

The Senate

Foreign Affairs, Defence and Trade
References Committee

Australia's overseas development programs in
Afghanistan

May 2013

© Commonwealth of Australia 2013

ISBN 978-1-74229-828-3

Printed by the Senate Printing Unit, Parliament House, Canberra

Members of the committee

Core members

Senator Alan Eggleston, LP, WA (Chair)
Senator the Hon Ursula Stephens, ALP, NSW (Deputy Chair)
Senator Mark Bishop, ALP, WA
Senator David Fawcett, LP, SA
Senator Helen Kroger, LP, VIC
Senator Lee Rhiannon, AG, NSW (substituted for Senator Ludlam from 14.08.2012)
Senator Scott Ludlam, AG, WA (until 14.08.2012)

Participating members who contributed to the inquiry

Senator Anne McEwen, ALP, SA

Secretariat

Dr Kathleen Dermody, Committee Secretary
Mr Owen Griffiths, Principal Research Officer (from 22.10.12)
Ms Jedidiah Reardon, Senior Research Officer
Ms Penny Bear, Research Officer
Ms Jo-Anne Holmes, Administrative Officer

Senate Foreign Affairs, Defence and Trade Committee
Department of the Senate
PO Box 6100
Parliament House
Canberra ACT 2600
Australia

Phone: + 61 2 6277 3535

Fax: + 61 2 6277 5818

Email: fadt.sen@aph.gov.au

Internet: http://www.aph.gov.au/Parliamentary_Business/Committees/Senate_Committees?url=fadt_ctte/afghanistan/index.htm



Afghanistan—a land of great beauty and stark contrasts

Table of Contents

Members of the committee	iii
Abbreviations	xiii
Executive Summary.....	xv

Chapter 1

Introduction	1
Conduct of inquiry.....	1
Background to inquiry.....	1
Key documents	2
Definition of Official Development Assistance (ODA).....	3
Scope of inquiry	3
Structure of report.....	4
Acknowledgements	4

Part I

Background to development assistance to Afghanistan

Chapter 2

Background	7
Recent history of conflict and violence.....	7
Soviet withdrawal.....	7
Rise of the Taliban.....	8
Afghanistan.....	9
Taliban and al-Qaeda.....	11
Terrorist attack on US soil.....	12
Interim Administration	13
Transitional Authority	13
International Security Assistance Force (ISAF).....	15
United Nations Assistance Mission in Afghanistan (UNAMA)	16
Conclusion	18

Chapter 3

Development assistance to Afghanistan 2001–2010	21
International context	21
Tokyo Conference 2002	21
Paris Declaration 2005	22
London Conference 2006 and the Afghanistan Compact	23
Paris 2008 and the Afghanistan National Development Strategy (ANDS)	24
International assistance and the transition	25
London Conference 2010	25
Kabul 2010	26
Summary of international developments 2001–2010	26
Overview—Australian ODA	28
Funding and priorities before 2001	28
Funding and priorities—2001–2005	28
Funding and priorities—2006–2009	29
Funding and priorities 2010—2012	35
Post 2012	37
Conclusion	37

Chapter 4

Challenges.....	39
Impediments to aid effectiveness in Afghanistan.....	39
Physical impediments	39
Magnitude of destruction and displacement.....	40
Aid dependency	41
Capacity constraints.....	42
Corruption.....	44
Centralised government, loyalties and alliances	46
Security.....	48
Summary.....	50
Achieving aid effectiveness.....	50
Ownership.....	51
Alignment and matching priorities.....	53

Coordination	53
Managing for results	53
Conclusion	57

Part II

The effectiveness of Australia's development assistance to Afghanistan

Chapter 5

Afghanistan's national budget.....	61
On-budget support	61
Afghanistan Reconstruction Trust Fund.....	62
Australia's funding through Afghanistan's core budget.....	64
Benefits of funding through the ARTF	64
The National Solidarity Program	69
Overall effectiveness	74
Assessment of funding through government systems	75
2012 independent review of the ARTF	76
Conclusion	77

Chapter 6

International NGOs.....	79
International agencies	79
Multilateral organisations.....	79
NGOs	81
Partnerships with the Afghan Government	82
Delivering education services	83
Delivering health services	83
Strategic use of NGOs.....	84
Conclusion	85

Chapter 7.....

