

THE PARLIAMENT OF THE COMMONWEALTH OF AUSTRALIA

**FINANCE AND PUBLIC ADMINISTRATION**

**LEGISLATION COMMITTEE**

*Charter of Political Honesty Bill 2000 [2002]*

*Electoral Amendment (Political Honesty)  
Bill 2000 [2002]*

*Provisions of the Government Advertising (Objectivity,  
Fairness  
and Accountability) Bill 2000*

*Auditor of Parliamentary Allowances and  
Entitlements Bill 2000 [No. 2]*

August 2002

© Commonwealth of Australia 2002

ISSN: 1326-9356

This document is produced from camera-ready copy prepared by the Senate Finance and Public Administration Legislation Committee and printed by the Senate Printing Unit, Parliament House, Canberra.

## MEMBERSHIP OF THE COMMITTEE – 40<sup>th</sup> Parliament

### Members:

---

Senator Brett Mason (*Chair*)  
Senator Andrew Murray (*Deputy Chair*)  
Senator George Brandis  
Senator the Hon John Faulkner  
Senator Michael Forshaw  
Senator the Hon William (Bill) Heffernan (appointed 27 June 2002 with effect 1 July 2002)

### Participating Members:

---

Senator the Hon Eric Abetz  
Senator Kim Carr  
Senator Grant Chapman  
Senator Stephen Conroy  
Senator the Hon Helen Coonan  
Senator Alan Eggleston  
Senator Chris Evans  
Senator Alan Ferguson  
Senator Jeannie Ferris  
Senator Brian Harradine  
Senator Len Harris  
Senator Susan Knowles  
Senator Julian McGauran  
Senator Sue Mackay  
Senator Gavin Marshall (appointed 27 June 2002 with effect 1 July 2002)  
Senator Shayne Murphy  
Senator Marise Payne  
Senator Robert Ray  
Senator Aden Ridgeway  
Senator Nick Sherry  
Senator Tsebin Tchen  
Senator John Tierney  
Senator John Watson

### Former Members:

---

Senator Ross Lightfoot (until 30 June 2002)  
Senator Winston Crane - Participating Member (until 30 June 2002)

### Committee address:

---

Finance and Public Administration Committee  
SG 60  
Parliament House  
CANBERRA ACT 2600

Telephone: (02) 6277 3530  
Fax: (02) 6277 5809  
E-mail: [fpa.sen@aph.gov.au](mailto:fpa.sen@aph.gov.au)  
Internet: [http://www.aph.gov.au/senate\\_fpa](http://www.aph.gov.au/senate_fpa)

**Secretariat:**

---

Secretary: Sue Morton (to 19 August 2002)  
Alistair Sands (from 19 August 2002)

Principal Research Officers: Kathleen Dermody (to 6 May 2002)  
Catherine Rostron (from 3 June 2002)  
Louise Gell (March 2002)

Senior Research Officer: Erika Kerruish

Estimates Officer: Peter Banson (from 21 May 2002)

Executive Assistant: Margi Carruthers (from 22 May 2002)

## MEMBERSHIP OF THE COMMITTEE – 39<sup>th</sup> Parliament

### Members:

---

Senator Brett Mason (*Chair*)  
Senator Andrew Murray (*Deputy Chair*)  
Senator George Brandis  
Senator Stephen Conroy  
Senator Ross Lightfoot  
Senator Robert Ray

### Participating Members:

---

Senator the Hon Eric Abetz  
Senator Bob Brown  
Senator Grant Chapman  
Senator Helen Coonan  
Senator Winston Crane  
Senator Alan Eggleston  
Senator the Hon John Faulkner  
Senator Alan Ferguson  
Senator Jeannie Ferris  
Senator the Hon Brian Gibson  
Senator Brian Harradine  
Senator Leonard Harris  
Senator John Hogg  
Senator Susan Knowles  
Senator Kate Lundy  
Senator Julian McGauran  
Senator Marise Payne  
Senator Aden Ridgeway  
Senator Tsebin Tchen  
Senator John Tierney  
Senator John Watson

