

**SENATE FOREIGN AFFAIRS, DEFENCE AND TRADE
REFERENCES COMMITTEE**

**INQUIRY INTO RECRUITMENT & RETENTION
OF DEFENCE PERSONNEL**

SUBMISSION

Submission No: 24

Submittor: Author (A) – (Name withheld from
publication)

Address:

Telephone No:

Fax:

E-Mail:

No. of Pages: 6

Attachments: 1

SENATE DEFENCE PERSONNEL INQUIRY

SPECIALIST PERSONNEL IN THE AUSTRALIAN DEFENCE FORCE

ADF Chaplaincy

1. The current recruitment and retention strategies of the Australian Defence Force (ADF) appear to be ineffective in meeting the organisation's requirements for chaplains.

2. Chaplaincy recruitment appears to be a conservative and slow process that utilises a 1950's methodology. Only certain Christian churches, and the Jewish faith, are allowed to provide chaplains to the ADF. This approach is inconsistent with the modern and progressive ADF and with multicultural Australian society.

- a. The Religious Advisory Committee to the Services (RACS), funded by Defence, is tasked with the recruitment of chaplains to the ADF. RACS consists of a Jewish Rabbi, an Anglican Bishop, a Roman Catholic Bishop, a Presbyterian Minister, a Uniting Church Minister, and a Minister representing what is known as the United Churches – Lutheran, Churches of Christ, Salvation Army, and Baptists. RACS members have two-star status in Defence.
- b. Chaplain personnel numbers are derived from a complicated formula based on denomination of approximately one third Anglican, one third Roman Catholic, and one third Protestant.
- c. This formula excludes from Defence other protestant churches functioning in modern Australia, and other faith groups also now resident in modern Australia such as the Muslims, Hindus, and Budhists.

3. It is difficult to recruit fit, young (25 – 35 years of age), clergy into the ADF, in part because of the relatively narrow recruiting pool, and in part because of the relatively low remuneration of Defence chaplains. Unlike all other members of the ADF, chaplains get paid less than their worn rank. A proposal to the Defence Personnel Executive to increase the salaries of ADF chaplains demonstrated that the average civilian clergy package was \$71, 435 (at Nov 00), yet the starting salary for an ADF chaplain is approximately \$52,000. The Directorate of Salary and Allowances (DSA) is currently developing a pay case for chaplains. The narrow recruiting pool, and remuneration discrimination has several outcomes:

- a. Unacceptable vacancies are carried which places stress on already overworked military chaplains.
- b. Age extensions are granted to chaplains well past the retirement age of 55 years of age. Many of these chaplains are granted medical waivers to allow them to serve on. In a young, fit, Defence Force, some chaplains are age extended to 62 years of age. Recently, a 60 year old chaplain with health concerns was deployed into the operational area of Bougainville for an operational tour.
- c. Clergy recruited into the ADF are not necessarily top calibre, and consequently some do not readily fit in to the ADF and do not perform effectively as chaplains.

4. The current ADF chaplaincy structure is top heavy and cumbersome. Approximately 92 full-time ADF chaplains are managed by nine one-star Principal Chaplains. Other western Defence Forces have only one Principal Chaplain (equivalent) to manage a greater number of chaplains. For example, Canada has only a single one-star Chaplain General to manage 145 full-time Defence chaplains. See Annex A attached.

Conclusion

5. Young and fit clergy could be potentially recruited into the ADF if christian churches, and other faith groups, currently excluded, were included to form a broader recruiting base.

6. A flexible attitude toward the denominational/faith group spread of chaplaincy personnel numbers within the ADF is needed.
7. Negative discrimination with respect to pay should cease. Chaplains need to be remunerated to a level of at least equal to their worn rank.
8. The recruiting of other faith group chaplains could, in fact, encourage the recruitment of soldiers and officers from these faith group communities. In other words, what comes first? Do we need to wait for particular faith group members to join the ADF in large numbers before we recruit their chaplains?

Recommendations

9. Recruit clergy from the broad denomination and faith spectrum representative of multicultural Australia.
10. Replace the restrictive formula of Anglican, Roman Catholic, and Protestant ADF chaplaincy positions with a broader and more flexible approach.
11. Remunerate chaplains to a level at least equal to their worn rank.
12. Reduce the excessive numbers of ADF Principal Chaplains.

