

The Senate

---

Standing Committee on  
Foreign Affairs, Defence and Trade

---

Blue water ships: consolidating past  
achievements

December 2006

© Commonwealth of Australia 2006

ISBN 0 642 71736 2

Printed by the Senate Printing Unit, Parliament House, Canberra.

# Members of the Committee

## Core Members

Senator David Johnston, LP, WA (Chair)  
Senator Steve Hutchins, ALP, NSW (Deputy Chair)  
Senator Mark Bishop, ALP, WA  
Senator Alan Ferguson, LP, SA  
Senator John Hogg, ALP, QLD  
Senator Marise Payne, LP, NSW  
Senator Russell Trood, LP, QLD

## Participating members who contributed to the inquiry

Senator Judith Adams, LP, WA  
Senator Andrew Bartlett, AD, QLD  
Senator George Campbell, ALP, NSW  
Senator Concetta Fierravanti-Wells, LP, NSW  
Senator Glenn Sterle, ALP, WA  
Senator Ruth Webber, ALP, WA

## Secretariat

Dr Kathleen Dermody, Committee Secretary  
Ms Lisa Fenn, Principal Research Officer  
Dr Richard Grant, Senior Research Officer  
Ms Pamela Corrigan, Research Officer  
Ms Angela Lancsar, Executive Assistant

Standing Committee on Foreign Affairs, Defence and Trade  
Department of the Senate  
PO Box 6100  
Parliament House  
Canberra ACT 2600  
Australia

Phone: + 61 2 6277 3535  
Fax: + 61 2 6277 5818  
Email: [fadt.sen@aph.gov.au](mailto:fadt.sen@aph.gov.au)  
Internet: [www.aph.gov.au/Senate/committee/fadt\\_ctte/index.htm](http://www.aph.gov.au/Senate/committee/fadt_ctte/index.htm)



# Table of contents

<b>Members of the Committee</b>	iii
<b>Acronyms and abbreviations</b>	xi
<b>Main finding</b>	xv
<b>Executive summary</b>	xix
<b>CHAPTER 1</b>	
<b>INTRODUCTION AND CONDUCT OF THE INQUIRY</b>	<b>1</b>
Referral of the inquiry	1
Terms of reference	1
Conduct of the inquiry	2
Submissions	2
Public hearings and site inspections	3
Overseas delegation	3
Structure of the report	7
Acknowledgments	7
<b>Part I</b>	
<b>Background—developments in the shipbuilding and repair industry overseas and in Australia</b>	<b>9</b>
<b>CHAPTER 2</b>	
<b>CURRENT TRENDS IN NAVAL SHIPBUILDING</b>	<b>11</b>
The experience overseas	11
Falling demand, increased capability	12
New shipbuilding model	13
Globally integrated production systems	14
A new 'heavy industry' sector	15
A protected industry	16
Major shipbuilding economies	17
The United States	17
Europe	20
The United Kingdom	23
South Korea, Japan and China	25
Segmentation in the shipbuilding industry	26
Current trend—growing complexity in the construction of naval vessels	27
Building in modules	28
Modern construction and the challenges for the prime contractor	30
Developing and retaining a skilled workforce	33
Peaks and troughs in demand for naval vessels	35
Conclusion	37

<b>CHAPTER 3</b>	
<b>A BRIEF HISTORY OF AUSTRALIA'S NAVAL SHIPBUILDING INDUSTRY</b>	<b>39</b>
The early years of naval vessel construction and repair in Australia	39
Shipbuilding challenges—the experience of the 1960s, 1970s & early 1980s	41
Problems with Defence specifications—the DDL destroyer project	42
Problems with foreign acquisition—the FFG 01–04 project	43
Problems with foreign design and Australian construction—HMAS Success	45
Developing a modern, efficient naval shipbuilding industry	46
The Australian Frigate Project	46
Naval shipbuilding as a platform for a competitive local defence industry	49
Conclusion	49
<b>Part II</b>	
<b>Australia's capacity to produce large naval vessels</b>	<b>51</b>
<b>CHAPTER 4</b>	
<b>AUSTRALIAN NAVAL SHIPBUILDERS</b>	<b>53</b>
The prime contractors	53
ASC and the Collins-class submarines: high achievement and high risk	53
Tenix and the ANZAC class frigates: on time and on budget	60
Thales Australia (ADI)	66
Summary	71
The aluminium shipbuilders—Austal and Incat	71
Summary	75
The Air Warfare Destroyer (AWD) and Amphibious Ship (LHD) projects	75
The future of the primes	79
Conclusion	80
<b>CHAPTER 5</b>	
<b>SME SUPPLIERS</b>	<b>81</b>
Supply network in Australia	81
Steel fabrication—an example of Australia's capability	85
Tasmania and its supply chain	86
Committee view	90
SMEs and their contribution to the industry	90
Value adding	90
Gaps in capability	93
International companies filling a void	94
Overseas companies—fostering local industry	96
Overseas companies—technology transfer and indigenous innovation	97
Committee view	99

