

The Senate

Community Affairs
Legislation Committee

Truth in Food Labelling Bill 2003

March 2004

© Parliament of the Commonwealth of Australia 2004

ISBN 0 642 71347 2

Senate Community Affairs Legislation Committee Secretariat

Mr Elton Humphery – Secretary

Ms Leonie Peake – Research Officer

Ms Ingrid Zappe – Executive Assistant

The Senate

Parliament House

Canberra ACT 2600

Phone: 02 6277 3515

Fax: 02 6277 5829

E-mail: community.affairs.sen@aph.gov.au

Internet: http://www.aph.gov.au/senate_ca

This document was produced by the Senate Community Affairs Legislation Committee Secretariat and printed by the Senate Printing Unit, Parliament House, Canberra.

Membership of the Committee

Members

Senator Sue Knowles, Chairman	LP, Western Australia
Senator Brian Greig, Deputy Chairman	AD, Western Australia
Senator Guy Barnett	LP, Tasmania
Senator Kay Denman	ALP, Tasmania
Senator Gary Humphries	LP, Australian Capital Territory
Senator Steve Hutchins	ALP, New South Wales

Participating members

Senator Bob Brown	AG, Tasmania
Senator Michael Forshaw	ALP, New South Wales

TABLE OF CONTENTS

Membership of the Committee	iii
REPORT - TRUTH IN FOOD LABELLING BILL 2003	1
THE INQUIRY	1
THE BILL.....	1
ISSUES.....	2
RECOMMENDATION.....	6
DISSENTING REPORT – Senator Bob Brown, Australian Greens.....	7
APPENDIX 1 – Submissions received by the Committee	9
APPENDIX 2 – Public Hearing.....	25

REPORT

TRUTH IN FOOD LABELLING BILL 2003

THE INQUIRY

1.1 The Truth in Food Labelling Bill 2003 (the Bill) was introduced into the Senate on 13 October 2003 by Senator Bob Brown, Australian Greens, Tasmania. On 29 October 2003, the Senate, on the recommendation of the Selection of Bills Committee (Report No. 14 of 2003), referred the Bill to the Committee for report.

1.2 The Committee considered the Bill at a public hearing on 4 March 2004. Details of the public hearing are referred to in Appendix 2. The Committee received 583 submissions relating to the Bill and these are listed at Appendix 1. A number of the submissions may be accessed through the Committee's website at http://www.aph.gov.au/senate_ca

THE BILL

1.3 The purpose of the Bill is to provide for a comprehensive food labelling system in Australia that will require the labelling of all foods derived from gene technology and not just those foods that still have detectable levels of genetically modified (GM) protein or DNA left after processing.¹

1.4 The Bill is the result of a Trans-Tasman link-up between Greens Members of Parliament (MPs) in Australia and New Zealand. An almost identical Bill has been introduced in the New Zealand Parliament by Ms Sue Kedgley, MP, Green Party of Aotearoa New Zealand.

1.5 The proposed legislation is based on the concept that consumers have the right to sufficient, accurate and meaningful information on a label to enable them to make informed food purchasing decisions.

1.6 The Bill proposes that all GM derived foods, ingredients, flavourings and additives would have to be labelled, irrespective of whether there is DNA or protein of GM origin in the final product. The following foods are exempted from the provisions of sections 10 and 11 of the Bill which cover this matter:

- (a) All meat, milk, eggs obtained from animals treated with GM veterinary products, or fed GM food;
- (b) Food produced with the help of GM enzymes;
- (c) Takeaway foods and restaurant meals.

1 Second Reading Speech, Senator Bob Brown, *Senate Hansard*, 13.10.03, pp.16180-16181.

1.7 The Bill also proposes that the threshold for labelling foods that are inadvertently contaminated with GM material would be lowered from 1% to 0.5%. The threshold for non-approved GM material would remain at its current level of zero.

1.8 The proposed legislation would require animal feed derived from GM material to be labelled for the first time. It would also ensure that GMOs can be traced at all stages in the production, distribution and marketing chain which would enable authorities to keep track of all GM material that enters the food chain and trace GM food ingredients and foods from the moment of their inception through the processing stage. This would ensure that producers could prove that they have taken all appropriate steps to avoid such contamination.

1.9 The Bill also requires the Minister to implement a monitoring plan that would enable the tracing of any direct or indirect unforeseen effects on human health or the environment of GM food or feed after it has been placed on the market.

1.10 The legislation proposes that the country of origin of all packaged meat, fish, fruit and vegetables placed on the market in Australia be clearly identified. All unpackaged meat, fish, fruit and vegetables, including bulk foods, would be required to have the country of origin identified at the point of display for sale. Exemptions to this requirement would be meat, fish, fruits, and vegetables which constitute less than 20 per cent of a product.

ISSUES

1.11 A large number of submissions were received supporting the proposed legislation. The majority of these submissions were from residents of New Zealand and were of a very similarly worded 'standardised' nature.

