

The Parliament of the Commonwealth of Australia

Inquiry into Electromagnetic Radiation

**Report of the Senate Environment, Communications,
Information Technology and the Arts References Committee**

May 2001

© Commonwealth of Australia 2001

ISBN 0 642 71126 7

This document is produced from camera-ready copy prepared by the Senate Environment, Communications, Information Technology and the Arts References Committee Secretariat, and printed by the Senate Printing Unit, Parliament House, Canberra.

TERMS OF REFERENCE

On 8 December 1999 the Senate referred the following matters to the Environment, Communications, Information Technology and the Arts References Committee for inquiry (to commence not before 31 March 2000) and report by 31 October 2000 (subsequently extended to 4 May 2001):

- (a) an examination of the allocation of funding from the Commonwealth's \$4.5 million fund for electro-magnetic radiation research and public information;
- (b) a review of current Australian and international research into electro-magnetic radiation and its effects as it applies to telecommunications equipment, including but not limited to, mobile telephones;
- (c) an examination of the current Australian Interim Standard [AS/NZS 2772.1 (Int): 1998], as it applies to telecommunications;
- (d) an examination of efforts to set an Australian Standard dealing with electro-magnetic emissions;
- (e) an examination of the merits of the transfer of the responsibility for setting a new Australian standard for electro-magnetic emissions to the Australian Radiation Protection and Nuclear Safety Agency.

MEMBERSHIP OF THE COMMITTEE - 39TH PARLIAMENT

Members:

Senator Lyn Allison (Chair) (AD, VIC)
 Senator John Tierney (Deputy Chair) (LP, NSW)
 Senator Mark Bishop (ALP, WA)
 Senator the Hon Nick Bolkus (ALP, SA)
 Senator Kate Lundy (ALP, ACT)
 Senator Tseben Tchen (LP, VIC)

Participating Members:

Senator the Hon Eric Abetz (LP, TAS)	Senator Steve Hutchins (ALP, NSW)
Senator Andrew Bartlett (AD, QLD)	Senator Sue Knowles (LP, WA)
Senator the Hon Ron Boswell (NP, QLD)	Senator Meg Lees (AD, SA)
Senator Bob Brown (AG, TAS)	Senator Sue Mackay (ALP, TAS)
Senator Paul Calvert (LP, TAS)	Senator Brett Mason (LP, QLD)
Senator George Campbell (ALP, NSW)	Senator Julian McGauran (NPA, VIC)
Senator Kim Carr (ALP, VIC)	Senator Jan McLucas (ALP, QLD)
Senator Grant Chapman (LP, SA)	Senator Shayne Murphy (ALP, TAS)
Senator Helen Coonan (LP, NSW)	Senator Marise Payne (LP, NSW)
Senator Winston Crane (LP, WA)	Senator the Hon Chris Schacht (ALP, SA)
Senator Alan Eggleston (LP, WA)	Senator Natasha Stott Despoja (AD, SA)
Senator the Hon John Faulkner (ALP, NSW)	Senator John Watson (LP, TAS)
Senator Alan Ferguson (LP, SA)	
Senator Jeannie Ferris (LP, SA)	Senator Aden Ridgeway (AD, NSW)
Senator the Hon Brian Gibson AM (LP, TAS)	appointed for arts issues
Senator Brian Harradine (IND, TAS)	Senator Vicki Bourne (AD, NSW)
Senator Len Harris (PHON, QLD)	appointed for the inquiry into the online delivery of ABC material

Committee Secretariat

Senate Environment, Communications, Information Technology
and the Arts References Committee

S1.57, Parliament House

Canberra ACT 2600

Tel: 02 6277 3526

Fax: 02 6277 5818

Email: ecita.sen@aph.gov.au

Internet: http://www.aph.gov.au/senate_environment

TABLE OF CONTENTS

TERMS OF REFERENCE	iii
MEMBERSHIP OF THE COMMITTEE - 39TH PARLIAMENT	v
TABLE OF CONTENTS	vii
ACRONYMS AND GLOSSARY	xi
 EXECUTIVE SUMMARY	 xv
Introduction	xv
The research.....	xv
Possible mechanisms	xvi
Cancer.....	xvii
Other health effects.....	xviii
Mobile phone towers and base stations	xix
Minimising the risk.....	xix
Funding of research and public information	xix
 RECOMMENDATIONS	 xxv
 CHAPTER 1	 1
INTRODUCTION	1
Reference to the Committee	1
Conduct of the inquiry.....	1
Acknowledgments	3
Terminology and background.....	3
 CHAPTER 2	 11
RESEARCH ON THE HEALTH EFFECTS OF ELECTROMAGNETIC RADIATION	11
Introduction	11
Exposure to electromagnetic radiation – if biological effects are shown, what are the health implications?.....	11
The role of epidemiology, <i>in vitro</i> and <i>in vivo</i> studies	15
Replication.....	17
Is the scientific evidence inconclusive?	21

