

2012 SENATE ECONOMICS LEGISLATION COMMITTEE
QUESTIONS ON NOTICE – ADDITIONAL ESTIMATES – 15 FEBRUARY 2012
INDUSTRY, INNOVATION, SCIENCE, RESEARCH AND TERTIARY EDUCATION PORTFOLIO

Q No.	Program: Division/ Agency	Senator	Broad Topic	Question	Proof Hansard Page & Hearing Date or Written Question
QUESTIONS IDENTIFIED FROM HANSARD					
AI-1	CSIRO	Mason	CSIRO Publishing	<p>Senator MASON: Again, this is prior to my time, but I understand that these are important issues. I want to ask some questions about Dr Spash, who resigned apparently with some fanfare from the CSIRO a few years ago. I understand that Dr Spash wrote a paper entitled <i>The brave new world of carbon trading</i>, in which he argued against, apparently, a cap and trade and for a carbon tax, against the government's then policy. At the last estimates, I think Senator Colbeck was told that the paper was knocked back at least in part because the paper was also viewed as offering opinions on matters of government policy. I have been on the CSIRO's publishing website and found a book entitled, <i>The Case for a Carbon Tax: Getting Past Our Hang-ups to Effective Climate Policy</i>. This book, I understand, advocates the imposition of a carbon tax, which is very much in accordance with the government's policy. With that preamble, my question is this: Dr Spash resigned because he felt he was being censored by the CSIRO upon advocating a carbon tax, which was not then government policy, and now the CSIRO is selling a book which appears to be doing the same thing, and that is in accordance with government policy. Can you understand that many people have a perception that these two actions might be inconsistent?</p> <p>Mr M Whelan: CSIRO Publishing is a part of the CSIRO and operates an independent editorial publishing service on behalf of the science community. One of the functions of the CSIRO under the act is to disseminate information about science and technology more generally and not just science and technology from the CSIRO. So CSIRO Publishing publishes books on behalf of a range of institutions, and I am reasonably certain that the authors of the book that you are referring to are not CSIRO officers.</p> <p>Senator MASON: I think that that is correct. But there is some editorialising on the webpage. Let me quote from it. Hsu— who is the author— deftly explores the social and political factors that prevent us from embracing this commonsense approach. And he shows why we must get past our hang-ups if we are to avert a global crisis. That clearly trespasses on public policy. It does not seem to be in accord with what we discussed before, Dr Clark, about the CSIRO's code of conduct. Mr Whelan, at the last estimates, you were quoted as</p>	Pages 6-7 15 February 2012

2012 SENATE ECONOMICS LEGISLATION COMMITTEE
QUESTIONS ON NOTICE – ADDITIONAL ESTIMATES – 15 FEBRUARY 2012
INDUSTRY, INNOVATION, SCIENCE, RESEARCH AND TERTIARY EDUCATION PORTFOLIO

				<p>saying that the organisation needs to: ... ensure that we were not associated, and that officers were not in a position to be seen to be advocating for or against the pricing of carbon or a carbon tax. That is correct, isn't it? Mr M Whelan: That is correct. Senator MASON: That strikes me as advocacy. Mr M Whelan: I will have to take on notice whose comments they are. If they are the comments of the editor of the book or of the authors of the book, I would have to take that on notice to see whether they were CSIRO officers. If they were CSIRO officers, I think we would have to look at the basis of those statements. Senator MASON: So you will have a look at it? Okay.</p>	
AI-2	CSIRO	Mason	CSIRO Publishing	<p>Senator MASON: But it is less than 12 months ago; that is my point. Mr Whelan, in terms of the publishing question, could you find out who did it, if that is all right? Who decided to upload the description? Was it a staff member of CSIRO Publishing? If you could find that out for us, that would be great. If indeed it was a CSIRO staff member, then it looks to me to be, prima facie, a breach. But I understand that there is a further process to go through. So could you please look at that? Will you undertake to review the books and their descriptions found on the website to ensure that it is clear that any books and description which do breach the CSIRO's public comment policy are the opinion of others? Will you make sure that the publishing site is in accordance with your own policy about engaging in public policy? Mr M Whelan: With regard to the books that the CSIRO publishes, we make it very clear in the foreword to those books whether the statements are on behalf of the CSIRO or not and whether they are produced by CSIRO or not. I can give you those assurances now with respect to books. With respect to other comments on the website, I will take your question on notice. Senator MASON: And any editorialising, as it were, with respect to the books. Mr M Whelan: I understand your question.</p>	Page 7 15 February 2012
AI-3	CSIRO	McKenzie	Merbein Facility	<p>Senator McKENZIE: My questions go to a report on 8 February around the Merbein CSIRO facility in Mildura and the National Irrigators Council's claims around that. I am wondering if you can comment on where the research capacity from that facility has ended up? I know table and wine grape research has gone down to Adelaide, but what about the citrus et cetera? Dr Clark: We have moved some of the scientific activity to Adelaide. We have also retained, for a short time, the citrus breeding activity. We have also maintained a growing facility where we can do citrus testing, et cetera. So we</p>	Page 8 15 February 2012

2012 SENATE ECONOMICS LEGISLATION COMMITTEE
QUESTIONS ON NOTICE – ADDITIONAL ESTIMATES – 15 FEBRUARY 2012
INDUSTRY, INNOVATION, SCIENCE, RESEARCH AND TERTIARY EDUCATION PORTFOLIO

				<p>have maintained some land to be able to do that. Our field testing site, if you like, has been maintained.</p> <p>Senator McKENZIE: The Mallee soil structure et cetera is specific to that sort of research. Does that capacity still exist within Sunraysia?</p> <p>Dr Clark: I would take the question on notice with regard to the Mallee soils. Our soils work is in Adelaide, but I would have to take any movement of that activity from Merbein to Adelaide on notice.</p>	
AI-4	CSIRO	McKenzie	Merbein Facility	<p>Senator McKENZIE: The viticulture has shifted to Adelaide. Given the importance of irrigated agriculture to the Sunraysia district and the way that they grow their particular things in their particular space, I am just wondering if that research capacity is somewhere within the CSIRO, given the closure of Merbein?</p> <p>Dr Clark: Yes. We are continuing that work in Adelaide, and we are also doing it in conjunction with our partners in South Australia—that is, the University of Adelaide and other partners that sit on the same location as us at the Waite Campus. We cover a number of areas all the way from the actual flavours and compounds that are in the wine through to the grape varieties themselves, new grape varieties and new and faster ways of growing, back to the soils research, the health of the soils and microbial aspects of the soils. So we cover that in depth, but we also have very strong partnerships in South Australia. It is our intention to maintain that work at the Waite Campus and to strengthen our partnerships with the other organisations co-located at the Waite Campus.</p> <p>Senator McKENZIE: So that is specifically wine grapes?</p> <p>Dr Clark: I would have to take on notice the work on table grapes, because we were doing table grapes at Merbein.</p> <p>Senator McKENZIE: Yes.</p> <p>Dr Clark: I will take on notice whether we are continuing to do the table grape work at Adelaide. The work that I was referring to was definitely related to the wine grape industry.</p>	<p>Page 8 15 February 2012</p>
AI-5	CSIRO	McKenzie	Merbein Facility	<p>Senator McKENZIE: Absolutely. I notice on your website, when we look at the focus of the research around the CSIRO and horticulture, we have cereals, cotton, wine grapes, oil seeds, legumes and sugar cane. Whereas there is a glaring gap, I guess, in aspects of your research into the horticultural industries that hold up northeast and northwest Victoria and that are under irrigation. So if you could take on notice in terms of assuring regional Victorians from the north that the CSIRO is still going to be driving innovation in their particular industry, that would be fantastic.</p> <p>Dr Clark: We have diminished our investment in some of those horticulture</p>	<p>Pages 8-9 15 February 2012</p>

2012 SENATE ECONOMICS LEGISLATION COMMITTEE
QUESTIONS ON NOTICE – ADDITIONAL ESTIMATES – 15 FEBRUARY 2012
INDUSTRY, INNOVATION, SCIENCE, RESEARCH AND TERTIARY EDUCATION PORTFOLIO

				<p>areas and in some of the areas of table grapes. So I will not be able to provide assurance, but I will be able to provide you with the actual information.</p> <p>Senator McKENZIE: The facts will be fine. Great.</p>	
AI-6	CSIRO	Bernardi	CarbonKids Program	<p>Senator BERNARDI: Dr Clark, I have a few questions on the CarbonKids program. Would you like me to direct them to you directly</p> <p>Dr Clark: The CarbonKids program is covered in a couple of areas, but mainly our education area, which is covered by Mr Whelan.</p> <p>Senator BERNARDI: Okay. Mr Whelan, I will address this to you. The CarbonKids program receives funding from Bayer. Is the total cost of the program funded by that single organisation?</p> <p>Mr M Whelan: I would have to take that on notice. But in doing so I would say that a substantial proportion of the cost of the program would be funded by Bayer. There may be some contribution for overheads or underlying base infrastructure from the CSIRO, but I think the bulk of the program is funded by Bayer. But I can take the detail on notice.</p> <p>Senator BERNARDI: If you would not mind. I am interested in how much it costs. I do not need to know Bayer's specific contribution, but I am interested to know the overall costs of administration and what proportion of it is borne directly by the CSIRO either in staffing, overheads or things of that nature. What is the annual budget for the CarbonKids program?</p> <p>Mr M Whelan: I would have to take that on notice.</p>	<p style="text-align: center;">Page 9 15 February 2012</p>
AI-7	CSIRO	Bernardi	CarbonKids Program	<p>Senator BERNARDI: Do you know how many schools are now registered with the CarbonKids program?</p> <p>Mr M Whelan: No, I do not, but I do know that it has been growing over time.</p> <p>Senator BERNARDI: It was disclosed that, I think, 170 schools across Australia were registered originally. Has it grown since then?</p> <p>Mr M Whelan: That is my understanding, Senator.</p> <p>Senator BERNARDI: Could you provide me with the number of schools, please?.....</p>	<p style="text-align: center;">Pages 9-10 15 February 2012</p>
AI-8	CSIRO	Bernardi	CarbonKids Program	<p>Senator BERNARDI:It wont surprise you that I have some concerns in respect to the program. I can congratulate the CSIRO for coming to this conclusion in their notes for teachers. It says: Climate change is a complicated topic that many find daunting and confusing. It can be controversial and involve a diverse range of disciplines and fields of expertise, leading to many different opinions. And yet, the information that is produced and distributed to school children appears to only present a single opinion about what is driving climate change.</p>	<p style="text-align: center;">Page 10 15 February 2012</p>

2012 SENATE ECONOMICS LEGISLATION COMMITTEE
QUESTIONS ON NOTICE – ADDITIONAL ESTIMATES – 15 FEBRUARY 2012
INDUSTRY, INNOVATION, SCIENCE, RESEARCH AND TERTIARY EDUCATION PORTFOLIO

				<p>How can you explain that, given that the explanatory note for teachers says that it leads 'to many different opinions'?</p> <p>Mr M Whelan: I have not personally seen the material that is presented. I would envisage the material would be consistent with those comments. I would be happy to examine the material and provide you with a view.</p>	
AI-9	CSIRO	Bushby	<p>Relates to QoN SI-82 - Senior Staff Complaints</p>	<p>Senator BUSHBY: The question specifically refers to the answer, though, and the answer says: 'There have been cases where the manager to whom the case was initially referred has become the subject of further complaint.' The answer on notice deals with this issue, and I was just clarifying—</p> <p>Senator Chris Evans: Do we have a copy of the answer?</p> <p>Dr Clarke: Yes, we do.</p> <p>Mr Roy: Dr Clarke, as indicated in the answer, receives a number of suggestions and complaints from staff throughout the course of the year. I think the answer notes that it is up to about 10 per annum, and obviously it would fluctuate from year to year and from time to time. The process we follow in doing that is that Dr Clarke would review it. Generally she would not step in and personally address the case itself. It would be done through line management, and she would refer the matter back to line management. In some cases, though, it has eventuated that line management has become the subject of the complaint, and in those cases we would refer to someone either further up the hierarchical chain or across the chain from another part of the business unit. But we would not have a circumstance in which a complaint was made against a particular officer and it was referred back to that officer to solve.</p> <p>Senator BUSHBY: Just for clarification, there has been no case, whether one that was referred in 2010 or otherwise, where that has actually occurred?</p> <p>Mr Roy: I am going to the general issue to start off with. I do not know every particular case. We could take that on notice if you had a particular circumstance you wanted us to review.</p> <p>Senator BUSHBY: I just want CSIRO's assurance that that has not occurred.</p> <p>Mr Roy: We do protect the individual who has made the complaint. We have strong processes and procedures, including a very constructive whistleblower policy that supports what we do, so it would not be our general practice to do that.</p> <p>Senator BUSHBY: Perhaps you could take that on notice—to clarify that it has not actually occurred.</p>	<p style="text-align: center;">Page 17 15 February 2012</p>

2012 SENATE ECONOMICS LEGISLATION COMMITTEE
QUESTIONS ON NOTICE – ADDITIONAL ESTIMATES – 15 FEBRUARY 2012
INDUSTRY, INNOVATION, SCIENCE, RESEARCH AND TERTIARY EDUCATION PORTFOLIO

AI-10	CSIRO	Bushby	Dr Wonhas – Carbon Tax Campaign	<p>Senator BUSHBY: Perhaps you could take that on notice—to clarify that it has not actually occurred. I will move on. At the last estimates hearing there was a discussion about the participation of one of your employees, Dr Alex Wonhas, in the government's carbon tax advertising campaign. On what date was Dr Wonhas first contacted by the Department of Climate Change about his potential involvement in the campaign?</p> <p>Mr Whelan: I do not know that Dr Wonhas was contacted by the Department of Climate Change. He was probably contacted by a communications manager inside CSIRO. I would have to take the specific date on notice.</p> <p>Senator BUSHBY: Perhaps you could find out the date of that for me.</p>	Page 17 15 February 2012
AI-11	CSIRO	Bushby	The Conversation website	<p>Senator BUSHBY: I apologise. I have been popping in and out of the room a couple of times and did not realise that Senator Milne had asked that. I will not pursue that any further. It has probably been canvassed. CSIRO is apparently a founding partner of the conservation website. As an organisation, how much has CSIRO committed financially to that project?</p> <p>Mr Whelan: Perhaps I could just clarify: did you say the 'conversation' or 'conservation'?</p> <p>Senator BUSHBY: Conservation, sorry.</p> <p>Mr Whelan: I think that we are—I am not sure about the material you have before you. We are a founding member of The Conversation, which is an—</p> <p>Senator BUSHBY: That is probably what I meant to say, yes.</p> <p>Mr Whelan: Okay. So yes, we have made some contributions to the creation of that website. Off the top of my head—and I could take the detail on notice—it is probably of the order of \$125,000. But I would have to take the detail of that on notice.</p> <p>Senator BUSHBY: Thank you.</p>	Page 18 15 February 2012
AI-12	CSIRO	Bushby	Social Research Unit	<p>Senator BUSHBY: I have only about 25 seconds left. Does the CSIRO have a social research unit and, if so, in which part of the organisation is it housed; how many full-time, part-time and casual employees are part of the unit; and what is the total funding allocated to it?</p> <p>Mr Whelan: I think that question was asked on notice at the last hearing. I would be happy to refer you to the answer. Perhaps you want to ask another question.</p> <p>Senator BUSHBY: I think I am probably done time-wise.</p> <p>Mr Whelan: Okay. I will get you the answer to that question.</p>	Page 18 15 February 2012

2012 SENATE ECONOMICS LEGISLATION COMMITTEE
QUESTIONS ON NOTICE – ADDITIONAL ESTIMATES – 15 FEBRUARY 2012
INDUSTRY, INNOVATION, SCIENCE, RESEARCH AND TERTIARY EDUCATION PORTFOLIO

AI-13	Office of the Chief Scientist	Mason	Climate Change briefings	<p>Senator MASON: Good morning. Professor. Since becoming Chief Scientist, have you provided any advice, whether written or oral, to the Prime Minister or to her department on the specific issue of the science surrounding climate change?</p> <p>Prof. Chubb: Probably.</p> <p>Senator MASON: Would that be written or oral?</p> <p>Prof. Chubb: What I have said and probably written is to point out where the weight of the evidence lies at the moment, or at the time I talked about it. It has basically been a summary of the position adopted by a broad range of people rather than an interpretation of the detail.</p> <p>Senator MASON: Was that written or oral advice?</p> <p>Prof. Chubb: I can find out, I guess. I could not tell you right now. It has probably been both.</p> <p>Senator MASON: Perhaps you could find out the date for that advice.</p> <p>Prof. Chubb: Sure.</p> <p>Senator MASON: I do not need a copy of that advice; just when you gave it, and whether it was written or oral.</p> <p>Prof. Chubb: Yes, okay.</p> <p>Senator MASON: Thanks.</p> <p>Prof. Chubb: On the oral issue, I should say that I have had lots of conversations with a lot of people about a lot of things.</p> <p>Senator MASON: I accept that. I think the committee—</p> <p>Prof. Chubb: Somewhere in amongst all that I might have dropped the magic phrase 'climate change', but I would not have made a record of that.</p> <p>Senator MASON: I appreciate that. But I would appreciate the dates of any written advice and whether there has been any specific oral advice to the Prime Minister or the department. -</p>	Page 19 15 February 2012
AI-14	Corporate-Ministerial Liaison Office	Mason	Carbon Tax	<p>Senator MASON: As Chief Scientist, have you provided any advice to the government that failing to implement the government's carbon tax will lead to Australians experiencing higher rates of infectious and vector-borne diseases, as well as food- and water-borne diseases?</p> <p>Prof. Chubb: No. I have steered clear of making comments about the carbon tax. I think I said that the last time I was here, and probably the first time—no, that was a bit earlier, but certainly the last time I was here. I am not an expert in economics; I am not an expert in the whole issue surrounding the carbon tax. I have taken the view that, if I am asked to provide advice on where the science sits—potentially to interpret some of the science if I were asked—that that is</p>	Page 19-20 15 February 2012

