Rural and Regional Affairs and Transport Legislation Committee

Questions placed on notice at the Budget estimates hearings Wednesday, 25 and Thursday, 26 May 2005 Department of Agriculture, Fisheries and Forestry

26/08/2005 1:58 PM

1

Hansard page no	Output Class no	TRD question number	Senator	Subject
7	Management Services	01	O'Brien	 (Department and Biosecurity output) So the output of the department and Biosecurity together is represented by that \$312-odd million, and for the coming financial year the output of the department and Biosecurity together seems to me to be the combination of the department's output and Biosecurity's output. Mr Pahl—That is true. Mr Gaukroger—That is correct. Senator O'BRIEN—Which is \$327 million. Mr Pahl—Yes. Senator O'BRIEN—So, comparing like with like, there has actually been an increase in the funding of the departmental Biosecurity output from \$312 million to \$327 million—an increase of \$15 million. Has a substantial part of that been going into Biosecurity Australia or has it been going into other parts of the department?
10	Management	02	O'Brien	(Revenue from sources other than 'goods and services')

Hansard page no	Output Class no	TRD question number	Senator	Subject
	Services			What about the revenue from other sources? It keeps going up. It was 6.8 in the budget last year, it is revised to 9.8 and you are estimating 10.025.
13	Food & Ag	01	O'Brien	(Food processing technologies)
				Can you give us a list of the key technology areas that you are referring to?
14	Food & Ag	02	O'Brien	(Food Innovation Grants technologies)
				Mr Souness —Through the programs, both the centres of excellence and the Food Innovation Grants program, we are starting to see some new products and new concepts coming through, but again these take a period going from research and development to getting a product to market and then seeing if it is successful within the marketplace. Under the Food Innovation Grants program, I think we have now had 36 grants and there are a number of new products and technologies coming through.
				Senator O'BRIEN —Can you perhaps identify those new products and technologies on notice?
				Mr Souness —Yes, we can do that. We could list them now, but we can provide some further material.
17	Food & Ag	03	O'Brien	(National food industry strategy expenses)
				Mr Mortimer —No, there is other funding for the National Food Industry Strategy, essentially provided through what are called departmental expenses, which goes to other activities in DAFF and some other activities with National Food Industry Strategy Ltd.

Hansard page no	Output Class no	TRD question number	Senator	Subject
				Senator O'BRIEN —Can you give us some indication of how much money is involved for this and the next financial year?
24	Food & Ag	04	O'Brien	(New Industries Development Program)
				How many enterprises—new or otherwise—have gained skills and resources that have enabled them to commercialise new products? Can you quantify that?
25	Food & Ag	05	O'Brien	(PCP Grants)
				There was a mid-term review. There must be some objective data.
				Mr Souness—There was an internal review.
				Senator O'BRIEN —I do not know whether it was mid-term or internal—I am not sure whether I missed it.
				Mr Souness —It was undertaken by an independent consultant. That is available. It was done about a year ago.
				Senator O'BRIEN —Where is it available? Can you supply it to the committee?
				Mr Souness —It is available and we can make it available to the committee.
28	Food & Ag	06	O'Brien	(Horticulture Code Administration committee)
				As to the code administration committee, I know that farmers were looking for increased representation on that committee, which they see as being stacked at present in favour of wholesalers and retailers. What representations has Mr Truss made to his ministerial counterpart Mr Macfarlane about those

Hansard page no	Output Class no	TRD question number	Senator	Subject
				concerns?
				Mr Mortimer —I cannot answer that question, because it is not something we are aware of.
				Senator O'BRIEN—Are you aware, Senator Colbeck?
				Senator Colbeck—No, I am not.
				Senator O'BRIEN—Can you advise the committee on notice?
				Senator Colbeck—I am happy to take that on notice.
33	AQIS	01	O'Brien	(Citrus Canker eradication)
				The deed that Senator Heffernan referred to dealt with arrangements for both grape and citrus crops, did it?
				Ms Gordon —It enabled us to go onto the property and monitor the specified plant materials on the property. The owners voluntarily destroyed some material on the property at that point in time that were part of the allegations.
				Senator O'BRIEN—What sort of material?
				Ms Gordon —I think it was the citrus material, but I would have to check on that.
34	AQIS	02	Heffernan	(Citrus Canker eradication)
				The minister made the deed public in 2004. It provided for ongoing monitoring of the property—is that correct?
				Ms Gordon —The deed allowed us to monitor the property for 18 months.

Hansard page no	Output Class no	TRD question number	Senator	Subject
				CHAIR —Did this monitoring continue for that period?
				Ms Gordon —We went onto the property and took samples on four occasions in that time. There was no indication that any of those samples carried the quarantineable diseases.
				CHAIR —The frequency was four times. When was the last inspection of that 18 months?
				Ms Gordon —I would have to come back to you on that one. I cannot tell you.
				CHAIR —While you are doing that, could you come back and tell us who actually carried out the inspections?
				Ms Gordon —The inspections were carried out by scientific officers of AQIS. I will have to check but I understand that officers of the Queensland department were also involved at varying times.
				CHAIR —Could you give us the dates of those inspections?
34	AQIS	03	Heffernan	(Citrus investigations)
				So what form does an inspection take? Is it visual; do they take samples?
				Ms Gordon —The officers did both visual inspections and took samples.
				CHAIR—How long does it take to inspect an orchard?
				Ms Gordon —I would have to come back and give you the details of how long they were on the properties and what activities they

Hansard page no	Output Class no	TRD question number	Senator	Subject
				were involved in.
34	AQIS	04	Heffernan	(Map of citrus investigations)
				Could you give us the details set out on a map of what blocks they did inspect in each inspection?
				Ms Gordon—I believe we would be able to do that.
				CHAIR —Were any of those blocks then subsequently found to be infected with canker?
				Ms Gordon —I cannot comment on which particular blocks are now infected with canker.
				CHAIR —We will ask you to provide us with the fact or the fiction of where they went for a start and then blow me down if later on from where they went perhaps canker turned up. What I am trying to look for is whether the outbreaks of canker were outside the inspected area or inside the inspected area. What did they do with the samples they took away?
35	AQIS	05	Heffernan	(2001 AQIS citrus tests)
				Samples were taken away for testing during the original AQIS raid in 2001. They were tested for diseases and also to determine what variety those samples were. What did that variety test show?
				Ms Gordon —I would have to come back to you with the details, but as I understand it there was no definitive indication that they were exotic varieties of citrus.
35	AQIS	06	Heffernan	(Variety of mandarin)

