

Enhanced Land Force Stage 2 Facilities Project

- 5.1 The Enhanced Land Force Stage 2 (ELF 2) facilities project proposes to construct new, extended or refurbished facilities at Gallipoli Barracks, Enoggera, Queensland and other defence bases and training areas. The estimated cost of the project is \$1,457.836 million (excluding GST).¹
- 5.2 The proposal was referred to the Committee on 17 September 2009.

Conduct of the inquiry

- 5.3 The inquiry was advertised in local and national newspapers and submissions sought from those with a direct interest in the project. The Committee received eleven submissions and five supplementary submissions, one of which was confidential and detailed the project costs. A list of submissions can be found at Appendix A.
- 5.4 The Committee undertook a site inspection of Gallipoli Barracks followed by a public hearing and an in-camera hearing on the project costs on Wednesday, 4 November 2009 in Brisbane, Qld. In addition, the Committee undertook two site inspections, to Lone Pine Barracks, Singleton, NSW on Friday, 30 October 2009 and Lavarack Barracks, Townsville, Qld on Thursday, 5 November 2009.
- 5.5 The transcript of the public hearing as well as the submissions to the inquiry are available on the Committee's website.² Plans for the proposed works are detailed in Submission 1: Department of Defence (Defence).

1 Submission No. 1, Department of Defence (Defence), p 41.

2 <www.aph.gov.au/pwc>.

Need for works

- 5.6 The Defence submission states that the proposed works are needed due to the ELF initiative which aims to increase the size of the Defence force by 3,000 members. The works are the second stage of the ELF stage 1 project which was approved by the Committee in February 2009. Both projects are required in order to support the increased capacity of the Defence force which will result from the ELF initiative.
- 5.7 On 2 October 2007, the Government announced the re-raising of the 8th/9th Battalion to be located at Gallipoli Barracks, Enoggera and deployable by 2010. This requires the development of permanent facilities and infrastructure to support:
- 8th/9th Battalion, Royal Australian Regiment and other elements of 7th Brigade and 1st Division being enhanced under this project at Gallipoli Barracks; and
 - the development of enabling capabilities, in order to sustain increases in the delivery of collective training capability, career training and logistic support facilities at Defence Bases and Training Areas in South East Queensland and various locations throughout Australia.
- 5.8 The Committee finds that there is a need for the proposed works.

Scope of works

- 5.9 The proposed scope of works is detailed in Submission 1: Department of Defence. In short the project proposes the following by state.

QUEENSLAND

Gallipoli Barracks, Enoggera

- Elements to enable 8th/9th Battalion and the growth in the supporting units to fit within a spatially constrained Barracks:
 - ⇒ construct new 8th/9th Battalion precinct comprising Battalion headquarters and Training facilities, Manoeuvre Company and Manoeuvre Support Company facilities and Administration Company facilities;
 - ⇒ construct new 2nd Combat Engineer Regiment facilities comprising Regimental Headquarters and Unit Training, 2, 7 and 11 Combat Engineer Squadrons facilities, 24 Support Squadron facilities, Operations Support Squadron facilities, Transport Compound and Training facilities;

- ⇒ construct new 7th Combat Signal Regiment precinct comprising Regimental Headquarters and Unit Training, 139th and 140th Signal Squadron facilities and Operational Support Squadron facilities;
- ⇒ construct new and refurbish existing 7th Combat Services support Battalion facilities comprising shared two-storey facility, Battalion Armoury workshop, Electronic Instrument Repair workshop, Vehicle Storage Compound, Supply Company warehouse, extension of Vehicle Workshop, new Bulk Fuel Tanker park and administration building;
- ⇒ construct new 2nd/14th Light Horse Regiment facilities comprising working accommodation, storage space and ablutions;
- ⇒ construct new Headquarters for 1st Division and 1st Intelligence Battalion comprising shared office building, Battalion Q-Store, administration, ablutions and maintenance facility;
- ⇒ construct new multi-storey Explosive Hazards Centre;
- ⇒ construct new working accommodation, storage and vehicle shelters for 1st Topographical Survey Squadron;
- ⇒ construct new facilities for Land Warfare Centre Warrant Officer and Non Commissioned Officer Academy comprising lecture theatres, rooms, working accommodation and living-in accommodation;
- ⇒ construct new Defence Support precinct comprising three-storey office building and garrison conference centre;
- ⇒ construct new Garrison support precinct comprising facility for Defence Publishing Service, Mail Centre and Furniture Store;
- ⇒ other various new facilities including Joint Logistics Unit – South Queensland Clothing Store, three multi-storey car-parks, additional childcare centre, Physical Training Centre comprising indoor pool, courts, rooms and offices and 361 Living-In Accommodation rooms;
- ⇒ refurbish the DefCredit facility;
- ⇒ construct new and refurbish existing Barracks Training Facilities; and
- ⇒ construct new and refurbish existing Engineering Services comprising fire and potable water reticulation, stormwater, sewer, natural gas, high voltage electrical reticulation, fire protection systems, communications networks, road network and car-parking.