1.12 Some peak organisations expressed strong support for the existing legislation and regulation which they consider ensures that any GM crop or food is rigorously assessed for its impact on human health, and that existing food labelling requirements ensure that consumers have information available to enable them to make informed choices. They therefore considered that the proposed legislation was unnecessary. Avcare expressed the view that:

The strength of the current Australian legislation in relation to the labelling of foods as GM is that it links labelling to presence of DNA and protein in the final food. There is a defined threshold that a competent laboratory can test for in the final food. The standard is therefore enforceable, without reference to documentation and the records of growers and food manufacturers. This emphasis on product and not process is a positive attribute of the current labelling regime.²

1.13 The Australian Food and Grocery Council (AFGC) stated that it did not support the proposed legislation because 'it is not based on sound science and evidence of risk

to public health and safety'. The AFGC believed that the existing regulations provided confidence in the regulatory safeguards governing the development, release and labelling of products made using gene technology.³

1.14 The opinion was expressed by Bayer CropScience that the present regulatory system for the regulation of food substances, including the labelling of foods, is one of the best in the world and that the proposed legislation would introduce additional costs for industry without providing anything of benefit to the consumer.⁴

1.15 The South Australian Minister for Health, who is a member of the Australia New Zealand Food Regulation Ministerial Council (ANZFRMC), believes that the existing Food Standards Code *Standard 1.5.2 – Food Produced Using Gene Technology* represents a practical and workable standard for the regulation of GM food labelling.⁵

1.16 Avcare submitted that Standard 1.5.2 of the Food Standards Code prescribes the labelling of genetically modified food where:

- novel DNA and/or protein is present in the final food; and
- where the food has altered characteristics.

The following are exempt from these requirements:

- highly refined food where the effect of the refining process is to remove novel DNA and/or protein;
- processing aids and food additives except those where novel DNA and/or protein is present in the final food;
- flavours which are present in a concentration less than or equal to 0.1% in the final food; and
- food prepared at the point of sale.

Also exempt from GM labelling are ingredients where they contain up to 1% of genetically modified material where its presence is unintended. This threshold has been set based on FSANZ review of international literature in relation to health, safety and monitoring.⁶

1.17 Avcare also pointed out that the Food Standards Code is complemented by provisions in the *Trade Practices Act* which ensures food manufacturers and retailers provide accurate information to consumers.⁷

3 *Submission 428* (AFGC).

4 *Submission 26* (Bayer CropScience).

5 *Submission 567* (Minister for Health, South Australia).

6 *Supplementary Submission 444* (Avcare), p.1.

7 *Submission 444* (Avcare).

1.18 The Committee's attention was also drawn to the fact that when *Standard 1.5.2* was approved it was noted that the ANZFRMC should be:

...mindful of international developments and that there would be a review by Food Standards Australia New Zealand (FSANZ) three years from the date the Standard was gazetted in December 2000. Consequently the existing GM labelling requirements are currently under review with the final report to be present to the ANZFRMC in early 2004.⁸

1.19 Some submissions noted that Australia has an exceptional record in the analysis and reporting of chemical residues and contaminants of food products through the National Residue Survey. The Australian Total Diet Survey also provides publicly available information on residues.⁹

1.20 Greenpeace, however, considered that the current system of labelling does not provide sufficient information for consumers to be fully informed, as they believe is their right. They referred to a recent survey by Biotechnology Australia which showed that public concern over genetic engineering is increasing and covers a wide range of environmental impacts.

1.21 Greenpeace raised the issue of full traceability and argued that a number of food companies are not willing to label their products as genetically engineered (GE) saying that the public do not want them, but they are moving beyond that and are removing GE from their whole supply chain including animal feed. Greenpeace stated that it would be easier for these companies if there was labelling of animal feed in the supply chains so that they could then make clear requests to their suppliers.¹⁰

1.22 With regard to traceability, Avcare advised the Committee that the Gene Technology Grains Committee principles provide a system to establish traceability for GM canola grown in Australia. The principles bring together quality assurance at each state of the supply chain so as to ensure product integrity that meets market specifications.¹¹

1.23 The Committee also discussed the new labelling requirements to be introduced shortly in the European Union (EU). Greenpeace claimed that, in their opinion, the EU was basically moving to a full traceability system that would require any product derived from a GE crop to be labelled, though it stops short of requiring that products from animals that have been fed GE crops need to be labelled.¹²

1.24 Ms Sue Kedgley, MP, Green Party of Aotearoa New Zealand informed the Committee that New Zealand farmers had not expressed concern about possible

8 *Submission 567* (Minister for Health, South Australia).

9 *Submissions 444*, p.1 (Avcare); 427 (SFMCA); 428 (AFGC).

10 *Committee Hansard*, 04.03.04, p.CA8.

11 *Committee Hansard*, 04.03.04, p.CA2.

12 *Committee Hansard*, 04.03.04, p.CA8.

government requirements of carrying out a traceability regime because of the fact that the majority do not grow GE food. However, the situation would be that if they intended to export produce to Europe the new EU regulations would require them to include labelling and traceability of the products they exported.¹³

1.25 When questioned concerning organic foods on supermarket shelves and food regulation in Australia Avcare responded:

Senator Brown – Are you aware that that is regulated right from the farm gate through to the supermarket shelves?

Mr Gauchat – I would argue that in Australia that would not be the case. Maybe in some other markets it is.

Senator Brown – So you are saying that the organic food that we get ...there is not a traceability factor to it?

Mr Gauchat – I am saying that there is an export standard, which is world class, but there are not the same domestic standards.¹⁴

1.26 The Stock Feed Manufacturers' Council of Australia (SFMCA) submitted that:

The global feed industry has recognised that it is part of the food chain and as such has responded positively to the increasing demands placed upon food suppliers. Food safety issues, particularly those originating within Europe have resulted in increased levels of quality assurance within the feed industry.¹⁵

1.27 The SFMCA stated that within Australia the stockfeed industry has been working proactively to ensure the industry maintains its high level of compliance with all issues relating to food safety. For instance, in 2003 a national quality assurance program known as FeedSafe was introduced which is based upon a Code of Good Manufacturing Practice. This Code was developed in conjunction with the Chief Veterinary Officers in the Commonwealth Government and each of the State and Territory governments.