2012 SENATE ECONOMICS LEGISLATION COMMITTEE
QUESTIONS ON NOTICE – ADDITIONAL ESTIMATES – 15 FEBRUARY 2012
INDUSTRY, INNOVATION, SCIENCE, RESEARCH AND TERTIARY EDUCATION PORTFOLIO

				<p>entirely within my brief, but comments on academic matters are not my game. Senator MASON: No, I understand that, Professor. Are you aware of any advice being provided to the government by any other agency or official in DIISRTE—I will call it the acronym— Senator Chris Evans: That is not an appropriate question for the Chief Scientist. Whether he is aware of what other advice people have provided to the government is beyond his remit. Senator MASON: All right. But he may be— Senator Chris Evans: If you want to ask the question of the department, that is fine, but— Senator MASON: Okay. Dr Russell, are you aware of any? Dr Russell: Am I aware of any— Senator MASON: I will repeat the question. It might make it easier. Are you aware of any advice being provided to the government by any other agency or official in the department or its predecessor that failing to implement the government's carbon tax will lead to Australians experiencing higher rates of infectious and vector borne diseases, as well as food and water borne diseases? Dr Russell: Sorry; I was still pondering about the earlier question. The answer is no from the department, but we will check with the agency.</p>	
AI-15	Office of the Chief Scientist	Colbeck	Climate Report – <i>The Critical Decade</i>	<p>Senator COLBECK: I might refer you to some references by close to 100 scientists that looked very closely at the forestry section, which I am aware of. To give Professor Steffen his credit, I think he is responding that they are looking at that. But it is something that we might come back to at a subsequent— Prof. Chubb: I am happy to find out. But I have not—</p>	Page 23 15 February 2012
AI-16	Office of the Chief Scientist	Colbeck	Rising sea levels	<p>Senator COLBECK: Are you satisfied that the arrangements for media monitoring are working well in your office? If so, has your attention has been drawn to two reports: one in the <i>Spectator</i> magazine in December titled 'Rising Credulity', on sea levels, by the Swedish scientist Nils-Axel Morner, and the other in the <i>Wall Street Journal</i> in January 2012, from 16 eminent scientists, titled 'No Need to Panic about Global Warming'? Do you have a reaction to each of those articles? Prof. Chubb: I am aware of them and I have a response, which you did not refer to, also published in the <i>Wall Street Journal</i> shortly afterwards, which says, in response to that letter: do you consult your dentist about your heart condition? I think that is a fair comment. Scientists can comment on science. That is true. But experts comment at some depth and with some extra knowledge. That is truer. And the 32 or so scientists that signed the second letter all claim to be experts,</p>	Page 23 15 February 2012

2012 SENATE ECONOMICS LEGISLATION COMMITTEE
QUESTIONS ON NOTICE – ADDITIONAL ESTIMATES – 15 FEBRUARY 2012
INDUSTRY, INNOVATION, SCIENCE, RESEARCH AND TERTIARY EDUCATION PORTFOLIO

				<p>whereas they claim that, of the 16, two were. So I think we have got to get some—</p> <p>Senator COLBECK: So it is a claim and counterclaim situation in that circumstance.</p> <p>Prof. Chubb: Isn't that what we are talking about?</p> <p>Senator COLBECK: Yes. And can you tell me from your knowledge which state of Australia faces the highest risk of projected sea level rise and flooding along our coastlines during this century because of climate change?</p> <p>Prof. Chubb: No, I cannot tell you that. Do you want to know? I could find out.</p> <p>Senator COLBECK: I would be interested if you would put that on the record for us, if you could take that on notice.</p> <p>Prof. Chubb: Yes.</p>	
AI-17	ANSTO	Ludlam	HIFAR Reactor	<p>Senator LUDLAM: If this is complex, perhaps you can table it, but can you provide me with a current timetable and order of works for the decommissioning of the former HIFAR reactor in the site?</p> <p>Dr Paterson: There is no formal decommissioning plan which has been adopted at the moment. As we indicated, I believe, at a previous estimates, there is a window of time in which we would like to begin that decommissioning process. A will take on notice the current status of how we are thinking about that window and when the works can begin.</p>	Page 27 15 February 2012
AI-18	ANSTO	Ludlam	HIFAR Reactor	<p>Senator LUDLAM: That is what I am going to come to now. Is it too early for me to ask you what the cost is going to be of pulling that facility apart?</p> <p>Dr Paterson: I think the engineering estimates for the moment can be tabled.</p> <p>Senator LUDLAM: Can be?</p> <p>Dr Paterson: But the level of certainty of those estimates improves over time. So there are significant contingencies that are not allocated to specific works at the moment. But we can table that number.</p> <p>Senator LUDLAM: I would greatly appreciate that, and we will not hold you to it. You have told us that there is obviously a range of latitude there.</p>	Page 27 15 February 2012
AI-19	ANSTO	Ludlam	Return of Waste	<p>Senator LUDLAM: On notice, if there has been any material change, tell me where I can find an accurate estimate of the volume and the activity of the waste that is scheduled to return and how that compares to the volume and the activity of the waste that is already stored [continues...]</p> <p>Senator EVANS: This is similar to a question that I have taken on notice for the senator in relation to the bill we are dealing with currently in the parliament. The full title escapes me but-</p> <p>Senator LUDLAM: It is in the Committee stage Minister</p>	Pages 28-29 15 February 2012

2012 SENATE ECONOMICS LEGISLATION COMMITTEE
QUESTIONS ON NOTICE – ADDITIONAL ESTIMATES – 15 FEBRUARY 2012
INDUSTRY, INNOVATION, SCIENCE, RESEARCH AND TERTIARY EDUCATION PORTFOLIO

				<p>Senator EVANS: Yes, I have taken it on notice and will reply when we resume the debate. I think it is more a question of whether someone can help you now with any basic information-</p> <p>Dr Paterson: I do not think we would provide any additional information at the moment. We would want to make a clear distinction between the different types of wastes and the volumes and activities. Therefore, we will take it on notice and consult with your office.</p>	
AI-20	ANSTO	Ludlam	Comcare Review	<p>Senator CAMERON: Dr Paterson, the Comcare review panel findings said that you still need to address your duty of care. What is your view on that, and what have you done about that?</p> <p>Dr Paterson: Can I ask for clarification of which Comcare review panel you mean?</p> <p>Senator CAMERON: This was a clarification of review panel findings listed on the Comcare website. Have you seen the Comcare website?</p> <p>Dr Paterson: We will clarify the source and take it on notice and provide a full reply.</p> <p>Senator CAMERON: Do you accept there was a concern by the review about how you operated your duty of care?</p> <p>Dr Paterson: I would say that, from the documents that I have read, which may not include the document that is on their website—it is the reports of the investigations and the reviews—and in the discussions we have had with Comcare, the operation of our duty of care to our employees has not been a substantial or significant matter. But I will review it and provide an answer on notice.</p> <p>Senator CAMERON: I am looking at a media release which was put out by Comcare on 21 July 2011. I am really surprised you have not seen that.</p> <p>Dr Paterson: I did see that news release, and I had subsequent discussions with Comcare about that, and I understood that that matter was closed between us and Comcare.</p> <p>Senator CAMERON: It might be, but I am raising the issue. I am raising the issue that one of the conclusions were that you had to improve your duty of care.</p> <p>Dr Paterson: I will take it on notice.</p>	Page 29 15 February 2012
AI-21	ANSTO	Colbeck	PETNET	<p>Senator COLBECK: In May of last year, Dr Paterson, you stated that investment in PETNET was \$12.5 million; at the last hearing in October the investment was confirmed to be \$17.2 million. In May of last year PETNET was reported to be profitable in two years; in October that story became that it was cash-flow positive. In May of last year the return on investment was 10 years; in</p>	Pages 29-30 15 February 2012

2012 SENATE ECONOMICS LEGISLATION COMMITTEE
QUESTIONS ON NOTICE – ADDITIONAL ESTIMATES – 15 FEBRUARY 2012
INDUSTRY, INNOVATION, SCIENCE, RESEARCH AND TERTIARY EDUCATION PORTFOLIO

				<p>October it became 15 years. Can you bring us up to speed with the current forecast for PETNET?</p> <p>Dr Paterson: The current forecast in terms of the 15 years remains unchanged. We review this as we come to the end of the financial year. The situation in the market is very dynamic at the moment, and we are seeking additional information about that. I would be in a position either to take on notice or to make a later presentation to this committee on some of the features of the marketplace which were not anticipated when we made the original investment.</p> <p>Senator COLBECK: Would those issues go to the impairment that caused the write-down of \$3 million?</p> <p>Dr Paterson: Those issues are at the heart of it.</p>	
AI-22	Manufacturing	Ryan	Car Industry Briefings	<p>Senator RYAN: I now turn to cars, Senator Carr and Dr Russell. Aside from the incoming ministerial brief that Minister Combet would have received following the reshuffle in December, how many written briefings has Mr Combet requested about the car industry?</p> <p>Mr Durrant: I will have to take that on notice. I don't have that information with me.</p> <p>Senator RYAN: Could you also supply the dates of those requests?</p> <p>Mr Durrant: Will do.</p>	Page 37 15 February 2012
AI-23	AusIndustry	Ryan	Green Car Innovation Fund	<p>Senator RYAN: I understand all of the applications for grants under the Green Car Innovation Fund would have been assessed by now. Is that correct?</p> <p>Mr Durrant: That is correct.</p> <p>Senator RYAN: Could you please tell me the date that the last of the applications was assessed?</p> <p>Mr Durrant: I will defer to my AusIndustry colleagues.</p> <p>Ms Kennedy: The final application was for a stream B grant, which, in addition to the assessment by Innovation Australia's Green Car Innovation Committee and Innovation Australia itself, was also required to be assessed by cabinet under the arrangements for the program. I don't believe I have the date of the actual cabinet meeting.</p> <p>Ms Butler: We can have a look for the date and will try to get back to you before the end of the session.</p> <p>Senator RYAN: That would be much appreciated. Is it possible to also get a simple list of dates of applications and when assessments were made going back through the program?</p> <p>Ms Kennedy: For those that were approved?</p> <p>Senator RYAN: Yes, for those that were approved.</p>	Page 37 15 February 2012

2012 SENATE ECONOMICS LEGISLATION COMMITTEE
QUESTIONS ON NOTICE – ADDITIONAL ESTIMATES – 15 FEBRUARY 2012
INDUSTRY, INNOVATION, SCIENCE, RESEARCH AND TERTIARY EDUCATION PORTFOLIO

				<p>Ms Kennedy: We can provide that. Ms Butler: We will see if we can do that again during the session.</p>	
AI-24	Manufacturing	Ryan	Automotive Transformation Scheme	<p>Senator RYAN: I appreciate that very much. Can I be told how much has been spent, in full, or committed and expended—and I appreciate the difference—on the ATS to date, including the capped and the uncapped amounts, in the capped and uncapped elements of the program? Senator RYAN: Is it possible to break that down into capped and uncapped? I am happy for you to take this on notice. Mr Sexton: It might be easier to take it on notice. Senator RYAN: Thank you, Mr Sexton. Mr Sexton: There are a lot of figures. Mr Lawson: As to that previous question you asked about the budget estimates for the capped and uncapped Automotive Transformation Scheme, if your staff look at page 44 of the PAES, that is where that is reported. Senator RYAN: And that just goes out to the budget forecast? Mr Lawson: The forward estimates, yes. Senator RYAN: Do you have any numbers beyond the forecast years? Mr Lawson: We want to take that on notice as to whether we release them— Senator RYAN: Sure. Mr Lawson: Because they are less reliable— Senator RYAN: I appreciate they are less reliable. But I appreciate there probably would not be a commercial in-confidence element to them. I would appreciate it if you would take that on notice.</p>	Pages 42-43 15 February 2012
AI-25	AusIndustry	Ryan	Automotive Transformation Scheme	<p>Mr Sexton: Senator, there are currently participating in the ATS program 163 businesses. Senator RYAN: Is that the number who are receiving assistance? Mr Sexton: Yes. Senator RYAN: Is there any difference between the numbers who are registered but not receiving any assistance? Mr Sexton: No. If you are registered for the program, you are receiving assistance. Senator RYAN: What is the total amount that has gone to motor vehicle producers out of the money that has been expended so far? I understand the way the program works is that there will be motor vehicle producers, effectively the big three, as well as components and others.</p>	Pages-44 15 February 2012

2012 SENATE ECONOMICS LEGISLATION COMMITTEE
QUESTIONS ON NOTICE – ADDITIONAL ESTIMATES – 15 FEBRUARY 2012
INDUSTRY, INNOVATION, SCIENCE, RESEARCH AND TERTIARY EDUCATION PORTFOLIO

				<p>Mr Sexton: Senator, I will have to take that on notice. There are two pools of funding within the program.</p> <p>Senator RYAN: Sure.</p>	
AI-26	Manufacturing	Ryan	Automotive Transformation Scheme	<p>Senator Carr: As a result of the parameter changes there is money available in the ATS which the government has made available to the industry for particular program initiatives. That is how we funded the Ford program.</p> <p>Senator RYAN: When was the decision made to change the arrangements within the ATS to use that uncapped element for other initiatives?</p> <p>Senator Carr: I would have to check the precise date, but it was in November of last year. It was a cabinet decision in November.</p> <p>Senator RYAN: Was an announcement made about those particular changes in policy?</p> <p>Senator Carr: We will check the precise date.</p>	Page 47 15 February 2012
AI-27	Manufacturing	Ryan	Automotive Transformation Scheme	<p>Senator RYAN: Do we have the criteria for the decision on Ford?</p> <p>Senator Carr: I beg your pardon?</p> <p>Senator RYAN: We have made one decision. I appreciate the details are in negotiation, but one decision has been made. You and cabinet have made a decision with respect to Ford. There were criteria for that. Can we have the criteria for that decision?</p> <p>Senator Carr: I will have to take on notice the method by which information can be provided. We just want to have a look at it in terms of negotiations that are currently underway regarding the contract.</p>	Page 49 15 February 2012
AI-28	Manufacturing	Ryan	Automotive Industry Structural Adjustment Program	<p>Senator RYAN: I appreciate that. Would you take on notice, please, one of the questions I was asking before the lunchbreak about the Automotive Industry Structural Adjustment Program? Can I have the amount of payments that have been made and to whom they have been made, if they are organisations, not individuals, over the course of the program?</p>	Page 49 15 February 2012
AI-29	Manufacturing	Cameron	Free-trade Agreements – Car Industry	<p>Senator CAMERON: Was there any analysis done in that US free trade agreement that factored in massive increases in their currency and the exchange rate between the two parties?</p> <p>Mr Durrant: It was before my time in automotive. I would have to take that on notice.</p>	Pages 54 15 February 2012

2012 SENATE ECONOMICS LEGISLATION COMMITTEE
QUESTIONS ON NOTICE – ADDITIONAL ESTIMATES – 15 FEBRUARY 2012
INDUSTRY, INNOVATION, SCIENCE, RESEARCH AND TERTIARY EDUCATION PORTFOLIO

AI-30	Manufacturing	Cameron	Downstream Employment	<p>Senator CAMERON: But manufacturing provides one of the biggest multiplier effects in terms of downstream employment, doesn't it?</p> <p>Senator Carr: Do we have a figure on that?</p> <p>Senator CAMERON: If you do not have it at hand, I am happy for you to come back with that.</p> <p>Mr Lawson: A range of estimates exist around the world on multipliers, and there are differences about whether you use them when you are talking about changes in employment or average levels. We can check for you just at the moment what the degree of integration between the mining sector and the manufacturing sector is and what direct inputs it has. I am pretty sure you are right that there is a higher direct input from that multiplier concept in manufacturing than there is in mining.</p>	Pages 54-55 15 February 2012
AI-31	Minister Carr's Office	Colbeck	Meetings with ALCOA	<p>Senator COLBECK: But I am asking you a question about whether you were made aware by Alcoa in October last year that its two Victorian aluminium smelters would be extremely exposed to carbon cost impacts and their economic viability was in doubt because of the carbon tax.</p> <p>Dr Byrne: The department can say that we are not aware of that correspondence or any information on that.</p> <p>Senator COLBECK: You are not aware of that? So, Minister, you are not aware of those either?</p> <p>Senator Carr: The department would have brought it to my attention and the department is not aware of that.</p> <p>Senator COLBECK: So, because the department is not aware, you are not aware?</p> <p>Senator Carr: I have indicated to you that I am aware of what was said at the time of the passage of the legislation. I have also said to you that I am aware of what has been said in regard to the recently announced review. Now you are saying that there is other correspondence. You are saying that correspondence was made available to me, are you?</p> <p>Senator COLBECK: No, I am asking you, and I will ask you now: on what dates from October onwards have you met personally with the company management of Alcoa?</p> <p>Senator Carr: I would have to check what date I met with Alcoa last. I met with people this week from Alcoa. I might have to take on notice whether or not there have been any other meetings with Alcoa.</p>	Page 57 15 February 2012