Hansard page no	Output Class no	TRD question number	Senator	Subject
				Does the food on these trees look like the Chinese variety, conkin mandarin?
38	AQIS	07	O'Brien	(Citrus canker: Exotic plant material)
				What was the nature of the investigations into the source of this material?
39	AQIS	08	O'Brien	(Citrus canker: imported plant materials)
				The term you used was 'definitive evidence.' What does that mean?
				Ms Gordon —I am not sure of the particular plant material—I would have to check for you—but there were indications that there was a range of citrus tristeza virus in the plant material; however, it was not definitive that they were exotic strains of citrus tristeza. As I understand, there is a variety of strains. Perhaps Ms Ransom could explain it to you in some more scientific detail, but it was not possible to determine definitively that it was a strain of a disease that had not been present in the country already.
39-40	AQIS	09	Heffernan	(Grape plant material tests)
				Who would have done those tests?
				Ms Gordon —The testing was variously done by AQIS's own scientific officers and by scientific officers of, as I recall, New South Wales and Victoria, depending on their particular expertise.
				CHAIR —So it would be possible to get the details.
				Ms Gordon—I would have to get advice for you on what

Hansard page no	Output Class no	TRD question number	Senator	Subject
				information is available.
41	AQIS	10	O'Brien	(Citrus: deeds of arrangement)
				Do you know of any other deeds of arrangement—ones that you have not experienced? Perhaps you could take this question on notice: have any other such deeds of arrangement being entered into by AQIS in the past and how many?
				Ms Gordon —I am happy to take it on notice, but my understanding is that this would be the only one.
41	AQIS	11	O'Brien	(Citrus: courts decision on deed of arrangement)
				What about the public interest right to know whether there was a potential threat of a livelihood threatening disease?
				Ms Gordon—At that particular point in time the court had given us six weeks to go onto the property and to monitor it. Because of the nature of the diseases that we were concerned about we believed that we required a much more extended period of time. The way in which we were able to effect that was to enter into this arrangement with the owners of the property.
				Senator O'BRIEN —Is there a judgment that the committee can see which would give us insight into the reasons of the court?
				CHAIR —What was in the mind of the judge?
				Ms Gordon —The court's decision is publicly available. I am sure we can make a copy of that available to you.
43	Management Services	03	O'Brien	(Breakdown on revenue)

Hansard page no	Output Class no	TRD question number	Senator	Subject
				Is it possible to get a more in-depth explanation of the way that the revenue has been calculated, attributing the other sources individually? It says 'revenue from other sources'. I would like a breakdown of what is involved.
44	AQIS	12	O'Brien	(AQIS cost of citrus destruction)
				I note it was agreed that in certain circumstances AQIS would meet the costs associated with the destruction and disposal of citrus plants on the property. Did AQIS eventually have to meet any of this cost?
				Ms Gordon —I will have to confirm that, but it is my recollection that we did not and that the company voluntarily destroyed the citrus at its own cost.
46	AQIS	13	O'Brien	(Citrus samples)
				So you do not hold samples of the area in which the disease was discovered in 2004, from back in 2001?
				Ms Gordon —I would have to ask Lois Ransom and we would need to check and probably come back to you to confirm whether they were adjacent blocks or—
				Senator O'BRIEN—It is not the same block, clearly?
				Ms Ransom —I do not believe it to be the same block. The property did renumber the blocks on the farm. My understanding is that the block of particular concern to AQIS was adjacent to where the disease was first picked up on the infected property—
				Senator O'BRIEN—In 2004?

Hansard page no	Output Class no	TRD question number	Senator	Subject
				Ms Ransom—In 2004, but by that time it was also quite widespread through that property on both of the major citrus-growing blocks that they had.
				CHAIR—The samples that you took back to Badgerys Creek—
				Senator O'BRIEN—Were from a block that was destroyed.
				CHAIR—Why did you pick those samples from that block?
				Ms Gordon —I cannot tell you why the particular samples were taken.
				CHAIR —What was the allegation—that they planted a row of trees that came from Woop Woop? And you allegedly took samples from trees or cuttings?
				Ms Gordon —I would have to go back and check our records on that matter. We focused on the particular blocks that the informant advised us contained the illegally imported material.
				CHAIR —Was it alleged that the whole block with illegally imported material had some trees with grafts or whatever on them?
47	AQIS	14	Heffernan	(Citrus canker: informant's interview)
				Would it be possible to get a copy of the record of interview for this committee?
47	AQIS	15	O'Brien	(Destruction of citrus block)
				Just to make it clear, was the block that was destroyed the block identified to AQIS as containing material which had been illegally

Hansard page no	Output Class no	TRD question number	Senator	Subject
				imported?
				Ms Stanton —That is my understanding, but I would have to confirm it.
				Senator O'BRIEN —How did AQIS identify that block? Clearly, you were given some information orally.
				Ms Stanton—That is correct.
				Senator O'BRIEN—Were you given a map?
				Ms Stanton —I would have to check with our compliance officer. I suspect the answer is yes, we were given a map.
48	AQIS	16	Heffernan	(Exotic citrus method of entry)
				Let's go right back to when they were put in the ground. They were somehow smuggled into Australia in what form and what shape? How much room would it have taken to smuggle them in?
				Ms Gordon —I understand the allegation was that cuttings were smuggled in.
				CHAIR—How big? A foot, two feet, two inches, half an inch?
				Ms Stanton —I am not sure. We would need to look at that statement of evidence
				CHAIR —Given the crisis, no-one here honestly knows? Were they things they could just run along and plant? Did they have to graft them? What did they do? How did it happen?
				Ms Gordon —My understanding is that they were grafted, but that would have to be confirmed. We will get back to you with some