Lavarack Barracks, Townsville

- refurbish facilities for the 3 Combat Services Supply Battalion;
- construct new and refurbish existing Combat Training Centre;
- construct new and refurbish existing Land Warfare Centre Warrant Officer and Non-Commissioned Officer Academy;
- construct 3 new ranges for the Field Training Area; and
- construct new Explosives Store House.

Wide Bay Training Area, near Gympie

- construct new Special Weapons Range, Assault Grenade Ranges, Explosive Pallet Space, Marksmanship Training Range and Accommodation; and
- refurbish existing Vehicle refuelling/washing facilities, Infrastructure and Demolitions Range.

RAAF Base Amberley, Ipswich

- construct new facility to support the relocation of Headquarters 6th Engineer Support; and
- construct new facilities to support a regiment from Gallipoli Barracks, Enoggera, Queensland comprising working accommodation, ablution, storage and training facilities.

Greenbank Training Area, Greenbank

- construct new 25th/49th Battalion Headquarters, 2 Company buildings, Q Store and transport compound;
- construct new accommodation facilities;
- construct new training facilities comprising Safe Driver Training Area, Marksmanship Training Range, Range control complex, Urban Operation Training facility, Method of Entry training facility, Engineer Mine Clearance Lanes and Vehicle wash facility and depot; and
- construct new entry point.

Kokoda Barracks and Canungra Training Area, Canungra

- construct new Battle Simulation Centre, Living-In Accommodation and Camp Accommodation; and
- refurbish existing facilities comprising works to the Gymnasium and Electronic Open Range.

NEW SOUTH WALES

Lone Pine Barracks, Singleton

- construct new School of Infantry Headquarters, permanent Living in Accommodation, Battle Simulation Centre, Weapon Repair Facility, Museum and Pass Office; and
- construct new and refurbished training area and ranges comprising new Urban Operations Training facility, new Explosive Pallet Space, new vehicle wash point and refurbished ablutions and storage.

Garden Island and HMAS Penguin, Sydney

- construct new Primary Casualty Reception Facility comprising Central Dispensing Point addition at Garden Island; and
- refurbish existing working and training facilities and HMAS Penguin.

AUSTRALIAN CAPITAL TERRITORY

Royal Military College, Canberra

- construct new Living-In Accommodation and working accommodation for instructors; and
- construct new facilities for Majura Training Area Camp Blake comprising accommodation, lecture theatre, headquarter offices, amenities and refurbishment of existing Urban Operations Training Facility.

VICTORIA

Simpson Barracks, Watsonia

- construct new Technical Training Wing building; and
- refurbish covered training area.

Puckapunyal Military Area, Puckapunyal

- construct new Explosive Pallet Space.

SOUTH AUSTRALIA

RAAF Base Edinburgh, Adelaide

- construct new Land Warfare Centre's Warrant Officer and Non-Commissioned Officer Academy.

Cultana Training Area, Cultana

- construct new Explosive Pallet Space, Urban Operations Training facility, Field Firing Training system Range and accommodation.

5.10 The ELF Stage 2 project is due to commence construction in mid 2010 with completion anticipated in 2014.

5.11 The Committee finds that the proposed scope of works is suitable to meet the needs of the ELF Stage 2 Facilities project.

Cost of works

5.12 The total estimated out-turn cost for this project is \$1,457.836 million excluding GST.

5.13 Defence notes in its submission that it anticipates an increase in net operating costs due to the construction of new facilities and the associated increases in facilities maintenance, cleaning and utilities expenses.³

5.14 The Committee is satisfied that the costings for the project provided to it are adequate and suitable contingency planning is in place to ensure budget overruns in any one area do not compromise the project as a whole.