1.28 The Code of Good Manufacturing Practice has the following objectives:

- To protect the health of the human consumer of food products derived from livestock fed on prepared stock feeds.
- To protect the health of livestock and to enable livestock producers to achieve expected levels of performance by delivering stock feed of consistent quality to animals.
- To contribute to the delivery of livestock products of consistent and appropriate quality to the end consumer.

13 *Committee Hansard*, 04.03.04, p.CA13.

14 *Committee Hansard*, 04.03.04, p.CA5.

15 *Submission 427 (SFMCA)*, p.3.

1.29 SFMCA also informed the Committee that the introduction of FeedSafe has been initiated voluntarily by the industry and reinforces the industry's commitment to maintaining a supply of safe feed and food products.¹⁶

RECOMMENDATION

1.30 The Committee reports to the Senate that it has considered the Truth in Food Labelling Bill 2003 and **recommends** that the Bill not proceed.

Senator Sue Knowles
Chairman
March 2004

DISSENTING REPORT

BY SENATOR BOB BROWN, AUSTRALIAN GREENS

Why the Bill should be endorsed

The Committee's report made the following points which support the Bill being endorsed by the Senate:

- a) Consumers have a right to know if food for sale has derived from genetically modified stock.
- b) This right granted in the bill is not met by current legislation. There is growing public concern about GMO impacts on the environment.

To explain this further, many consumers do not want to buy foods (eg canola oil, margarine) which comes from GMO crops, even if there is no food contamination, because the consumers are aware of major scientific concerns about the impact of GMO crops on the land, other crops and natural ecosystems.

- c) Stronger European Union laws will mean Australian and New Zealand food exports will require traceability and tougher labelling laws. It is daft not to have at least equal domestic standards on food labelling to those required for exports. Australia and New Zealand consumers deserve world's best standards.

The bill should proceed.

Senator Bob Brown

APPENDIX 1

Submissions received by the Committee

- 1 Hamill, Ms Sue (NZ)
- 2 Richards, Mr Don (NZ)
- 3 Clements, Ms Anna
- 4 Pulham, Bryan & Chalmers, Ms Elizabeth (NZ)
- 5 Hannah, Ms Lynda (NZ)
- 6 Newby, Ms Karen
- 7 Purnell, Mr Scott & Ms Lisa
- 8 Simon, Mr Michael & Ms Gisela
- 9 Carnachan, Mr Hamish
- 10 Flett, Mhairi (NZ)
- 11 Laing, Ms Debbie (NZ)
- 12 Brine, Ms Joan C (SA)
- 13 Cochrane, Mr Phillip (NZ)
- 14 Speizer, Mr Imre (NZ)
- 15 Higgins, Ms Margaret (SA)
- 16 Wall, Ms Nicola
- 17 Cole, Mr Josh
- 18 Hornby, Ms Rachel (SA)
- 19 Cattey, Ms Grace (NZ)
- 20 Higgins, Ms Leanne (SA)
- 21 Bramhall, Dr Stuart (NZ)
- 22 Oliver, Mr Ryan (NZ)
- 23 Penning, Mr Michael (SA)
- 24 Clayton, Mrs Maria (NZ)
- 25 Owers, Ms Nicky (NZ)
- 26 Bayer CropScience (VIC)
- 27 Vickery, Ms Kristy
- 28 Elwell-Sutton, Mr Paul (NZ)
- 29 Penning, H (SA)
- 30 French, Shari & Wood, Anthony (NZ)
- 31 Ough, Ms Jane (NZ)
- 32 Singh, Ms Vidya (NZ)
- 33 Tomes, Marilyn (NZ)
- 34 Grant, Ms Carol (NZ)
- 35 Austring, Ms Diana (NZ)

- 36 Prince, Ms Kylie (NZ)
- 37 O'Callaghan, Ms Sharon (NZ)
- 38 Muller, Mr Jon (NZ)
- 39 Brown, Mr Derek (NZ)
- 40 Platt, Mr Grant (NZ)
- 41 Carapiet, Mr Jon (NZ)
- 42 Buchler, Ms Marie (NZ)
- 43 Holley, Mr Alex (NZ)
- 44 Bean, Ms Glenys (NZ)
- 45 Hurley, Ms Charlotte (NZ)
- 46 Metuamate Tuatini, Areti (NZ)
- 47 Buck, Ms Donna (NZ)
- 48 Smith, Mr Warren & Ms Sharon (NZ)
- 49 Lehwenz Family (NZ)
- 50 Reisinger, Mr Thomas (NZ)
- 51 Ray, Ms Janet (NZ)
- 52 Higgins, Ms Madeleine (NZ)
- 53 Hughes, Mr Bob (NZ)
- 54 Reid, Ms Amanda (NZ)
- 55 Inglis, Mr Kent (NZ)
- 56 Roesch, Ms Joan & Mr Henry (NZ)
- 57 Miller, Ms Leah (NZ)
- 58 Rodgers, Mr Peter and Rodgers, Mrs Nicholas (NZ)
- 59 Davidson, Ms Ange (NZ)
- 60 Sorrenson, Ms Amanda (NZ)
- 61 Hein-Patrik, C (NZ)
- 62 Anderson, Mr Phil (NZ)
- 63 Dewar, Ms Kath (NZ)
- 64 McKee, Mr Billy (NZ)
- 65 Rouse, Mr David (NZ)
- 66 Morrison, Mr Chris (NZ)
- 67 Newton, Mr John (NZ)
- 68 Chalmers, Jesse (NZ)
- 69 Barton, Dr Mels (NZ)
- 70 Baragwanath, Mr Paul (NZ)
- 71 Simpson, Dr Kenneth (NZ)
- 72 Parkins, Kerry (NZ)
- 73 Benseman, Ms Julie (NZ)
- 74 Green, Mr Richard (NZ)