Overseas companies meeting special requirements	99
Conclusion	100
<b>CHAPTER 6</b>	
<b>INFRASTRUCTURE</b>	<b>103</b>
Investment in infrastructure	104
Overview of shipyards in Australia	106
Infrastructure and the lead naval shipyards in Australia	107
The Australian Marine Complex at Henderson in Western Australia	107
Osborne in South Australia	112
Older shipyards	115
Williamstown in Victoria	115
Garden Island in New South Wales	119
The Cairncross Dry Dock in Queensland	121
Overall infrastructure development in Australia	122
Infrastructure needs for the AWDs and LHDs	125
Capacity to meet the challenges of an AWD and LHD program	126
Through-life costs	129
Infrastructure outside the shipyard	129
High wide load corridors	129
Committee view	131
<b>CHAPTER 7</b>	
<b>WORKFORCE AND SKILLS</b>	<b>133</b>
Introduction	133
Skilled labour shortages	133
Naval shipbuilding—workforce demand	135
Sustainment workforce	137
Other industry sectors—competition or support?	138
Transferability of skills	141
Workforce mobility—geographic issues	142
Skill sets	145
Trade skills sets	145
High-end skill sets	147
The AWD and LHD builds	154
Workforce and skills initiatives	158
Federal government—skilling Australia's defence industry	158
State government initiatives	159
Overseas migration	162
Conclusion	164
<b>CHAPTER 8</b>	
<b>INTELLECTUAL PROPERTY</b>	<b>167</b>
Negotiating in a global market	167
Benefits of IP access	169
Australian IP development	171
Conclusion	172

<b>Part III</b>	
<b>Productivity of the Australian shipbuilding and repair industry</b>	<b>175</b>
<b>CHAPTER 9</b>	
<b>THE COMPARATIVE ECONOMIC PRODUCTIVITY OF THE AUSTRALIAN SHIPBUILDING INDUSTRIAL BASE AND ASSOCIATED ACTIVITY WITH OTHER SHIPBUILDING NATIONS</b>	<b>177</b>
Difficulties in comparing the productivity of shipyards in Australia and overseas	177
Quality of available data	178
A protected industry and distorted data	179
Data on Australian productivity	181
Australian shipyards, the construction of commercial steel ships and niche capabilities	181
Australia's record in the construction of naval ships	183
Factors influencing productivity in Australia's shipbuilding and repair industry	186
Costs and economies of scale	186
Costs in meeting Australia's unique requirements	189
The costs of customising a ship for Australian conditions	192
Fluctuations in work flow	193
Impediments to export trade	195
Comparative labour productivity	195
Summary	196
Conclusion	197
<b>CHAPTER 10</b>	
<b>THE COMPARATIVE ECONOMIC COSTS OF MAINTAINING, REPAIRING AND REFITTING LARGE NAVAL VESSELS THROUGHOUT THEIR USEFUL LIVES WHEN CONSTRUCTED IN AUSTRALIA VICE OVERSEAS</b>	<b>199</b>
Background	199
Through-life costs	199
The ACIL Tasman estimate	203
Conclusion	206
<b>CHAPTER 11</b>	
<b>ECONOMIC BENEFITS</b>	<b>209</b>
Broader benefits accruing from an in-country build	209
Quantifiable evidence of wider economic benefits	210
The Minehunter and ANZAC studies	210
Critiques of the ANZAC and Minehunter studies' modelling	213
Employment growth and broadening the industrial base	214
Contributing to an innovative and productive industrial base	215



Disadvantages of building overseas	219
Defence's assessment of these benefits	222
Conclusion	222
<b>CHAPTER 12</b>	
<b>THE STRATEGIC IMPERATIVE</b>	<b>223</b>
Defence capability and the national interest	223
Australia's unique strategic requirements	224
The relationship between defence capability and an indigenous naval shipbuilding industry	227
The relationship between defence capability and an indigenous naval ship maintenance and repair industry	231
Connection between shipbuilding and maintenance, repair and upgrades	233
Conclusion	237
<b>CHAPTER 13</b>	
<b>OVERALL ASSESSMENT OF AUSTRALIA'S SHIPBUILDING AND REPAIR INDUSTRY INCLUDING COMMITTEE'S MAIN FINDING</b>	<b>239</b>
<b>Part IV</b>	
<b>The role of governments</b>	<b>243</b>
<b>CHAPTER 14</b>	
<b>THE ROLE OF DEFENCE IN AUSTRALIA'S NAVAL SHIPBUILDING AND REPAIR INDUSTRY—INFORMING INDUSTRY</b>	<b>245</b>
Australian industry—an informed provider	245
Premiums for local builds	247
Industry involvement	249
Conclusion	254
<b>CHAPTER 15</b>	
<b>STRATEGIC PLANNING</b>	<b>255</b>
Assisting industry improve productivity	255
SMEs	255
Infrastructure	256
Committee view	257
Competition and collaboration	258
Committee view	259
Skills	259
Committee view	259
Summary	260
Managing demand fluctuations	260
A strategic plan	265
Committee view	267
Strategic planning—Defence Capability Plan	268
Committee view	270

Summary	271
<b>CHAPTER 16</b>	<b>273</b>
<b>DEFENCE—AN INFORMED BUYER</b>	<b>273</b>
Strategic analysts	273
Technical specialists	273
Project managers and leaders	276
Conclusion	280
<b>BIBLIOGRAPHY</b>	<b>283</b>
<b>ADDITIONAL COMMENTS – SENATOR MARK BISHOP</b>	<b>285</b>
<b>APPENDIX 1</b>	
Public submissions	289
<b>APPENDIX 2</b>	
Additional information, tabled documents, and answers to questions on notice	291
<b>APPENDIX 3</b>	
Public hearings and witnesses	295
<b>APPENDIX 4</b>	
Site visits in Australia	301
<b>APPENDIX 5</b>	
Delegation program to the Republic of Korea and the United States of America	303
<b>APPENDIX 6</b>	
Extract containing a summary of main issues and points for discussion from a discussion paper published by the committee on 25 August 2006	305
<b>APPENDIX 7</b>	
Naval ships built at Cockatoo Island, Balmain and Williamstown dockyards; repair and upgrade activities at Garden Island (1912–1945)	323