Output Class TRD Senator Subject Hansard question page no no number information. CHAIR—When you were looking at the trees they were grafted onto, was it a partial graft on a tree to get more tissue or were they grafted on rootstock which produced just the foreign material or was it grafted onto a tree using just two trunks of the tree as other material? ... Ms Gordon—I think the allegation initially had to do with a teachest. **CHAIR**—Was it one or 50 or a container full? 49 AQIS 17 O'Brien (*Citrus: minister and director of quarantine*) Can you get us, on notice, the exact details of the timing of the briefings of the minister and the director of quarantine? Ms Stanton—Certainly. Senator O'BRIEN—If there is a documentary brief can the committee have a copy of it? Ms Stanton—I will take that on notice. 49 AQIS 18 Heffernan (Alleged illegal grape cuttings) Were there allegations of illegal importation of grape cuttings? Ms Stanton—Yes. **CHAIR**—Do we know whether it was half a boxful or a boxful? Can you get all that detail for us? 51 Food & Ag 07 O'Brien (Regional Advisory Groups)

Hansard page no	Output Class no	TRD question number	Senator	Subject
				What is the estimated cost of the provision of the secretariat services?
53	Food & Ag	08	O'Brien	(Sugar reform package)
				In the unlikely event that that is spent, how much will have been spent over the four reform packages since 1998?
55	Food & Ag	09	O'Brien	(Sugar industry 'patching')
				Can you give some examples of the patching proposed?
				Mr Mortimer —No, I do not have examples with me. I am not in a position to do that.
				Senator O'BRIEN—You do not remember any?
				Mr Mortimer—No, I do not. It would be potentially misleading for me to try to draw that up from my memory here and now.
				Senator O'BRIEN—Could you take that on notice?
56	Food & Ag	10	O'Brien	(R.A.G 'patching and repairing')
				Can you supply on notice examples of the particular items the regional advisory groups were talking about when, as you describe it, they were taking a patching and repairing approach?
56	Food & Ag	11	O'Brien	(Assistance to develop business plans applications)
				Can you get us a breakdown of the 107—not individually, of course, but how many rejections fall into which category?
57	Food & Ag	12	O'Brien	(Rejected Industry Advisory Group recommendations)
				You can say on how many occasions the minister has not accepted

Output Class TRD Subject Senator question no number the recommendations of the industry advisory group, and that is consistent with responses that, for example, Finance and Public Administration has received in relation to the consideration of ACC recommendations by the Minister for Transport and Regional Services in approving or not approving Regional Partnerships grants. Food & Ag 13 O'Brien (I.A.G approved recommendations) Also, I would like a breakdown of the number of projects recommended for approval by the industry oversight groups and the number of projects recommended not to be approved and also, as I have already said, the number of occasions on which the minister has not accepted the oversight group's recommendation. Food & Ag O'Brien 14 (Department and I.A.G) On how many occasions did the department disagree with the advice of the IAG in this regard? Food & Ag 15 O'Brien (Applications for intergenerational transfer) Can you give us a breakdown, perhaps on notice, of the reasons for rejection of the 20 applications? Food & Ag 16 O'Brien (Commonwealth spending on South Johnstone Mill) What legal costs did the Commonwealth incur? Food & Ag 17 **O'Brien** (South Johnstone Mill meetings)

Hansard

page no

57

57

58

59

59

Can you provide a list of all meetings which the minister, his staff, officers of the department or officers of other Commonwealth departments attended to discuss the financial situation facing the

Hansard page no	Output Class no	TRD question number	Senator	Subject
				South Johnstone Mill in 1999 and 2000?
60	Food & Ag	18	O'Brien	(South Johnstone Mill legal framework)
				Surely you can tell us what safeguards the department, or any agent on behalf of the department, put in place to protect the interests of the Commonwealth and Australian taxpayers prior to providing for the financial assistance to the South Johnstone mill, the financial matters having been resolved?
62	Food & Ag	19	O'Brien	(Service fee paid to Department's levies branch)
				What is the estimated actual service fee paid to the department's levies branch for the administration of the wheat export charge collection and disbursement and the exporters charge collection in 2004-05?
				Mr Taylor —I cannot find a reference at this point but my understanding is that the cost is generally around \$27,000 per year. I will confirm that for you on notice.
				Senator O'BRIEN —Would that be your estimate for 2005-06 as well?
				Mr Taylor—That is correct.
63	Food & Ag	20	O'Brien	(Cost to implement review panels recommendation)
				So where does the other \$261,000 end up?
				Mr Taylor—I do not have that detail with me, unfortunately.
				Senator O'BRIEN —It is the lion's share of the \$318,000. Could you give us a rough idea? I accept you will give us the precise

Hansard page no	Output Class no	TRD question number	Senator	Subject
				detail on notice.
66	Food & Ag	21	Ferris	 (Iraqi wheat) I was not suggesting that but I would have thought that it fell within principal output No. 2 which, just to contextualise it, says: To effectively monitor, examine, and accurately report to stakeholders on the export performance of AWBI and the resulting benefits to growers. AWB Ltd has a chartering division paid by the national pool to provide ocean freight capacity to transport wheat to market and my understanding is that no other freight provider can even bid for business to AWB(I), that is, it is a monopoly. Therefore I would have thought that when a vessel is held up at the other end of a journey, such as the bulk ships that have been outside the Iraqi ports for some months now waiting to discharge wheat, that under output No. 2 it would have been of interest to the WEA to start looking at the effect on the return to growers through the pool of the continuing costs of demurrage. I am particularly interested in the liability for costs for this wheat that has now been held up for quite a long period of time while arguments take place about the quality of the wheat. As I say, I know it is owned by the Iraqis but the demurrage comes back to the pool costs and I would have thought that under output 2 that would have been of interest to
68	Food & Ag	22	Ferris	you. (AWB Ltd amended services agreement) At page 16 of your 2004 report there is reference to the amended services agreement between AWB Ltd and AWB International. A

Hansard page no	Output Class no	TRD question number	Senator	Subject
				wholly owned subsidiary, AWB Services, was formed to supply services to AWB International. Does the subsidiary supply services to AWB Australia, the domestic trading division? If so, how does AWB(I) ensure that the base fee of \$65.1 million is not cross-subsiding the operations of the domestic division?
69	Food & Ag	23	O'Brien	(WEA staff profile)
				How many of your staff were born overseas with English as a first or second language?
70	Food & Ag	24	O'Brien	(WEA member expenses)
				In addition to remuneration, what member expenses does WEA fund or reimburse?
				Would it be a problem to provide us with a breakdown for the current financial year?
71	Food & Ag	25	O'Brien	(WEA meeting locations and costs)
				Where was each board meeting held in the current financial year and what was the associated cost?
				Mr Besley —We can provide that. Do you want the direct costs— travel costs?
				Senator O'BRIEN—Travel costs, venue and accommodation.
71-72	Food & Ag	26	O'Brien	(WEA Correspondence from Mr Walter)
				On what date did Mr Walter notify the minister and the WEA he would be standing aside from duties as at 27 July last year?
				Mr Besley—It would have been about that date. I do not have his

