House

T: (02) 6277 3560  
F: (02) 6277 5794

E: [legcon.sen@aph.gov.au](mailto:legcon.sen@aph.gov.au)  
W: [www.aph.gov.au/senate\\_legal](http://www.aph.gov.au/senate_legal)



# TABLE OF CONTENTS

<b>TABLE OF CONTENTS .....</b>	<b>v</b>
<b>MEMBERS OF THE REFERENCES COMMITTEE.....</b>	<b>iii</b>
<b>ABBREVIATIONS .....</b>	<b>xi</b>
<b>RECOMMENDATIONS.....</b>	<b>xv</b>
<b>INTRODUCTION.....</b>	<b>1</b>
Referral of the Inquiry .....	1
Background to the inquiry .....	1
Scope of the inquiry.....	2
Conduct of the inquiry.....	3
Structure of the report.....	4
<b>CHAPTER 1 .....</b>	<b>5</b>
<b>MINISTERIAL RESPONSIBILITY .....</b>	<b>5</b>
Cultural problems within DIMIA.....	5
Ministerial responsibility.....	7
Personal responsibility.....	9
Were Ministers aware of DIMIA's cultural problems? .....	10
Committee view.....	13
<b>CHAPTER 2 .....</b>	<b>15</b>
<b>PROCESSING OF PROTECTION VISA APPLICATIONS.....</b>	<b>15</b>
Issues raised during this inquiry .....	15
Inconsistent and arbitrary decision-making by DIMA.....	16
Delays in processing applications, advising decisions and issuing visas.....	20
Failure to interview protection visa applicants.....	25
Use of inadequate and inappropriate interpretation services.....	29

Lack of appropriate knowledge, information and training.....	31
Questionable quality of information used in decision making.....	42
The existence of an adversarial and hostile culture within DIMA.....	47
Restrictions on applicants' access to legal advice and assistance.....	52
<b>CHAPTER 3 .....</b>	<b>67</b>
<b>SECONDARY ASSESSMENT OF VISA APPLICATIONS.....</b>	<b>67</b>
Criticism of secondary assessment procedures .....	88
Further avenues for review .....	107
Committee view.....	114
<b>CHAPTER 4 .....</b>	<b>119</b>
<b>MINISTERIAL DISCRETION .....</b>	<b>119</b>
Statutory framework.....	119
Concerns raised in earlier inquiries .....	126
Concerns raised during this inquiry.....	136
Committee view.....	149
<b>CHAPTER 5 .....</b>	<b>151</b>
<b>MANDATORY DETENTION POLICY.....</b>	<b>151</b>
Introduction .....	151
History of the policy of mandatory detention .....	151
Criticisms of the policy .....	161
Alternatives to mandatory detention .....	172
Committee view.....	173
<b>CHAPTER 6 .....</b>	<b>175</b>
<b>MANDATORY DETENTION IN PRACTICE.....</b>	<b>175</b>
The use of detainee labour.....	175
Penal approach to immigration detention.....	178
Allegations of mistreatment .....	183

Health standards and medical care of detainees .....	189
Poor food .....	204
Detention costs .....	206
Alternative approaches to mandatory detention .....	208
Committee view.....	210
<b>CHAPTER 7 .....</b>	<b>213</b>
<b>OUTSOURCING OF MANAGEMENT OF IMMIGRATION DETENTION CENTRES .....</b>	<b>213</b>
Background.....	213
Recent reports relating to outsourcing arrangements .....	216
Government response to recent reports on outsourcing arrangements .....	225
Criticisms of outsourcing arrangements at immigration detention centres.....	228
Recommendations for change .....	239
Committee view.....	242
<b>CHAPTER 8 .....</b>	<b>245</b>
<b>TEMPORARY PROTECTION VISAS, BRIDGING VISAS, AND COST SHIFTING.....</b>	<b>245</b>
Temporary Protection Visas .....	245
Bridging Visas .....	252
Humanitarian Program – cost shifting.....	260
Committee view.....	270
<b>CHAPTER 9 .....</b>	<b>273</b>
<b>REMOVAL AND DEPORTATION.....</b>	<b>273</b>
Removal of unlawful non-citizens from Australia .....	273
Deportation of long term Australian residents .....	280
Failure to monitor after removal or deportation .....	295
Committee view.....	303
<b>CHAPTER 10 .....</b>	<b>305</b>

<b>STUDENT VISAS .....</b>	<b>305</b>
Relevant legislation .....	305
Importance of overseas students to Australia .....	307
Student awareness of migration law and policy .....	308
Student visa cancellations.....	310
Administration and enforcement issues – recent cases .....	315
Detention of students .....	318
Committee view.....	320
<b>ADDITIONAL COMMENTS FROM THE AUSTRALIAN DEMOCRATS .....</b>	<b>323</b>
<b>ADDITIONAL COMMENTS FROM THE AUSTRALIAN GREENS....</b>	<b>329</b>
<b>DISSENTING REPORT BY GOVERNMENT SENATORS .....</b>	<b>335</b>
<b>APPENDIX 1 .....</b>	<b>355</b>
<b>SUBMISSIONS RECEIVED.....</b>	<b>355</b>
<b>TABLED DOCUMENTS.....</b>	<b>365</b>
<b>APPENDIX 2 .....</b>	<b>367</b>
<b>WITNESSES WHO APPEARED BEFORE THE COMMITTEE .....</b>	<b>367</b>
<b>APPENDIX 3 .....</b>	<b>376</b>
<b>PALMER REPORT - FINDINGS AND RECOMMENDATIONS AND GOVERNMENT RESPONSE .....</b>	<b>376</b>
<b>APPENDIX 4 .....</b>	<b>418</b>
<b>COMRIE REPORT – FINDINGS AND RECOMMENDATIONS AND GOVERNMENT RESPONSE .....</b>	<b>418</b>
<b>APPENDIX 5 .....</b>	<b>445</b>
<b>THE PROCESSING OF VISA APPLICATIONS - BACKGROUND .....</b>	<b>445</b>
<b>APPENDIX 6 .....</b>	<b>472</b>



<b>GOVERNMENT RESPONSE TO THE SENATE LEGAL AND CONSTITUTIONAL REFERENCES COMMITTEE'S REPORT 'A SANCTUARY UNDER REVIEW' .....</b>	<b>472</b>
<b>APPENDIX 7 .....</b>	<b>479</b>
<b>RECOMMENDATIONS OF THE SENATE SELECT COMMITTEE ON MINISTERIAL DISCRETION IN MIGRATION MATTERS.....</b>	<b>479</b>
<b>APPENDIX 8 .....</b>	<b>485</b>
<b>RECOMMENDATIONS OF THE SENATE FOREIGN AFFAIRS DEFENCE AND TRADE COMMITTEE REPORT ON VIVIAN SOLON .....</b>	<b>485</b>
<b>APPENDIX 9 .....</b>	<b>487</b>
<b>INTERIM PROCEDURE FOR INDEPENDENT MEDICAL OPINIONS...</b>	<b>487</b>