### Committee address:

---

Finance and Public Administration Committee  
SG 60  
Parliament House  
CANBERRA ACT 2600

Telephone: (02) 6277 3530  
Fax: (02) 6277 5809  
E-mail: [fpa.sen@aph.gov.au](mailto:fpa.sen@aph.gov.au)  
Internet: [http://www.aph.gov.au/senate\\_fpa](http://www.aph.gov.au/senate_fpa)

**Secretariat:**

---

Secretary:	Helen Donaldson
Principal Research Officer:	Kathleen Dermody
Research Officers:	Erika Kerruish Sue Rickard Peter Crawford Loes Slattery Claire Shepard Kirsty Windeyer
Estimates Officer:	Margaret Cahill
Executive Assistant:	Carol Evans

## **Referral of Bills**

In its 20<sup>th</sup> report of 2000, the Selection of Bills Committee recommended that the following Bills be referred to the Senate Finance and Public Administration Legislation Committee:

- Charter of Political Honesty Bill 2000 [2002]; and
- Electoral Amendment (Political Honesty) Bill 2000 [2002].

The principal reasons for referral were to examine the effectiveness of the bills in meeting community expectations for the monitoring and enforcement of electoral and parliamentary standards; and to consider whether the bills meet international standards of accountability; and the practicality of the proposed mechanisms.

On 20 November 2000, the Senate referred the above Bills to the Finance and Public Administration Legislation Committee for inquiry and report by 24 May 2001.

On 5 December 2000, the Senate also referred the following Bills to the Committee for inquiry and report by 24 May 2001 in conjunction with the Committee's inquiry into the above two bills:

- Auditor of Parliamentary Allowances and Entitlements Bill 2000 [No. 2]; and
- Provisions of the Government Advertising (Objectivity, Fairness and Accountability) Bill 2000.

A number of extensions to the reporting date were sought by the Committee and approved by the Senate. The Bills lapsed with the issue of writs on 8 October 2001 for a federal election to be held on 10 November. On 13 February 2002, the first two bills were restored to the notice paper while the latter two bills were not. However, the Senate re-referred the four bills to the Committee with a reporting date of 25 June 2002. The chronology is as follows:

- referred 29 November and 5 December 2000;
- readopted 21 March 2002; and
- reporting date varied: 28 February 2002, 25 June 2002 and (current) 29 August 2002.





# TABLE OF CONTENTS

<b>EXECUTIVE SUMMARY</b> .....	i
Introduction .....	i
The Charter of Political Honesty Bill 2000 [2002]—Part 3, Ministerial and Parliamentary Ethics .....	i
Formulating a code of conduct .....	ii
Enforcement mechanisms .....	ii
The Auditor of Parliamentary Allowances and Entitlements Bill 2000 [No. 2] .....	iii
The Electoral Amendment (Political Honesty) Bill 2000 [2002] .....	v
Part 2 of the Charter of Political Honesty Bill 2000 [2002] and the Government Advertising (Objectivity, Fairness and Accountability) Bill 2000 .....	vii
Summary on the proposed legislation to regulate government advertising .....	ix
<b>RECOMMENDATIONS</b> .....	xi
<b>CHAPTER ONE</b> .....	1
<b>THE COMMITTEE’S INQUIRY</b> .....	1
Establishment of the inquiry .....	1
Conduct of the inquiry .....	2
Structure of the report .....	3
Acknowledgments .....	3
<b>PART I</b> .....	5
<b>THE DEVELOPMENT OF ETHICS REGIMES OVERSEAS AND IN     AUSTRALIA</b> .....	5
<b>CHAPTER TWO</b> .....	7
<b>BACKGROUND TO THE BILLS</b> .....	7
Introduction .....	7
The political context—a disenchanted electorate .....	8
Ethics regimes in other countries .....	10
The American model .....	10
The Canadian model .....	11
The United Kingdom model .....	11
Overview of overseas models .....	12
Ethics regulation in Australia—State precedents .....	12
Federal ethics developments .....	14
Joint Committee on Pecuniary Interests of Members of Parliament—1975 .....	15