SENATE DEFENCE PERSONNEL INQUIRY ANNEX A

A PROPOSAL FOR THE RESTRUCTURE OF HIGHER LEVELS OF CHAPLAINCY

Proposal

1. A review of the higher management structure of the chaplains is proposed to:
 - a. Complement changes under the government's efficiency and reform programs by reducing duplication of one star positions,
 - b. Bring greater effectiveness into the chaplaincy service, and
 - c. Produce savings in salaries and other costs.

Senate Terms of Reference

2. The Terms of Reference ask the Committee to examine and report on, among other issues, the current levels and categories of specialist personnel in the ADF compared to the organisation's requirements. Chaplains are specialist personnel.

The Current Situation

3. Currently ADF chaplaincy is managed by nine Principal Chaplain's (BRIG-E). Each single service has one full-time and two part-time Principal Chaplains all at one-star level. The current system is top heavy with duplication of position and function, is structured for conservatism, and lacks the dynamism required in a modern and progressive Defence Force.
4. The full-time one star Principal Chaplain in each service is currently selected, from a small pool of chaplains, on a denominational rotation basis, between Anglican, Roman Catholic, and Protestant denominations, and this means selection for representation rather than talent. Although the person selected may possess a certain competence, the main criterion in selection is religious denomination rather than leadership, ability, and high level performance.
5. There is no clearly defined career path to senior levels for General Reserve chaplains. Appointments usually terminate at CHAP3 (LTCOL-E). The GRES Principal Chaplain positions are usually occupied by Principal Chaplains retired from full-time duty who transfer to the reserve upon completion of full-time service.
6. There is no comprehensive and clearly structured approach to tri-service chaplaincy in the ADF. A piece-meal and ineffective paradigm operates at present.

Proposed Structure

7. It is proposed to create the positions of a full-time one-star Director General ADF Chaplaincy, and a CHAP4 (COL-E) GRES Deputy Director General ADF Chaplaincy.
8. This can be implemented by disestablishing 2 full-time one-star Principal Chaplain positions and 5 GRES one-star Principal Chaplain positions. The remaining full-time one star Principal Chaplain position can be redeployed and titled Director General ADF Chaplaincy and be located in HQ ADF to report to CDF (possibly through HDPE) to technically control the three single service chaplaincy organisations.
9. The Director General ADF Chaplaincy (one-star) could be appointed from any single service. The position should be non-denominational and non-service specific. The position could rotate between services on a two or three year basis.
10. The General Reserve (GRES) Deputy Director General ADF Chaplaincy position can be created from the reduction in rank of a GRES one-star Principal Chaplain position. This will provide a career structure to the General Reserve chaplaincy by being only available for members of the General Reserve. There is currently no structured opportunity for Reserve chaplains to contribute at the higher

levels of ADF chaplaincy. The position should be non-denominational and rotate between services on a two or three year basis.

11. A civilian Administrative Assistant should staff the office of the Director General ADF Chaplaincy. Transferring the current civilian Administrative Officer's position from the office of the Principal Chaplain-Army can create this position.

12. The office should also be supported by a full-time CHAP3 Staff Chaplain (LTCOL-E) from any service. Transferring the current Army Staff Chaplain's position from the office of the Principal Chaplain-Army, can create this position.

13. To ensure denominational and service representation at the highest levels of chaplaincy management, an ADF Chaplaincy Management Committee may be formed. The ADF Chaplaincy Management Committee, chaired by the Director General ADF Chaplaincy, would consist of the 2 Command Senior Chaplains (CHAP4) of each Service, and the Deputy Director General (GRES).

14. Single service Chiefs would obtain chaplaincy advice from the Director General ADF Chaplaincy.

Denominational Representatives' Function

15. In this model, within each single service, denominational recruiting and pastoral care resides with the designated denominational representative chaplain in consultation with their denominational Religious Advisory Committee to the Services (RACS) member. The single Service denominational representative would be a CHAP4 (COL-E) senior chaplain, or if not available, then a CHAP3 (LTCOL-E) senior chaplain.

Other Defence Force Chaplain Organisations

16. ADF chaplaincy is unique in that it has such a large number of one-star Principal Chaplains (Brigadier equivalent) to manage a relatively small number of chaplains. Other nations chaplaincy examples are:

- a. USA. A Chaplain General (two-star) heads each single service chaplaincy due to the large size of the United States military.
- b. UK. A Chaplain General (two-star) heads each single service chaplaincy due to the size of the Defence Force.
- c. Canada. A Defence Chaplain General (one-star) heads Defence chaplaincy.
- d. NZ. A Defence Principal Chaplain (COL) heads Defence chaplaincy.