2012 SENATE ECONOMICS LEGISLATION COMMITTEE
QUESTIONS ON NOTICE – ADDITIONAL ESTIMATES – 15 FEBRUARY 2012
INDUSTRY, INNOVATION, SCIENCE, RESEARCH AND TERTIARY EDUCATION PORTFOLIO

				<p>Senator COLBECK: Can you recall how many meetings you would have had with them in your last two months as minister?</p> <p>Senator Carr: I would have to check that. I meet with a lot of companies.</p> <p>Senator COLBECK: I would hope that you do, but I would have thought you would have had some sense of the meetings that you might be having, particularly when dealing—</p> <p>Senator Carr: I have indicated to you that I will check the dates on which I have met with Alcoa.</p> <p>Senator COLBECK: But you cannot tell me how many times you would have met with them in the last two months of your being industry minister?</p> <p>Senator Carr: Not offhand.</p>	
AI-32	Higher Education	Colbeck	PICSE	<p>Senator COLBECK: I would like to put on the table a personal advocacy for both of those programs. PIEF is coming to the end of its funding in this budget cycle and PICSE likewise.</p> <p>Senator Chris Evans: Which is PICSE?</p> <p>Mr de Carvalho: PICSE we know about. That is the one that Professor Robson sponsors.</p> <p>Senator COLBECK: Associate Professor David Russell of PIEF—the Primary Industries Education Foundation—is currently being funded partly out of DAFF and through membership fees, which are quite meagre. The work they are doing is quite good, because they are producing curriculum materials to deal with some of the issues that I spoke about a moment ago. You are looking at getting agricultural curriculum materials into the education system more broadly, which I think is a very positive move. Having seen and spoken to some of the companies that associate with PISCE and also the students who have certainly had their career paths changed by association, I will just put a plug in for that too.</p> <p>Senator Chris Evans: We will give you a comprehensive answer as to where those things are up to. I do not know whether the department has yet informed the Senate committee inquiry as to the progress of that.</p> <p>Mr de Carvalho: Yes, we have.</p> <p>Senator Chris Evans: I will follow up and make sure that we have covered off that space as well.</p>	Page 69 15 February 2012
AI-33	Higher Education	Mason	University Fees	<p>Senator MASON: Can a schedule of the fees charged by each university in 2012 be provided to the committee? Are there any concession rates?</p> <p>Mr Warburton: Universities have a reasonable amount of discretion in how they charge fees. They can charge different categories of students different amounts of fees. They are required to charge part-time students less.</p>	Page 72-73 15 February 2012

2012 SENATE ECONOMICS LEGISLATION COMMITTEE
QUESTIONS ON NOTICE – ADDITIONAL ESTIMATES – 15 FEBRUARY 2012
INDUSTRY, INNOVATION, SCIENCE, RESEARCH AND TERTIARY EDUCATION PORTFOLIO

				<p>Senator MASON: How much less?</p> <p>Senator Chris Evans: I am sure it was in the legislation.</p> <p>Mr Warburton: It was in the guidelines.</p> <p>Senator MASON: It does not specify any particular amount.</p> <p>Mr Warburton: A part-time student is a student that does less than 75 per cent of a full-time load. A part-time student cannot be charged more than 75 per cent of the maximum that applies to a full-time student.</p> <p>Senator MASON: But they could be charged less?</p> <p>Mr Warburton: Yes. Universities like to do things in their own unique ways. You can find their student services and amenities fee schedules on their websites, but they are all quite different.</p> <p>Senator MASON: I understand that.</p> <p>Senator Chris Evans: I have an interest in our trying to combine the information to get a sense of what has happened across the board with the fees. I think that is your interest; I share it. We will take on notice what we can do to actually get that together.</p> <p>Senator MASON: Also, if it is possible, all 39 would be really good.</p> <p>Senator Chris Evans: Yes, I think the officer is reflecting the fact that this is the sort of information owned by the universities, but I think it is appropriate that we have that in a document so people can look at what has happened.</p>	
AI-34	Higher Education	Mason	University Fees	<p>Senator MASON: You may need to take this on notice, because, again, it is a question of detail and perhaps the information is not in. What number and percentage of university students commencing in first semester 2012—that is about now or very shortly—chose to pay the new fee up-front, because the government has allowed them to pay it through the HECS-HELP line? Do you have that?</p> <p>Mr Warburton: No.</p> <p>Senator MASON: A bit early, is it? A little bit early?</p> <p>Mr Warburton: Yes.</p> <p>Senator MASON: Can you take that on notice. If you can get me the information, that is great but, as I said, I will ask at budget estimates, so be prepared for me to ask you that in more detail in budget estimates.</p>	Page 73 15 February 2012
AI-35	Higher Education	Mason	Student Debt	<p>Senator MASON: I am not an economist, Dr Russell, but it does show the elasticity of demand for students to borrow. You cannot compare the US directly with Australia, but there is some comparison you could make about the elasticity of demand to put yourself in debt to pay for it. I am not saying it is a bad thing. I am not saying that. I am just saying it is an emerging issue and I think it is a</p>	Page 74 15 February 2012

2012 SENATE ECONOMICS LEGISLATION COMMITTEE
QUESTIONS ON NOTICE – ADDITIONAL ESTIMATES – 15 FEBRUARY 2012
INDUSTRY, INNOVATION, SCIENCE, RESEARCH AND TERTIARY EDUCATION PORTFOLIO

				<p>growing one.</p> <p>.....</p> <p>Senator MASON: No. I am just thinking about what policy options the government is looking at. I am just thinking this might be something the government is looking at, but I am not going to ask you that. Let us not go there now. It is a discussion for another time. We have not got the time. Is it possible for the department to provide the committee with—even making some assumptions—what the average debt would be, Mr Griew, by 2025, assuming the Bradley target is met?</p> <p>Mr de Carvalho: We can certainly think about what such a task might entail and the nature of the assumptions that would be required to be made in order to produce a meaningful result. I cannot necessarily commit that we will be able to do that, but we will certainly take that task on notice.</p>	
AI-36	Skills Group	Rhiannon	Roundtable Meetings	<p>Senator Chris Evans: This is obviously a negotiation with the states, so there is some sense of confidentiality although the Commonwealth has made its objectives very clear both through the Prime Minister, me and through Mr Griew. But I can say that I was concerned about the lack of transparency about these processes in the past, particularly the lack of engagement with key stakeholders in these things. The public service or the Commonwealth and the states meet in what used to be smoke-filled rooms—of course, they are now smoke-free rooms—and batter out a deal and they all come out and claim victory either for the Commonwealth or the states without much input from others.</p> <p>I have engaged with industry, as has the department, including people like TAFE directors and the TAFE unions, to have a few roundtables to try to engage people as we develop our position, which is not to say they will be at the final negotiation. But as Mr Griew can outline, we have had a range of engagements to try to make sure that whatever the final negotiated agreements are it actually meets industry's needs and protects the vital public investment in things like the TAFE system, which I am very keen to preserve, because I always acknowledge the fact that the TAFEs provide means of access for rural and regional students, low socioeconomic students, women and migrants in a way that many others do not. They also provide access for capital intensive courses and they are a bedrock of our vocational education system. I want to make it very clear that this government is not at all interested in downgrading or reducing the role of the TAFE system, but we are keen to make sure that we make improvements in the training system if we are going to meet the needs of our emerging economy and make sure we have enough skilled people. Quite frankly, there is need for a</p>	<p style="text-align: center;">Page 81 15 February 2012</p>

2012 SENATE ECONOMICS LEGISLATION COMMITTEE
QUESTIONS ON NOTICE – ADDITIONAL ESTIMATES – 15 FEBRUARY 2012
INDUSTRY, INNOVATION, SCIENCE, RESEARCH AND TERTIARY EDUCATION PORTFOLIO

				<p>reform agenda, and we will be pursuing that.</p> <p>Senator RHIANNON: You mentioned that there have been meetings with some of the groups involved. Could you provide details of those meetings and who attended?</p> <p>Senator Chris Evans: We can give you some of them. Obviously, my office is constantly in touch with a range of groups as well in a more informal sense. Did we formally call them roundtables?</p> <p>Mr Griew: The minister convened a roundtable, which had not individual sectors but all of them together—all the ones he just mentioned—and we have backed that up with that group again a couple of times. Skills Australia convened a very large meeting of industry stakeholders and senior officers from states and ourselves have held meetings in most capital cities now with regional—</p>	
AI-37	TEQSA	Mason	University of Queensland	<p>Senator MASON: That is an excellent explanation to the committee. Thank you for that. With respect to this particular case—I appreciate that you cannot go into it—have you written to the university and asked them to, in a sense, explain what they have done?</p> <p>Dr Nicoll: It is on the public record that I wrote a letter to them. I can get the date for you if you want me to, but it is some months ago, at the end of last year. It is accessible through FOI on our website because an FOI proposal was put to us and we are in a position to disclose that to anybody who requests it.</p> <p>Senator MASON: If you could disclose it to the committee when it is possible, then that would be appreciated.</p> <p>Dr Nicoll: We would be happy to do that.</p>	Page 85 15 February 2012
AI-38	TEQSA	Rhiannon	TEQSA fee schedule	<p>Senator RHIANNON: I understand that prior to the establishment of TEQSA there was concern raised about its fee schedule, given the full cost recovery model in place. What concerns have been raised about TEQSA fees and by which type of providers?</p> <p>Dr Nicoll: I would like to correct you first of all. We do not have a full cost recovery regime to implement. The way TEQSA has been set up is partial cost recovery. We have put out a fee schedule on 29 January after consultation with the sector, given the fact that cost recovery should be based on an understanding of how costs are derived. We are a brand new agency; we have no data of what the costs are going to be and how we would go about activity costing those. We have had to use historical data, including basing it on the fees of the states and territories, but it is very important to recognise that many of the states and territories significantly subsidised their approaches to this and were not working on full cost recovery. In some states it is fair to say that our fees will be higher.</p>	Page 87 15 February 2012

2012 SENATE ECONOMICS LEGISLATION COMMITTEE
QUESTIONS ON NOTICE – ADDITIONAL ESTIMATES – 15 FEBRUARY 2012
INDUSTRY, INNOVATION, SCIENCE, RESEARCH AND TERTIARY EDUCATION PORTFOLIO

				<p>There are other states that were full cost recovery attempted, they were much higher than what we have set.</p> <p>In response to the feedback we had we made changes to the draft schedule that we put out for consultation and we have undertaken to review the fee schedule later next year, after we have had a good year of actual operations—and we will be collecting data from now about how our operations work. It may be that the sector is either pleasantly or unpleasantly surprised by the outcome of that, but we will undertake a review.</p> <p>Senator RHIANNON: So there is no particular grouping that is complaining at the moment? Is it the case that we have not got to that stage?</p> <p>Dr Nicoll: We had responses. I can actually go through them.</p> <p>Senator RHIANNON: I am not asking you to do it now. I was trying to see the trends. I am trying to get my head around how all this works. Is there any particular group in your providers that is exploring this with you and raising concerns?</p> <p>Dr Nicoll: Given the time restraints of the committee, I would be happy to take it on notice and we could give you a summary of the issues that were raised through the consultation. We would be very happy to provide you with those.</p>	
AI-39	AQSA	Bushby	ASQA fee schedule	<p>Senator BUSHBY: Thank you. I will move on in view of the limited amount of time. Senator Rhiannon asked some questions about the cost recovery model. I noted that the intention is to get to 85 per cent by the end of the forward estimates. You are doing that, as I understand it, by ramping up the fees over time to achieve that end; is that correct?</p> <p>Mr C Robinson: Yes. A fee schedule was published when ASQA commenced. It followed the department running quite an extensive consultation process with stakeholders, RTOs and the like about the fees. In most cases the fees are higher than the fees that were charged by previous state regulators, but not in all cases.</p> <p>Senator BUSHBY: That is what I was going to ask you. Is it possible—and I am happy for this to be on notice, given the time—to provide a breakdown of how these fees compare with what did exist beforehand?</p> <p>Mr C Robinson: Yes, we can provide that on notice. We have the details.</p>	Page 91 15 February 2012
AI-40	AQSA	Bushby	AQSA Employee Levels	<p>Senator BUSHBY: How many employees currently work for ASQA?</p> <p>Mr C Robinson: We have about 110 or 112 at the moment. We are in the process of being established. As you may be aware, Queensland, Tasmania and South Australia are currently in the process of coming across to ASQA and the issues are going through their parliaments as we speak.</p> <p>Senator BUSHBY: When are those states expected to be fully referred?</p>	Page 91-92 15 February 2012

2012 SENATE ECONOMICS LEGISLATION COMMITTEE
QUESTIONS ON NOTICE – ADDITIONAL ESTIMATES – 15 FEBRUARY 2012
INDUSTRY, INNOVATION, SCIENCE, RESEARCH AND TERTIARY EDUCATION PORTFOLIO

				<p>Mr C Robinson: We are expecting them to be referred before the end of the financial year. In the case of Tasmania the legislation has been through both houses of parliament and the proclamation was due to occur today. That will include notification of an actual referral date, which we are expecting to be in the next couple of months. Queensland has listed the referral in its parliamentary sittings this week. It has been through its committee stages and hopefully that legislation will go through this week. Similarly, South Australia has also got its legislation listed this week for sittings, and so we are getting to the final stages of those referrals with those states.</p> <p>Senator BUSHBY: That is good. In respect of the employees—and if you would take this on notice it would be fine as well—can you provide a breakdown of their APS levels? Not by name, but just in terms of how many of each.</p> <p>Mr C Robinson: We could, yes.</p>	
AI-41	AQSA	Bushby	Remuneration for Michael Lavarch	<p>Senator BUSHBY: What would be the total remuneration payable to the commissioner of risk analysis and investigation, Mr Michael Lavarch?</p> <p>Mr C Robinson: We will take that on notice. We are just not too sure of the exact amount.</p> <p>Senator BUSHBY: If you could provide that.</p> <p>Mr C Robinson: It would be a lesser amount.</p> <p>Senator Chris Evans: He has not commenced.</p> <p>Mr C Robinson: He is commencing in April.</p> <p>Senator BUSHBY: Do you know what date in April?</p> <p>Mr C Robinson: He is due to commence on 16 April.</p> <p>Mr Griew: The answer to that question will, of course, be determined by a remuneration tribunal determination that sets the remuneration for all three of the commissioners.</p> <p>Mr C Robinson: It is already published on the website. We will provide you with the information.</p>	Page 92 15 February 2012
AI-42	Higher Education	McKenzie	Regional Universities	What support does the department provide specifically for regional university campuses?	Written Question 21 February 2012
AI-43	Higher Education	McKenzie	Skills Shortages	What programs, if any, do you run that encourage tertiary students to choose a particular pathway, for example, to address particular skill shortages?	Written Question 21 February 2012

2012 SENATE ECONOMICS LEGISLATION COMMITTEE
QUESTIONS ON NOTICE – ADDITIONAL ESTIMATES – 15 FEBRUARY 2012
INDUSTRY, INNOVATION, SCIENCE, RESEARCH AND TERTIARY EDUCATION PORTFOLIO

AI-44	Higher Education	McKenzie	Skills Shortages	Do any of these programs include agricultural education? Could they?	Written Question 21 February 2012
AI-45	Higher Education	McKenzie	Future Skills Requirements	Is there any overall consideration or oversight of the course options available at Australian universities in the context of adequately meeting future skills requirements?	Written Question 21 February 2012
AI-46	Skills Group	McKenzie	Regional Skills Shortages	What is the department doing to address regional skill shortages in non-mining areas? For example, there are no tertiary education options in the Buloke Shire in Victoria, and they are now in a situation where many many younger people have left to pursue educational opportunities and the average age of local farmers is 59.	Written Question 21 February 2012
AI-47	Higher Education	McKenzie	Practical Experience in Regional Areas	Are there any programs that encourage tertiary students to seek practical experience, such as a medical internship, in a regional area? Where can students find out more about these programs? How successful are these programs?	Written Question 21 February 2012
AI-48	CSIRO	McKenzie	Chief Plant Scientist	I understand that DAFF have decided to have their Chief Plant Scientist 'job share' with CSIRO. How will this work? In what ways can the roles be combined? What work is being cut to enable this?	Written Question 21 February 2012
AI-49	ARC	Bushby	Centre of Excellence for the History of Emotions	How much money has been allocated to the Centre of Excellence for the History of Emotions and over what period? What process does the centre have to go through in order to secure further funding beyond that time period? How many people are employed by the centre? How much did it cost to fund the 'Hearts and Stones' project? How is it decided what amount of funding a project is allocated? Do participants have to meet any cost analysis benchmarks?	Written Question 22 February 2012
AI-50	Manufacturing	Boyce	Subsidies to car manufacturers	From November 2007 to November 2011, almost 100,000 jobs have been lost from the manufacturing sector. Since November 2007, would you please outline what subsidies car manufacturers have received? How many of those manufacturers have since closed down? How many are threatening to close down? What analysis has the department undertaken on the impact of unions on the car manufacturing sector, particularly as this is a sector directly subsidised by the taxpayer?	Written Question 23 February 2012

