

The Parliament of the Commonwealth of Australia

Senate Legal and Constitutional References Committee

**Inquiry into the Human Rights
(Mandatory Sentencing of Juvenile Offenders)
Bill 1999**

March 2000

© Commonwealth of Australia 2000

ISBN 0 642 71066 X

This document was produced from camera-ready copy prepared by the Senate Legal and Constitutional References Committee, and printed by the Senate Printing Unit, Department of the Senate, Parliament House, Canberra.

REFERENCES COMMITTEE MEMBERSHIP

Members

Senator J McKiernan (**Chair**) ALP
Senator M Payne (**Deputy Chair**) LP
Senator H Coonan LP
Senator B Cooney ALP
Senator J Ludwig ALP
Senator B Greig AD

Participating Members

Senator the Hon. E Abetz	Senator A Bartlett	Senator the Hon. N Bolkus
Senator B Brown	Senator the Hon. D Brownhill	Senator P Calvert
Senator G Chapman	Senator W Crane	Senator P Crossin
Senator A Eggleston	Senator A Ferguson	Senator J Ferris
Senator B Gibson	Senator B Harradine	Senator S Knowles
Senator R Lightfoot	Senator B Mason	Senator J McGauran
Senator Hon. W Parer	Senator J Quirke	Senator N Stott Despoja
Senator T Tchen	Senator J Tierney	Senator J Watson

Secretariat

Dr Pauline Moore (Secretary to the Committee)
Mr Noel Gregory (Principal Research Officer)
Ms Yvonne Marsh (Principal Research Officer)
Mr Paul Harris (Research Officer)

Mr Derek Drinkwater
Ms Saxon Patience

The Committee acknowledges assistance from the
Parliamentary Library

The Senate
Parliament House
CANBERRA ACT 2600

Tel: (02) 6277 3560; Fax: (02) 6277 5794
InteNet: legcon.sen@aph.gov.au

TABLE OF CONTENTS

MEMBERSHIP	III
ABBREVIATIONS	IX
CHAPTER 1	1
INTRODUCTORY	1
Conduct of the inquiry.....	1
Supervening events.....	2
The Bill.....	3
Background to the Bill.....	3
Structure of the Report	4
CHAPTER 2	5
MANDATORY SENTENCING LEGISLATION IN THE NORTHERN TERRITORY AND WESTERN AUSTRALIA	5
Introduction	5
Terminology	5
The definition of a child in the Convention on the Rights of the Child	6
Development of mandatory sentencing	8
Objectives of the legislation	9
Western Australia.....	10
Northern Territory.....	10
Western Australia	11
Adults	11
Young persons.....	12
Summary	13
Alternatives	13
Northern Territory	14
Crimes exempt from mandatory sentencing.....	14
Adults	14
Juveniles.....	16
QUICK REFERENCE	19
Western Australia’s Mandatory Sentencing Regime for Property Offences.....	19
Northern Territory’s Mandatory Sentencing Regime for Property Offences.....	19

CHAPTER 3	21
STATISTICAL INFORMATION.....	21
Statistical Information	21
Criminal justice statistics before mandatory sentencing came into operation	21
Comparison with the rest of Australia.....	22
Criminal Justice Statistics after Mandatory Sentencing came into operation.....	26
Comparative Indigenous/Non-Indigenous Detention Rates for Juveniles	34
Conclusions from statistical information.....	35
CHAPTER 4	37
CONSTITUTIONAL CONSIDERATIONS	37
Introduction	37
The Commonwealth and the States/Territories	37
States' rights issue	38
The Commonwealth's Territories power.....	38
References to the territories in the Bill	38
The Territories Power in the Constitution.....	38
Overriding territory laws—the Euthanasia Laws Act 1997 (Cth).....	39
The High Court and the territories power	40
Nature and scope of the power	40
Characterising general Commonwealth laws which apply to the territories.....	41
Commonwealth laws and self-governing territories	41
Summary.....	42
The external affairs power.....	43
The External Affairs Power.....	44
The external affairs power is a broad one	45
'Federal Balance'	47
Limits on the Power	48
Summary.....	49
Conclusion.....	49
CHAPTER 5	51
AUSTRALIA'S INTERNATIONAL HUMAN RIGHTS OBLIGATIONS AND MANDATORY SENTENCING	51
Introduction	51
The International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights.....	52
Claims that mandatory sentencing breaches the ICCPR.....	52
The United Nations Convention on the Rights of the Child	63
Other instruments	64

