Appendix 1

Department of Defence: progress of reforms to the military justice system

AUSTRALIAN DEFENCE FORCE

REPORT TO THE SENATE STANDING COMMITTEE ON FOREIGN AFFAIRS, DEFENCE AND TRADE

N

PROGRESS OF REFORMS TO THE MILITARY JUSTICE SYSTEM

APRIL 2007

LEGEND:

Complete, no outstanding action is required.
Problematic, requires attention to ensure implementation is on track and/or significant risks to implementation are emerging.
Highly problematic, requires urgent and decisive attention to get implementation on track and/or major risks are emerging.
Underway or has not yet started (awaiting precursor actions), no significant risks foreseen.

	S	4		1, 2	Rec
				1, 2, 3, 7, 8 and 9	Committee Recommendations
 encourage military personnel secondments and exchanges with civilian police authorities; undertake a reserve recruitment drive to attract civilian police into the Defence Forces; 	The Government agreed in part that all Service police would act upon accepted recommendations of the Ernst and Young Report, as appropriate to each Service.	The Government agreed in part, noting that the ADF made an initial determination on whether offences of a suspected criminal nature should be retained for investigation and prosecution; and that: • Defence would as for Recommendations 1, 2 and 3 above.	 reviewing and clarifying the guidelines, and examining the need for, and implementing as necessary, formal arrangements with the States and Territories for referral of offences; and establishing a common database for tracking referrals. 	In response to Recommendations 1, 2, 3, 7, 8 and 9, the Government agreed that: • Defence would work to improve the management and effectiveness of the relationship between the military and civilian authorities on referral issues. This would include:	Government Response/Action Directed by Government
Jun 2007 Oct 2007	Jun 2006	As for Rec 1	Oct 2007 Oct 2007		Planned Completion
 Secondments have been undertaken with the Victorian and NSW homicide squads, NSW Forensic Officers Branch and the QLD Police Criminal Investigations Branch. Now that the ADF Investigative Service has been established, stronger links between Service police and civilian police are being put in place to allow for a more comprehensive program of secondments and training. The workforce requirements for Service Police investigators have been updated to inform recruiting targets, and work is underway to inform the best recruiting methods for each of the Services. 	 INCORPORATED IN RECOMMENDATION 6 The outcomes of the Audit of ADF Investigative Capability and its implementation plan have overtaken Ernst and Young (Recommendation 6). As such, the planned completion dates have been revised to reflect the Audit report. UNDERWAY 	Onderway Action as per Recommendation 1.	 An ADF policy (based on the Government response to recommendations 1, 2, 3, 7, 8 and 9) is being finalised. The policy will be used as the basis for clarifying the referral and retention of offences with the civilian authorities. A major upgrade (Stage 2) to the Defence Policing and Security Management System (DPSMS) is currently underway, with user testing planned to commence in May 07 and roll out planned for Jul/Aug 07. 	UNDERWAY	Status