2012 SENATE ECONOMICS LEGISLATION COMMITTEE
QUESTIONS ON NOTICE – ADDITIONAL ESTIMATES – 15 FEBRUARY 2012
INDUSTRY, INNOVATION, SCIENCE, RESEARCH AND TERTIARY EDUCATION PORTFOLIO

AI-51	Skills Group	Back	National VET Guarantee	<p>Has either the Department or the Minister received correspondence from any state or territory, indicating concerns about the National VET Guarantee? If so, which states? What are their main concerns? Have any indicated that they will not be signing up to the Agreement as it currently stands?</p>	Written Question 23 February 2012
AI-52	Higher Education	Nash	Higher Education Base Funding Review	<p>Refer to Weekly Times story `Agriculture course fees to rise'. http://www.weeklytimesnow.com.au/article/2012/01/09/427881_latest-news.html The report refers to the Higher Education Base Funding Review recommendation for a 40:60 student/govt funding ratio. http://www.deewr.gov.au/HigherEducation/Policy/BaseReview/Documents/HigherEd_FundingReviewReport.pdf It specifically refers to a resulting 25 per cent increase in student fees for agricultural courses, that farming groups such as Victorian Farmers' Federation say will worsen the skills shortage in agriculture. <u>Victorian Farmers Federation</u> Young Agribusiness Professionals committee chairman Aaron Sanderson is quoted in the Weekly Times saying the Higher Education Base Funding Review recommendation would have a detrimental impact on future enrolments. He says increasing fees for agricultural courses when the industry is already experiencing a lack of skilled workers is ridiculous and that it will place further limits on those who want to get an agricultural degree.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Does the govt/dept intend to monitor enrolments in courses where there is an evident skills shortage within the related sector, such as agriculture, to ensure enrolments don't decline further because of increased costs. • Has it, or will it seek advice and consult farming groups such as the NFF on this finding? <p>On skills shortages, the report states: <i><u>the Panel found no compelling evidence that lowering student contributions for the purpose of increasing enrolments in areas of skills shortages has any significant impact. Fee reductions for this purpose should therefore be removed.... (executive summary, pg xiv)</u></i></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Does the dept know what evidence this is based on? <p>Minister Evans states in his media release (dated 8 Dec 2011) http://www.ministers.deewr.gov.au/evans/base-funding-review-report-released there will be <i>targeted consultation with stakeholders who will have an</i></p>	Written Question 23 February 2012

2012 SENATE ECONOMICS LEGISLATION COMMITTEE
QUESTIONS ON NOTICE – ADDITIONAL ESTIMATES – 15 FEBRUARY 2012
INDUSTRY, INNOVATION, SCIENCE, RESEARCH AND TERTIARY EDUCATION PORTFOLIO

				<p><i>opportunity to provide their feedback on the report and express their priorities for the future at roundtable discussions to be held in February and March 2012’.</i></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Can the dept detail the consultation process and will it go to regional centres? <p>The media release also states the government <i>‘intends to consider its response to the Review following the consultations and expects to commence its response in the course of 2012.’</i></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Can the dept give a more specific timeline for when the govt will announce its response. 	
AI-53	Higher Education	Nash	<p>Cancellation of UWS’s Agriculture Course</p>	<p>Refer to ABC AM story regarding the cancellation of UWS’s agriculture course at the Hawkesbury campus. http://www.abc.net.au/am/content/2012/s3428900.htm The story is on the cancellation of the course this year with student numbers falling from what used to be about 80 students a year to less than 10 enrolments this year. Professor Jim Pratley from the Australian Council of Deans of Agriculture (ACDA) is interviewed and comments on students’ lack of interest in pursuing agriculture as a career.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • What programs does the government have in place to <u>specifically</u> address the shortage of agriculture graduates • What is <u>specifically</u> being done by the govt to encourage students to study agriculture at a tertiary level and pursue it as a career • Has or would the govt consider ACDA’s proposal for student scholarships for prospective students. (<u>NOTE</u>: ACDA says scholarships for other careers seem to be more attractive than any for agriculture.) • Has or would the govt consider improving conditions and career paths for research students and early researchers as called for by ACDA. (<u>NOTE</u>: ACDA says the latter are on short term soft money and thus there is high attrition out of the industry. PhD stipends are not competitive with industry salaries and hence the best students are not encouraged to stay with research) • What role if any is the government is playing in promoting 2012 as the Year of the Farmer and more broadly agriculture and related industries and as a future career opportunity • Has it been considered that the Prime Minister take a high profile stance on promoting agriculture and related industries during the Year of the Farmer (as the Governor-General has done) as the Prime Minister of 	Written Question 23 February 2012

2012 SENATE ECONOMICS LEGISLATION COMMITTEE
QUESTIONS ON NOTICE – ADDITIONAL ESTIMATES – 15 FEBRUARY 2012
INDUSTRY, INNOVATION, SCIENCE, RESEARCH AND TERTIARY EDUCATION PORTFOLIO

				<p>Australia, to help raise awareness of not just the contribution of agriculture to the economy but as an industry with exciting career opportunities.</p> <p><u>NOTE:</u> Senator Nash touched on this issue during estimates but due to time constraints the questions above were not asked.</p>	
AI-54	Higher Education	Nash	Places at Regional Universities	<p>Refer to Nine MSN story `More uni offers in demand-driven system'. http://news.ninemsn.com.au/national/8405601/more-uni-offers-in-demand-driven-system</p> <p>It refers to extra places being offered to students at NSW and ACT universities as a result of the govt removing the cap on the number of uni places that it will fund from this year.</p> <p>Minister Evans is quoted saying data from state-based tertiary admissions centres indicates there is strong demand from students for uni courses.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • How much demand is there is for uni places at regional universities • Is there a breakdown per regional uni and courses if possible 	Written Question 23 February 2012
AI-55	Higher Education	Nash	Financial Assistance to Tertiary Students	<p><u>Refer to ICPA letter to Senator Evans dated 10/10/11</u> (copied to Senator Nash) regarding the need for financial assistance to tertiary students who have to relocate to do clinical placements, block releases and practicums as part of their course.</p> <p>Students doing certain course that require placements face additional financial hardship in paying for travel and accommodation while away, as well as rent on their usual place of residence.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Can the dept confirm that the govt provides assistance to apprentices and trainees when required to attend training away from home (as claimed by ICPA) • Is there any assistance at all for tertiary students who have to travel to clinical placements. If not, how come. 	Written Question 23 February 2012
AI-56	Higher Education	Nash	Independent Youth Allowance	<p>Refer to QON response from Budget Supplementary estimates in October regarding independent youth allowance. http://www.aph.gov.au/Senate/committee/eet_ctte/estimates/sup_1112/answers/EW0647_12.pdf</p> <p>The dept was asked to explain the need for the \$150,000 parental income test for <u>independent</u> youth allowance when the purpose of the criteria is for students to prove they're `independent'.</p> <p>The dept responded that it ensures the available assistance is directed at those regional families and students who need it the most.</p>	Written Question 23 February 2012

2012 SENATE ECONOMICS LEGISLATION COMMITTEE
QUESTIONS ON NOTICE – ADDITIONAL ESTIMATES – 15 FEBRUARY 2012
INDUSTRY, INNOVATION, SCIENCE, RESEARCH AND TERTIARY EDUCATION PORTFOLIO

				<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Can the dept explain how students on independent youth allowance differ in their circumstances if they are all required to work and earn an income (without financial help from their family) to prove their independence. Are they not all in the same boat? • Why does the dept determine the threshold based on gross salary which, once taxed, the take-home pay is significantly lower. • Does the dept acknowledge the net salary is more transparent of real living costs and pressures faced by families trying to educate their children? • Can the dept provide data of eligibility for independent youth allowance for regional students before the \$150K parental income test was introduced and since the income test was introduced. If not, provide an explanation as to why this data doesn't exist. <p><u>NOTE:</u> Senator Nash touched on this issue but due time constraints could not ask more detailed questions as above.</p>	
AI-57	Higher Education	Nash	Parental Assets Test – Youth Allowance	<p><u>Refer to ICPA letter to Senator Evans dated 24/10/11</u> (copied to Senator Nash) regarding concerns about the parental assets test that is applies for <u>dependent</u> youth allowance. The ICPA highlights the problem in which farming income may be low but parental business assets are over the threshold.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Does the dept give any consideration to variable factors that preclude selling business assets to create cash flow such as: <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Some farming businesses cannot sell land due to conditions of their occupation of land ie pastoral leases 2. Farm machinery is included in the assets test but is required to earn an income 3. Irrigation assets during the drought have been largely unsaleable and produced little to nil income but are still a farming asset within the business. These assets need to be assessed according to the current market value at the time of applying for youth allowance. • Does the dept acknowledge the ICPA member concerns that the parental asset threshold is too low and does not realistically reflect the actual circumstances of most farming families where high land and machinery prices are taken into asset calculation but generate minimum to low incomes. • Would it consider raising the threshold to a more realistic level? 	Written Question 23 February 2012

2012 SENATE ECONOMICS LEGISLATION COMMITTEE
QUESTIONS ON NOTICE – ADDITIONAL ESTIMATES – 15 FEBRUARY 2012
INDUSTRY, INNOVATION, SCIENCE, RESEARCH AND TERTIARY EDUCATION PORTFOLIO

AI-58	Higher Education	Nash	Regional Students – Youth Allowance	<p>Various Labor MPs early this year issued media releases detailing the number of regional students to benefit from changes to the independent youth allowance criteria for inner regional students starting 1 January this year. http://www.ministers.deewr.gov.au/evans/regional-students-benefit-youth-allowance-changes Can the dept provide a breakdown of the number of regional students to benefit from the changes per electorate.</p>	Written Question 23 February 2012
AI-59	Skills Group	Nash	National Skills Needs List	<p>Refer to reply to Budget Supplementary estimates Question on Notice regarding the National Skills Needs List (NSNL). http://www.aph.gov.au/Senate/committee/eet_ctte/estimates/sup_1112/answers/EW0638_12.pdf</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Can the dept provide a copy of the NSNL prior to November 2007. • The dept states it will review its skill shortage occupational coverage when data is available from the 2011 census which is expected to be provided by the ABS in late 2012 – is there a more specific timeframe for when this census data will be available? <p>The dept's own Skills Shortage website lists, under Technicians and Trade Workers, 'agricultural technicians' as an occupation in which there is a shortage. http://www.deewr.gov.au/Employment/LMI/SkillShortages/Documents/SSL_AUS.pdf</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Given the list was last collated in 2010-11, is this shortage of agricultural technicians still the case? • If so, why is it not listed on the National Skills Needs List? (NOTE: 'technicians and trade workers at skill level 3 are part of the NSNL criteria). <p>Agrifood Skills Australia states in its submission to the Victorian Parliament's Inquiry into Agricultural Education and Training in Victoria http://www.parliament.vic.gov.au/images/stories/committees/etc/Past_Inquiries/AEV_Inquiry/Submissions/51_Agrifood_Skills_Australia_300911.pdf (page 3) states 'the industry faces a looming crisis in several sectors' due to a number of challenges including an ageing workforce; the scale of both high skilled and <u>lower skilled</u> labour shortages will accelerate in severity in the near future and longer term; and the potential risk that between 2013 and 2018, Australia's regional workforce will become depleted beyond critical mass. The submission (page 4) makes a number of recommended actions including</p>	Written Question 23 February 2012

2012 SENATE ECONOMICS LEGISLATION COMMITTEE
QUESTIONS ON NOTICE – ADDITIONAL ESTIMATES – 15 FEBRUARY 2012
INDUSTRY, INNOVATION, SCIENCE, RESEARCH AND TERTIARY EDUCATION PORTFOLIO

				<p>attracting and retaining workers at skilled and semi-skilled levels; <u>build skilled and robust labour pools</u> in cooperation with industries in regional areas; and <u>fill the demand for technician</u> and para professional roles.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Why are these challenges and recommendations not reflected in the occupations listed in the National Skills Needs List? 	
AI-60	Skills Group	Nash	Agrifood Skills Australia	<p>The Agriculture Minister, Joe Ludwig, states in his submission to a Victorian Parliament Inquiry into Agricultural Education and Training that the Primary Industries Ministerial Council invited Agrifood Skills Australia to develop a Regional Agrifood Skills and Workforce Development Strategy looking at skills and workforce issues.</p> <p>http://www.parliament.vic.gov.au/images/stories/committees/etc/Past_Inquiries/AEV_Inquiry/Submissions/20_Senator_Joe_Ludwig.pdf</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Can the dept state where that strategy is at and when it will be released. 	Written Question 23 February 2012
AI-61	Skills Group	Nash	COAG Reform Council Report	<p>Refer to Nine MSN story `Skilled workforce increases: report' regarding COAG Reform Council report released last November on the skilled workforce target for 2020.</p> <p>http://news.ninemsn.com.au/national/8372180/skilled-workforce-increases-report (NOTE: report unavailable on website http://www.coagreformcouncil.gov.au/timeframes.cfm)</p> <p>The story states the Reform Council warned the long-term trends showed the 2020 target of only 23.6 per cent of the workforce not having a minimum qualification would not be met.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • What is the dept's response, does it agree or not? <p>The minister, Chris Evans, is quoted saying he was pleased skills increases had occurred in the most disadvantaged socio-economic areas.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Can the dept elaborate on this, what areas are they (ie. regional/rural/remote communities?) <p>The story states that while the amount of people gaining skills has improved, the report found the percentage of those new vocational education and training graduates who found jobs fell for the second year in a row. Just 76.3 per cent of VET graduates in 2010 were employed after their training.</p> <p>What per cent of these came from regional, rural and remote areas?</p>	Written Question 23 February 2012
AI-62	CSIRO	Bernardi	Global Warming	<p>(a) At what point in time did the CSIRO move from using the term 'global warming' to using 'climate change'?</p> <p>(b) How was this decision made?</p> <p>(c) Why was this decision made?</p>	Written Question 24 February 2012

2012 SENATE ECONOMICS LEGISLATION COMMITTEE
QUESTIONS ON NOTICE – ADDITIONAL ESTIMATES – 15 FEBRUARY 2012
INDUSTRY, INNOVATION, SCIENCE, RESEARCH AND TERTIARY EDUCATION PORTFOLIO

AI-63	CSIRO	Bernardi	Rising Sea Levels	(a) In 1987 it was reported that a CSIRO expert had forecast “that by the year 2020 world temperatures would rise from one to six degrees, increasing ocean levels from one to 18 metres.” (‘Dire warnings about our fragile protective blanket’, <i>Sunday Tasmanian</i> , 8 February 1987, p.15). Does the CSIRO stand by this claim made by one of its own? If not, how does the CSIRO explain the failure of its prediction methods?	Written Question 24 February 2012
AI-64	CSIRO	Bernardi	Snow Cover	(a) In May 2008 CSIRO’s Dr Penny Whetton warned that mountain snow cover in Australia could be reduced by up to 54 per cent by 2020 (‘Global warming to shorten ski season: CSIRO’, ABC News, 28 May 2008). Yet reports state that the last few years have seen great skiing conditions on our mountains (for example: Arthur Stanley, ‘2m mark in our sights’, <i>Daily Telegraph</i> blog, 31 July 2008 and Nathan Mawby, ‘It’s a chiller thriller at ski resorts this Queen’s Birthday long weekend’, <i>Herald Sun</i> , 11 June 2011). Given these conditions, and that 2020 is now only eight years away, does the CSIRO still stand by Dr Whetton’s prediction? If not, how does the CSIRO explain the failure of its prediction methods?	Written Question 24 February 2012
AI-65	CSIRO	Bernardi	Rising Sea Levels	(a) What is the CSIRO’s response to the work by Phil Watson (published in the <i>Journal of Coastal Research</i> in 2011 and reported by <i>The Australian</i> on 22 July 2011), that finds that sea level rises are decelerating? What does this research say about the CSIRO’s predictions regarding sea-level rises?	Written Question 24 February 2012
AI-66	CSIRO	Bernardi	Rising Sea Levels	(a) What has been the average sea level rise over the last 25 years? (b) How does this compare with sea level rise over the past 100 years?	Written Question 24 February 2012
AI-67	CSIRO	Bernardi	Global Temperature	In terms of global temperature, what has been the hottest year in the last century?	Written Question 24 February 2012
AI-68	CSIRO	Bernardi	‘State of the Climate’ leaflet	The CSIRO’s leaflet ‘State of the Climate’ (released 5 July 2010) includes a map from the Bureau of Meteorology about the trend in annual rainfall from 1960-2009, to illustrate that “the geographic distribution of rainfall has changed significantly over the past 50 years.” Why did the CSIRO not choose the trend in annual rainfall map from 1900-2009, which is also available from the Bureau of Meteorology? This map indicates that much of Australia actually got wetter from 1900-2009. Link to State of the Climate leaflet: http://www.csiro.au/Outcomes/Climate/Understanding/State-of-the-Climature.aspx	Written Question 24 February 2012

