

The Senate

Finance and Public Administration
References Committee

Independent Arbitration of Public Interest Immunity
Claims

February 2010

© Commonwealth of Australia 2010

ISBN 978-1-74229-237-3

PO Box 6100
Parliament House
Canberra ACT 2600
Ph: 02 6277 3530
Fax: 02 6277 5809
E-mail: fpa.sen@aph.gov.au
Internet: www.aph.gov.au/senate_fpa

Printed by the Senate Printing Unit, Parliament House, Canberra.

Membership of the Committee

Members

Senator Cory Bernardi (Chair)	LP, SA
Senator Helen Polley (Deputy Chair)	ALP, TAS
Senator Doug Cameron	ALP, NSW
Senator Stephen Parry	LP, TAS
Senator Scott Ryan	LP, VIC
Senator Rachel Siewert*	AG, WA

Substitute Member

*Senator Scott Ludlam (AG, WA) substituted for Senator Siewert for this inquiry.

Participating Members for this inquiry

Senator Steve Fielding	FFP, VIC
Senator Nick Xenophon	Ind, SA

Secretariat

Mr Stephen Palethorpe, Committee Secretary

Ms Nina Boughey, Senior Research Officer

Ms Maria Sarelas, Research Officer

Ms Sophia Fernandes, Executive Assistant

Ms Tegan Gaha, Executive Assistant

Table of Contents

Membership of the Committee	iii
Recommendations	vii
Chapter 1	1
The terms of the inquiry	1
Background to the inquiry	1
Conduct of the inquiry	2
Acknowledgments	2
Structure of the report.....	2
Chapter 2	3
Background to the inquiry.....	3
The Senate's powers to require the giving of evidence	3
Previous attempts to introduce independent arbitration	9
Senate order relating to publication of a government contracts list.....	13
Independent arbitration processes in state and territory parliaments	13
The Senate's power to receive privileged documents.....	17
Committee view.....	19
Chapter 3	21
Independent arbitration processes—benefits, costs and potential for misuse..	21
Potential benefits	21
Costs	22
Potential for misuse by the Senate.....	24
Potential for frustration by government	26
Committee view.....	28
Chapter 4	29
The proposed Senate resolution	29
Outline of the proposal	29
The role of the arbitrator.....	30
The arbitrator's access to documents	34
The proposed role of the Auditor-General	36

Chapter 5	41
Conclusions.....	41
Australian Greens and Senator Xenophon's Dissenting Report	43
The need for an independent arbitration process.....	43
The majority's arguments against independent arbitration.....	44
The proposed Senate resolution.....	47
Conclusion	51
Appendix 1	53
Submissions Received.....	53
Additional Information Received.....	53
Appendix 2	55
Public Hearing and Witnesses.....	55
Appendix 3	57
NSW Legislative Council Standing Order 52	57
Appendix 4	59
Legislative Council of Victoria, Sessional Order.....	59
Appendix 5	61
ACT Legislative Assembly Order for the Production of Documents	61