Hansard page no	Output Class no	TRD question number	Senator	Subject
				letter with me, but we could tell you precisely what it was. He wrote to the minister and stood aside.
				Senator O'BRIEN—Could we have copies of the correspondence?
				Mr Mortimer —That is an issue for the department for the minister if Mr Walter wrote to the minister, but we are happy to see whether the minister is happy to do that.
				Senator O'BRIEN —He wrote to the board as well. Can we have a copy of the letter to the board? There were two different letters.
				Mr Besley—I would need to check that.
				Senator O'BRIEN —Are you saying the minister got a copy of the letter to the board or vice versa?
				Senator Ian Macdonald —Why don't we take it all on notice, check facts and see whether the minister is happy to release it?
72	Food & Ag	27	O'Brien	(Advice on 'presiding member')
				Yes, they did seek advice on the situation that the WEA board was faced with, with the chairman standing aside. That advice outlined for the WEA what scope it had and what options it had to function in the absence of a chairman.
				Senator O'BRIEN —I wonder if the board would provide a copy of that advice to this committee.
				Mr Besley—From the Government Solicitor?
				Senator O'BRIEN—Yes.

Hansard page no	Output Class no	TRD question number	Senator	Subject
				Mr Besley—Again, I think the advice is a matter for the department. David, is it not?
				Mr Mortimer—It is probably a board matter.
				Mr Besley —If the board can do it, I do not have a problem at all with it. I am told that we sought it, and I see no problem in providing that advice.
74	Food & Ag	28	O'Brien	(Grain Council of Australia reimbursements)
				What reimbursements have been provided for meetings in 2004-05 to date?
74	Food & Ag	29	O'Brien	(WEA International travel)
				It appears that in 2003-04 representatives of the WEA, members and/or staff travelled to Vietnam, New Zealand, China and Italy. I would like to know what the total cost of overseas travel in that financial year and the current financial year has been.
74	Food & Ag	30	O'Brien	(Cost to produce growers and ministers report)
				One of the authority's key functions is to prepare a report on AWBI's export performance that examines and reports on how growers benefit from that performance. You produced two reports, one for the minister and one for the growers. Can you tell me what it cost to produce the 2004 report to the minister and the 2004 growers report?
75	Food & Ag	31	O'Brien	(WEA insurance contract)
				A final question which goes to the issue of accountability to wheat growers and the parliament: page 58 of your annual report says

Output Class TRD Subject Hansard Senator question page no no number the WEA's insurance contract 'prohibits the disclosure of the amount of premiums payable by the authority'. I would have thought the growers that fund the organisation and therefore pay the bills and the parliament that authorise the compulsory collection of that funding would be entitled to know every last detail of your finances. Who do you insure with? Mr Taylor—I am not sure of the basis of that statement, but I would be happy to take that on notice and get back to you, if that is okay. Senator O'BRIEN—I would like to know who insures and what the premium is, because I believe that growers are entitled to know. Can you quantify the value of the benefit of the single desk to Australian wheat growers after five years in existence? 75 Food & Ag 32 Heffernan (AWBI assessment of the single desk benefit) What parts had to be withdrawn? You are starting to get my curiosity up here. They were put out by-Mr Besley—They put out some fact sheets, which we took a little bit of umbrage at. They accepted that it was reasonable for us to take umbrage. They withdrew it or they did not circulate it anymore. CHAIR—You would not care to supply that to the committee, would you? Mr Besley—I forget which one it was, frankly. I think it might have been headed 'Your single desk'.

Hansard page no	Output Class no	TRD question number	Senator	Subject
				Mr Taylor—There was a fact sheet associated with it.
				Mr Besley—If they have not all been pulped, we can get you one.
76 - 77	Food & Ag	36	Heffernan	(Insurance Premiums)
				How many other insurance instances are there where the premium is not disclosed around the traps? Is that uncommon, or common?
77	Market	01	Heffernan	(Iraqi wheat)
	Access			Is there a restriction zone around these ships that are sitting 100 yards offshore?
78-79	Market	02	Heffernan	(Iraqi wheat)
	Access			What was the previous load in the ship?
				Mr Burns —I would have to take that on notice. I cannot answer that.
				CHAIR—That would be interesting to know.
				Mr Morris —It is more than one ship. I think there were five ships involved.
				CHAIR —It would be interesting to know what their previous load was and where it went.
				Mr Burns—We could find out.
				Mr Morris —As Mr Burns has said, prior to the wheat being loaded they were inspected both by AQIS inspectors and by the marine surveyor, so the likelihood of—
				CHAIR—Are they grain specific ships, or ships that back load

Hansard page no	Output Class no	TRD question number	Senator	Subject
				with other stuff?
				Did the five ships that were knocked back come from five different loading points?
				Mr Morris—We will double-check that. I am not aware of the details.
				CHAIR —So you can let us know where they were loaded and what their previous loads were.
80	Food & Ag	33	O'Brien	(Buffalo slaughter levy)
				In 2004-05, the buffalo slaughter levy was forecast to be 20,000— that is on page 24 of last year's PBS. It is now estimated to be 5,000. How has that come about?
				Ms Standen —I cannot give you any details on the changes in the buffalo slaughter levy. You are specifically asking why there has been a change in the estimates?
				Senator O'BRIEN —Yes, why it has been reduced from 20,000 at the beginning of the financial year to an estimated 5,000 at the end of the—
80	Food & Ag	34	O'Brien	(MLA and Austrade)
				So there are no joint programs; it is up to MLA to do the development?
				Mr Mortimer —MLA raises funding through levies to do that sort of promotion and activity and the industry is comfortable that those activities are well targeted and effective and so they continue.