2012 SENATE ECONOMICS LEGISLATION COMMITTEE
QUESTIONS ON NOTICE – ADDITIONAL ESTIMATES – 15 FEBRUARY 2012
INDUSTRY, INNOVATION, SCIENCE, RESEARCH AND TERTIARY EDUCATION PORTFOLIO

AI-69	CSIRO	Bernardi	Comments made by Dr Whetton – An Inconvenient Truth	In 2006 the CSIRO’s Dr Penny Whetton said the following of <i>An Inconvenient Truth</i> : “Its scientific basis is very sound.” (‘An Inconvenient Truth or opportunism? You decide’, <i>The Age</i> , 9 Sept 2006). Given that since then a number of errors have been found in <i>An Inconvenient Truth</i> (such as the judge in the UK’s High Court 2007 ruling on nine erroneous statements in the film) does the CSIRO stand by the comment made in 2006 by Dr Whetton?	Written Question 24 February 2012
AI-70	CSIRO	Bernardi	Comments made by Professor Flannery – Cooling trend	On <i>Lateline</i> on 23 November 2009, the government’s head of the Climate Change Commission, Professor Tim Flannery, said: “for the last few years we have gone through a slight cooling trend” and “What Kevin Trenberth, one of the most respected climate scientist in the world, is saying is, ‘We have to get on our horses and find out what we don’t know about the system, we have to understand why the cooling is occurring, because the current modelling doesn’t reflect it’. And that’s the way science progresses, we can’t pretend to have perfect knowledge, we don’t.” (a) Does the CSIRO agree with these statements made by Professor Flannery? If so, how does the CSIRO account for the cooling given that CO ₂ levels have rapidly risen in the past 10 years?	Written Question 24 February 2012
AI-71	ASQA	Payne	ASQA accreditation applications	Can the Department provide advice of the details of the process of application, audit, and approval, including all stages of the process and timeframes/time limits, involved in an organisation seeking ASQA accreditation?	Written Question 24 February 2012
AI-72	ASQA	Payne	ASQA accreditation applications	Can the Department provide details of the number and proportion of applications that require amendment following lodgement in order to meet the ASQA accreditation application requirements, the number and proportion of these that have then been rejected, either on their merits or due to the delays causing time limits to be exceeded?	Written Question 24 February 2012
AI-73	ASQA	Payne	ASQA accreditation applications	Can the Department advise of the average processing time, by jurisdiction, for applications for ASQA accreditation since July 1 2011 that have been accepted, rejected or required amendments by the applicant? Can the Department also provide details of the number and proportion of applications that have required amendment?	Written Question 24 February 2012
AI-74	ASQA	Payne	ASQA accreditation applications	Can the Department advise what its targets are for the length of time to finalise the assessment of applications for ASQA accreditation, and what length of time the Department would consider is an excessive amount of time to finalise an application?	Written Question 24 February 2012

2012 SENATE ECONOMICS LEGISLATION COMMITTEE
QUESTIONS ON NOTICE – ADDITIONAL ESTIMATES – 15 FEBRUARY 2012
INDUSTRY, INNOVATION, SCIENCE, RESEARCH AND TERTIARY EDUCATION PORTFOLIO

AI-75	ASQA	Payne	ASQA accreditation applications	In the event that ASQA requires an applicant make amendments to its application, what time limits are involved for those amendments to be made, and are any time limits restarted in the event that ASQA requires further amendments?	Written Question 24 February 2012
AI-76	ASQA	Payne	ASQA accreditation applications	What advice and assistance is available to applicants for ASQA accreditation in the preparation of applications, in particular in relation to meeting ASQA application guidelines?	Written Question 24 February 2012
AI-77	ASQA	Payne	ASQA accreditation applications	What processes are available to applicants for ASQA accreditation to ascertain the progress of their application?	Written Question 24 February 2012
AI-78	ASQA	Payne	ASQA accreditation applications	Does the Department have any appeal process for firms that have their applications for ASQA accreditation rejected? In the event that an application is wrongly rejected, or inordinately delayed due to processing times, is there any avenue for the applicant to seek compensation?	Written Question 24 February 2012
AI-79	CSIRO	Bushby	CSIRO Board – Conflict of Interest	Since 1 January 2008, on how many separate occasions has a CSIRO Board member absented themselves from discussion at a Board meeting on the grounds of a real or potential conflict of interest?	Written Question 24 February 2012
AI-80	CSIRO	Bushby	CSIRO Board – Conflict of Interest	Since 1 January 2008, at the beginning of how many Board meetings has any Board member declared and/or had documented any potential conflict of interest both generally and relating to an item to be considered at the meeting? If there have been any such instances, on what date(s) has this happened in each case – and what have been the subjects to which these conflicts of interest have respectively related?	Written Question 24 February 2012
AI-81	CSIRO	Bushby	Dr Clark – Conflict of Interest	On how many occasions has Dr Clark absented herself from discussion at a Board meeting on the grounds of a real or potential conflict of interest? And, if there have been any such occasions, on what date(s) has this happened in each case?	Written Question 24 February 2012
AI-82	CSIRO	Bushby	Dr Clark – Conflict of Interest	At the beginning of how many Board meetings has Dr Clark declared and/or had documented any potential conflict of interest both generally and relating to an item to be considered at the meeting? If there have been any such instances, on what date(s) has this happened in each case – and what have been the subjects to which these conflicts of interest have respectively related?	Written Question 24 February 2012
AI-83	CSIRO	Bushby	Dr Clark – Conflict of Interest	Has the property Dr Clark owns in Western Australia been disclosed as part of her conflict of interest declarations? If yes, on what date did she purchase the property and on what date was the interest disclosed? If not, why not?	Written Question 24 February 2012

2012 SENATE ECONOMICS LEGISLATION COMMITTEE
QUESTIONS ON NOTICE – ADDITIONAL ESTIMATES – 15 FEBRUARY 2012
INDUSTRY, INNOVATION, SCIENCE, RESEARCH AND TERTIARY EDUCATION PORTFOLIO

AI-84	CSIRO	Bushby	Public Research Agency Charter	Is there any recourse for someone other than the Minister or CSIRO management to take action where they believe someone is in breach of the Public Research Agency Charter? Or is it only self-administered?	Written Question 24 February 2012
AI-85	CSIRO	Bushby	Code of Conduct	How many CSIRO employees have been formally disciplined for breaching the Code of Conduct since 1 January 2008?	Written Question 24 February 2012
AI-86	CSIRO	Bushby	Public Research Agency Charter	How many CSIRO employees have been found to have breached the Public Research Agency Charter since its adoption – and how many of these have been formally disciplined for doing so?	Written Question 24 February 2012
AI-87	CSIRO	Bushby	CSIRO Publishing	How many people are employed in the area of CSIRO Publishing?	Written Question 24 February 2012
AI-88	CSIRO	Bushby	Enterprise Portfolios	How regularly are new ‘enterprise portfolios’ nominated by the CSIRO? For each of the 11 items listed under the Enterprise Portfolio heading on pages 15 and 16 of the CSIRO Operational Plan 2011-12: from which part of the broader CSIRO Budget is the funding drawn; from what financial year does the funding begin; and how much has been allocated to them over each year of the forward estimates?	Written Question 24 February 2012
AI-89	CSIRO	Bushby	Renewable energy	Has CSIRO’s research on renewable energy ever included a comparison of the energy used to create, maintain and retire a wind driven power generator with the energy they produce? If so, what have been the findings?	Written Question 24 February 2012
AI-90	CSIRO	Bushby	Integrated Carbon Pathways Project	How much in funding has been allocated and/or committed to the Integrated Carbon Pathways project – and over what period? How many staff have been allocated to the project? Is it only operational from 2015 – and, if so, why?	Written Question 24 February 2012
AI-91	CSIRO	Bushby	Formal economic modelling research	Prior to the approach made to the organisation last year by Choice, the Australian Council of Social Service and the Climate Institute, when did the CSIRO last undertake formal economic modelling research on a specific government policy? And what was the policy that was the subject of that economic analysis? In the course of determining whether or not to undertake such work, what process is typically followed when CSIRO is approached by an external individual or organisation to perform formal economic modelling? Does CSIRO typically check with Treasury (and/or other government departments or agencies) to see if such work has already been done and/or whether it is therefore appropriate for it to undertake its own modelling?	Written Question 24 February 2012

2012 SENATE ECONOMICS LEGISLATION COMMITTEE
QUESTIONS ON NOTICE – ADDITIONAL ESTIMATES – 15 FEBRUARY 2012
INDUSTRY, INNOVATION, SCIENCE, RESEARCH AND TERTIARY EDUCATION PORTFOLIO

AI-92	CSIRO	Bushby	Choice, the Australian Council of Social Service and the Climate Institute	How much, in total, was CSIRO paid for the research that it undertook for Choice, the Australian Council of Social Service and the Climate Institute?	Written Question 24 February 2012
AI-93	CSIRO	Bushby	Climate Adaptation Flagship	How much was spent in total on the Climate Adaptation Flagship during 2010-11? And can you please provide a detailed breakdown of how that money was specifically spent?	Written Question 24 February 2012
AI-94	CSIRO	Bushby	Climate Adaptation Flagship	What does CSIRO consider have been the most tangible, practical achievements of the Climate Adaptation Flagship over the course of its existence?	Written Question 24 February 2012
AI-95	CSIRO	Bushby	Energy Transformed Flagship	How much was spent in total on the Energy Transformed Flagship during 2010-11? And can you please provide a detailed breakdown of how that money was specifically spent?	Written Question 24 February 2012
AI-96	CSIRO	Bushby	Energy Transformed Flagship	What does CSIRO consider have been the most tangible, practical achievements of the Energy Transformed Flagship over the course of its existence?	Written Question 24 February 2012
AI-97	CSIRO	Bushby	Food Futures Flagship	How much was spent in total on the Food Futures Flagship during 2010-11? And can you please provide a detailed breakdown of how that money was specifically spent?	Written Question 24 February 2012
AI-98	CSIRO	Bushby	Food Futures Flagship	What does CSIRO consider have been the most tangible, practical achievements of the Food Futures Flagship over the course of its existence?	Written Question 24 February 2012
AI-99	CSIRO	Bushby	Future Manufacturing Flagship	How much was spent in total on the Future Manufacturing Flagship during 2010-11? And can you please provide a detailed breakdown of how that money was specifically spent?	Written Question 24 February 2012
AI-100	CSIRO	Bushby	Future Manufacturing Flagship	What does CSIRO consider have been the most tangible, practical achievements of the Future Manufacturing Flagship over the course of its existence?	Written Questions 24 February 2012
AI-101	CSIRO	Bushby	Minerals Down Under Flagship	How much was spent in total on the Minerals Down Under Flagship during 2010-11? And can you please provide a detailed breakdown of how that money was specifically spent?	Written Question 24 February 2012
AI-102	CSIRO	Bushby	Minerals Down Under Flagship	What does CSIRO consider have been the most tangible, practical achievements of the Minerals Down Under Flagship over the course of its existence?	Written Question 24 February 2012

2012 SENATE ECONOMICS LEGISLATION COMMITTEE
QUESTIONS ON NOTICE – ADDITIONAL ESTIMATES – 15 FEBRUARY 2012
INDUSTRY, INNOVATION, SCIENCE, RESEARCH AND TERTIARY EDUCATION PORTFOLIO

AI-103	CSIRO	Bushby	Preventative Health Flagship	How much was spent in total on the Preventative Health Flagship during 2010-11? And can you please provide a detailed breakdown of how that money was specifically spent?	Written Question 24 February 2012
AI-104	CSIRO	Bushby	Preventative Health Flagship	What does CSIRO consider have been the most tangible, practical achievements of the Preventative Health Flagship over the course of its existence?	Written Question 24 February 2012
AI-105	CSIRO	Bushby	Sustainable Agriculture Flagship	How much was spent in total on the Sustainable Agriculture Flagship during 2010-11? And can you please provide a detailed breakdown of how that money was specifically spent?	Written Question 24 February 2012
AI-106	CSIRO	Bushby	Sustainable Agriculture Flagship	What does CSIRO consider have been the most tangible, practical achievements of the Sustainable Agriculture Flagship over the course of its existence?	Written Question 24 February 2012
AI-107	CSIRO	Bushby	Water for a Healthy Country Flagship	How much was spent in total on the Water for a Healthy Country Flagship during 2010-11? And can you please provide a detailed breakdown of how that money was specifically spent?	Written Question 24 February 2012
AI-108	CSIRO	Bushby	Water for a Healthy Country Flagship	What does CSIRO consider have been the most tangible, practical achievements of the Water for a Healthy Country Flagship over the course of its existence?	Written Question 24 February 2012
AI-109	CSIRO	Bushby	Wealth from Oceans Flagship	How much was spent in total on the Wealth from Oceans Flagship during 2010-11? And can you please provide a detailed breakdown of how that money was specifically spent?	Written Question 24 February 2012
AI-110	CSIRO	Bushby	Wealth from Oceans Flagship	What does CSIRO consider have been the most tangible, practical achievements of the Wealth from Oceans Flagship over the course of its existence?	Written Question 24 February 2012
AI-111	Office of the Chief Scientist	Bushby	Transcripts of Speeches and Media appearances	Is only a selection of transcripts of Professor Chubb's speeches and media appearances uploaded to the Office of Chief Scientist website? If so, why – and who and what determines which transcripts are uploaded?	Written Questions 24 February 201
AI-112	Office of the Chief Scientist	Bushby	Taxpayer-funded Research	Does Professor Chubb agree with the principle that the results of scientific research should be made openly available to the public, especially where that research is taxpayer-funded?	Written Question 24 February 2012
AI-113	Office of the Chief Scientist	Bushby	The Bolt Report	On what grounds did Professor Chubb decline to appear on 'The Bolt Report' last year?	Written Question 24 February 2012

2012 SENATE ECONOMICS LEGISLATION COMMITTEE
QUESTIONS ON NOTICE – ADDITIONAL ESTIMATES – 15 FEBRUARY 2012
INDUSTRY, INNOVATION, SCIENCE, RESEARCH AND TERTIARY EDUCATION PORTFOLIO

AI-114	Office of the Chief Scientist	Bushby	Climategate	Has Professor Chubb made any public comments about the so-called 'Climategate' and/or 'Climategate 2' scandals? If so, on what date(s) and what did he say?	Written Question 24 February 2012
AI-115	Office of the Chief Scientist	Bushby	Civility in Climate Change Debate	In his capacity as Chief Scientist, does Professor Chubb still believe he needs to speak out in instances where there is a lack of civility in the climate change debate, as he did last year about alleged death threats made to a group of academics? And will he continue to do so?	Written Question 24 February 2012
AI-116	Office of the Chief Scientist	Bushby	Government roles of Professor Chubb	Have there been any other government roles (aside from being Chief Scientist) for which Professor Chubb has been financially remunerated since November 2007? If so, which position(s)?	Written Question 24 February 2012
AI-117	Office of the Chief Scientist	Bushby	Office relocation – staffing numbers	Further to answer SI-16 from the last round of Estimates, how many staff were employed by the Office of Chief Scientist at the time of each of the (a) office relocation of January 2010 and (b) office relocation of August 2011?	Written Question 24 February 2012
AI-118	Corporate	Bushby	Ministerial responsibilities	For which specific areas of policy is Mr Combet responsible in his role as Minister for Innovation and Industry? For which specific areas of policy is Senator Carr responsible in his role as Minister for Manufacturing? For which specific areas of policy is Senator Evans responsible in his role as Minister for Science and Research?	Written Question 24 February 2012
AI-119	Corporate	Bushby	Charter Letters	Following the Ministerial reshuffle of 12 December 2011, on what date(s) respectively did each of the three Ministers receive a Charter Letter and/or any other document outlining their new Ministerial responsibilities?	Written Question 24 February 2012
AI-120	Corporate	Bushby	Manufacturing Cabinet Minister	Prior to the Ministerial reshuffle of 12 December 2011, when was the last time in Australian history that the Minister responsible for manufacturing policy was not a member of Cabinet?	Written Question 24 February 2012
AI-121	Corporate	Bushby	Staffing	How many SES officers are there in DIISRTE, how many Division Heads, and how many Deputy Secretaries?	Written Question 24 February 2012
AI-122	Corporate	Bushby	Recruitment	Late last year, recruitment advertising was undertaken by DIISR for a new Deputy Secretary and several new Executive Assistants for the Departmental Executive. Was a new Deputy Secretary recruited and how many new EAs were recruited – and at what total cost, and why?	Written Question 24 February 2012

2012 SENATE ECONOMICS LEGISLATION COMMITTEE
QUESTIONS ON NOTICE – ADDITIONAL ESTIMATES – 15 FEBRUARY 2012
INDUSTRY, INNOVATION, SCIENCE, RESEARCH AND TERTIARY EDUCATION PORTFOLIO