-
- 75 McCree, Mr M (NZ)
76 Scott, Mr Mike and Shotton, Ms Sue (NZ)
77 Kirkham, Ms Hazel (NZ)
78 Rogan, Mr Bruce (NZ)
79 Phippen, Ms Christine (NZ)
80 Griffin, Ms Francisca (NZ)
81 Collins, Ms Meg (NZ)
82 Smith, Mr Graham (NZ)
83 James, Mrs Lyn (NZ)
84 Sturrock, Mr Campbell (NZ)
85 Harris, Mr Ken & Harris, Ms Jenny (NZ)
86 Mullins, Ms Paula (NZ)
87 Metcalfe, Ms Thelma (NZ)
88 Nicolau, Ms Margot (NZ)
89 Judge, Mr Steve (NZ)
90 Burnside, Ms Gretta (NZ)
91 Bracey, Ms Robyn (NZ)
92 Allen, Ms Caroline (NZ)
93 Gates, Mr Brendan (NZ)
94 NZ Health Limited (NZ)
95 NZ Health Trust (NZ)
96 Sloan, Mr Dave (NZ)
97 Dick, Ms Lesley (NZ)
98 VEF Charitable Trust (NZ)
99 NZ Essentials Limited (NZ)
100 Ellis, Mr Robert (NZ)
101 MyHealth Limited (NZ)
102 Kruhlak, Mr Robert (NZ)
103 Day, Ms Suzanne (NZ)
104 Anderson, Ms Sandra (NZ)
105 Gruner, Dr Ingrid (NZ)
106 Chignell, Mr Bevan (NZ)
107 Iseke, Mr Franz & Ms Maria (NZ)
108 Gwynn, Ms Margaret (NZ)
109 Devcich, Ms Anita (NZ)
110 Baylis, Mr Anthony (NZ)
111 Howard, Ms Helen (NZ)
112 Bergersen, Ms Diana & Mr John (NZ)
113 Beverley, Ms Johanna (NZ)

- 114 Harrow, Ms Mary (NZ)
- 115 Zwaan, Ms Monique (NZ)
- 116 Curnow, Ms Esther (NZ)
- 117 Basker-Lowe, Ms Jill (NZ)
- 118 Owen, Mr Dawson & McLennan, Ms Ruth (NZ)
- 119 Cook, Ms Jane (NZ)
- 120 Stevenson, Mr Stewart (NZ)
- 121 Jorgensen, Ms Rosemary (NZ)
- 122 MacKenzie, Ms Tracey (NZ)
- 123 Proctor, Mr Rex (NZ)
- 124 Foster, Ms Penelope (NZ)
- 125 de Smit, Mr Andrew (NZ)
- 126 Sparks, Ms Jane (NZ)
- 127 Elworthy, Ms Fiona (NZ)
- 128 Cromie, Ms Alastair (NZ)
- 129 Lauria, Mr Salvatore (NZ)
- 130 Telfer, Ms Vivienne (NZ)
- 131 O'Brien, Ms Patsy (NZ)
- 132 Wrighton, Mr Ben (NZ)
- 133 Kydd, Ms Jeni (NZ)
- 134 Pates, Ms Catherine (NZ)
- 135 Congregational Leaders' Conference of Aotearoa New Zealand (NZ)
- 136 Neighbours, Mr Colin (NZ)
- 137 Wicks, Ms Nola (NZ)
- 138 Vickers, Mr Alistair (NZ)
- 139 Mead, Dr Graham (NZ)
- 140 Brooks, Ms Jocelyn (NZ)
- 141 Sparks, Ms Dianne (NZ)
- 142 Brown, Ms Cherie (NZ)
- 143 Andringa, Mr Siets (NZ)
- 144 Trotter, Ms Liesl (NZ)
- 145 Baragwanath, Dr Lucy (NZ)
- 146 Hislop, Ms Ana (NZ)
- 147 Parker, Ms Sarah (NZ)
- 148 Collins, Ms Cath (NZ)
- 149 Prince, Mr Don (NZ)
- 150 Dymond, Rev Michael (NZ)
- 151 Vickers, Ms Amanda (NZ)
- 152 Baldwin, Mr Alan (NZ)

-
- 153 Pearl, Ms Amare (NSW)
154 Barr, mr Tremane (NZ)
155 Lissaman, Ms Claire (NZ)
156 Anderson, Dr Robert (NZ)
157 Smith, Ms Anita (NZ)
158 Tankard, Ms kerry (NZ)
159 Marjorbanks, Mr Ewen (NZ)
160 Bateson, Mr Liston (NZ)
161 Royal Forest & Bird Protection Society Waitakere Branch (NZ)
162 Aylward, Ms Margaret (NZ)
163 Beecroft, Mr Brian (NZ)
164 Watson, Ms Leah (NZ)
165 Beecroft, Ms Patricia (NZ)
166 Marriner, Mr Darryl (NZ)
167 Volker, Mr Peter (NZ)
168 Huxholl, Mr Heinz
169 Stephen, Ms Rosemary (NZ)
170 Doherty, Mr Greg (NZ)
171 Smith, Ms Carolyn (NZ)
172 Hill, Ms Elizabeth (NZ)
173 Wilson, Ms Jeanette
Carter, Mr Andrew James
Carter, Ms Sarah
Carter, Mr Liam
Carter, Ms Mary
Chancellor, Lee (NZ)
174 Jennings, Ms Celia (NZ)
175 Rodgers, Mr Alex (NZ)
176 Rodgers, Ms Jill (NZ)
177 Rodgers, Ms Sandy (NZ)
178 Rodgers, Mr Michael (NZ)
179 Rodgers, Ms Rebecca (NZ)
180 Rodgers, Ms Samantha (NZ)
181 Green, Ms Cynthia (NZ)
182 Annan, Ms Meg (NZ)
183 Gard'ner, Brendan and Family (NZ)
184 Keith, KB (NZ)
185 Eskelsen, Ms Dawn (NZ)
186 Schloemer, Dr Volker (NZ)
187 Klein, Mr Hugh (NZ)