	TO THE PARTY OF		
 The statutory position of DMP was established under the Defence Legislation Amendment Bill (No. 2) 2005 which was assented on 12 Dec 05 and the position has been filled. 		independent Office of Director of Military Prosecutions (DMP).	
COMPLETED (DEC 05)	Jun 2006	The Government agreed to legislate as soon as possible to create the statutorily	10
• The ongoing requirement for secondment of an AFP officer has been informed by the outcome of the audit. Former Deputy Commissioner (AFP), Mr Adrien Whiddett is being re-engaged by Defence. The requirement to supplement service police with civilian investigative skills in particular circumstances, is being determined in consultation with the AFP.			
 The initial Provost Marshal ADF (Colonel Tim Grutzner, AM) was appointed on 14 May 06 and heads up the new ADF Investigative Service. UNDERWAY 		III VESI BAIOIS.	
Mar 07) of some 140 qualified investigators and direct support personnel, giving him central oversight and control of ADF investigations.	Oct 2007	The unit would deliver central oversight and control of ADF investigations and develop common professional standards through improved and consistent training. Service police may be supplemented by civilian investigators.	
the posting of six Service police investigators (including the PM ADF) to complement the Office of the PM ADF. The PM ADF has now assumed control (vide CDF Directive dated 21	Jun 2006	 The [investigative] unit would be headed by a new ADF Provost Marshal outside single Service chains of command. 	
recommendations were released by the CDF on 4 Dec 06.	Dec 2006	That Defence would establish a joint ADF investigation unit to deal with	
The Audit Report into the ADF's Investigative Capability and the Defence action plan to implement the agreed	Jun 2006	 To conduct a Tri-Service audit of Service police to establish the best means for develoning investigative canability 	o
police can now be clarified.			
• With the implementation of the ADF Investigative Service (some 140 personnel under the central oversight of the PM ADF), the career paths and development goals for Service	Oct 2007	 design clearer career paths and development goals for military police personnel 	
recovery, defensive tactics, and fingerprint and ballistics procedures.			
Service police personnel attend a range of civilian investigative training courses in areas such as the management of serious crimes, sexual assault, forensic documents, DNA	Jun 2007	 increase participation in civilian investigative training courses; and 	5 contd
Status	Planned Completion	Government Response/Action Directed by Government	Committee Recommendations
The state of the s	FIDENCE	COMMITTEE-IN-CONFID	

	COMMITTEE-IN-CONFID	FIDENCE	- Maria Carlo Carl
Committee Recommendations	Government Response/Action Directed by Government	Planned Completion	Status
	The Government agreed that it is timely to review the Office of the DMP to ensure that it had sufficient resources to meet current and future work loads and was able to respond to operational requirements.	Dec 2006	 Eleven additional positions, required to implement the enhancements to the military justice system, have been established, albeit not yet filled. Additional resources such as IT and accommodation have been reviewed and the DMP will relocate to permanent accommodation in Canberra in mid 2007. Resource requirements will be further reviewed as part of the review of the system at the end of the two year implementation period (as per Recommendation 35).
12	The Government agreed to review the training requirements for permanent legal officers assigned to the Office of the DMP (ODMP). The review would be extended to include the training requirements for reserve legal officers who may be assigned prosecution duties by the DMP.	Jun 2007	 UNDERWAY Two new training positions have been established in the ODMP to facilitate the training of newly assigned officers. The Commonwealth DPP is also providing assistance in the training of newly assigned officers to the ODMP.
13	The Government noted that the ODMP has been actively engaged in increasing its profile over the last 18 months, and agreed that action should continue to raise the awareness and profile of the Office.	Jun 2007	 UNDERWAY The DMP has commenced a range of briefs to the Services and various command and staff courses to raise the awareness of the ODMP. A web page has also been developed to further assist in raising the awareness and profile of the DMP.
14	The Government agreed to the statutory appointment of DMP at one star rank	Dec 2005	OMPLETED (MAR 06) DMP has been established at one star rank and the position has been filled.
15	The Government agreed to appropriate remuneration for the appointment of the DMP, the remuneration to be determined by the Commonwealth Remuneration Tribunal.	Jun 2006	COMPLETED (DEC 05) The Commonwealth Remuneration Tribunal made a determination on remuneration for the DMP, effective 12 Dec 05. (The determination also covered the Inspector General ADF (IGADF), Chief Judge Advocate (CJA) and Registrar of Military Justice (RMI).