Deferred works

5.15 Defence briefed the Committee on the potential for savings accrued throughout the works project to be used to fund deferred works. In particular two issues of concern were discussed, being:

- urgent upgrades that may result from the Defence security review; and

3 Submission 1, Defence, p 41.

- the lack of adequate Living-In Accommodation at Townsville for personnel at Lavarack Barracks, Townsville.
- 5.16 The Committee encourages Defence to ensure that any deferred works focus on potential security upgrades to bases and the provision of Living-In Accommodation at Lavarack Barracks, Townsville.

Recommendation 6

The Committee recommends that the Department of Defence direct any savings identified in the Enhanced Land Force Stage 2 facilities project on Lavarack Barracks towards improving base security and providing additional Living-In Accommodation at Lavarack Barracks, Townsville.

Project issues

Traffic concerns

- 5.17 The most significant concern that has been raised with the Committee relates to traffic congestion around a number of the bases where ELF 2 works will occur. A number of submissions to the inquiry as well as participants at the public hearing raised concerns about the severity of traffic congestion around the various bases in Queensland.⁴
- 5.18 Specific traffic problems are detailed below.

Gallipoli Barracks

- 5.19 Local residents expressed dissatisfaction with the current levels of traffic on roads surrounding the base, in particular Samford Road. Residents stated that traffic congestion could be eased by building a new entrance to the Barracks off Samford Road.⁵ They assess that this entrance would ease congestion on other local roads by drawing traffic away from those areas.

4 See for example: Submission 2; Submission 5; Submission 6; Submission 7, Submission 9, Submission 10 and Submission 11 as well as Community Statements from Mr N. Dance, Private Capacity, Mr I. Ferrier, Ferry Grove Neighbourhood Watch; Mr D. Selth, Department of Transport and Main Roads; Mr M. Watt, State Member for Everton; Mr T. Fensom, Brisbane Region Environment Council; Mr H. Gibson, Private Capacity and Mr C. Harbeck, Private Capacity, *Proof Transcript of Evidence*, 4 November 2009, pp 14 – 20.

5 Mr H. Gibson, Private Capacity, *Proof Transcript of Evidence*, 4 November 2009, p 19, Mr I. Ferrier, Submission No. 5, p 4.

- 5.20 Defence responded that there is land reserved for an entry on to Samford Road and that consultation with state and local government is ongoing. Defence added that it hoped to resolve this issue in the next six to 12 months.⁶

Recommendation 7

The Committee recommends that the Department of Defence consult with state and local governments in order to finalise plans for an entrance off Samford Road, Enoggera with Defence funding a fair and reasonable portion of the cost of the road works, in order to ease traffic congestion in the vicinity of Gallipoli Barracks.

Greenbank Training Area

- 5.21 Logan City Council raised concerns about the proposal to relocate the range entry of the Greenbank Training Area. Of particular concern to the Council was the impact of increased traffic and military convoys on Greenbank State School, which would be directly impacted by the proposed changes.
- 5.22 Defence responded that the proposed new entry point was indicative only, and that the final location was yet to be determined, and will be done once a detailed traffic study has been undertaken. Defence undertook to consult with Logan City Council and the Queensland Department of Transport and Main Roads in the preparation of the traffic study. Defence added that Defence vehicles would not be required to drive along Goodna Road past the Greenbank State School.⁷

⁶ Brigadier W. Grice, Defence, *Proof Transcript of Evidence*, 4 November 2009, p, 21.

⁷ Supplementary Submission 1.2, Defence.

Wide Bay Training Area

- 5.23 A submission to the inquiry raised concerns that there is only one access road to Wide Bay Training Area. The submission states that there is a proposal to upgrade Counter Road, which would provide an alternate access to the training area, however the upgrade cannot commence due to a lack of funding.⁸
- 5.24 The Committee recognises that solving traffic problems around Defence bases is not only the responsibility of Defence. Nevertheless, as a contributor to traffic congestion, Defence should accept responsibility for some of the traffic concerns. The Committee urges Defence to consult with federal, state and local traffic and roads authorities to mitigate some of the traffic problems which have been raised throughout this inquiry.
- 5.25 Another concern that has been brought to the attention of the Committee, in the current and previous inquiries, is the impact of anti-social and dangerous behaviour by Defence personnel on the local communities in which Defence bases are located. Similar concerns have been raised in Chapter 3. The Committee remains concerned that the behaviour of some Defence force personnel impacts negatively on local residents. Defence has a responsibility, as an employer and member of the community, to ensure that its personnel act in a responsible manner both on and off-base.