- 188 Gannaway, Ms Noeline (NZ)
- 189 Taylor-Bell, Ms Jean (NZ)
- 190 Bell, Ms Heather (NZ)
- 191 Onderwater, R (NZ)
- 192 Taylor, Ms Janene (NZ)
- 193 Donaldson, Ms Gabriella (NZ)
- 194 Baron, Mr Steve (NZ)
- 195 Butler, Ms Maria (NZ)
- 196 Haskins, Ms Amanda (NZ)
- 197 Sinclair, Ms Libby (NZ)
- 198 Badger, Mrs Zenda (NZ)
- 199 Poff-Pencole, Ms Isabelle (NZ)
- 200 Poff, Mr Joseph (NZ)
- 201 Pronk, Ms Melissa (NZ)
- 202 Sullivan, Ms Denise (NZ)
- 203 Meyer, Mr Greg (NZ)
- 204 Luck, Ms Becky (NZ)
- 205 Ussher, Ms Anna (NZ)
- 206 Greenhough, Mr Robert (NZ)
- 207 MacDuff, Campbell (NZ)
- 208 Robinson, Ms Deborah (NZ)
- 209 Thomson, Ms Ra (NZ)
- 210 Low, Ms Andrene (NZ)
- 211 Hooper, Ms Sarah (NZ)
- 212 Nelson, Mr Mike (NZ)
- 213 Marshall Family (NZ)
- 214 Lee, Mr Shaun (NZ)
- 215 Sweden, Mr John (NZ)
- 216 Ufton, Mr Darryl (NZ)
- 217 Donovan, Mr John (NZ)
- 218 Moxham, Ms Helen (NZ)
- 219 Shanks, Ms Pamela (NZ)
- 220 Rennie, Ms Jocelyn (NZ)
- 221 Munro, Ms Susan (NZ)
- 222 Far North Environment Centre (NZ)
- 223 Flynn, Ms Jan & Kennedy, Mr Michael (NZ)
- 224 Dalbeth Ms D K (NZ)
- 225 Read, Mr Michael (NZ)
- 226 Williamson, Kim (NZ)

-
- 227 Brookes, Mr John (NZ)
228 Crossland, Ms Fran (NZ)
229 McEntee, Mr Patrick (NZ)
230 Schaverien, Jane & Kaa, Herewini (NZ)
231 Watts, Ms Charmaine (NZ)
232 Thomson, Ms Mary (NZ)
233 Duyvestyn, Ms Helen (NZ)
234 Martin-Austin, Ms Cornelia (NZ)
235 Jagannath, Rekha
236 Tyrrell, Ms Jacqueline (NZ)
237 Gibb, Mr Nigel (NZ)
238 Karauria, Ms Merania (NZ)
239 Bailey, Ms Pauline (NZ)
240 Bailey, Mr David (NZ)
241 Eggers, Ms Helen (NZ)
242 Todd, Ms Christine (NZ)
243 Harman, Ms Gaye (NZ)
244 Verduyn, Mr Lewis (NZ)
245 Chao, Ling Ling
246 Waterman, Ms Brenda (NZ)
247 Marshall, Mr Steve (NZ)
248 Howell, Ms Wendy (NZ)
249 Wilshire, Ms Shirley (NZ)
250 Carter, Ms Lisa
251 Hilhorst, Ms Marieke & Hansford, Mr Dave (NZ)
252 Ross, Mr Phil (NZ)
253 Meyer, Ms Helga (NZ)
254 Fawcett, Mr Paul
255 Stephens, Ms Kerensa (NZ)
256 Schloemer, Ms Ingrid (NZ)
257 Guthrie, Mr Ian & Ms Claudia (NZ)
258 Thornton, Ms Jocelyn (NZ)
259 Tangohau, Ms Andrea (NZ)
260 Eggers, Mr Grant (NZ)
261 Piekarski, Ms Joanna (NZ)
262 Buist, Ms Sarah (UK)
263 Christensen, Ms Mark (NZ)
264 McMullan, Ms Sarah (NZ)
265 Koppert, C (NZ)

- 266 Cooper, Ms Alexia (UK)
- 267 Anderson, Ms Sarah (NZ)
- 268 Willard, Mr Glenn & Ms Willard-Moore, Donna (NZ)
- 269 Evans, Ms Carolyn (NZ)
- 270 Luff, Ms Tessa (NZ)
- 271 Wendt, Ms Una (NZ)
- 272 Peacocke, Mr Anthony (NZ)
- 273 Fitzgerald, Ms Janmarie (NZ)
- 274 Hatfield, Ms Jane (NZ)
- 275 Wiesner, Mr Ivo (NZ)
- 276 Mikkelsen, Ms Elisabeth (NZ)
- 277 Kidd, Ms Sarah-Jane (NZ)
- 278 Macmillan, Mr John (NZ)
- 279 Rickard, Mr Wayne (NZ)
- 280 Mortensen, Ms Tina & Wemyss, Mr Greg (NZ)
- 281 Daley, Mr Mike (NZ)
- 282 Milasinovich
- 283 Jolly, Mr Dan (NZ)
- 284 Fowlie, Ms Pam (NZ)
- 285 Wilson, Ms Eryn (NZ)
- 286 Mowbray, Ms Emily (NZ)
- 287 Murphy, Ms Melanie (NZ)
- 288 Lyons, Ms Tracey (NZ)
- 289 Flett, J & M (NZ)
- 290 Laing, Ms Catherine (NZ)
- 291 Harris, Ms Lynda (NZ)
- 292 Caro, Ms Nonny (NZ)
- 293 Lockie, Lynley & Family (NZ)
- 294 Digby, Ms Janet (NZ)
- 295 Cooper, Ms Rachel
- 296 Radford, Ms N (NZ)
- 297 Duke, Ms Nicole
- 298 Kyle, Ms Hannah (NZ)
- 299 Sims, Mr Gary & Ms Ann (NZ)
- 300 Sherwood, Ms Melody (NZ)
- 301 Hale, Mr Darren (NZ)
- 302 Askam, Ms Beverley (NZ)
- 303 Meek, Ms Shelley (NZ)
- 304 Friedlander, Ms Emily (NZ)