		OT IT TO SELECT TO SE	
Committee Recommendations	Government Response/Action Directed by Government	Planned Completion	Status
16	The Government agreed in-principle that: • legal officers in the Office of the DMP would be required to hold Practicing Certificates, and other permanent legal officers would be encouraged to take them out; and that • the matter of their independence would be established through amendment of the Defence Act, and commitment to professional ethical standards (ACT Law Society).	Oct 2007	 UNDERWAY All legal officers in the Office of the DMP now hold Practicing Certificates. Permanent legal officers are being encouraged to take out practicing certificates. An amendment to the Defence Act is being developed to address the matter of legal officer's independence and professional ethical stands. It is planned to include this amendment in legislation expected to be introduced into Parliament in 2007.
17	The Government agreed to establish a Director of Defence Counsel Services (DDCS) as a military staff position within the Defence Legal Division, to coordinate and manage the access to and availability of Defence counsel services by identifying and promulgating a Defence panel of legal officers, permanent and reserve.	Jun 2006	• The position of Director of Defence Counsel Services has been established and filled. ADF members requiring Defence Counsel Services have the right to select their legal representatives from the Defence Counsel Services panel. When they select an ADF legal officer (permanent or reserve), their services are provided at Commonwealth expense. Defence counsel discharge their duties at trial or during Inquiries in accordance with their professional duties to the service member who is their client, and their independence is legislated in the Defence Force Discipline Act 1982 (section 193(2)) and regulation 61(2) of the Defence (Inquiry) Regulations 1985.
18, 19 and 20	The Government agreed to create a permanent military court — the Australian Military Court (AMC), to replace the current system of individually convened trials by Court Martial and Defence Force Magistrate. The AMC would be established under appropriate Defence legislation.	Oct 2007	Legislation (the Defence Legislation Amendment Act 2006) to create the AMC was passed by Parliament on 5 Dec 06. The Bill received Royal Assent on 11 Dec 06. Procedural and administrative matters are now being progressed to allow the AMC to commence in Oct 07, under Recommendation 21.
21	The Government: • agreed in principle that judge advocates appointed to the Australian Military Court should have appropriate experience, and that appointments should be based on the same professional qualifications and experience that apply to other judicial appointments; and	Oct 2007	 UNDERWAY The establishment of a panel of military judges, within the Australian Military Court is being progressed. A Commonwealth Remuneration determination was made on 13 Feb 07.

Committee Recommendations	Government Response/Action Directed by Government	Planned Completion	Status
21 contd	 noted that military judge advocates would predominantly be drawn from the Reserve and would have adequate civilian and military experience, nevertheless, qualified military legal practitioners should not be automatically excluded on the basis that they do not have civilian practice experience. 		• The selection process for the Chief Military Judge is underway. Applications for the positions of permanent military judges have been sought in advertisement.
22	The Government agreed in principle with the concept of a right to elect trial. The form of that right and appropriate thresholds would be determined once the structure of the Australian Military Court was established, but would be based on existing determinations that certain classes of serious offence must be tried by a court incorporating a military jury.	Oct 2007	 UNDERWAY The form of the right to elect trial from summary procedures to the Australian Military Court will be included in legislation to revise summary procedures. Drafting instructions have been received by the Office of Parliamentary Counsel and the Bill has category A status for the 2007 Winter sitting of Parliament.
23	The Government agreed the concept of an automatic right of appeal, on conviction or punishment, from summary authorities to a judge advocate of the Australian Military Court. The current process of review would be discontinued. The existing right of appeal from Court Martial and Defence Force Magistrate to the Defence Force Discipline Appeals Tribunal (DFDAT) would be retained. Currently, the DFDAT may only hear appeals on conviction on points of law, and may quash a conviction or substitute a conviction on an alternative offence. This would be amended to include appeals on punishment, noting that such an appeal might result in an increased punishment.	Oct 2007	 COMPLETE Amendment to the right of appeal to the DFDAT was included in the Bill to create the Australian Military Court. UNDERWAY The right of appeal from summary authorities to a military judge of the Australian Military Court will be included in legislation to revise summary procedures (as per Recommendation 22).
24	 Agreed to continue the regular reviews of the Defence Whistleblower Scheme that have been undertaken since its inception. The current comprehensive review and its implementation would emphasise the present provisions against reprisals in the current Defence Whistleblower instruction. Supported annual reporting of the operation of the scheme against documented performance standards. 	Dec 2005	• The first of a series of regular reviews was completed into the Defence Whistleblower Scheme and the operation of the Scheme is to be reported annually in the Defence Annual Report (This internal review indicates that the scheme is operating satisfactorily).
25	The Government noted that Defence already reported statistics on reporting unacceptable behaviour in its annual report. The Government agreed in part that Defence would continue to include this data in the Defence Annual Report.	Jun 2006	Reporting of wrong-doing was included in the 2004-05 Defence Annual Report and will continue to be reported. (Wrong-doing is generally accepted as being inappropriate behaviour).

