

The Senate

Foreign Affairs, Defence and Trade
References Committee

Defence's request for tender for aviation
contracts

August 2011

© Commonwealth of Australia 2011

ISBN 978-1-74229-472-8

Printed by the Senate Printing Unit, Parliament House, Canberra.

Members of the committee

Core members

Senator Alan Eggleston, LP, WA (Chair) from 7.7.2011
Senator the Hon Ursula Stephens, ALP, NSW (Deputy Chair) from 7.7.2011
Senator Mark Bishop, ALP, WA (Deputy Chair until 7.7.2011)
Senator David Fawcett, LP, SA – from 1.7.2011
Senator Helen Kroger, LP, VIC (Chair until 7.7.2011)
Senator Scott Ludlam, AG, WA

Senator the Hon Alan Ferguson, LP, SA – until 30.6.2011
Senator Michael Forshaw, ALP, NSW – until 30.6.2011
Senator Russell Trood, LP, QLD – until 30.6.2011

Participating members who contributed to the inquiry

Senator the Hon David Johnston, LP, WA

Secretariat

Dr Kathleen Dermody, Committee Secretary
Ms Christina Raymond, Senior Research Officer – until 29.6.2011
Ms Angela Lancsar, Administrative Officer

Senate Foreign Affairs, Defence and Trade Committee
Department of the Senate
PO Box 6100
Parliament House
Canberra ACT 2600
Australia

Phone: + 61 2 6277 3535
Fax: + 61 2 6277 5818
Email: fadt.sen@aph.gov.au
Internet: www.aph.gov.au/Senate/committee/fadt_ctte/index.htm

Table of contents

Members of the committee	iii
Acronyms and abbreviations	ix
Executive summary and recommendations	xi
CHAPTER 1	
INTRODUCTION	1
Referral of inquiry	1
Terms of Reference	1
Conduct of inquiry	3
Submissions, hearings and additional information.....	3
Key documents	4
Scope and structure of report.....	4
Potential matters of parliamentary privilege	5
Acknowledgments	6
Note on references	6
PART I	
BACKGROUND TO THE TENDER.....	7
CHAPTER 2	
BACKGROUND TO THE 2010 TENDER PROCESS	9
The delivery of air sustainment services to the MEAO	9
The move to a single contract for air sustainment services from 2005	10
Re-test the market in 2009	11
The nature of the Australian air charter industry.....	12
Controversies associated with previous air sustainment contracts.....	13
Companies involved in the 2010 tender process	14
Strategic Aviation Pty Ltd	15
Adagold Aviation Pty Ltd	17
Hi Fly Transportes Aereos, SA	19
Individuals involved in the 2010 tender process	22
Mr Shaun Aisen, Strategic.....	22
Major David Charlton.....	22
Relationship between Mr Aisen and Major Charlton.....	25
Mr Mark Clark, Adagold.....	26
Conclusion	28
PART II	
FACTUAL NARRATIVE OF EVENTS.....	31
CHAPTER 3	
THE CONDUCT OF THE 2010 TENDER PROCESS	33
The lead-up to the tender	33
Decision to re-test the market.....	33
Preparation for re-tender.....	34