Hansard page no	Output Class no	TRD question number	Senator	Subject
				Senator O'BRIEN—Is Austrade involved at all, do you know?
				Mr Mortimer —I cannot say specifically. My expectation is that MLA would be working with Austrade in different markets, but I cannot say with authority. If you like, I can take it on notice.
81	Food & Ag	35	O'Brien	(Integrity of wine exports)
				I wanted to know if you can tell us what the sampling and testing regime is.
84	Biosecurity	01	O'Brien	(MOU with DAFF and Biosecurity Australia)
	Australia			Is there a memorandum of agreement between Biosecurity Australia and the department?
				Mr Cahill —We have a draft memorandum of understanding which relates to services that the department will continue to provide to Biosecurity Australia, principally management services, payroll, some accounting services and other things. We have not finalised that yet, but that will be in an MOU between me and the secretary of the department.
				Senator O'BRIEN —Can this committee have a copy when it is finalised?
				Mr Cahill—We are happy to provide that, yes.
	Biosecurity	02	O'Brien	(Beef imports: draft policy memorandum)
	Australia			The files will record the nature of the consultation—when, where and with whom?
				Mr Cahill—As I understand it, they will, yes.

Hansard page no	Output Class no	TRD question number	Senator	Subject
				Senator O'BRIEN —Could we get copies of extracts from those files?
				Dr Martin —Yes. The policy has a list of stakeholders that it was circulated to.
				Senator O'BRIEN—Does it have their responses?
				Dr Martin—And the comments that were received.
				CHAIR—What years did that occur?
				Dr Martin —This was when it was circulated in 1998 as a draft.
				CHAIR —Are you saying that the Cattle Council and other people—
				Dr Martin —I am not sure whether the Cattle Council was in existence then, but the National Farmers Federation and—
				CHAIR —They, in their profound wisdom, kicked this off as a good idea.
				Dr Martin —It went to state chief veterinary officers. We can provide you with a copy of the draft policy memorandum and the stakeholders that it went to and their comments.
92	Biosecurity	03	Heffernan	(NFF technical advisor)
	Australia			Who was the technical adviser?
				Mr Cahill—I do not know the names.
				CHAIR—Could you provide them?

Output Class TRD Subject Hansard Senator question page no no number Biosecurity 92 04 **O'Brien** (Beef imports consultation) Australia The file will show who was consulted. It will tell you and you will be able to tell us the nature of that consultation, and you will be able to supply us with the material that they received and the responses you received from those who replied. (*Beef imports: permit applications from Brazil*) 95 AOIS 19 O'Brien The two permits for imports have been suspended. Is that right? Mr Cahill—The permits that were issued under the policy for imports from Brazil have been revoked. Senator O'BRIEN—And there were two permits? Dr Clegg—There were something like 11 permits. CHAIR—How many applications were not processed? **Dr Clegg**—I do not think there were any, but I can check that for you. We did not have hundreds of applications. AOIS 20 Heffernan 96 (Beef imports: product labels) The three containers came in and went to the soup factory. What supervision is made, by whoever the appropriate authorities are, of what goes on the label, as in 'Made in Australia' or 'Bully beef: souped here but cooked in Brazil'? Do they identify what you are actually eating when you buy the can of bully beef? Dr Clegg—That would be about Australia's labelling requirements. I am sorry, I cannot advise you on that.

Hansard page no	Output Class no	TRD question number	Senator	Subject
				CHAIR —I will have a little punt with you that it does not say 'Brazilian beef'.
				Dr Clegg —I cannot advise you on that.
				Mr Wonder—I think we should take that on notice.
98	Market	03	O'Brien	(MOUs)
	Access			Are English language copies of these agreements able to be supplied to the committee?
100	PIAPH	01	O'Brien	(Accounts: National Cattle Disease Eradication)
				I want to refer you to page 22 of this year's PBS and page 30 of last year's PBS. In last year's document, under the heading 'Output 3', there is a reference to the National Cattle Disease Eradication Trust Account of 1991. There was an estimated expense of \$606,000 for 2003-04 and \$604,000 for the current financial year, but in this year's PBS that number is just \$3,000 and there is nothing for next year. Can you explain what has happened to change the numbers so dramatically?
				Mr McCutcheon —I think that is just the wind-up of that particular account, Senator, but I would have to take that on notice. It is a small amount, and I do not know why it appears there.
102	PIAPH	02	O'Brien	(National Biosecurity Strategy)
				Can you give me the consultancy details—name, price et cetera?
				Mr McCutcheon—Yes. Mr Roger Smith, former head of the

Hansard page no	Output Class no	TRD question number	Senator	Subject
				Northern Territory Department of Primary Industries.
				Senator O'BRIEN—What fee will he be paid?
				Mr McCutcheon—I do not have those details here.
				Senator O'BRIEN —Do you know if it is a fixed fee or an hourly charge?
				Mr McCutcheon—No, I do not know that.
				Senator O'BRIEN —If you can get us that information, I would appreciate it.
106	PIAPH	03	O'Brien	(Management of exotic diseases expenditure)
				Dr Biddle —The Australian Veterinary Reserve has initiated its recruitment of some 100 members, its planned size. The initial pilot training course was held last year and there is presently a redesign process, a bit of engineering around the initial pilot training course, to inform the content of the planned remaining training courses for about 80 officers that have still to be trained. The program is close to commencing the remaining training activity, which is planned to be completed over approximately the next 12 months, subject of course to a variety of factors. That is the game plan.
				Senator O'BRIEN—How much has been spent on this in the current financial year?
				Mr McCutcheon —We will have to take that question on notice, Senator. We do not have the precise figures of expenditure to date.

Output Class TRD Senator Subject Hansard question page no no number Senator O'BRIEN—You are achieving the target number of participants? 04 112 PIAPH O'Brien (*F&MD* outbreak human resource capacity) No. Animal Health Australia is conducting a project to define what normal commitment is for each jurisdiction during an emergency. It would look at what their core responsibilities were and would also do an analysis of their respective sizes, their resource bases and their emergency animal disease risks. Animal Health Australia is also developing performance standards to describe the expected capacities of those jurisdictions. That is one of those works in progress by Animal Health Australia. Senator O'BRIEN—Any expected time line for finalisation of the work? Mr McCutcheon—I am sure there is a time line. I do not have that information. Senator O'BRIEN—Can you get that for us? PIAPH 117 05 **O'Brien** (Eradication program) Yes. Perhaps on notice, can you give us an update on what is exactly happening with the eradication programs for branched broom rape, grapevine leaf rust and exotic fruit flies?