Summary of claims that Mandatory sentencing breaches CROC (and Beijing Rules)	65
CHAPTER 6	79
RELATED INTERNATIONAL OBLIGATIONS	79
Women	79
The discriminatory impact on women	80
Racial discrimination: Indigenous people	83
People with intellectual and other disabilities	89
The impact of mandatory sentencing on intellectually disabled people and people with other disabilities	89
General comments	89
Future directions	92
CHAPTER 7	95
THE SOCIAL AND LEGAL IMPACTS OF MANDATORY SENTENCING	95
Social effects	95
Strengthening stereotypes	95
The effect on indigenous people	96
Mandatory sentencing in the context of recommendations of RCADC	97
Stolen Generation	98
Disability	100
People with an intellectual disability	100
People with a psychiatric disability	101
People with acquired brain damage	102
Women	103
Effect on the law	104
Judges and magistrates	104
Community distrust of the legal system	108
Access to the legal system	109
Appeal to international bodies	112
CHAPTER 8	113
SUMMARY AND CONCLUSIONS	113
Recommendation	117
ADDITIONAL COMMENTS BY SENATOR COONEY	119
<u>PREVENTING THE JAILED GENERATION</u>	123
AUSTRALIAN GREENS SENATOR BOB BROWN	123

COMMITTEE REPORT ON THE INQUIRY INTO THE HUMAN RIGHTS (MANDATORY SENTENCING OF JUVENILE OFFENDERS) BILL 1999.	125
HUMAN RIGHTS (MANDATORY SENTENCING OF JUVENILE OFFENDERS) BILL 1999	127
GOVERNMENT SENATORS REPORT	127
1. BACKGROUND	127
2. MANDATORY SENTENCING	128
4. STATE AND TERRITORY RIGHTS	132
5. SEPARATION OF POWERS	133
6. COMMONWEALTH POWERS	133
7. VALIDITY OF THE BILL	135
8. MANDATORY SENTENCING – INTERNATIONAL OBLIGATIONS	136
9. SOCIAL AND LEGAL IMPACTS OF MANDATORY SENTENCING	137
10. REFORMS AND OPTIONS	138
11. COMMONWEALTH GOVERNMENT PROGRAMS	142
12. CONCLUSIONS AND RECOMMENDATIONS	143
COMMONWEALTH PROGRAMS	147
FURTHER COMMENTS BY SENATOR MARISE PAYNE, DEPUTY CHAIR	157
CONCLUDING COMMENT BY SENATOR HELEN COONAN	159
APPENDIX A	161
ORGANISATIONS THAT PROVIDED THE COMMITTEE WITH SUBMISSIONS	161
APPENDIX B	167
ORGANISATIONS AND PERSONS THAT EXPRESSED VIEWS FOR OR AGAINST THE BILL	167

APPENDIX C 171
WITNESSES WHO APPEARED BEFORE THE COMMITTEE..... 171

MANDATORY SENTENCING

NOTE ON REFERENCES AND ABBREVIATIONS

Submissions

The Committee received 136 submissions, including supplementary submissions. Four volumes of printed submissions were compiled, and in footnotes reference is made to the volume number and the volume page for those submissions, as opposed to the page number of the original submission. Submissions after Submission No. 93, were not printed, and many of the supplementary submissions were also not included in the printed documents. References to these submissions therefore do not include reference to a volume number, and the page number will be the number of the submission.

Abbreviations

Where possible, reference is made to the full name of an organisation, with the exception of the Aboriginal and Torres Strait Islander Commission (ATSIC) which is well known. For the benefit of readers, the following abbreviations of organisation names are occasionally used. Full names of Conventions are given in the text, but abbreviations of these are also used:

ASYASS – Alice Springs Youth Accommodation and Support Services

CAALAS - Central Australian Aboriginal Legal Aid Service

CAWLS – Central Australian Women’s Legal Service

CERD - Convention on the Elimination of Racial Discrimination

CROC – Convention on the Rights of the Child

DEAC – Disability Employment Action Centre

NAALAS – North Australian Aboriginal Legal Aid Service

NCYLS – National Children’s and Youth Law Centre

NTAJAC – Northern Territory Aboriginal Justice