-
- 305 Bleakley, Ms Claire (NZ)
306 Larsen, Ms Anne (NZ)
307 Pilott, Mr Marty (NZ)
308 Quin, Ms Mirelle (NZ)
309 Barnes, Mr John
Sydor, Ms Maria
Long, Ms Carol (NZ)
310 Schmidt, Mr Otto (NZ)
311 Cohen, Ms Gila
312 Woodhouse, Mr Graeme (US)
313 Hart, Mr Phillip (NZ)
314 Thompson, Mr Robert & Ms Brown-Thompson, Ms Rebecca (NZ)
315 Strohfeldt, Ms Elizabeth (NZ)
316 Deed, Ms Ngaire (NZ)
317 Britton, Ms Lindsey (NZ)
318 Bannatyne, Ms Kay (NZ)
319 Marsh, Ms Laura (NZ)
320 Hodges, Mr David (NZ)
321 Barsanti, Mr Theo (NZ)
322 Avery, Ms Melanie (NZ)
323 McIntyre, Mr Bruce & Ms Takaku, Tomo (NZ)
324 Williams, Mr Marcus (NZ)
325 Parkinson, Mrs M J (NZ)
326 Huddleston, Mr Ian (NZ)
327 Rabone, Ms Christine (NZ)
328 Menzies, Ms Sarah (NZ)
329 McIntyre, Mr Stephen (NZ)
330 Rosenberg-Smith, Ms Lana (NZ)
331 Davis, Ms Victoria (NZ)
332 Lynn, Mr Simon & la Roche, Ms Liz (NZ)
333 Todd, Mr Ian (NZ)
334 Wallace, Ms Anne (NZ)
335 Knight, Mr Peter (NZ)
336 Thomas, Ms Liz (NZ)
337 Schneider, Ms Sabine (NZ)
338 Groen, Mr Martijn (NZ)
339 Timney, Ms Linda (NZ)
340 Zanetti, Ms Stephen (NZ)
341 Copeland, Ms Sheryl (NZ)

- 342 Sharpe, Ms Amanda & Family (NZ)
- 343 Mettrick, Ms Carolyn (NZ)
- 344 McKee, Ms Shona (NZ)
- 345 Philpott, Mr Murray (NZ)
- 346 Bazeley, AP (NZ)
- 347 van den Bemd, Ms Yolanda (NZ)
- 348 Bruinsma, Ms Berthine (NZ)
- 349 St Columbkille's Social Action Group (NZ)
- 350 Navidad, Ms Ana (NZ)
- 351 Caldwell, Ms Alicia (NZ)
- 352 Scott, Ms Felicity (NZ)
- 353 Waterview Environmental Society Inc (Nz)
- 354 Murray, Ms Sandra (NZ)
- 355 Davis, Sir Thomas & Lady Carla (NZ)
- 356 McGregor, Ms Wilma (NZ)
- 357 Reader, Mr Alan & Ms Joan (BHUTAN)
- 358 Gerson, Ms Ruth (NZ)
- 359 Hunter, Ms Anne (NZ)
- 360 Hug, Mr Peter (NZ)
- 361 Von Tippelskirch, Mr Manfred & Scott, Ms Helen (NZ)
- 362 Reader, Ms Annabel (NZ)
- 363 Kolff, Mr J Kris (NZ)
- 364 Scott, Ms Patricia (NZ)
- 365 Zwan, van der, Mr Sebastian (NZ)
- 366 Metzler, Mr Shane (NZ)
- 367 Robinson, Mr Martin (NZ)
- 368 Morgan, Ms Kay (NZ)
- 369 Heard, Ms Nita (NZ)
- 370 McManus, Ms Sonia (NZ)
- 371 Powell, Ms Sarah (NZ)
- 372 Young, Ms Carolyn (NZ)
- 373 Dolan, Ms Julia (NZ)
- 374 Hewer, Mr Kevin (NZ)
- 375 Winter, Mr Vincent (NZ)
- 376 Henderson, Leslie (NZ)
- 377 Armstrong, Ms Leane (NZ)
- 378 Winter, Mr Peter (NZ)
- 379 Fitzgerald, Mr Gary
- 380 Simpson, NC & BA (NZ)