Hansard page no	Output Class no	TRD question number	Senator	Subject
117	PIAPH	06	O'Brien	(Food Chain Assurance Advisory Group) There are no payments to industry involved at this stage?
				THURSDAY 26 May 2005
3	PIAPH	07	O'Brien	(International convention for chemicals)
				Yes, at this point we are. The money that we have allocated under this program for those activities relates initially, to the communication of what those obligations are to relevant stakeholders in the Australian community and, secondly, to putting in place a database which enables us to maintain that information and provide appropriate reports to international organisations.
				Senator O'BRIEN —So how often do we report to the international organisations?
				Mr McCutcheon—I would have to take that question on notice.
				Senator O'BRIEN—Would those reports be published? Perhaps you could tell us that as well.
8	PIAPH	08	O'Brien	(2, 4-D)
				Do you know what particular products have been applied in the circumstances we have been talking about?
				Dr Smith —No, I do not have that particular information.

Hansard page no	Output Class no	TRD question number	Senator	Subject
				Senator O'BRIEN—Would the states have it?
				Dr Smith —They may have. That is the sort of information we are working with the states to get at the moment. I can check and then provide that detail to you.
9	PIAPH	09	O'Brien	(MRLs)
				Are our MRLs the same as those which exist overseas for the same product?
				Dr Smith —Not always. Generally we are fairly well lined up with places—with things like Codex—in other countries—but there are differences. I cannot tell you specifically how they line up on 2,4-D products. I could check that information and provide that to you.
15	AQIS	21	O'Brien	(Wheat shipments)
				Yesterday we talked about the wheat shipments and we were told about a role that AQIS plays in assessing the shipment before it leaves. I wonder if you could explain that process for me. On reflection, I did not quite understand the routine that AQIS was involved in when assessing a shipment before it leaves. For example, is an assessment made before it is loaded, as it is loaded or after it is loaded and what actually happens? How broad is the sampling? How can you be sure you have a representative sample of a whole shipment when there are thousands of tonnes et cetera?
15	AQIS	22	O'Brien	(Checking procedures)
				On how many occasions have your checking procedures been

Hansard page no	Output Class no	TRD question number	Senator	Subject
				questioned in the sense that there has been a suggestion of a contaminant in a shipment after it has been checked by AQIS and you have not discovered it?
				Are there reports of those occasions that you can provide us?
				Ms Stanton—I am sure there are.
				Senator O'BRIEN—Will you be able to get them for us?
				Ms Stanton —Yes, certainly. I will get you the details of the occasions over recent years.
17	AQIS	23	O'Brien	(US meatworks audits)
				Have our export works ever been subject to an enforcement audit?
20-21	AQIS	24	O'Brien	(Cocos Island quarantine station)
				There is no-one on the island who has any responsibility for maintaining that property?
				Dr Clegg —The way we have managed it in the past is that we have used our contacts with the local government there. When it was the responsibility of the quarantine station we hired a contractor to clean up the weeds. Pest or weed control were the main things that we were doing. I would have to find out about that for you.
28	BRS	01	O'Brien	(Murray Darling Basin)
				The PBS says that BRS does work on the Murray-Darling Basin and other catchments. I think the Murray-Darling Basin accounts for about 80 per cent of our agricultural production. Given the

Hansard page no	Output Class no	TRD question number	Senator	Subject
				agency outcome for the National Water Commission is sustainable management it is not surprised you have such a role. Can you give us an outline.
				Dr Grant —In terms of our work within the Murray-Darling Basin?
				Senator O'BRIEN—Yes.
				Dr Grant —I can. It may not be absolutely exhaustive but I can give you a broad array of the things we are doing. We are working with the CSIRO and the Bureau of Meteorology, for example, on some work on the water balance across Australia. That will include the Murray-Darling Basin. We have responsibility to take forward an election commitment by the government regarding expenditure of \$20 million for salinity mapping, focused within the basin. We are planning that, with the commencement in the beginning of the financial year. We have already done considerable work in the basin. We have contracts on various issues with the Murray-Darling Basin Commission. I would need to take on notice, if you want the detail, what precisely those pieces of work are. We are reasonably deeply infused into the Murray-Darling Basin. We work with state agencies collectively, we work with CSIRO and, as I have indicated, we are offering our services to the National Water Commission. We are doing a considerable amount of work on both water and salinity.
30	RPI	01	O'Brien	(Drought and EC)
				Do you have a figure for drought declared, including but not exclusively EC?

Hansard page no	Output Class no	TRD question number	Senator	Subject
				Mr Koval —No, I do not. Some states have a different declaration process. It is something we can see if we can determine for you, but I do not have a figure to hand.
36	RPI	02	O'Brien	(Dairy Industry Reform Act)
				When did the minister first seek information about this matter?
				Mr Pearson —I will have to take that on notice. I cannot recall. There has been an iterative process. As the annual report and other information have been coming in, the minister has been trying to reassure himself that compliance has been made by Dairy Australia.
				Senator O'BRIEN —I would appreciate if you would let me know the details of the process: when the department first contacted the minister about the matter, when the minister first contacted the department about the matter and what requests he made.
36-37	RPI	03	O'Brien	(EC declarations)
				On average, what is it?
				Mr Koval —At the moment it is just over 13 per cent of farmers within EC declared areas.
				Senator O'BRIEN —So you will be able to get us on notice the number that was used to calculate that figure?
				Mr Koval—I can do that.
				Senator O'BRIEN—And you will be able to get us the number

Hansard page no	Output Class no	TRD question number	Senator	Subject
				that has been used to calculate the current figure in the PBS for next year?
37	RPI	04	O'Brien	(AAA package for rural finance counselling)
				In nominal terms it is a slight increase. In real terms, if the increase is less than the projected rate of inflation, it is a reduction, isn't it?
				Mr Williamson —I am not sure. The numbers are as they are in the PBS.
				Senator O'BRIEN —You said they are indexed. What are they indexed against?
40	RPI	05	O'Brien	(1994 Rural Partnership Program)
				On notice, can you give us more detail about this? I would like to know why there was a view that no milestones would be met and suddenly \$3.8 million worth of milestones has popped up in these projects.
				Mr Williamson—Certainly, I can get you a breakdown project by project.
41	RPI	06	Ferris	(SA government drought relief contribution)
				The Australian government has committed more than \$1 billion in drought funding to farmers since 2003-03. In total, this is four times the amount of funding announced by all state governments. In the current drought, more than 46,000 applications for income support grants, EC relief payments and interest rate subsidies have been approved. Total Australian government expenditure to date