AI-123	Manufacturing	Bushby	Ford Grant	Prior to the distribution of Senator Carr’s joint media release (with the Prime Minister and Victorian Government) of 10 January 2012, what documents were formally provided to Ford about the milestones they would have to meet in order to receive the \$34 million grant – and on what date(s) respectively?	Written Question 24 February 2012
AI-124	Manufacturing	Bushby	Ford Grant	Is it correct that Ford did not receive any written information or explanation during January 2012 about the source of the money (and/or the program) from which the Federal Government’s contribution of \$34 million was being provided? If not, how were they advised in written form and on what date(s)?	Written Question 24 February 2012
AI-125	Manufacturing	Bushby	Automotive Transformation Scheme	Of the total funding that has already been spent through the uncapped element of the Automotive Transformation Scheme, how much of that money was spent prior to the so-called ‘change of parameters’ of November 2011 to which Senator Carr and Mr Durrant referred at the Estimates hearing of 15 February 2012 – and how much has been spent after the ‘parameter changes’?	Written Question 24 February 2012
AI-126	Manufacturing	Bushby	Automotive Market Access Program	How much in total has been spent each year on the Automotive Market Access Program? How much remains allocated to that scheme over each of the remaining years of the program?	Written Question 24 February 2012
AI-127	Manufacturing	Bushby	Automotive Supply Chain Development Program	How much in total has been spent each year on the Automotive Supply Chain Development Program? How much remains allocated to that scheme over each of the remaining years of the program?	Written Question 24 February 2012
AI-128	AusIndustry	Bushby	LPG Vehicle Scheme	How many grants were paid (and what were the total amounts spent on those grants) through the LPG Vehicle Scheme for each of the years 2006, 2007, 2008, 2009, 2010 and 2011?	Written Question 24 February 2012
AI-129	Manufacturing	Bushby	Automotive Industry Structural Adjustment Program	Has any of the funding in the Automotive Industry Structural Adjustment Program been earmarked (or already paid) in respect of the job losses publicly announced during 2012 at Toyota and GM Holden – and, if so, how much? What are the criteria the Government uses in making its decisions on how funding under AISAP is awarded?	Written Question 24 February 2012
AI-130	Manufacturing	Bushby	Structural adjustment programs	For what industries other than the automotive industry does the Government currently operate specific structural adjustment programs – and what are these?	Written Question 24 February 2012
AI-131	Manufacturing	Bushby	Financial assistance for the Car Industry	How much has the car industry received in total direct financial assistance from the Federal Government since 1 January 1985?	Written Question 24 February 2012

2012 SENATE ECONOMICS LEGISLATION COMMITTEE
QUESTIONS ON NOTICE – ADDITIONAL ESTIMATES – 15 FEBRUARY 2012
INDUSTRY, INNOVATION, SCIENCE, RESEARCH AND TERTIARY EDUCATION PORTFOLIO

AI-132	Manufacturing	Bushby	Australian manufactured cars	Of all of the cars presently manufactured in Australia, which has the highest percentage of Australian content – and what is that percentage?	Written Question 24 February 2012
AI-133	Manufacturing	Bushby	Trade and Assistance Review	Senator Carr has said, on a number of occasions recently, that mining and agriculture receive more financial assistance from the Government than the car industry. Notwithstanding that, in doing that, he is comparing a single industry with whole sectors: does the Department share that view and therefore disagree with the figures calculated by the Productivity Commission in its annual Trade and Assistance Review? And, if so, on what basis?	Written Question 24 February 2012
AI-134	Manufacturing	Bushby	Green Car Innovation Fund and the Automotive Transformation Scheme	With what specific government rules and guidelines are car manufacturers and component manufacturers required to comply regarding the amount of local content used in projects supported under the Green Car Innovation Fund and the Automotive Transformation Scheme respectively?	Written Question 24 February 2012
AI-135	Corporate	Bushby	Clean Technology Program – MYEFO and PAES	Are any of the so-called ‘clean energy future’ programs for which the Department is responsible missing from either MYEFO or PAES – and, if so, which one(s)?	Written Question 24 February 2012
AI-136	Corporate	Bushby	Clean Technology Program – MYEFO and PAES	Are the figures for any of the so-called ‘clean energy future’ programs for which the Department is responsible inaccurate in either MYEFO or PAES – and, if so, which figure(s) is/are inaccurate?	Written Question 24 February 2012
AI-137	Corporate	Bushby	Clean Technology Program – MYEFO and PAES	On what page is the allocation for the Clean Technology Innovation program listed in MYEFO, and what page is it listed in PAES?	Written Question 24 February 2012
AI-138	AusIndustry	Bushby	Clean Technology Program	Who will choose the projects that get funded under the clean technology programs, and how? What are the basic criteria?	Written Question 24 February 2012

2012 SENATE ECONOMICS LEGISLATION COMMITTEE
QUESTIONS ON NOTICE – ADDITIONAL ESTIMATES – 15 FEBRUARY 2012
INDUSTRY, INNOVATION, SCIENCE, RESEARCH AND TERTIARY EDUCATION PORTFOLIO

AI-139	AusIndustry	Bushby	Clean Technology Program	How will progress against the targets for each of the projects be monitored and measured, and how often?	Written Question 24 February 2012
AI-140	AusIndustry	Bushby	Clean Technology Program	What are the risks that have been identified in the rollout of these programs?	Written Question 24 February 2012
AI-141	Corporate	Bushby	Audit and Evaluation Teams	Does the Department still have audit and evaluation teams in Corporate Division – if so, how far in advance do they choose the activities and/or programs they will evaluate? And have any of the ‘clean energy future’ programs been flagged for audit and/or evaluation as part of their work programs – if so, which ones and when?	Written Question 24 February 2012
AI-142	ISBP	Bushby	Carbon Price Implementation Team	Has the Department been asked to provide any information and/or other resources to the Government’s so-called ‘Carbon Price Implementation Team’ since it was established in July? And, if so, what information and/or resources?	Written Question 24 February 2012
AI-143	AusIndustry	Bushby	Promotional notes – Wodonga Council	In answer to question SI 112 on notice from the last round of Estimates, AusIndustry advised that it did not provide local councils with promotional information about the carbon tax which it sought to have published. In that case, how is it that the Wodonga Council published, last year, a series of promotional notes about the carbon tax and not only the contact details of an AusIndustry officer but also an invitation for people to email or phone her? <i><Please see an online copy of Wodonga Council’s quarterly newsletter of at the following URL: http://www.wodonga.vic.gov.au/business/statistics/images/Quarterly_Business_Newsletter_Edition_31.pdf. The information relating to AusIndustry appears on page 7.></i>	Written Question 24 February 2012
AI-144	Manufacturing	Bushby	Manufacturing Businesses	Does the Department possess statistics that indicate how many manufacturing businesses there currently are in Australia – and, if so, what is that number?	Written Question 24 February 2012
AI-145	Manufacturing	Bushby	Manufacturing Businesses	Does the Department possess statistics that indicate how many manufacturing businesses were in existence in Australia in June 2008 – and, if so, what was that number?	Written Question 24 February 2012
AI-146	Manufacturing	Bushby	Manufacturing Businesses	What percentage of current Australian manufacturing businesses are SMEs?	Written Question 24 February 2012
AI-147	Manufacturing	Bushby	Manufacturing Workforce - Union Members	What percentage of the current Australian manufacturing workforce are union members?	Written Question 24 February 2012

2012 SENATE ECONOMICS LEGISLATION COMMITTEE
QUESTIONS ON NOTICE – ADDITIONAL ESTIMATES – 15 FEBRUARY 2012
INDUSTRY, INNOVATION, SCIENCE, RESEARCH AND TERTIARY EDUCATION PORTFOLIO

AI-148	Manufacturing	Bushby	PM's Manufacturing Taskforce	How many times has the Prime Minister's Manufacturing Taskforce formally met – and on what dates?	Written Question 24 February 2012
AI-149	Manufacturing	Bushby	PM's Manufacturing Taskforce	How many cities or communities has the Taskforce collectively visited as part of its deliberations?	Written Question 24 February 2012
AI-150	Manufacturing	Bushby	PM's Manufacturing Taskforce	There were seven Ministers who were originally chosen to be part of the Prime Minister's so-called Manufacturing Taskforce. Why, in top-level terms, were those particular Ministers selected?	Written Question 24 February 2012
AI-151	AusIndustry	Bushby	Green Building Fund	How many ASL have been assigned to the Green Building Fund for each of the years 2007-08, 2008-09, 2009-10, 2010-11 and 2011-12?	Written Question 24 February 2012
AI-152	AusIndustry	Bushby	Green Building Fund	What is the total of all of the Departmental, operating and administered expenses that have been spent on the Green Building Fund for each of the years 2007-08, 2008-09, 2009-10, 2010-11 and 2011-12? Of that amount, how much was spent purely on ASL costs?	Written Question 24 February 2012
AI-153	AusIndustry	Bushby	TCF Strategic Capability Program	How many ASL have been assigned to the TCF Strategic Capability Program for each of the years 2007-08, 2008-09, 2009-10, 2010-11 and 2011-12?	Written Question 24 February 2012
AI-154	AusIndustry	Bushby	TCF Strategic Capability Program	What is the total of all of the Departmental, operating and administered expenses that have been spent on the TCF Strategic Capability Program for each of the years 2007-08, 2008-09, 2009-10, 2010-11 and 2011-12? Of that amount, how much was spent purely on ASL costs?	Written Question 24 February 2012
AI-155	AusIndustry	Bushby	Green Car Innovation Fund	Further to Ms Butler's answer on 15 February 2012, how much in total of the spending on the Green Car Innovation Fund was spent on (a) IT and (b) property? What was the nature of the spending, specifically, on property?	Written Question 24 February 2012
AI-156	AusIndustry	Bushby	Automotive Transformation Scheme	What is the total of all of the Departmental, operating and administered expenses that were spent on the Automotive Transformation Scheme for the calendar year 2011?	Written Question 24 February 2012
AI-157	AusIndustry	Bushby	Green Building Fund	With what specific government rules and guidelines are grant recipients required to comply regarding the amount of local content used in projects supported under the Green Building Fund?	Written Question 24 February 2012
AI-158	Manufacturing	Bushby	Ethical Clothing Australia	How much has DIISR (and now DIISRTE) provided in total since 3 December 2007 to the Textile Clothing and Footwear Union of Australia?	Written Question 24 February 2012

2012 SENATE ECONOMICS LEGISLATION COMMITTEE
QUESTIONS ON NOTICE – ADDITIONAL ESTIMATES – 15 FEBRUARY 2012
INDUSTRY, INNOVATION, SCIENCE, RESEARCH AND TERTIARY EDUCATION PORTFOLIO

AI-159	AusIndustry	Bushby	TCF Strategic Capability Program	How many businesses have applied for funding under the TCF Strategic Capability Program?	Written Question 24 February 2012
AI-160	AusIndustry	Bushby	TCF Strategic Capability Program/ Ethical Clothing Australia	Of all the businesses that have applied for funding under the TCF Strategic Capability Program, how many have not been members of Ethical Clothing Australia? And, of these, how many have been informed in writing that they did not qualify to receive grants because they were not members of Ethical Clothing Australia?	Written Question 24 February 2012
AI-161	Manufacturing	Bushby	Australian Industry Participation	In January 2012, the Prime Minister made announcements about Federal Government funding for both the Adelaide Oval and Sydney Cricket Ground redevelopment projects. With what specific government rules and guidelines have the recipients of this funding been required to comply regarding the amount of local content they are using?	Written Question 24 February 2012
AI-162	Manufacturing	Bushby	Australian Industry Participation	In respect of all Federal Government funding provided to the redevelopment of sporting stadiums since the election of the Rudd Government in 2007, with what specific government rules and guidelines have grant recipients been required to comply regarding the amount of local content used in such projects?	Written Questions 24 February 2012
AI-163	AusIndustry	Bushby	Commercialisation Australia	What formal monitoring, audit and evaluation processes are used to track the progress and success (or otherwise) of grants made through the Commercialisation Australia program?	Written Question 24 February 2012
AI-164	Audit	Bushby	Internal Audit Reports	In answer to AI-85 in February 2011, the Department provided a list of each of the internal audit reports that has been written since the creation of the Department of Innovation, Industry, Science and Research on 3 December 2007. Could an updated list showing all internal audit reports that have been written since the time of that answer now be provided, including with an accompanying indication – for each of the reports that is listed – of how many of the findings were noted respectively as having a CR1 and CR2 status?	Written Question 24 February 2012
AI-165	Income Support Group	Nash	Youth Allowance	How many students from a regional area in each of the last five years received youth allowance, living away from home? (Please break down into the ASGC-RA map zones.)	Written Question 26 February 2012
AI-166	Income Support Group	Nash	Youth Allowance	How many students from a regional area in each of the last five years received independent youth allowance, living away from home? (Please break down into the ASGC-RA map zones.)	Written Question 26 February 2012

2012 SENATE ECONOMICS LEGISLATION COMMITTEE
QUESTIONS ON NOTICE – ADDITIONAL ESTIMATES – 15 FEBRUARY 2012
INDUSTRY, INNOVATION, SCIENCE, RESEARCH AND TERTIARY EDUCATION PORTFOLIO

AI-167	Income Support Group	Nash	Youth Allowance	How many students from a regional area in each of the last five years were receiving youth allowance, living away from home, whose parental income was Less than \$50,000 Between \$50,000 - \$100,000 Over \$100,000 (Please break down into the ASGC-RA map zones.)	Written Question 26 February 2012
AI-168	Income Support Group	Nash	Youth Allowance	In each of the last five years, what was the total expenditure for independent youth allowance, living away from home?	Written Question 26 February 2012
AI-169	Income Support Group	Nash	Youth Allowance	In each of the last five years, what was the total expenditure for dependent youth allowance, living away from home?	Written Question 26 February 2012
AI-170	Income Support Group	Nash	Youth Allowance	How many students have applied for independent youth allowance since 1 Jan 2012?	Written Question 26 February 2012
AI-171	Income Support Group	Nash	Youth Allowance	How many students have had their application for independent youth allowance rejected since 1 January 2012? If any, for what reasons?	Written Question 26 February 2012
AI-172	Skills Group	Rhiannon	VET Funding	In relation to the impact that long term underfunding is having on the TAFE sector, and the threat that this presents to quality, and given the policies being enacted and contemplated in a number of states and territories to increase the exposure of the TAFE system to competition from private for-profit providers: 1. What strategies or policies is the Australian government contemplating in the next VET funding agreement to protect the quality of the TAFE system? 2. What strategies or policies is the Australian government contemplating in the next VET funding agreement to protect the government's investment in the system? 3. What terms will the Australian Government include in the new funding agreement to at least maintain TAFE institutes' total funding levels and funding per student (full year training equivalent)?	Written Question 26 February 2012
AI-173	Skills Group	Rhiannon	Victorian VET	A recent example of rorts by private providers in Victoria involved a private provider offering a CIV in Outdoor Recreation to more than 10 community sports groups. The private provider, Vocational Training Group, was offering an incentive of \$1000 per student to the sports group and \$500 to each student. This qualification, which attracts funding for anywhere between 700 – 1,100 hours of delivery, was being offered over nine evenings (about 27 hours) by this provider. This means that the provider was receiving between 700 and 1,100 hours of funding at \$7 per hour for a qualification it was delivering in about 27 hours (Flyer attached).	Written Question 26 February 2012

2012 SENATE ECONOMICS LEGISLATION COMMITTEE
QUESTIONS ON NOTICE – ADDITIONAL ESTIMATES – 15 FEBRUARY 2012
INDUSTRY, INNOVATION, SCIENCE, RESEARCH AND TERTIARY EDUCATION PORTFOLIO

				<p>What proportion of this funding was federal? What budget did it come from? How long had this provider been operating and offering this qualification? How much federal funding was expended by this private provider in this exercise? What does the government intend to do to make sure this does not occur again? Do you regard that examples like this are undermining confidence in vocational education qualifications, and in the national VET system? Do you have confidence in the Victorian and other state governments' capacity to assure quality in an increasingly competitive market? Private providers in Victoria can recognise prior learning for students for full qualifications and receive the same funding per student contact hour that they received if they had delivered the full qualification. Did Recognition of Prior Learning (RPL) increase in Victoria in 2009, 2010 and 2011? If it did, by how much compared to 2008, in what fields of education and at what qualification levels?</p>	
AI-174	Skills Group	Rhiannon	Income contingents loans	<p>Under the Federal Government's proposed expansion of income contingent loans in VET, what criteria will VET providers have to meet for their students to be eligible for ICL? Who will make these judgements?</p>	Written Question 26 February 2012
AI-175	Skills Group	Rhiannon	Skills Training, Agriculture and Climate Change	<p>Given the recognised shortage of higher level skills in the agriculture sector, will the government consider targeting that sector via the Critical Skills Investment Fund: If not, why not? The agriculture sector is recognised as suffering a professional image problem, which is contributing to higher level skills shortages in the industry. Given the importance of climate change and skills training to the sustainability of agricultural industries, what is the government doing to integrate climate change research and emissions reduction research into research and skills training for the industry?</p>	Written Question 26 February 2012
AI-176	Skills Group	Rhiannon	TAFE as Subcontractor to Private Providers	<p>Following on from your previous questions about TAFE being subcontracted by private providers to run courses:</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. How many private VET providers are sub-contracting their contracted services back to TAFE, specifically in the Language, Literacy and Numeracy Program and Australian Apprenticeships Access Program? 2. In such instances, what is the value of those primary contracts in public dollar terms? 3. Would private providers be profiting from such an arrangement? 	Written Question 26 February 2012

2012 SENATE ECONOMICS LEGISLATION COMMITTEE
QUESTIONS ON NOTICE – ADDITIONAL ESTIMATES – 15 FEBRUARY 2012
INDUSTRY, INNOVATION, SCIENCE, RESEARCH AND TERTIARY EDUCATION PORTFOLIO