Committee Recommendations	Government Response/Action Directed by Government	Planned Completion	Status
26	The Government agreed to amend the Administrative Inquiries Manual to specify that quick assessments, while mandatory, should not replace the appropriate use of other forms of administrative inquiries. The Manual would provide improved guidance on the use of quick assessments.	Jun 2006	Amendments to the Administrative Inquiries Manual were completed and promulgated in Apr 06. In addition to covering these recommendations, the amendments incorporate agreed action from the earlier Acumen Alliance Review.
27	The Government agreed to amend the Administrative Inquiries Manual to improve guidance to Commanders who are responsible for the selection of inquiry officers to carry out administrative inquiries, such as routine inquiries, or those appointed as Investigating Officers under the Defence [Inquiry] Regulations.	Jun 2006	As for Recommendation 26.
28	 The Government agreed in part: to consider proposals to enhance the transparency and accountability in the appointment of investigating officers, and that investigating officers be required to produce statements of independence and to make known any potential conflicts of interest. 	Jun 2006	• As for Recommendation 26.
	The Government did not support the proposal that conflict of interest reports be included in reports to the Commanding Officer, rather, the Government would direct Defence to: • amend the Administrative Inquiries Manual to require that investigating officers must provide statements of independence, and that following receipt of the statement of independence, the complainant must alert the appointing authority to any potential conflict of interest or objection to an investigating officer. Resolution of any conflict would then occur prior to the commencement of the investigation.	Jun 2006	
29	In response to Recommendation 29, the Government agreed the need to improve the complaints and redress of grievance management system and proposed that the shortfalls in the existing system would best be met by streamlining the existing ADF complaints management and redress of grievance system and retaining independent internal and external review and oversight agencies. The Government proposed to reform and streamline the complaints and redress of grievance management system in line with the recommendations of a joint Defence Force Ombudsman/ CDF Redress of Grievance System Review 2004. Implementation of these recommendations has commenced in line with a CDF Directive 2/2005.	Oct 2007	The Defence Fairness and Resolution Branch was established (vide CDF/Sec Directive dated 27 Feb 06) as the central management body, outside of normal line-management, for managing all complaints and grievances. Implementation of the ROG Review recommendations is being monitored through a senior-level ROG Review Working Group.

	COMMITTEE-IN-CONFIDENCE	FIDENCE	
Committee Recommendations	Government Response/Action Directed by Government	Planned Completion	Status
29 contd			 The final draft of Defence Instruction (G) Personnel 34-1 ROG Tri-Services Procedures is being prepared for endorsement within Defence.
			 Amendments to the Defence (Inquiry) Regulations 1985 are currently being prepared for drafting by the Office of Legislative Drafting. The IGADF has been established as a statutory position, remuneration has been determined, & Mr Earley appointed to the position. IGADF provides CDF with internal audit & review of the military justice system independent of the ordinary chain of command. This includes both Defence Force discipline and the Defence Inquiries system.
30	The Government has taken action to clear the backlog of grievances in line with	Dec 2005	COMPLETED (DEC 05)
	recommendations from the DFO/CDF Redress of Grievance Review 2004. This is scheduled to be completed by the end 2005, with no requirement for additional funding or a task force.		 The backlog of Redresses of Grievance cases has been cleared (There is no longer a backlog of cases which previously caused undue pressure on the complaints resolution system).
31	The Government agreed to amend the Administrative Inquiries Manual to require the President to ensure that a copy of the relevant evidence is provided to a person whom the President considers is an affected person but who is not present at the hearings. It would be a matter for the President to determine what evidence should be made available to an affected person having regard to all the circumstances of each case.	Jun 2006	COMPLETED (APR 06) • As for Recommendation 26.
32	The Government agreed to amend the Administrative Inquiries Manual as recommended, noting that the matter of what constitutes a reasonable opportunity for familiarisation is a matter for the decision of the President of the Board of Inquiry having regard to the circumstances of each case.	Jun 2006	• As for Recommendation 26.
33	The Government noted that the substance of this recommendation was agreed to following the 1999 Senate Inquiry into the Military Justice System, and Defence is finalising changes to Defence [Inquiry] Regulations 33. The Government agreed in part that:	Dec 2006	• Amendments to the Defence (Inquiry) Regulations 1985 (D(I)R) 33 were completed as at 31 Mar 06.
	 In cases where either the appointing authority, before the inquiry starts, or the President of a BOI makes a written determination that persons may be adversely affected by the Board's inquiry or its likely findings, that persons would be entitled to appear before the Board & would have a right to appoint a legal practitioner to appear to represent them before the Board, if they wish. 	Dec 2006	