TRD Subject **Output Class** Hansard Senator question page no no number for drought measures amounts to \$676 million. For this drought, though, a special Premier's package of up to \$5 million was announced in October 2002 for rural counselling support, additional FarmBis support, individual business and community grants, but no real money went directly to farmers. In fact, of the total, South Australia has spent only \$2.3 million. Can you advise the committee: how much real money has the South Australian government contributed to drought funding during 2003-04; how this would compare with other states? **Mr Koval**—I will have to take that on notice. I do not have how much money the states have committed direct to farmers on a financial year basis. 42 RPI 07 (SA drought: NRAC recommendations for rejected applications) Ferris Can you explain to me why the other two were not accepted? ... Mr Koval—As I recall, the first application was rejected on the basis that it could not demonstrate a rare and severe event that resulted in a prolonged impact on the majority of growers in that region. I can get more details of the exact recommendation from NRAC if you like. **ACTING CHAIR**—It is my recollection that some of the reasoning in the applications related to specific events on specific days-whether it was frost, wind or particularly bad climatic conditions-which dramatically affected the crop but which may not in the wider context have met the conditions for a successful application. Is that your recollection? Mr Koval—I will have to take that question on notice to be

Hansard page no	Output Class no	TRD question number	Senator	Subject
				exactly sure of the exact nature and extent of the event that they applied for.
42	RPI	08	Ferris	(SA drought: role of SA Farmers Federation)When you are looking at the records that go back a couple of years, can you see whether you are able to comment on the role played by the South Australian Farmers Federation in those applications?
44	Fisheries & Forestry	01	O'Brien	(Fishing rebuilding strategy)On notice, can you tell me how long each of these strategies has been in place and how many of them have been judged to have resulted in positive trends in species numbers to date?
47	Fisheries & Forestry	02	O'Brien	 (By-catch plans) There are some by-catch plans I wanted to be updated on: the Bas Strait scallop, the northern prawn fishery and the sub-Antarctic fisheries. Mr McLoughlin—A new by-catch action plan was published in June 2004. That was the first one. A further by-catch action plan for Bass Strait scallop will now not be developed in 2004-05. It will have a two-year life or thereabouts, depending on advice from DEH. What was the other one?
				 Senator O'BRIEN—The northern prawn fishery. Mr McLoughlin—It has a by-catch action plan in place. I do not have the current term of that plan in front of me, but I can provide it.

Hansard page no	Output Class no	TRD question number	Senator	Subject
				Senator O'BRIEN—Is it being reviewed or is it just in place?
				Mr McLoughlin —I do not have that information in front of me, but I can provide it.
				Senator O'BRIEN —Thanks—and the sub-Antarctic fisheries by- catch plan? Is that whale exclusion devices?
				Mr McLoughlin —Similarly, I do not have that in front of me either, unfortunately. I have nearly all of the others.
				Senator O'BRIEN —Can you let us know when each of the reviews is scheduled to be completed when you do that, please?
50	Fisheries &	03	Brown	(Australian territorial waters)
	Forestry			No. I was just seeking where Australia's territorial waters lie. That is not a legal matter. That is a matter that Australia has asserted
				Senator Ian Macdonald—I think, Senator, it might be good for all of us—I only saw a bit of your interaction with Senator Campbell and I am not sure whether he offered to do this—so that none of us are making claims to the media that are not accurate, if we get a note from the Attorney-General's Department on just what the status of those waters is. I will take that on notice and make it available.
57	Fisheries &	04	Stephens	(Indonesia AusAID program)
	Forestry			Can you inform the committee of the value of that second stage?
57-58	Fisheries &	05	Stephens	(Illegal fishing)
	Forestry			How do the figures you gave me—194 impounded and 154

Hansard page no	Output Class no	TRD question number	Senator	Subject
				boarded—compare to last year?
				Mr P Murphy—By financial year?
				Senator Ian Macdonald—I was just querying this myself. When I issue media releases I talk about this calendar year. These are financial year figures. I just want to make sure you understand there is a difference in case you are checking one of my media releases, because we are talking about different things.
				Mr P Murphy—I have the calendar year data as well.
				Senator STEPHENS —Calendar year would be useful, and then I can check the minister's press releases!
				Mr P Murphy —The figure for apprehensions in the calendar year up to 24 May is 98 and there have been 70 seizures of catch and fishing gear. I have calendar year data for 21 May last year, which shows that 48 boats were apprehended and 41 had forfeitures of catch and fishing gear.
				Senator STEPHENS—And the year before?
				Mr P Murphy —I can give you the totals for calendar year or financial year going back.
				Senator STEPHENS —Maybe you can take that on notice and provide it later—that will be fine.
60	Fisheries &	06	Stephens	(Illegal fishing: Darwin detention facilities)
	Forestry			Would it be 50 days or longer for the person who has been detained longest?

Hansard page no	Output Class no	TRD question number	Senator	Subject
62	Fisheries & Forestry	07	Stephens	 (Illegal fishing: news story) We will get you AQIS's account of the actual events. Senator STEPHENS—That would be useful. Mr Quinlivan—We did check with them after that story was reported and they said it was quite untrue. At least, the allegation that they had 'directed'—I think that was the word—this fisherman to make this arrest was quite untrue. But I cannot recall the precise detail of their conversations with the fisherman. We might get that and provide it to you. Senator STEPHENS—Thank you; that would be useful. Will that provide some information about the name of the boat, the type of boat, what it was fishing and what catch was secured, et cetera? Mr Quinlivan—I am not sure what information is available but, whatever it is, we will provide it to you.
64 *Senator Stephens intends to place these extra QON in the next few days	Fisheris & Forestry	08	Stephens	 (abalone) Getting to the issue of abalone, the department produced its discussion paper in March. It also canvasses some options around the illegal trade, I understand. What is the next step? Mr Quinlivan—You have us at some disadvantage now, because the person who dealt with that has left. If you have questions on that— Senator STEPHENS—I have a couple of questions. Mr Quinlivan—Can we take those on notice?