				<p>4. If yes, is it known what the profit is (value of contracts minus value of TAFE subcontracts)?</p> <p>5. Given GOAG's stated support for TAFE as a public VET provider, in such instances would it have cost less public dollars to award the contracts to TAFE – given TAFE is effectively delivering such courses?</p>	
AI-177	Higher Education	Rhiannon	Demand Driven Higher Education – Equity students	<p>Is there any feedback yet from this year's higher education enrolment, whether universities are meeting participation targets for students from low SES backgrounds and other nominated under-represented groups?</p> <p>What problems have been identified; and what is the government doing to address them?</p> <p>Are there any particular types of universities that have had trouble meeting those targets at this stage?</p>	Written Question 26 February 2012
AI-178	Higher Education	Rhiannon	Demand Driven Higher Education – Migration of students to larger units	<p>Has there been any reported significant drop in university enrolments at particular universities such as regional universities this year, with the new student demand driven system introduced from 1 January?</p> <p>If yes, where are those drops? At which universities and which courses?</p> <p>Has there been any noticeable or reported migration of students from smaller and regional universities to the sandstone city universities? If yes, what are the details?</p> <p>What strategies has the government considered to ensure rural and regional universities can provide quality education, notwithstanding regional loading funding.</p>	Written Question 26 February 2012
AI-179	Higher Education	Rhiannon	Demand Driven Higher Education – Student to Teacher ratios	<p>With a target of 40% more students studying bachelor degrees within 4 years, what modelling has been done to ascertain likely student teacher ratios with the expected expansion of student numbers?</p> <p>What types of student teacher ratios are we seeing at the moment in the different types of universities, for example rural v regional v city sandstones?</p> <p>How have ratios changed from 2000; and how does it compare with OECD best practice?</p> <p>Do these ratios affect student choice of where they study? International students?</p> <p>Whilst the department has advised Australian universities employ only 16.2% casual staff, what modelling has been done on future increases in that percentage given the planned expansion of the student numbers, and the looming retirement of the current fulltime academic cohort from the sector (with few experienced academics said to be in the system to replace them)?</p>	Written Question 26 February 2012

2012 SENATE ECONOMICS LEGISLATION COMMITTEE
QUESTIONS ON NOTICE – ADDITIONAL ESTIMATES – 15 FEBRUARY 2012
INDUSTRY, INNOVATION, SCIENCE, RESEARCH AND TERTIARY EDUCATION PORTFOLIO

AI-180	Higher Education	Rhiannon	Demand Driven Higher Education – Fulltime academics and replacement of retiring cohort	How many fulltime higher education academics are currently in the sector and what is the age proportion of those academics, and in what areas of study are they? What strategies does the government have planned to ensure that retiring cohort will be replaced by experienced and qualified academics?	Written Question 26 February 2012
AI-181	Higher Education	Rhiannon	Demand Driven Higher Education – \$35.7 billion Teaching and Learning in Universities	The Australian Govt is providing some \$35.7 billion for teaching and learning over the next 4 years: What is the expected breakdown of what that money will fund on the ground eg.How much of that money is expected to pay teachers wages; resources; professional development such as teaching skills etc?	Written Question 26 February 2012
AI-182	International Group	Rhiannon	Demand Driven Higher Education – International Students	By how much have international student enrolments dropped this study year since last year? About how much revenue to universities does this represent? In what way is a drop in international student revenue expected to affect universities in providing quality education to students? Is any major loss of such revenue a factor in the government’s funding to universities, given the importance of ensuring our universities are able to compete on an international stage? The Australian Government is supposed to provide consumer protection to international students through the ESOS Act and its National Code, however whilst recent legislation recognises the importance of refunds to international students for tuition fees, there seems no mechanism to ensure refunds for accommodation fees which are paid in advance to education providers: How much money have international students lost where their defaulting provider has not refunded accommodation fees since 2008? Given “providing relevant information on living in Australia” is not a mechanism for ensuring international students are provided accommodation fee refunds from defaulting providers, and given the importance of international students to the national economy.	Written Question 26 February 2012

2012 SENATE ECONOMICS LEGISLATION COMMITTEE
QUESTIONS ON NOTICE – ADDITIONAL ESTIMATES – 15 FEBRUARY 2012
INDUSTRY, INNOVATION, SCIENCE, RESEARCH AND TERTIARY EDUCATION PORTFOLIO

				Is the government and COAG investigating a mechanism to ensure this, as part of the Tertiary Protection Scheme, or a similar scheme application?	
AI-183	TEQSA	Mason	Torrens University Australia	In relation to the establishment of the new Torrens University Australia: Has TEQSA put in place all systems necessary for approval of new Universities? What steps are necessary for the establishment of a new University? Has TEQSA received all necessary information from Laureate in relation to the establishment of Torrens University Australia? If not, what information is Laureate yet to provide? When is Torrens University Australia expected to commence? Will Torrens University have any regulatory restrictions on the date of commencement? If so, when will they be removed? What follow up will be undertaken by TEQSA to determine the University is performing well?	Written Question 26 February 2012
AI-184	TEQSA	Mason	TEQSA's relationship with AQSA	In relation to TEQSA's relationship with the Australian Skills Quality Authority (ASQA): Has TEQSA signed a memorandum of understanding with ASQA? What are the terms of the memorandum of understanding? Will the memorandum of understanding be released? Are there any matters in which TEQSA and ASQA have not yet agreed?	Written Question 26 February 2012
AI-185	TEQSA	Mason	TEQSA Audits	In relation to the decision of TEQSA to not continue the practice of audits: When was this decision taken? Why was the decision taken? Was the decision to not continue with audits a result of a lack of resources? Will TEQSA be relying solely on risk matrixes and complaints in determining the health of an institution or will other methods also be used? If TEQSA will be relying only on risk matrixes and complaints is TEQSA concerned that some concerns will not come to their attention?	Written Question 26 February 2012
AI-186	Research	Mason	Focusing Australia's Publicly Funded Research Review	In relation to the outcomes of the "Focusing Australia's Publicly Funded Research Review" which were announced by Senator the Hon Kim Carr on 3 November 2011 in a paper entitled "Maximising the Innovation Dividend: Review Key Findings and Future Directions" and which Report had four recommendations: In relation to Recommendation 1, the ministerial press release of 3 November	Written Question 26 February 2012

2012 SENATE ECONOMICS LEGISLATION COMMITTEE
QUESTIONS ON NOTICE – ADDITIONAL ESTIMATES – 15 FEBRUARY 2012
INDUSTRY, INNOVATION, SCIENCE, RESEARCH AND TERTIARY EDUCATION PORTFOLIO

				<p>2011 states that “A new Commonwealth committee, chaired by Professor Chubb, will provide the Government with integrated and strategic advice on future research investments. Initially, the committee will develop a national research investment plan”.</p> <p>the establishment and set up of this committee progressing?</p> <p>Will be its membership?</p> <p>any timetable for the committee’s work, for example for developing a national research investment plan?</p> <p>In relation to Recommendation 2, what is the proposed timetable for the consultation to be undertaken by the Department with the research sector and other relevant stakeholders?</p> <p>In relation to Recommendation 3 – when will the feasibility study be conducted? What sort of forms would such measures take? How would the results be utilised?</p> <p>The ministerial press release of 3 November 2011 states that action will soon be taken in regards to Recommendations 2 and 3, but no explicit mention is made of Recommendation 4. What action will the government take in regards to this recommendation and when?</p>	
AI-187	Research	Mason	Sustainable Research Excellence Consultation Paper	<p>With reference to the “Sustainable Research Excellence Consultation Paper” released by the Department on 26/8/11 – at the Supplementary Estimates, the Department advised that: “The submission process closed at the end of September and we are in the process now of analysing the submission and the information that has been provided to us through that process. We will from here undertake some modelling and we will then make recommendations to the minister about options for a preferred model”.</p> <p>How is this consultation process progressing?</p> <p>Has the Department yet finished the process of analysing and finalising its consideration of submissions? If not, when will this be completed?</p> <p>What is the status of the modelling and recommendations?</p>	Written Question 26 February 2012
AI-188	Research	Mason	2011 HERDC and Online Publications	<p>At the Supplementary Estimates, the issue of how online publications are reported was raised, in particular online theses, and how these have been handled under the 2011 Higher Education Research Data Collection process. I understood, in effect, that a new definition that excluded online theses would be prepared for 2012, to avoid a repeat of the situation where one university used the expansive definition of online publications to include online theses in their count.</p> <p>Please provide an update on the status of this issue, and confirm whether the new parameters or new definition have yet been worked out? If so, how does the new</p>	Written Question 26 February 2012

2012 SENATE ECONOMICS LEGISLATION COMMITTEE
QUESTIONS ON NOTICE – ADDITIONAL ESTIMATES – 15 FEBRUARY 2012
INDUSTRY, INNOVATION, SCIENCE, RESEARCH AND TERTIARY EDUCATION PORTFOLIO

				definition address last year's problem?	
AI-189	Research	Mason	Regulation and compliance costs	<p>With reference to the response provided by the Department to a Question On Notice at the Supplementary Estimates hearings (Question No.SI-23) in relation to regulation and the compliance costs of universities arising from government regulations:</p> <p>In regards to the specific instances contained in this response, does the Department have an estimate of the cost (in terms of man-hours or expenditure) that the university has to incur in order to provide that information or data?</p> <p>Does the Department have any processes in place to monitor and review its information gathering activities to ensure that there is a balance between the Department's needs and universities' compliance workload, and if so please provide relevant details?</p> <p>Are there any known instances where the same information that is collected by the Department is also collected by other departments or federal agencies, and have any institutions raised concerns about this with the Department since 2007 (and if yes, please provide relevant specifics)?</p> <p>How will the recent transfer of responsibility for universities to the Department of Industry, Innovation, Science, Research and Tertiary Education (DIISRTE) affect the Department's information gathering process and requirements on higher education providers?</p>	Written Question 26 February 2012
AI-190	Higher Education	Mason	Retention and attrition rates for higher education	<p>What are the latest figures available on attrition and retention rates for undergraduate students at Australian universities and other higher education providers?</p> <p>Please provide the total and a breakdown of domestic undergraduate student enrolments, and completions, by course/discipline, by state and by institution – for each year since 2005 (inclusive).</p> <p>Please provide the total and a breakdown of international undergraduate student enrolments, and completions, by course/discipline, by state and by institution – for each year since 2005 (inclusive).</p> <p>Please provide the total and a breakdown of domestic postgraduate student enrolments, and completions, by level of study, by course/discipline, by state and by institution – for each year since 2005 (inclusive).</p> <p>Please provide the total and a breakdown of international postgraduate student enrolments, and completions, by level of study, by course/discipline, by state and by institution – for each year since 2005 (inclusive).</p> <p>How do the statistics on attrition rates take account of (or reflect) students who do</p>	Written Question 26 February 2012

2012 SENATE ECONOMICS LEGISLATION COMMITTEE
QUESTIONS ON NOTICE – ADDITIONAL ESTIMATES – 15 FEBRUARY 2012
INDUSTRY, INNOVATION, SCIENCE, RESEARCH AND TERTIARY EDUCATION PORTFOLIO

				not complete a degree at one institution, but nonetheless later enrol and continue their course of study at another higher education institution?	
AI-191	Higher Education	Mason	Barriers to students undertaking undergraduate studies	What studies or work has been undertaken by the Department (or its agents) that provide evidence as to whether Australian domestic students considering undertaking undergraduate courses at a higher education institution regard course fees as a significant disincentive notwithstanding the existence of the income-contingent HECS-HELP loan scheme? What evidence does the Department or its agencies have that the living costs associated with undertaking study are acting as a disincentive for existing or potential Australian domestic to pursue, or continue, their studies at Australian universities?	Written Question 26 February 2012
AI-192	Higher Education	Mason	Student residential accommodation at universities	Does the Department collect or possess any data on the enrolment levels at student residential colleges located on university campuses or nearby precincts? If so, please provide relevant data. Please provide details of all federal funding that has been provided to universities for the purpose of providing student accommodation, including a breakdown by state and institution, for each year since 2007-08? What conditions (if any) were attached to this funding? What funding or other contributions were sought and/or made by the relevant state or territory government in each case?	Written Question 26 February 2012
AI-193	Higher Education	Mason	HECS-HELP and student debt	What was the total expense to the Budget of the HECS-HELP contingent loan scheme for the 2011 calendar year, and where is this expense identified in the relevant Portfolio Budget Statements and/or Budget Papers? In relation to the one student that the Department has confirmed owes taxpayers over \$400,000 – without discussing the personal specifics of that particular student – what circumstances and how many courses of study have given rise to the accumulation of such a large HECS-HELP debt by that student? currently the second largest individual HECS-HELP debt?	Written Question 26 February 2012
AI-194	Higher Education	Mason	Publications and Statistics on Higher Education	What is the scheduled publication date for the publication “Higher Education Report 2010”? Please provide a schedule of the proposed publication dates for all Departmental and/or agency publications that relate to higher education and/or international education?	Written Question 26 February 2012
AI-195	Higher Education	Mason	Australian university	How many domestic university students study off-shore as part of their educational experience, and how has this trend changed over the past decade?	Written Question 26 February 2012

2012 SENATE ECONOMICS LEGISLATION COMMITTEE
QUESTIONS ON NOTICE – ADDITIONAL ESTIMATES – 15 FEBRUARY 2012
INDUSTRY, INNOVATION, SCIENCE, RESEARCH AND TERTIARY EDUCATION PORTFOLIO

			students studying overseas	How many of these occur in a non-English speaking setting? What support is currently provided to such students, and are they eligible in any circumstances for income-contingent loans to assist with course fees incurred at such overseas universities (and if so what conditions attach to such support)? Are there statistics available on the number of low-SES students who have benefited from this internationalised university experience as part of their studies?	
AI-196	International Group	Mason	Academics migrating to, and leaving, Australia	What data is collected and available on migration to (and emigration from) Australia, by academics, scientists and researchers and how does the Department work with other federal agencies and Departments (including DIAC) in relation to these issues?	Written Question 26 February 2012
AI-197	International Group	Mason	Growth of International Education sectors	Is higher education still projected to be the largest sector, and the largest growth sector, for international student enrolments in Australia in each year over the next decade?	Written Question 26 February 2012
AI-198	Higher Education	Mason	Teaching, research and administrative staff at Australian universities	Please provide the number of research-only staff, teaching only-staff, staff with combined teaching and research responsibilities, and administrative staff at Australian universities, including an indication of whether those positions are full-time, part-time and/or casual positions – and how each of these categories of employment have changed in each year since 2005?	Written Question 26 February 2012
AI-199	Higher Education	Mason	Funding to universities and higher education providers	What funding to higher education providers from DISSRTE is channelled through the States and Territories? Please provide total figures and a breakdown of this funding by recipient. Please provide the regulatory basis for funding being provided in this manner, rather than directly to the higher education providers, and explain how this enhances accountability for these funds or improves the achievement of relevant outcomes?	Written Question 26 February 2012
AI-200	Higher Education	Mason	Low-SES students	How many low-SES students attend higher education courses at non-university higher education providers, both in total and broken down by state/territory and provider (where available)?	Written Question 26 February 2012
AI-201	Higher Education	Mason	'My University' website	Please provide an update on the current state of play with respect to the rollout, implementation and funding of the 'My University' website? What data is to be included on the My University website on launch and what further data is it planned to be added over time? How will the data contained on the 'My University' website be used by the Department?	Written Question 26 February 2012

2012 SENATE ECONOMICS LEGISLATION COMMITTEE
QUESTIONS ON NOTICE – ADDITIONAL ESTIMATES – 15 FEBRUARY 2012
INDUSTRY, INNOVATION, SCIENCE, RESEARCH AND TERTIARY EDUCATION PORTFOLIO

AI-202	Higher Education	Mason	University compacts	How will the process and mission-based compacts that have been negotiated with each university be impacted by the changed departmental structure and the transfer of Outcome 3 from DEEWR to DIISRTE following the recent machinery of government changes? What performance funding has been provided to each university in total to date under these mission-based compacts? What is the low-SES enrolment target for each individual university agreed as part of the compact with the Department, what is the basis of this target, and what additional funding is offered if the target is met by each institution?	Written Question 26 February 2012
AI-203	Higher Education	Mason	Funding in 2011 to higher education providers	What was the total amount of Commonwealth funding received by each university and/or non-university higher education provider in the 2011 calendar year? Please provide details in each case of under which programme or other basis this funding was provided to each provider.	Written Question 26 February 2012
AI-204	ISBP	Ryan	Structure of ISBP	Can you confirm The ISBP division is broken into 5 branches, Small business and deregulation, Industry Policy and Economics Analysis, Food, chemicals and Deregulation Projects, Business conditions and Executive	Written Question 26 February 2012
AI-205	ISBP	Ryan	Departmental expenditure for ISBP	Can you confirm the departmental expenditure for ISBP For 2011-12 is \$13,171,000. For 2012-13: \$12,183,000. For 2013-14: \$11,850,000	Written Question 26 February 2012
AI-206	ISBP	Ryan	ISBP staffing numbers	How many staff currently work in ISBP division?	Written Question 26 February 2012
AI-207	ISBP	Ryan	Small Business staffing numbers	How many staff within ISBP currently work in the Small business unit of the ISBP division?	Written Question 26 February 2012
AI-208	ISBP	Ryan	Small Business staffing	Can you confirm all 23 staff in small business unit are based in the Canberra office (10 Binara street Canberra). Can you provide a breakdown of which staff work on which projects/areas within the small business division?	Written Question 26 February 2012
AI-209	ISBP	Ryan	National Small Business Summit	Will the current Minister for Small Business be attending the NAB 2012 National Small Business Summit?	Written Question 26 February 2012

