

The Senate

---

Foreign Affairs, Defence and Trade  
References Committee

---

Held Hostage

Government's response to kidnapping of  
Australian citizens overseas

November 2011

© Commonwealth of Australia 2011

ISBN 978-1-74229-552-7

Printed by the Senate Printing Unit, Parliament House, Canberra.

# **Members of the committee**

## **Core members**

Senator Alan Eggleston, LP, WA (Chair) from 7.7.2011  
Senator the Hon Ursula Stephens, ALP, NSW (Deputy Chair) from 7.7.2011  
Senator Mark Bishop, ALP, WA (Deputy Chair until 7.7.2011)  
Senator David Fawcett, LP, SA – from 1.7.2011  
Senator Helen Kroger, LP, VIC (Chair until 7.7.2011)  
Senator Scott Ludlam, AG, WA

Senator the Hon Alan Ferguson, LP, SA – until 30.6.2011  
Senator Michael Forshaw, ALP, NSW – until 30.6.2011  
Senator Russell Trood, LP, QLD – until 30.6.2011

## **Participating members who contributed to the inquiry**

Senator Bob Brown, AG, TAS

## **Secretariat**

Dr Kathleen Dermody, Committee Secretary  
Mr Michael Klapdor, Senior Research Officer  
Ms Alpana Modi, Research Officer  
Ms Angela Lancsar, Administrative Officer  
Ms Jo-Anne Holmes, Administrative Officer

Senate Foreign Affairs, Defence and Trade Committee  
Department of the Senate  
PO Box 6100  
Parliament House  
Canberra ACT 2600  
Australia

Phone: + 61 2 6277 3535  
Fax: + 61 2 6277 5818  
Email: [fadt.sen@aph.gov.au](mailto:fadt.sen@aph.gov.au)  
Internet: [www.aph.gov.au/Senate/committee/fadt\\_ctte/index.htm](http://www.aph.gov.au/Senate/committee/fadt_ctte/index.htm)



# Table of contents

Members of the committee .....	iii
Table of contents .....	v
Acronyms and Abbreviations .....	ix
Executive summary and recommendations .....	xi

## Chapter 1

<b>Introduction .....</b>	<b>1</b>
Conduct of inquiry .....	1
Scope of inquiry .....	3
Acknowledgements .....	5

## Part I - Background

### Chapter 2

<b>Background .....</b>	<b>9</b>
Kidnapping worldwide .....	9
Australians kidnapped overseas .....	17
Conclusion .....	19

### Chapter 3

<b>Recent cases.....</b>	<b>21</b>
John Martinkus .....	21
Douglas Wood .....	23
Nigel Brennan.....	26

## Part II - Response to kidnapping incidents

### Chapter 4

<b>Australia's no-ransom policy .....</b>	<b>31</b>
---	-----------

The rationale for the no-ransom policy .....	31
Support for the no-ransom policy.....	32
Position of other governments.....	33
Constraints on the government's response to kidnappings.....	34
Communicating the no-ransom policy .....	40
Conclusion .....	42
 <b>Chapter 5</b>	
<b>Options and decisions—paying a ransom .....</b>	<b>43</b>
Difficult decisions .....	43
Paying a ransom and advice to families .....	45
 <b>Chapter 6</b>	
<b>Response team and interagency coordination .....</b>	<b>53</b>
Consular Response Group (1996) .....	53
Inter-Departmental Emergency Task Force .....	54
Family views on the response.....	58
Managing a hostage crisis .....	61
A specialist unit in DFAT.....	63
Conclusion .....	65
 <b>Chapter 7</b>	
<b>Consular support.....</b>	<b>67</b>
Respect for the work of government officials .....	67
Consular services.....	68
Communicating and liaising with families.....	69
Interpreters.....	80
Proposed written guidelines .....	82
Conclusion .....	83

## **Chapter 8**

<b>Post crisis support.....</b>	<b>85</b>
Support for Mr Martinkus .....	85
Support for Mr Brennan .....	89
Benefiting from the experiences of former hostages.....	92
Conclusion .....	94

## **Chapter 9**

<b>Public commentary and media coverage.....</b>	<b>97</b>
Previous experience.....	97
Current approach to media .....	98
Criticisms of DFAT's media policy .....	98
Public statements .....	103

## **Chapter 10**

<b>Legal implications of negotiating and paying a ransom .....</b>	<b>105</b>
United Nations .....	105
Australia's compliance with UN conventions and resolutions .....	107
Paying a ransom and the law .....	113
Defences and likelihood of prosecution .....	115
Need for criminal offences relating to the payment of a ransom .....	116

## **Part III - Post resolution procedures**

### **Chapter 11**

<b>Lessons to be learned and the McCarthy review.....</b>	<b>121</b>
Lessons learned exercise .....	121
McCarthy review .....	122
Review of the review .....	125
Conclusion .....	127

## **Appendix 1**

Public submissions .....	129
--------------------------	-----

## **Appendix 2**

Public hearings and witnesses .....	131
-------------------------------------	-----

## **Appendix 3**

Additional information, tabled documents, and answers to questions on notice .....	133
---	-----

## **Appendix 4**

List of reported kidnapping incidents overseas involving Australians since 2001 .....	135
--	-----

## **Appendix 5**

Terms of Reference for the Independent review of the Nigel Brennan kidnapping in Somalia (McCarthy review) .....	139
---	-----