Committee Recommendations	Government Response/Action Directed by Government	Planned Completion	Status
33 contd	 Where such persons are represented by an ADF legal officer, or some other Defence legal officer, such representation would be provided at Commonwealth expense, in accordance with standing arrangements. The representatives of the estate of deceased persons who had died as a result of an incident and may be adversely affected by the Board's inquiry or its likely findings, would be entitled to be legally represented before the BOI into that incident. Where the representative of the estate of such persons choose to be represented before the Inquiry by an ADF legal officer, or some other Defence legal officer, such representation would be provided at Commonwealth expense, in accordance with standing arrangements. 	Dec 2006	
34	In response to Recommendation 34, the Government agreed that there is a need to demonstrate that ADF inquiries into notifiable incidents including suicide, accidental death or serious injury are independent and impartial. To meet this principle, the Government would: • propose amendments to legislation to create a Chief of Defence Force Commission of Inquiry.	Dec 2006	 COMPLETE Legislation (the Defence Legislation Amendment Bill 2006) was passed by Parliament on 5 Dec 06 to facilitate the creation of a CDF Commission of Inquiry (CDF COI). The provisions for the CDF COI commenced on Royal Assent on 11 Dec 06.
	 CDF should appoint a mandatory Commission of Inquiry into suicide by ADF members and deaths in Service. The commission may consist of one or more persons, with one being a civilian with judicial experience. Where the commission consists of more than one person, the civilian with judicial experience would be the President. 	Oct 2007	 Mendments to the Defence (Inquiry) Regulations 1985 are currently being developed to support the conduct of a CDF COI, and are expected to be considered by the Federal Executive Council in April 07.
	 This form of inquiry would be in addition to the existing arrangements for appointment of Investigating Officers and Boards of Inquiry. External independent legislative oversight by Comcare would continue in relation to the conduct of all ADF inquiries into notifiable incidents. This includes arrangements for consultation with Comcare on the terms of reference, as well as options for attendance or participation in the inquiry 		 In the interim, Boards of Inquiry were appointed under the amended (31 Mar 06) provisions of the Defence (Inquiry) Regulations 1985. The amended Regulations allow a civilian to preside at a Board of Inquiry, to overcome perceptions of bias in the administrative inquiry process. An initial panel of suitably qualified persons with judicial
	 State and Territory Coroners would continue to review the outcomes of ADF inquiries into deaths of personnel. The ADF would work towards completing a Memorandum of Understanding with State and Territory Coroners. The Defence Force Ombudsman would continue to provide external independent legislative review of the conduct of ADF inquiries. This may occur as a consequence of a complaint or by own motion independently of the ADF. 		 establishment. The panel consists of six persons, and is expected to increase this year. To date, three Boards of Inquiry have been run under interim arrangements, with a civilian president from this panel. A CDF COI coordination and support cell has been establishment within the Office of the CDF.