Uruzgan Province	87
Background.....	87

Australia's engagement in Uruzgan	87
Achievements	88
Overall progress.....	96
Ownership and alignment.....	96
Criticism of Australian development assistance to Uruzgan	98
Managing for results—sustainability	98
Dynamics of local politics—patronage networks	100
Conclusion.....	105

Chapter 8

Civil/Military development assistance.....	107
Winning hearts and minds	107
Australia's counterinsurgency strategy in Uruzgan	108
Blurred perceptions	110
Counterinsurgency objectives	110
Effectiveness.....	111
Distribution of aid.....	112
Local institutions	114
Risk of attack	114
Risk to non-military aid organisations	115
Defence's perspective on civil-military relations in Afghanistan.....	117
Evaluation.....	119
Conclusion.....	119

Chapter 9

Case Studies.....	121
AliceGhan.....	121
Tarin Kowt Waste Water Facility	124
Visa applications for visiting Afghans	124
Australian Leadership Awards Scholarships.....	125
General criticism	130
Whole-of-government	131
Achievements	131
Conclusion.....	132

Part III

Transition to Transformation

Chapter 10

Security	135
Transition to Afghan National Security Forces (ANSF).....	135
Australia's contribution to Afghanistan's national security	136
Progress toward the transformation decade.....	137
Transition in Uruzgan.....	137
Security in Afghanistan	138
Security in Uruzgan.....	141
Post 2014	142
Conclusion.....	143

Chapter 11

Safety of aid workers and Australian civilian personnel.....	145
Safety of aid workers—limited access and ability to consult and monitor	145
Summary.....	147
Safety of Australian personnel	147
Closure of PRT.....	150
Summary.....	150
Afghans who have worked with Australian aid agencies.....	151
Conclusion.....	152

Chapter 12

Development assistance.....	155
International conferences.....	155
Bonn meeting 2011.....	155
Chicago summit 2012.....	156
Tokyo 2012 and mutual accountability framework	156
Predictions and international responses	157
Australia's assistance post 2014	160

Commitments—increased funding, accountability	160
Protecting the gains	161
Focus and priorities	163
Conclusion	164
Chapter 13	
Protecting the gains—education	165
Education	165
Girls	166
Education—a priority for Australia.....	168
Uruzgan	169
Conclusion.....	170
Chapter 14	
Rural development and food security.....	173
Land use in Afghanistan.....	173
Summary.....	174
Australia's contribution.....	174
Distribution and accessibility	178
Train the farmers	179
Women in agriculture	179
Disaster reduction and management—building resilience.....	180
Opium cultivation.....	182
Dependency	182
Mining	184
Potential driver of development	185
Australia's contribution.....	186
Concerns about mining in Afghanistan.....	186
Proposed legislation.....	190
Chapter 15	
Aid delivery channels	193
On budget funding.....	193

NGOs.....	195
Summary.....	196
Phasing out of PRTs	196
Summary.....	198
Civil society including local NGOs.....	198
Civil society monitoring and evaluation	202
Private sector	203
Afghan diaspora.....	205
Conclusion	205

Chapter 16

The role of Afghan women.....	207
Status of women in Afghanistan.....	207
Australia's aid program and women	209
Combating violence against women.....	211
Summary.....	214

Part IV

Transparency and accountability

Chapter 17

Evaluating the effectiveness of Australian aid.....	219
ARTF	219
Mutual accountability.....	220
Importance of monitoring and evaluation	221
Multilaterals and NGOs own systems	222
Effectiveness of aid as delivered and used	224
Difficulty evaluating projects in Afghanistan	225
Independent evaluation.....	226
ADF projects	230
Whole-of-government	232
Reporting	233

Parliamentary oversight.....	235
Request to Auditor-General.....	235
Conclusion.....	235
Additional Comments	
Senator Lee Rhiannon for the Australian Greens.....	237
Select Bibliography	241
Appendix 1	
Public submissions	245
Appendix 2	
Tabled documents, answers to questions on notice and additional information	247
Appendix 3	
Public hearings and witnesses	249
Appendix 4.....	253