-
- 381 Bonallack, Mr Douglas (NZ)
382 Hawken, Mr Rob & Ms Glen (NZ)
383 Saunders, Ms Gillian (NZ)
384 Trotman, Mr Richard (NZ)
385 Knowles, Ray, Judy, Sam and Amy (NZ)
386 Godfrey, Dr M E (NZ)
387 Calcott, Ms Anne (NZ)
388 Laureys, Ms Marlene (NZ)
389 Davis, Mr John (NZ)
390 Mcpartlin, Ms Celia
391 Mawhinney, Ms Marianne (NZ)
392 de Raadt, Ms Marius (NZ)
393 Buchan, B (NZ)
394 New Zealand Association of Medical Herbalists (NZ)
395 Richards, Ms Deborah (NZ)
396 Wilson, Dr Michael (NZ)
397 Robertson, Ms Jacqui (NZ)
398 Jimenez, Ms Niki (NZ)
399 Aubertin, Bobbie (NZ)
400 Bieleski, Ms Jocelyn & Mr Bieleski, Paul (NZ)
401 Dickinson, Ms Tracey (NZ)
402 Brice, Marise, Jeff, Aidan and Amanda (NZ)
403 Jews for GE-free food (New Zealand) (NZ)
404 Walter, Ms Mary (QLD)
405 Galloway, Mr Louis
406 Ellis, Ms Kate (NZ)
407 Neilson, Ms Daveena (NZ)
408 Parsons, Ms Pam (NZ)
409 Sheridan, Kim (NZ)
410 Quaggin, Ms Helen (NZ)
411 Thompson, Mr David (NZ)
412 Borchowsky, Ms Lilian (NZ)
413 Johnstone, Ms Laraine & Pearson, Neville (NZ)
414 Wood, Jana (NZ)
415 Drueckler, Ms Sabine (NZ)
416 Humm, Mr Adrian (NZ)
417 Hiepe, Mr Wolfgang (NZ)
418 Wright, Ms Glenda (NZ)
419 Alete, Ms Maggie (NZ)

- 420 Burston, Mr Joseph (NZ)
421 Douglas, Jackie – ACU-Power TCM (NZ)
422 Salmen, Ms Myriam (NZ)
423 Handley, Dr Sean (NZ)
424 Canham, Mr Lloyd (NZ)
425 Watson, Mr William (NZ)
426 Puentener, Ms Rachel (NZ)
427 Stock Feed Manufacturers’ Council of Australia (SFMCA) (VIC)
428 Australian Food and Grocery Council (AFGC) (ACT)
429 Garlick, Ms Brenda (NZ)
430 Brown, Mr Milton (NZ)
431 McAuley, Ms Jean (NZ)
432 Brown, Ms Clare (NZ)
433 Avery, Lyndsay (NZ)
434 Vincent, AH & G (NZ)
435 Britain, Ms Christine (NZ)
436 Pirrit, Ms Sue (NZ)
437 Bethune, Ms Rhonda (NZ)
438 Kuenning Herbert, Ms Kris (NZ)
439 Gerritsen, Jan (NZ)
440 Bain, Mr Alun
441 Lambrechtsen, Dr Nick C (NZ)
442 Blankenbyl, Mr Lawrence (NZ)
443 Sturmer, Ms Lea and Sturmer, Mr Richard (NZ)
444 Avcare Limited (ACT)
Tabled at public hearing 04.03.04
- opening statement
- *Canola industry stewardship principles for coexistence of production systems and supply chains*, Gene Technology Grains Committee, July 2003
- Article from *Australian Financial Review*, 04.03.04, titled 'Proof of demand for GM food is in the puree'.
Supplementary submission 09.03.04
445 Backstrom, Ms Cheryl (NZ)
446 Moore, Mr Timothy (NZ)
447 Ireland, Ms Kathryn (NZ)
448 Graf, Mr Marcus (NZ)
449 Gray, Mr Martin (NZ)
450 Wisewitch, Ms Yolanda (NZ)
451 Naylor, Ms Eva (NZ)
452 Vodnik, Ms Zvone (NZ)

-
- 453 Copeland, Ms Ruth (NZ)
454 Lord, L (NZ)
455 Andrews, Ms Carol (NZ)
456 Butterworth, Ms Cheryl (NZ)
457 Marriner, Mr Darryl (NZ)
458 Drake, Mr Mike (NZ)
459 Hinkley, Mr Dale (NZ)
460 Summerhays, Ms Karen (NZ)
461 West, Mr Bernard (NZ)
462 Sidebotham, Mr Mark (NZ)
463 Ives, Ms Brenda (NZ)
464 Major, Mr Paul (NZ)
465 Young, Ms Heather (NZ)
466 Cronwright, Mr Hugh (NZ)
467 Raunigg, Mr Manfred & Raunigg, Ms Ana (NZ)
468 Royal, Mr Clifford (NZ)
469 Barnett, Ms Anaia (NZ)
470 Grammer, Ms Zelka (NZ)
471 GE Free Northland (in Food & Environment) (NZ)
472 Aulman, Chris (NZ)
473 Ajani, Ms Janette (NZ)
474 Howell, Mr Steven (NZ)
475 Brown, Ms Jill (NZ)
476 Andrews, Ms Brodie (NZ)
477 Bradley, Ms Jill & Atwood, Mr Keith (NZ)
478 Gee, Ms Nicola (NZ)
479 Lovegrove, Ms Rebecca (NZ)
480 Bradford, Dr Nick (NZ)
481 Hamilton, Mr Paul (NZ)
482 Tellier, Mr Marco (NZ)
483 Klinac, Dr David & Klinac, Dr Robyn (NZ)
484 Kefford, Ms Jo (NZ)
485 Keen, Mr Ross (NZ)
486 Sullivan, Ms Victoria (NZ)
487 Evans, V (NZ)
488 Rural Women New Zealand (NZ)
489 Spence, Ms Heather (NZ)
490 Vogt, Mr Raymond (NZ)
491 Blake, Ms Theresa (NZ)