	COMMITTEE THE CONTRACT	TE HUELVEE	
Committee Recommendations	Government Response/Action Directed by Government	Planned Completion	Status
34 contd			• The ADF is also consulting with State and Territory Coroners to establish protocols regarding the review of outcomes of ADF inquires into deaths of personnel. Two State Coroners have already signed protocols, and one has agreed to establish liaison arrangements.
35	The Government agreed in principle that, in addition to ongoing internal	Oct 2007	UNDERWAY
	monitoring and review, Defence would commission regular independent reviews on the health of the military justice system. Such reviews would be headed by a qualified eminent Australian, with the first timed to assess the effectiveness of the overhauled military justice system proposed in this submission, at the conclusion of the two-year implementation period.		• Arrangements for the conduct of a review of the effectiveness of the overhauled military justice system at the conclusion of the two-year implementation period will be made in 2007. This independent review will be conducted in an open and transparent manner, and include a more detailed review of the DFDA.
			COMPLETE
			• In addition to the Government response, as announced by the CDF in Oct 2005, an independent audit of the learning culture in ADF schools and training establishments was undertaken. The Learning Culture Inquiry report into ADF Schools and Training Establishments and Defence's action plan for implementing the agreed recommendations were released by the CDF on 6 Dec 06. Implementation is being reported separately.
36	The Government agreed in principle to examine the combination of criminal law	Oct 2007	COMPLETE
	and administrative action in terms of best-practice military justice, noting that such a review would also satisfy a recommendation from the Burchett Report to review the nature of the punishments that may be imposed in the light of contemporary standards. This review would be undertaken outside the broad review proposed at recommendation 35, and would be completed within the two-year implementation period.		 Examination of the combination of criminal and administrative law was completed by obtaining independent external advice on double jeopardy from the Australian Government Solicitor. The advice has been incorporated into a revised Defence Instruction (General) 35-6, which deals with Formal Warnings and Censures in the ADF.
			 An internal review of offences and punishments has been conducted as part of the process for enhancing summary procedures, and is now being progressed under Recommendations 22 and 23.
			 Offences and punishments will also be further reviewed as part of the review of the effectiveness of the overhauled military justice system to be conducted in accordance with Recommendation 35.

Committee Recommendations	Government Response/Action Directed by Government	d by Government Planned Completion	Status
377	The Government supported the need for transparency and parliamentary oversight of the military justice system. The Government agreed to provide, in the Defence Annual Report, reporting on the state of health of the military justice system. Reporting would include: progress in the implementation and effectiveness of reforms to the military justice system, arising both from this report and previous reviews under implementation, and the workload and effectiveness of the key bodies within the military justice system. Defence would also amend the Defence (Inquiry) Regulations to provide for an annual report on the operation of the Defence (Inquiry) Regulations, fulfilling a recommendation of the Burchett report, and report twice a year to the Senate committee [April and October], on progress of the reforms throughout the two	Jun 2006	 A report on the state of health of the military justice system is included in the 2005-2006 Defence Annual Report, and will be an ongoing element of this report. The Defence (Inquiry) Regulations have been amended to provide for an annual report on the operation of the Regulations. (Amendments were approved by the Federal Executive Council on 22 Jun 06.) Initial reports to the Senate FAD&T Committee on progress with enhancements to the military justice system were
38	The Government agreed to commission an expert to examine whether the human rights of children are being respected.	Jun 2006	Jenni Whelan, a consultant & former solicitor at the Human Rights and Equal Opportunity Commission, has been engaged, under a standing offer for up to two years, to review specific policies and programs for compliance with the Convention on the Rights of the Child in order to determine whether the human rights of children are being respected.
39	The Government agreed that the ADF take steps immediately to draft and make regulations dealing with the ADF Cadets to ensure that the rights and responsibilities of Defence and cadet staff are aligned, noting that as part of the significant work initiated under the Government's Cadet Enhancement Program, Defence is finalising amendments to the regulations that would more than meet the Committee's recommendations on the human rights of minors.	Jun 2006	The ADF Cadet Forces Regulations 1977 have been amended. (Amendments were approved by the Federal Executive Council on 22 Jun 06.)
40	The Government agreed that further resources be allocated to the Australian Defence Force Cadets to provide for an increased number of full-time, fully remunerated administrative positions across all three cadet organisations and noted that the Service Chiefs had already provided additional resources to the ADF Cadets to improve administrative support.	Jun 2006	Further administrative positions across all three cadet organisations have been established and filled.