The Bowen Report 1979—a ‘major revolution’ .....	15
A registration of interest .....	18
The Framework for Ethical Principles for Members and Senators—1995.....	19
Prime Minister’s Guide on Key Elements of Ministerial Responsibility—1996 .....	20
<b>PART II</b> .....	<b>23</b>
<b>MINISTERIAL AND PARLIAMENTARY ETHICS</b> .....	<b>23</b>
<b>CHAPTER THREE</b> .....	<b>25</b>
<b>CHARTER OF POLITICAL HONESTY BILL—PART 3 MINISTERIAL AND PARLIAMENTARY ETHICS</b> .....	<b>25</b>
Introduction .....	25
Overview of Part 3 the Bill .....	25
Parliamentary Joint Committee on a Code of Conduct for Ministers and Other Members of Parliament—its establishment and composition .....	26
Committee view—the parliamentary joint committee to frame a code of conduct.....	27
Contents of the code of conduct.....	27
Committee view—the content of the code of conduct.....	31
The Commissioner for Ministerial and Parliamentary Ethics.....	32
Education and advice .....	32
Committee view—education and advisory role of the Commissioner .....	33
Investigation and reporting .....	33
Committee view—investigation and reporting.....	34
Independence of the Commissioner—appointment and dismissal .....	34
Committee view—the independence of the Commissioner.....	36
Removal from Office .....	36
The Commissioner—-independent and impartial but an outsider .....	37
Committee view—who should pass judgement on breaches of the code of conduct.....	37
Conflict of roles .....	38
Committee view—conflicting roles: advising and investigating.....	39
Review or appeal provisions .....	39
Code of conduct for ministers .....	39
Establishing a ministerial code of conduct .....	41
Committee view—code of conduct for ministers .....	42
Education and advice .....	43
Committee view—prior advice for ministers .....	43
Investigating and reporting breaches of the code of conduct .....	43
Appointments by ministers .....	44
Appointments by ministers—a code of practice.....	44
Committee view—clarifying the term ministerial appointment .....	44

The contents of a code of practice for appointments by ministers .....	44
The code of practice as part of an integrated ethics regime for ministers .....	45
Committee view—the code of practice for making appointments by ministers.....	46
Code of conduct and government advertising as separate legislation.....	46
Committee view—government advertising, Part 2 of the Bill .....	47
Miscellaneous matters .....	47
Conclusions and recommendations.....	47
Overview.....	47
Mechanisms for formulating a code of conduct .....	48
Enforcement mechanisms .....	48
<b>CHAPTER FOUR.....</b>	<b>51</b>
<b>THE AUDITOR OF PARLIAMENTARY ALLOWANCES AND ENTITLEMENTS BILL.....</b>	<b>51</b>
Introduction.....	51
Parliamentarians’ remuneration—entitlements and allowances.....	52
Misuse of entitlements .....	53
Auditing .....	54
Views on the Bill.....	55
The Auditor of Parliamentary Allowances and Entitlements.....	56
Committee views—independence of the Auditor.....	57
Other concerns about the Auditor .....	57
Committee views—other concerns about the Auditor.....	58
The role of the Auditor.....	58
Conflict between advisory and investigative roles .....	58
Committee view—the role of the Auditor .....	60
Entry and search provisions .....	60
Committee view—entry and search provisions .....	63
Adequacy of review mechanisms.....	63
Committee view—the right of review .....	64
Auditor or ethics standard bearer .....	65
Committee view—auditing or ethics keeping.....	66
Penalties .....	66
Committee view—penalties.....	67
Ministerial entitlements and allowances under the Bill .....	67
Committee view—auditing the use of ministerial entitlements.....	67
Is a new auditor necessary? .....	68
Committee view—the need for an auditor dedicated solely to scrutinise the use parliamentary entitlements.....	71
Other options.....	71
Committee view—alternatives to the creation of a new Auditor .....	73
Conclusions and recommendations.....	74