- 492 Farrell, Ms Shelly (NZ)
- 493 Enari, Ms Loveni (NZ)
- 494 Beaton, Ms Sheena (NZ)
- 495 Crowe, Mr Peter (NZ)
- 496 Morrison, Mr Andrew (NZ)
- 497 Reid Family (NZ)
- 498 Irvine-Danner, Ms Sue (NZ)
- 499 Alber, Mr Erwin (NZ)
- 500 Alber, Ms Willow (NZ)
- 501 Duncan, Mr Leith (NZ)
- 502 Reed, Ms Julia & Reed, Mr Bob (NZ)
- 503 New Zealand Vegetarian Society Inc (NZ)
- 504 Jeffery, Ms Tania (NZ)
- 505 Kalasih, Ms Philippa (NZ)
- 506 Hastie, Mr Tony (NZ)
- 507 Shiels, Ms Claire (NZ)
- 508 Brown, Ms Heather (NZ)
- 509 Miller, Ms Susan (NZ)
- 510 Heath, Ms Cecilia (NZ)
- 511 Mulholland, Gerard & Mulholland, Ms Hedy (NZ)
- 512 Forbes, Mr Hugh (NZ)
- 513 Wong, Ms Cathryn (NZ)
- 514 Josephson, Mr Noel (NZ)
- 515 Patterson, Ms Lynne (NZ)
- 516 Boone, Ms Juliet (NZ)
- 517 Hirst, Ms Patricia & Mr Michael (NZ)
- 518 Bagnall, Ms Jillian (NZ)
- 519 Padman, Ms Carolyn (NZ)
- 520 Logan, Mr John & Logan, Ms Diane (NZ)
- 521 Masters, Ms Nicole (NZ)
- 522 Collins, Ms Jessica (NZ)
- 523 Pettinger Family (NZ)
- 524 Brownlie, Ms Morag (NZ)
- 525 Parker, Ms Jennifer (NZ)
- 526 Smith, Mr Jeffrey M (USA)
- 527 Taggart, Mr Dave (NZ)
- 528 Jones, Ms Oraina (NZ)
- 529 Strathdee, Ms Barbara (NZ)
- 530 Dixon, Ms Amanda (NZ)

-
- 531 Silig-McBride, Ms Corinne (NZ)
532 Wilson, Ms Marie (NZ)
533 Hay, Ms Karen (NZ)
534 Lodge, Ms Raylene & Lodge, Mr Graeme (NZ)
535 Hay, Mr Jeff (NZ)
536 Roberts, Ms Rochelle (NZ)
537 Goodwin, Ms Alison (NZ)
538 McGeorge, Mr Andrew & McGeorge, Ms Rebecca (NZ)
539 Zimny, Ms Maree (NZ)
540 Bonneau, Ms Kathryn (NZ)
541 Glenister, Ms Alison (NZ)
542 Morgan, Ms Helen (NZ)
543 Deuninck, Mr Rudy (NZ)
544 Caillard, Ms Chris (NZ)
545 Eddy, Mr Duncan (NZ)
546 Evans, Ms Berneice (NZ)
547 Ellingham, Ms Jane (NZ)
548 King, Mr Dave & MsDonald, Ms Sheryl (NZ)
549 MacLennan, Dr A O (NZ)
550 Bryant, Mr Jarad (NZ)
551 GE Free New Zealand in Food and Environment (RAGE) Inc (NZ)
552 Capital GE Free (NZ)
553 McArthur, C (NZ)
554 Dommissie, Dr Elvira (NZ)
555 Reid, Ms Anna (NZ)
556 Mountier, Ms Barbara (NZ)
557 Hall, Ms Di (NZ)
558 Blackmore, Ms Fiona (NZ)
559 Toon, Ms Rebecca (NZ)
560 Unger, Mr Leo (NZ)
561 Bowen, Ms Dawn (NZ)
562 Chard, Mr Phil (NZ)
563 Mitchell, Mr Graham (NZ)
564 Frith, Mr Hugh (NZ)
565 Johnston, Ms Wendy (NZ)
566 Greenpeace Australia Pacific (ACT)
567 South Australian Government (SA)
568 Mitchell, Ms Tessa
569 Grigg, Ms Janine (NZ)

- 570 Godwin, Mr John (NZ)
- 571 James, Ms Sue (NZ)
- 572 Earle, Mr Andrew (NZ)
- 573 Hadley, Ms Merissa (NZ)
- 574 Braidwood Greens (NSW)
- 575 St John-Ives, Ms Elizabeth (NZ)
- 576 O'Donnell, Mr Alec (NZ)
- 577 GeneEthics Network (VIC)
- 578 Kedgley, MP, Ms Sue , Green Party of Aotearoa New Zealand (NZ)
- 579 Molloy, Ms Adrienne (NZ)
- 580 Kolff, Ms Anni (NZ)
- 581 McCormack, Ms Lyndall (NSW)
- 582 Bedingfield, Ms Dawn (NZ)
- 583 Pullen, Ms Gemma (NZ)

APPENDIX 2

Public Hearing

A public hearing was held on the Bill on 4 March 2004 in Senate Committee Room 2S3, Parliament House, Canberra.

Committee Members in attendance

Senator Knowles
Senator Barnett
Senator Brown
Senator Denman
Senator Forshaw

Witnesses

Avcare Limited

Mr Claude Gauchat, Executive Director, Avcare Limited

Ms Heather Neil, Communications Director, Avcare Limited

Mr Matt Cahill, Regulatory Specialist, DowAgro Sciences and Member,
Avcare Biotechnology Committee

Dr John Huppatz, Science Advisor, Agrifood Awareness Australia Limited

Greenpeace Australia Pacific (*via video conference*)

Mr John Hepburn, GE campaigner

Ms Sue Kedgley, MP, Green Party of Aotearoa New Zealand (*via video conference*)