Canadian Defence Chaplaincy

17. In 1994, following a review, the Canadian Chaplaincy reduced its two full-time Chaplain General positions to a single one-star Chaplain General, and restructured other aspects of chaplaincy. It is reported that this resulted in a Defence wide integrated, effective and responsive chaplaincy organisation, better positioned to meet the needs of the Canadian National Defence Force.

18. In the Canadian National Defence Force a full-time one-star Chaplain General manages 145 full-time chaplains. By comparison, in the ADF nine one-star Principal Chaplains manage approximately 92 full-time chaplains.

19. The current Canadian chaplaincy structure, and the New Zealand chaplaincy structure, could be the model to emulate in the ADF.

ADF Restructures

20. It is of interest to note that other ADF organisations in the personnel sector have a leaner management structure than ADF chaplaincy. For example, ADF Health Services, a much larger organisation than ADF chaplaincy, has restructured to reduce the number of senior positions. The Director General Defence Health Services position is a full-time Brigadier. A full-time Colonel commands the Defence Psychology Organisation. The Defence Community Organisation welfare body is managed by a Colonel, or at times a Defence civilian of equivalent Colonel rank.

21. A proposal by Defence Personnel Executive to restructure the higher levels of ADF chaplaincy was put to the RACS and to the Principal Chaplains during 1999. They rejected this proposal, yet the majority of chaplains seem to favour a restructure by a reduction in the number of Principal Chaplains.

22. This paper is not suggesting that an ADF chaplaincy organisation separate from single Service responsibilities should be formed. Separate Navy, Army, and RAAF, chaplaincy branches should remain as, given the relational nature of chaplaincy, this will continue to allow for effective chaplaincy. The single service chaplaincy structure below Principal Chaplain level, that is from CHAP4 Command Senior Chaplain downward is lean and effective and should remain as it is.

Conclusion

23. The Defence Review 2000: Public Discussion Paper – Executive Summary in discussing efficiency and reform programs states that *'the government is determined to increase Defence's efficiency further to give value to taxpayers. The next series of reforms and efficiency measures need to be bold'*. This paper, in that spirit of boldness, proposes that a restructure of the nine one-star Principal Chaplains' positions will increase Defence's efficiency and provide increased value to taxpayers.

24. As demonstrated by the 1999 Defence Personnel Executive chaplaincy restructure proposal rejection, the higher levels of ADF chaplaincy appear incapable or unwilling to undertake structural reform to bring about greater levels of effectiveness and efficiency. This is disappointing in a time when the ADF is restructuring to produce savings that can be utilised to increase front line combat capability, or to be reinvested in remuneration and remuneration arrangements. It is therefore proposed that Defence initiate a review into the higher levels of ADF chaplaincy with a view to restructuring the current organisation along the lines suggested in this paper.

25. This proposal should provide for greater effectiveness and efficiency. The proposed Director General ADF Chaplaincy will be required to view and manage chaplaincy on a tri-service basis, although most day to day chaplaincy will be on a single service basis. The single Service Command Senior Chaplains (CHAP4) will be involved in the higher level chaplaincy management/decision making processes, thereby providing timely, relevant, and up-to-date single service advice and support. This proposal will enable a seamless, integrated, and cohesive approach to chaplaincy management.

26. This proposal does cater for denominational representation in the decision making processes, and although denominational representation is important at the brigade, ship, and base level, it is not such an important need at the highest level of chaplaincy where the best person for the job is required. The proposed restructure will encourage the selection of a one-star Principal Chaplain based on the criteria of leadership, ability, and high level performance, and not merely on denomination.

27. The proposed restructure could neatly dovetail into the current chaplains' pay case where some high level ADF chaplaincy positions may need to be disestablished to meet increased salary costs.

Recommendations

28. It is recommended that:

- a. A review into the higher management structure of ADF chaplaincy, to rationalise the organisation and produce savings, be undertaken, and

- b. As the Canadian chaplaincy restructure is considered a success in revitalising the chaplaincy by bringing about greater effectiveness and efficiency, that this model be closely considered.

