The Senate

Community Affairs Legislation Committee

Social Security and Other Legislation Amendment (Welfare Reform and Reinstatement of Racial Discrimination Act) Bill 2009 [Provisions]

Families, Housing, Community Services and Indigenous Affairs and Other Legislation Amendment (2009 Measures) Bill 2009 [Provisions]

Families, Housing, Community Services and Indigenous Affairs and Other Legislation Amendment (Restoration of Racial Discrimination Act) Bill 2009

March 2010

© Commonwealth of Australia 2010
ISBN 978-1-74229-273-1

Senate Community Affairs Committee Secretariat:
Mr Elton Humphery (Secretary)
Ms Naomi Bleeser (Secretary)
Ms Christine McDonald (Principal Research Officer)
Mr Owen Griffiths (Senior Research Officer)
Mr Bill Bannear (Senior Research Officer)
Ms Leonie Peake (Research Officer)
Ms Ingrid Zappe (Executive Assistant)
Ms Hanako Jones (Executive Assistant)
Ms Victoria Robinson-Conlon (Executive Assistant)
Ms Sophia Fernandes (Executive Assistant)

The Senate
Parliament House
Canberra ACT 2600
Phone: 02 6277 3515
Fax: 02 6277 5829
E-mail: community.affairs.sen@aph.gov.au
Internet: http://www.aph.gov.au/senate_ca

This document was produced by the Senate Community Affairs Committee Secretariat and printed by the Senate Printing Unit, Parliament House, Canberra.

MEMBERSHIP OF THE COMMITTEE

42nd Parliament

Members

Senator Claire Moore, Chair	ALP, Queensland
Senator Rachel Siewert, Deputy Chair	AG, Western Australia
Senator Judith Adams	LP, Western Australia
Senator Sue Boyce	LP, Queensland
Senator Carol Brown*	ALP, Tasmania
Senator Mark Furner	ALP, Queensland

Participating Members for this inquiry

Senator Trish Crossin (ALP, Northern Territory) to replace Senator Carol Brown for this inquiry.

TABLE OF CONTENTS

MEMBERSHIP OF THE COMMITTEE iii

Abbreviations ix

Recommendations xi

SOCIAL SECURITY AND OTHER LEGISLATION AMENDMENT (WELFARE REFORM AND REINSTATEMENT OF RACIAL DISCRIMINATION ACT) BILL 2009; 1

FAMILIES, HOUSING, COMMUNITY SERVICES AND INDIGENOUS AFFAIRS AND OTHER LEGISLATION AMENDMENT (2009 MEASURES) BILL 2009; AND 1

FAMILIES, HOUSING, COMMUNITY SERVICES AND INDIGENOUS AFFAIRS AND OTHER LEGISLATION AMENDMENT (RESTORATION OF RACIAL DISCRIMINATION ACT) BILL 2009 1

THE INQUIRY 1

BACKGROUND 1

THE BILLS 2

Social Security and Other Legislation Amendment (Welfare Reform and Reinstatement of Racial Discrimination Act) Bill 2009 2

Families, Housing, Community Services and Indigenous Affairs and Other Legislation Amendment (2009 Measures) Bill 2009 8

Families, Housing, Community Affairs and Other Legislation (Restoration of Racial Discrimination Act) Bill 2009 10

Structure of the Report 10

Note on references 11

Chapter 2 13

Reinstatement of the Racial Discrimination Act 13

Background 13

The need to reinstate the Racial Discrimination Act 15

Issues 16

NTER Redesign Consultations 27

Chapter 3 35

Income management 35

Background....35
The proposed new model of income management....35
Historical context of policy change....40
Issues....41

Chapter 4....63

Other measures....63

Senate Standing Committee on Community Affairs....69

COALITION SENATORS' DISSENTING REPORT....69

Executive summary....69
Inviting a legal challenge to the legislation....70
Special measures....72
Discrimination in the Bill....72
Proposed amendments – *'Dysfunction not race'*....73
Conclusion....74

Inquiry into the provisions of the Social Security and Other Legislation Amendment (Welfare Reform and Reinstatement of the Racial Discrimination Act) Bill 2009 and related legislation....75

Dissenting report by Senator Rachel Siewert, Australian Greens....75

Inadequacies of the majority report....76
The current approach does not restore the RDA....77
Permissible limitations on human rights....78
Failure to qualify as 'special measures'....78
The duty to consult....79
Land is a special case....80
The need for a 'notwithstanding' clause....81
Legal challenge is inevitable....82
Parliament should resolve legislative problems, not the courts....82

The national introduction of indiscriminate mandatory income management 84

Fundamental issues of principle....84
The lack of pathways 'up and out' of income management....87
No evidence income management has resulted in better nutrition....88
Income management does not improve financial capacity....89
Income management costs reduce investment in social services....91

Intensive case management, not IM alone, produces results 92
Absence of assessment framework and baseline data 93
Conclusion 94
Recommendations: 94

APPENDIX 1 97

Submissions and Additional Information received by the Committee 97

Submissions received 97
Additional Information 100

APPENDIX 2 103

Public Hearings 103