Hansard page no	Output Class no	TRD question number	Senator	Subject
67-68	Fisheries &	09	Brown	(Logging on Tiwi Islands)
	Forestry			Is there clear-fell logging on the Tiwi islands?
				Senator Ian Macdonald —It is all plantation, if there is. I guess there would be. When I saw them they were fairly small trees.
				Senator BROWN —Is it intended to increase the project from 30,000 to 100,000 hectares?
				Senator Ian Macdonald —That is not really information that w would have, unfortunately.
				Senator BROWN —Is the logging material going to Korea and other places overseas?
				Senator Ian Macdonald —I can see whether we have that information, but it is unlikely that we would.
69	ABARE	01	Brown	(Woodchip sales statistics)
				Can you comment on the trend for export woodchip sales out of Australia, taking into account the global market and the projections into the next two years?
				Mr Quinlivan —We cannot do that, Senator, but certainly ABARE can. They were here earlier today. So I could take that question on notice. They have recently published forest and woo product statistics. We can get back to you with some informatio on that.
71	PIAPH	10	Brown	(atrazine and simazine chemicals)
				I have no dispute with that, but I am surprised to hear that you sa

Hansard page no	Output Class no	TRD question number	Senator	Subject
				it is not a matter for you to be involved in or interested in seeking answers about. That is what I would have thought would be a reasonable response.
				Mr Quinlivan —I have offered to get whatever information we can on this matter from the APVMA, and if there is anything additional that can be added to the conversation that we had earlier today, we will be happy to get that for you.
				Senator BROWN —What action has been generated by your department on the matter of these chemicals to date?
73	Fisheries &	10	Brown	(Water catchments)
	Forestry			No, it is a forestry question. I am asking: is there any forestry operation or plantation in Australia that pays for the water that it withdraws or which does not get into the catchment because of that plantation growth? Could you take that question on notice?
				Senator Ian Macdonald —We would have to refer it to all the state governments.
				Senator BROWN—I would be happy if you did.
				Senator Ian Macdonald —I am not quite sure whether that is our role, but we will see how generous we are feeling at the time.
				Senator BROWN—I have put the question on notice.
82	NRM	02	Stephens	(National Action Plan on Salinity and Water Quality and the Natural Heritage Trust)
				Could you provide the committee with a list of who is doing the work; details of the consultants and the budgets for each of those

Hansard page no	Output Class no	TRD question number	Senator	Subject
				reviews. Is that possible?
84-85	NRM	03	Stephens	(EMS Pilot Programs)
				Do you anticipate that the people who have been doing the preliminary reviews will do the final review for you?
				Mr Thompson —We would anticipate that, similar to other reviews, each person undertaking the pilot would do an assessment of what they learnt, what they achieved, and complete that by way of progress and completion reports. We have a project manager in a firm oversighting and helping us to manage those programs and providing reports on that. That will feed into the process. We have not determined what sort of process we will use to review the outcomes of the program; it may involve an independent look or it may involve using internal resources.
				Ms Tomlinson —Halfway through the life of the pilots, there was a review of the program. That was completed at the end of 2004. One of the cross-learning activities that we had was an annual pilot forum that was held in March 2005. Ian Thompson mentioned that we had a list of the MBI pilots; we have a similar list of the EMS pilot programs that we could provide to you.
NA		Add 01	Ludwig	(Employee accreditation) The questions for all departments and agencies under your portfolio. It's a follow-up to a question we asked in December
				Regarding the employees that your department or agency has identified as having

Output Class TRD Senator Subject Hansard page no question no number a) fluency b) accredited translator c) accredited interpreter Of these employees, please indicate what the department is doing in order to make full use of its employees skills in this regard, and please provide a breakdown of this between employees whose accreditation was paid for by the department and those whose were not? NA Add 02 Ludwig (Legal service expenditure) What amount did the Department/agency spend during the financial year 2004/2005 on outsourced legal practitioners (including private firms, individuals, the Australian Government Solicitor, and any others)? NA Add 03 Ludwig (Legal service expenditure) What was the budgeted amount for outsourced legal practitioners in 2004/2005? NA Ludwig (Legal service expenditure) Add 04 What amount did the Department/agency spend on internal legal services? (Provide an estimate if exact amount is unavailable.) NA Add 05 Ludwig (Legal service expenditure) Does the Department/agency have an in-house legal section? If so, what was the 2004/2005 actual cost of this section? What was the budgeted

amount for this section in 2004/2005? What is the budget amount for

43

Hansard page no	Output Class no	TRD question number	Senator	Subject
				this section in 2005/2006?
NA		Add 06	Ludwig	(Legal service expenditure) What is the total projected expenditure on legal services for 2005/2006 for the Department/agency?
NA		Add 07	Ludwig	(Legal service expenditure) Which organisations or individuals were contracted to provide legal services to the Department/agency in 2004/2005?
NA		Add 08	Ludwig	(Legal service expenditure) In each instance, how much was each organisation or individual paid for these services?
NA		Add 09	Ludwig	(Legal service expenditure) Does the Department/agency use an open tendering or select tendering process (as described in the Commonwealth Procurement Guidelines, p 42) when procuring legal services?
NA		Add 10	Ludwig	(Legal service expenditure) If a select tendering process is used: (a) which method of select tendering is used and (b) which firms or individuals are currently eligible to tender for legal services?

Hansard page no	Output Class no	TRD question number	Senator	Subject
NA		Add 11	Ludwig	(Legal service expenditure) If a multi-use list is used: (a) which firms or individuals are currently on that list and (b) when was the list last opened for applications?
NA		Add 12	Ludwig	(Legal service expenditure) In 2004/2005 did the Department/agency obtain any legal services using a direct sourcing procurement process? If so, provide details including the name of the provider, the work involved and the cost?
NA		Add 13	Ludwig	(Legal service expenditure) In 2004/2005 did the Department/agency procure any legal services under the thresholds required for 'covered procurements' (within the meaning of 8.6 of the Commonwealth Procurement Guidelines)? If so, provide details including the name of the provider, the work involved and the cost.
NA		Add 14	Ludwig	(Legal service expenditure) In 2004/05 did the Department/agency contract any legal firms to provide services other than legal services (such as consulting, conduct of policy reviews etc)? If so, provide details including the name of the firm, the project involved and the cost of the contract.