Establishment of the Air Transport Standing Offer Panel	34
The Air Transport Deed of Standing Offer	36
Development of the procurement strategy	38
Consideration of probity issues in the tender planning stage.....	40
Contemporaneous events during the lead-up to the tender	41
The approach to market.....	42
The RFT—AO/014/09–10.....	42
Preliminary probity concerns	43
Industry briefing	45
Contemporaneous events during the tender response period	45
Tenders close and evaluation.....	46
Evaluation criteria and process.....	46
Conflict of interest management	48
Confidentiality	49
Probity risk management during the tender evaluation stage.....	50
Identification of preferred tenderer and the source evaluation report (SER)	52
Conclusion	54
CHAPTER 4	
COMPLAINTS ABOUT THE 2010 TENDER PROCESS	57
Complaints about the tender process	57
Conflicts of interest and confidentiality	57
The tender specifications	59
Adagold's fitness and propriety to contract with the Commonwealth	60
Investigation of complaints	60
Conclusion	61
CHAPTER 5	
INTERNAL REVIEW OF THE 2010 TENDER PROCESS	63
AFCD review.....	63
Scope and methodology	63
Key findings	65
Deficiencies in the tender process	68
Review limitations.....	70
The PwC review	71
Engagement	71
Methodology.....	72
Findings and AFCD's response	73
Limitations.....	76
Conclusion	77
CHAPTER 6	
EXTERNAL REVIEWS OF THE 2010 TENDER PROCESS.....	79
Correspondence with Strategic on completion of the internal review	79
Consideration of internal review findings	80
Commissioning external reviews	81
Deloitte review	81
Terms of engagement	81

Methodology.....	82
Key findings	83
AGS Review.....	88
Terms of engagement	88
Methodology.....	89
Key findings	89
Allegations concerning the 2005 tender and AFP investigation.....	95
Defence responses to the external review findings	95
Limitations of the external reviews	96
Limitations on the AGS Review.....	99
Conclusion	99
CHAPTER 7	
THE AWARDING AND PERFORMANCE OF THE 2010 CONTRACT	101
Awarding of contract.....	101
Performance of contract.....	101
Contractual performance management.....	101
Compliance with tender specifications.....	102
Lessons learned.....	104
Reforms to Defence procurement practices	104
Reforms to conflict of interest management policies	105
Conclusion	107
PART III	
COMMITTEE'S CONSIDERATION OF THE EVIDENCE.....	109
CHAPTER 8	
TAKING STOCK.....	111
The committee's approach to assessing adequacy and appropriateness.....	111
Achieving the objectives of good probity management.....	111
The scope of the committee's findings and recommendations.....	113
Areas for improvements	113
The reviews and the reliance on their findings.....	114
Conclusion	116
CHAPTER 9	
GOVERNANCE ARRANGEMENTS—PROBITY	117
Terms of reference.....	117
Matters of concern.....	117
Probity risk management.....	118
The appointment of an independent probity advisor to all Commonwealth aviation contracts.....	128
Terms of reference.....	128
CHAPTER 10	
GOVERNANCE ARRANGEMENTS—CONFLICTS OF INTEREST AND CONFIDENTIALITY	131
Defence policies on the disclosure and management of conflicts of interest.....	131

The contractual management of conflicts of interest	133
Adherence to risk management measures documented in the tender evaluation plan	134
Conclusion	136
CHAPTER 11	
FINDINGS ON TENDER DESIGN.....	139
Decision to re-tender, specifications and timeframe	139
The evidence.....	139
Areas for improvement—documentation, consultation and certification	141
Procurement Planning.....	141
Communication with potential tenderers.....	142
Tender evaluation	142
Conclusion	145
CHAPTER 12	
FINDINGS ON DUE DILIGENCE AND OTHER RELEVANT MATTERS ...	147
Due diligence on tender respondents.....	147
Matters of concern	148
Fit and proper persons	148
Financial and commercial capacity	150
Capacity to deliver the contracted services to the requisite quality and standard	151
Independent, expert scrutiny and continuing monitoring.....	152
Broader application of the committee's recommendations.....	153
Conclusion	153
APPENDIX 1	
PUBLIC SUBMISSIONS.....	157
APPENDIX 2	
PUBLIC HEARINGS AND WITNESSES.....	159
APPENDIX 3	
TABLED DOCUMENTS AND ANSWERS TO QUESTIONS ON NOTICE ...	161
APPENDIX 4	
LIST OF KEY PERSONNEL	163
APPENDIX 5	
CHRONOLOGY OF SIGNIFICANT EVENTS 2005-2011.....	165