<b>PART III</b> .....	75
<b>ELECTORAL AND GOVERNMENT ADVERTISING</b> .....	75
Electoral advertising .....	75
Government advertising.....	75
<b>CHAPTER FIVE</b> .....	77
<b>TRUTH IN ELECTORAL ADVERTISING</b> .....	77
Introduction.....	77
Current regulation of federal electoral advertising .....	78
Previous consideration of truth in electoral advertising.....	78
Previous amendments to the Electoral Act.....	79
Subsequent Commonwealth parliamentary inquiries .....	80
The Trade Practices Act model.....	81
Constitutional constraints on the regulation of political advertising .....	83
The South Australian model .....	83
Evidence to this inquiry.....	84
Is greater control of electoral and political advertising necessary? .....	84
Is legislation the best approach? .....	85
Enforcement through the courts.....	87
The South Australian experience .....	88
The proposed role of the Australian Electoral Commissioner.....	89
The AEC's proposal for an independent body.....	90
Conclusions and recommendations.....	91
Other issues .....	93
The definition of material to be prohibited under the Bill.....	93
Committee view .....	94
Reversal of the onus of proof.....	94
Committee view .....	94
Appropriateness of penalties.....	95
Committee view .....	96
Orders to publishers .....	96
Committee view .....	96
Headings to electoral advertisements.....	97
Committee view .....	97
Other matters.....	97
<b>CHAPTER 6</b> .....	99
<b>GOVERNMENT ADVERTISING</b> .....	99
Introduction .....	99

Background .....	99
Current regulation of government advertising .....	100
Legislation.....	100
Advice to government on advertising.....	101
The aims of the bills.....	102
The Charter of Political Honesty Bill 2000 [2002].....	102
The Government Advertising (Objectivity, Fairness and Accountability) Bill 2000.....	103
Previous proposals for change.....	103
The ANAO's proposals.....	104
The content of the ANAO's suggested principles and guidelines .....	105
The Joint Committee of Public Accounts and Audit .....	105
Other jurisdictions.....	107
Is legislation to regulate government advertising feasible? .....	107
Evidence on the Charter of Political Honesty Bill 2000 [2002] .....	108
Lack of precision in the guidelines .....	109
Difficulty in determining whether campaign objectives are legitimate.....	109
Implications for the office of the Auditor-General and the Ombudsman .....	110
Enforcement of committee directions by the courts .....	112
Lack of due process, including review of committee decisions .....	113
Structure of the Bill.....	114
Alternatives to the committee model .....	115
Parliamentary committee .....	115
Pre-clearance of government advertising.....	116
Evidence on the Government Advertising (Objectivity, Fairness and Accountability) Bill 2000.....	117
Conclusions and recommendations.....	119
 <b>ALP MINORITY REPORT .....</b>	 123
 <b>ADDITIONAL COMMENTS AND POINTS OF DISSENT, BY SENATOR FAULKNER AND SENATOR FORSHAW .....</b>	 125
 <b>AUSTRALIAN DEMOCRATS' MINORITY REPORT.....</b>	 129
 <b>ADDITIONAL COMMENTS BY SENATOR ANDREW MURRAY ON BEHALF OF THE AUSTRALIAN DEMOCRATS.....</b>	 131
 <b>APPENDIX 1 - LIST OF SUBMISSIONS .....</b>	 133
 <b>APPENDIX 2 - PUBLIC HEARING .....</b>	 135
 <b>APPENDIX 3 - CODE OF CONDUCT (BOWEN REPORT) .....</b>	 137

<b>APPENDIX 4 - A FRAMEWORK OF ETHICAL PRINCIPLES FOR MEMBERS AND SENATORS .....</b>	<b>139</b>
<b>APPENDIX 5 - THE CHARTER OF POLITICAL HONESTY BILL 2000 [2002]: SCHEDULE 1—GUIDELINES FOR GOVERNMENT ADVERTISING CAMPAIGNS .....</b>	<b>143</b>
<b>APPENDIX 6 -- THE GOVERNMENT ADVERTISING (OBJECTIVITY FAIRNESS AND ACCOUNTABILITY) BILL 2000: SCHEDULE 1—PRINCIPLES AND GUIDELINES FOR THE USE OF GOVERNMENT ADVERTISING SCHEDULE 1 .....</b>	<b>145</b>