Anecdotal and non-peer-reviewed evidence	23
Publication and research bias	25
Biological effects	26
The search for a mechanism	27
How important is it to distinguish between frequencies?	31
Observed biological and health effects of radiofrequency radiation	34
Health effects discussed	41
Mobile phone towers and base stations	59
Benefits of mobile phones	61
Electromagnetic Interference (EMI)	62
Electromagnetic radiation from non-telecommunication technologies	64
Measures to minimise potential health risks	65
Complaints mechanism	70
International research	75
Australian research	80
Future research	86
CHAPTER 3	89
ALLOCATION OF AUSTRALIAN RADIOFREQUENCY ELECTROMAGNETIC ENERGY PROGRAM FUNDS	89
Introduction	89
Committee on Electromagnetic Energy Public Health Issues (CEMEPHI)	89
Radiofrequency Electromagnetic Energy Program	90
National Health and Medical Research Council (NHMRC)	91
Where the Funds Have Been Allocated	91
CHAPTER 4	123
AUSTRALIAN STANDARD ON RADIOFREQUENCY FIELDS EXPOSURE LEVELS	123
Introduction	123
Development of the standard	123
Basis of Radiofrequency Standards	124
Standards Australia International Limited	128
Standards Australia Technical Committee TE/7	128
Standards Australia Processes	129
History of the Australian Standard	130

The Transfer of Responsibility for Setting a New Australian Standard to ARPANSA	148
Precautionary Approaches	154
Testing for compliance with the Standard	171
Testing of shielding devices	172
Other precautionary measures	173
Occupational Standards	173
ARPANSA Working Group Draft Standard	175
Conclusion	178
GOVERNMENT MEMBERS COMMENTS	179
MINORITY REPORT BY LABOR SENATORS	185
TABLE OF CONTENTS	185
RECOMMENDATIONS OF LABOR SENATORS	187
1. INTRODUCTION	189
2. CRITIQUE OF CHAIR’S REPORT	191
3. TERM OF REFERENCE (A) - ELECTROMAGNETIC RADIATION RESEARCH FUNDING ALLOCATION	193
1. Decision-making processes for the distribution of research funding	193
2. Timeframe for distribution and use of funds	194
3. Inappropriate expenditure of funds	195
Adequacy of research funding	195
4. TERM OF REFERENCE (B) - REVIEW OF RESEARCH	197
Expert evidence: contradictory	197
Scientific value of studies	197
Witness conclusions – EMR effects	199
International research reviews	200
International research	201
Conclusions of international research	204
Conclusions in evidence to the Committee	204
Recommendations based on conclusions	206
Recommendations of consumer and community groups	207
Powerlines and leukaemia	209
Planning issues – telecommunications and electricity infrastructure	212

5. TERMS OF REFERENCE (C) & (D) - THE CURRENT AUSTRALIAN INTERIM STANDARD [AS/NZS 2772.1 (INT): [1998], AS IT APPLIES TO TELECOMMUNICATIONS & EFFORTS TO SET AN AUSTRALIAN STANDARD DEALING WITH EME	215
History of setting standards relating to EMR in Australia	215
The appropriate standard	218
Metals industry and EMR standards.....	220
6. TERM OF REFERENCE (E) - ARPANSA'S STANDARD SETTING RESPONSIBILITY.....	221
Draft ARPANSA Standard.....	221
ARPANSA's role in standard setting - appropriateness.....	221
ARPANSA Draft and prudent avoidance/precautionary approach	222
Precautionary approach in ARPANSA draft standard	225
APPENDIX 1 – CRITIQUE OF CHAIR'S REPORT	227
(a) Issues extraneous to terms of reference	227
(b) Chair's recommendations/conclusions inconsistent with evidence.....	228
(c) Relative credibility of witnesses – distorted in Chair's report.....	229
(d) Evidence taken out of context/distorted.....	232
(e) Recommendations imprecise	233
APPENDIX 2 - GLOSSARY	234
APPENDIX 1	235
LIST OF SUBMISSIONS	235
APPENDIX 2	243
WITNESSES AT HEARINGS	243
APPENDIX 3	247
ADDITIONAL INFORMATION.....	247
Tabled Documents.....	247
Answers to Questions on Notice	250
Additional Correspondence	250
Responses to Adverse Comments made in Written Submissions	250