Consultation

- 5.26 The Committee acknowledges the difficulty confronting Defence when trying to consult with multiple stakeholders, and also acknowledges the recent good work of Defence in trying to ensure that it consults more widely.
- 5.27 However, as mentioned in the previous section, the Committee is aware of significant community concerns about the proposed works, many of which have resulted from the perceived inadequacy of Defence's consultation process.
- 5.28 Members of the community were given the opportunity to raise their concerns at the public hearing in Brisbane on 4 November 2009. These concerns include a failure by Defence to consult with the local State Member of Parliament, Mr Murray Watt MP, Member for Everton, whose electorate would be impacted on by the proposed works on the Base. Mr Watt recommended that:

8 Gympie Regional Council, Submission No. 6.

... in future local members whose electorates approach the barracks be consulted, given that there are often spillover effects from the barracks onto their electorates.⁹

- 5.29 The representative from Logan City Council, Mr James, raised the concerns regarding the Greenbank State School as noted above. Mr James noted that the Council would find it helpful if Defence consulted with the school directly to give accurate information and respond directly to concerns of the school.¹⁰
- 5.30 The Committee is of the opinion that many community concerns about Defence projects can be addressed and minimised through proper consultation. The Committee agrees that it is incumbent on Defence to be proactive when undertaking consultation by seeking to engage with all parties that may have an interest, not simply those in the immediate vicinity of the works.

Recommendation 8

The Committee recommends that the Department of Defence develop a consultation protocol that ensures that consultation with local government and, where appropriate state government, occurs in line with routine local planning procedures.

Open space

- 5.31 The Committee questioned Defence about the loss of open space at Duncan Oval, Gallipoli Barracks as a result of the proposed works. The Base Commander noted that the loss would be around 10 percent of current open space and that while he:
- ... would rather not lose any ... that [the 10 percent loss] will not have a significant impact on what we use it for now.¹¹
- 5.32 Brigadier Grice from Defence's Infrastructure Asset Development Branch noted that potential existed in future works projects to expand the open

9 Mr M. Watt MP, State Member for Everton, *Proof Transcript of Evidence*, 4 November 2009, p 17.

10 Mr B. James, Logan City Council, *Proof Transcript of Evidence*, 4 November 2009, p, 14.

11 Brigadier S. Day, Defence, *Proof Transcript of Evidence*, 4 November 2009, p, 24.

spaces of Gallipoli Barracks, and that this may result in a 15 percent increase in the size of Duncan Oval based on its original size.¹²

- 5.33 The Committee is concerned about the impact of a loss of open space on the training functions and physical exercise of Defence personnel based at Gallipoli Barracks.

Recommendation 9

The Committee recommends that the Department of Defence ensure that any future proposals for work at Gallipoli Barracks consider increasing the size of Duncan Oval, with a view to increasing the open space available on the Base.

Environmental Considerations

- 5.34 Defence submitted that a Departmental review of the project has not identified any significant environmental concerns. The submission adds that the designs have incorporated features such as: minimising tree loss through prudent siting decisions, use of low-water indigenous vegetation and stormwater reuse in gardens, and harnessing energy efficiency and conservation measures.
- 5.35 The Brisbane Region Environment Council (BREC) made a submission to the Committee, and was represented by Mr Fensom at the public hearing. BREC raised concerns about the impact on flora and fauna of elements of the project at Greenbank Military Training Area and that environmental management plans had not been developed to mitigate any potential negative environmental impacts.¹³
- 5.36 Defence responded that it is complying with the *Environment Protection and Biodiversity Act 1999* through developing a Defence Environment Management System (EMS). This EMS manages the environmental values across the site including weed control and fire management. In addition, the works proposed for Greenbank Military Training Area will be governed by a Construction and Environment Management Plan (CEMP). The CEMP will manage the environment during construction and will also

12 Brigadier W. Grice, Defence, *Proof Transcript of Evidence*, 4 November 2009, p, 24.

13 Submission 8, Brisbane Region Environment Council.

address off-site construction impacts such as construction vehicle traffic and lighting.¹⁴

Committee comment

- 5.37 Overall, the Committee is satisfied that this project has merit in terms of need, scope and cost.
- 5.38 Having examined the purpose, need, use, revenue and public value of the work, the Committee considers that it is expedient that the proposed works proceed.

Recommendation 10

The Committee recommends that the House of Representatives resolve, pursuant to Section 18 (7) of the *Public Works Committee Act 1969*, that it is expedient to carry out the following proposed work: Enhanced Land Force Stage 2 Facilities Project.

14 Submission 1.3, Defence.