2012 SENATE ECONOMICS LEGISLATION COMMITTEE
QUESTIONS ON NOTICE – ADDITIONAL ESTIMATES – 15 FEBRUARY 2012
INDUSTRY, INNOVATION, SCIENCE, RESEARCH AND TERTIARY EDUCATION PORTFOLIO

AI-210	ISBP	Ryan	Small Business Dispute Resolution options paper	What departmental resources have been allocated to developing a response to the Small Business Dispute Resolution options paper?	Written Question 26 February 2012
AI-211	ISBP	Ryan	Small Business Dispute Resolution options paper	Does the Minister or department have a consultation schedule, or something similar in relation to the Small Business Dispute Resolution Options Paper?	Written Question 26 February 2012
AI-212	ISBP	Ryan	Meetings with Small Business Minister	How many meetings has the Small Business Minister had with the Director of the ISBP Division of DIISR since his appointment as Minister? How many meetings has the Small Business Minister had with the Director of the ISBP Division for 2008-09, 2009-10, 2010-11?	Written Question 26 February 2012
AI-213	ISBP	Ryan	Meetings with Small Business Minister	How regularly does the Small Business Minister formally meet with the Director of the ISBP Division of DIISR?	Written Question 26 February 2012
AI-214	Corporate	Ryan	Small Business Minister – Office at 10 Binara	Does the Small Business Minister have an office at the 10 Binara St DIISR facility? How many times has it been used since his appointment as Minister for Small Business?	Written Question 26 February 2012
AI-215	AusIndustry	Ryan	BI-46 – Advertising Expenditure	Senator RYAN: I would appreciate an explanation as to how that amount of money was spent advertising a program after its closure, because I would assume that, with your deep involvement with this sector, the department might be able to communicate with potential applicants in different ways, other than through advertising. Ms Butler: I will take it on notice and get back to you. Senator RYAN: Can you take that on notice and also get me copies of some of the advertisements that that money was spent with? Ms Butler: We will get straight on to it and, if we can do it in this session, we will bring you those.	Page 42 15 February 2012
AI-216	Skills Group	Cash	National Partnership	1. I refer to QoN EW0555_12 from October: did the National Partnership commence in January 2012 as planned? 2. How many training places are currently being supported, of the 'up to 1200' capacity outlined at the last estimates hearing? 3. What can DEEWR report on take-up of the training places so far?	Written Question – transferred from DEEWR

2012 SENATE ECONOMICS LEGISLATION COMMITTEE
QUESTIONS ON NOTICE – ADDITIONAL ESTIMATES – 15 FEBRUARY 2012
INDUSTRY, INNOVATION, SCIENCE, RESEARCH AND TERTIARY EDUCATION PORTFOLIO

AI-217	Manufacturing	Bushby	Aluminium Industry	Rio Tinto, Norsk Hydro, Rusal and Alcoa have all in recent months expressed concern about the on-going viability of their Australian operations. What is the real situation with this industry in Australia? What reductions in refining and smelting capacity in Australia is the Government anticipating? What is the aggregate number of jobs at risk? What is the likely impact on national export income? What is the government doing to address this situation?	Written Question – transferred from RET
AI-218	Manufacturing	Ryan	Howe Automotive Limited	Appropriation Bill 4 (2011-12) show a \$25m loan to Howe and Company Proprietary Limited and its parent company Howe Automotive Limited, to be fully repaid over 10 years with interest. What is the purpose of the loan? What is the loan terms and conditions? What is the interest? What if the loan is not repaid?	Written Question – transfer from DoFD
AI-219	Corporate	Bushby	Staffing	How many ongoing staff recruited this financial year to date? What classification are these staff? How many non ongoing positions exist or have been created this financial year to date? What classification are these staff? This financial year to date, how many employees have been employed on contract and what is the average length of their employment period?	Written Question 22 February 2012
AI-220	Corporate	Bushby	Staffing	How many ongoing staff left in the year 2010-11? What classification were these staff? How many non ongoing staff left in the year 2010-11? What classification were these staff?	Written Question 22 February 2012
AI-221	Corporate	Bushby	Staffing	Are there any plans for staff reduction? If so, please advise details ie. reduction target, how this will be achieved, services/programs to be cut etc. If there are plans for staff reductions, please give the reason why these are happening.	Written Question 22 February 2012
AI-222	Corporate	Bushby	Efficiency Dividend	How will the efficiency dividend applied in the 2011-12 Mid-Year Economic and Fiscal Outlook be implemented in your agency/department? What percentage of your budget must be cut? Will any staff position be cut to meet the efficiency divided? If yes, provide details of where the positions are located, the classification, whether the position is ongoing or not.	Written Question 22 February 2012

2012 SENATE ECONOMICS LEGISLATION COMMITTEE
QUESTIONS ON NOTICE – ADDITIONAL ESTIMATES – 15 FEBRUARY 2012
INDUSTRY, INNOVATION, SCIENCE, RESEARCH AND TERTIARY EDUCATION PORTFOLIO

				Please list where and what spending has been reduced to meet the efficiency dividend.	
AI-223	Corporate	Bushby	Staffing	Please list the SES positions you have in your department/agency in the years 2007-08, 2008-09, 2009-10, 2010-11 and financial year to date. Identify the different levels and how many are permanent positions.	Written Question 22 February 2012
AI-224	Corporate	Bushby	Staffing	How many graduates have been engaged this year? Where have they been placed in the department/agency? Were these empty positions or are they new positions? List what training will be provided, the name of the provider and the cost.	Written Question 22 February 2012
AI-225	Corporate	Bushby	Government Advertising	What was the total cost of all advertising for 2007-08, 2008-09, 2009-10 and 2010-11? For each of those years, list whether the advertising is campaign or non-campaign and details of each advertising, including the program the advertising was for, the total spend and the business that provided the advertising services. Did the Department of Finance and Deregulation provide any advice about the advertising? Provide details of each advertising item. Did the Advertising comply with the Guidelines on Information and Advertising Campaigns by Australian Government Departments and Agencies? Provide the details for each advertising item. Provide details for any other communications program, including details of the program, the total spend and the business that provided the communication services. What advertising – Campaign and Non-Campaign – and other communications programs is the Department/Agency undertaking, or are planning to undertake?	Written Question 22 February 2012
AI-226	Corporate	Bushby	Hospitality and Entertainment	What is the Department/Agency's hospitality spend for this financial year to date? Detail date, location, purpose and cost of all events. For each Minister and Parliamentary Secretary office, please detail total hospitality spend for this financial year to date. Detail date, location, purpose and cost of each event. What is the Department's entertainment spend for this financial year to date? Detail date, location, purpose and cost of all events. For each Minister and Parliamentary Secretary office, please detail total entertainment spend for this financial year to date. Detail date, location, purpose and cost of each event. What hospitality spend is the Department/Agency's planning on spending? Detail date, location, purpose and cost of all events. For each Minister and Parliamentary Secretary office, what hospitality spend is	Written Question 22 February 2012

2012 SENATE ECONOMICS LEGISLATION COMMITTEE
QUESTIONS ON NOTICE – ADDITIONAL ESTIMATES – 15 FEBRUARY 2012
INDUSTRY, INNOVATION, SCIENCE, RESEARCH AND TERTIARY EDUCATION PORTFOLIO

				currently being planned for? Detail date, location, purpose and cost of each event. What entertainment spend is the Department/Agency's planning on spending? Detail date, location, purpose and cost of all events. For each Minister and Parliamentary Secretary office, what entertainment spend is currently being planned for? Detail date, location, purpose and cost of each event.	
AI-227	Corporate	Bushby	Board Appointments	List all of the boards within this portfolio, including: board title, terms of appointment, tenure of appointment and members. What is the gender ratio on each board and across the portfolio? Please detail any board appointments for this financial year to date.	Written Question 22 February 2012
AI-228	Corporate	Bushby	Discretionary Grants	Has the Department complied with interim requirements relating to the publication of discretionary grants?	Written Question 22 February 2012
AI-229	Corporate	Bushby	Freedom of Information	Has the Department/agency received any advice on how to respond to FOI requests? What was the total cost to the department to process FOI requests for 2009-10 and 2010-11? What is the total cost to the department to process FOI requests for this financial year to date? How many FOI requests did the Department receive for the financial year 2009-10 and 2010-11? For each financial year, how many requests were denied and how many were granted? Did the department fail to meet the processing times outlined in the FOI Act for any requests? If so, how many? Do any of these requests remain outstanding? How many FOI requests has the Department received for this financial year to date? How many requests have been denied and how many have been granted? Has the department failed to meet the processing times outlined in the FOI Act for any requests? If so, how many? Do any of these requests remain outstanding? How many conclusive certificates have been issued in relation to FOI requests for this financial year to date?	Written Question 22 February 2012
AI-230	Corporate	Bushby	Community Cabinets	What was the cost of Ministers travel and expenses for the Community Cabinet meetings held this financial year to date? How many Ministerial Staff travelled with the Minister for the Community Cabinet meetings for this financial year to date? What was the total cost of this	Written Question 22 February 2012

2012 SENATE ECONOMICS LEGISLATION COMMITTEE
QUESTIONS ON NOTICE – ADDITIONAL ESTIMATES – 15 FEBRUARY 2012
INDUSTRY, INNOVATION, SCIENCE, RESEARCH AND TERTIARY EDUCATION PORTFOLIO

				<p>travel? How many Departmental officers travelled with the Minister for the Community Cabinet meetings for this financial year to date? What was the total cost of this travel? List travel type, accommodate and any other expenses. What was the total cost to the Department and the Ministers office for the Community Cabinet meetings for this financial year to date?</p>	
AI-231	Corporate	Bushby	Reviews	<p>For the year 2010-11: When will each of these reviews be concluded? What reviews have been concluded? Which of these reviews has been provided to Government? When will the Government be responding to the respective reviews that have been completed? What is the estimated cost of each of these Reviews? For this financial year to date: How many Reviews are being undertaken? What reviews have concluded, and for those that are still ongoing, when will those reviews be concluded Which of these reviews has been provided to Government? When will the Government be responding to the respective reviews that have been completed? What is the estimated cost of each of these Reviews? What reviews are planned? When will each of these reviews be concluded?</p>	Written Question 22 February 2012
AI-232	Corporate	Bushby	Consultancies	<p>How many consultancies were undertaken in 2007-08, 2008-09 and 2009-10? How many consultancies have been undertaken this financial year to date? Identify the name of the consultant, the subject matter of the consultancy, the duration and cost of the arrangement, and the method of procurement (ie. open tender, direct source, etc). Also include total value for all consultancies. How many consultancies are planned for this calendar year? Have these been published in your Annual Procurement Plan (APP) on the AusTender website and if not why not? In each case please identify the subject matter, duration, cost and method of procurement as above, and the name of the consultant if known.</p>	Written Question 22 February 2012
AI-233	Corporate	Bushby	Media Monitoring	<p>What was the total cost of media monitoring services, including press clippings, electronic media transcripts etcetera, provided to the Minister's office for 2007-08, 2008-09, 2009-10 and 2010-11?</p>	Written Question 22 February 2012

2012 SENATE ECONOMICS LEGISLATION COMMITTEE
QUESTIONS ON NOTICE – ADDITIONAL ESTIMATES – 15 FEBRUARY 2012
INDUSTRY, INNOVATION, SCIENCE, RESEARCH AND TERTIARY EDUCATION PORTFOLIO

				<p>What was the total cost of media monitoring services, including press clippings, electronic media transcripts etcetera, provided to the department/agency for 2007-08, 2008-09, 2009-10 and 2010-11</p> <p>What was the total cost of media monitoring services, including press clippings, electronic media transcripts etcetera, provided to the Minister's office for this financial year to date?</p> <p>Which agency or agencies provided these services?</p> <p>What is the estimated budget to provide this same services for the year 2011-12?</p> <p>What has been spent providing these services this financial year to date?</p> <p>What was the total cost of media monitoring services, including press clippings, electronic media transcripts etcetera, provided to the department/agency for this financial year to date?</p> <p>Which agency or agencies provided these services?</p> <p>What is the estimated budget to provide this same services for the year 2011-12?</p> <p>What has been spent providing these services this financial year to date?</p>	
AI-234	Corporate	Bushby	Social Media	<p>Has there been any changes to department and agency social media or protocols about staff access and usage of Youtube; online social media, such as Facebook, MySpace and Twitter; and access to online discussions forums and blogs since publication of the Australian Public Service Commission's Circular 2012/1: Revisions to the Commission's guidance on making public comment and participating online? If yes, please explain and provide copies of any advice that has been issue. If no, please explain why not.</p>	Written Question 22 February 2012
AI-235	Corporate	Bushby	Contractors	<p>For this financial year to date:</p> <p>Has the department/agency ever employed Hawker Britton in any capacity or is it considering employing Hawker Britton? If yes, provide details.</p> <p>Has the department/agency ever employed Shannon's Way in any capacity or is it considering employing Shannon's Way? If yes, provide details.</p> <p>Has the department/agency ever employed John Utting & UMR Research Group in any capacity or is it considering employing John Utting & UMR Research Group? If yes, provide details.</p> <p>Has the department/agency ever employed McCann-Erickson in any capacity or is it considering employing McCann-Erickson? If yes, provide details.</p> <p>Has the department/agency ever employed Cutting Edge in any capacity or is it considering employing Cutting Edge? If yes, provide details.</p> <p>Has the department/agency ever employed Ikon Communications in any capacity or is it considering employing Ikon Communications? If yes, provide details.</p>	Written Question 22 February 2012

2012 SENATE ECONOMICS LEGISLATION COMMITTEE
QUESTIONS ON NOTICE – ADDITIONAL ESTIMATES – 15 FEBRUARY 2012
INDUSTRY, INNOVATION, SCIENCE, RESEARCH AND TERTIARY EDUCATION PORTFOLIO

				<p>Has the department/agency ever employed CMAX Communications in any capacity or is it considering employing CMAX Communications? If yes, provide details.</p> <p>Has the department/agency ever employed Boston Consulting Group in any capacity or is it considering employing Boston Consulting Group? If yes, provide details.</p> <p>Has the department/agency ever employed McKinsey & Company in any capacity or is it considering employing McKinsey & Company? If yes, provide details.</p>	
AI-236	Corporate	Bushby	Discretionary Grants	<p>Could the Department provide a list of all discretionary grants, including ad hoc and one-off grants for this financial year to date? Please provide details of the recipients, the intended use of the grants and what locations have benefited from the grants.</p> <p>Has the Department complied with interim requirements relating to the publication of discretionary grants?</p>	Written Question 22 February 2012
AI-237	Corporate	Bushby	Commissioned Reports	<p>How many reports were commissioned by the government in your portfolio in 2007-08, 2008-09, 2009-10 and 2010-11?</p> <p>How many Reports have been commissioned by the Government in your portfolio this financial year to date? Please provide details of each report including date commissioned, date report handed to Government, date of public release, Terms of Reference and Committee members.</p> <p>How much did each report cost/or is estimated to cost? How many departmental staff were involved in each report and at what level?</p> <p>What is the current status of each report? When is the Government intending to respond to these reports?</p>	Written Question 22 February 2012
AI-238	Corporate	Bushby	Government Payments of Accounts	<p>For this financial year to date, has the department/agency paid its accounts to contractors/consultants etc in accordance with Government policy in terms of time for payment (i.e.within 30 days)? If not, why not, and what has been the timeframe for payment of accounts? Please provide a breakdown, average statistics etc as appropriate to give insight into how this issue is being approached)</p> <p>For accounts not paid within 30 days, is interest being paid on overdue amounts and if so how much has been paid by the portfolio/department agency for the current financial year and the previous financial year?</p> <p>Where interest is being paid, what rate of interest is being paid and how is this rate determined?</p>	Written Question 22 February 2012

2012 SENATE ECONOMICS LEGISLATION COMMITTEE
QUESTIONS ON NOTICE – ADDITIONAL ESTIMATES – 15 FEBRUARY 2012
INDUSTRY, INNOVATION, SCIENCE, RESEARCH AND TERTIARY EDUCATION PORTFOLIO

AI-239	Corporate	Bushby	Government stationery requirements	How much was spent by each department and agency on the government (Ministers/Parliamentary Secretaries) stationery requirements in your portfolio (i.e. paper, envelopes, with compliments slips) this financial year to date?	Written Question 22 February 2012
AI-240	Corporate	Bushby	Media Subscriptions	<p>Does your department or agencies within your portfolio subscribe to pay TV (for example Foxtel)? If yes, please provide the reason why, the cost and what channels. What is the estimated cost for 2011-12? What is the cost for this financial year to date?</p> <p>Does your department or agencies within your portfolio subscribe to newspapers? If yes, please provide the reason why, the cost and what newspapers. What is the estimated cost for 2011-12? What is the cost for this financial year to date?</p> <p>Does your department or agencies within your portfolio subscribe to magazines? If yes, please provide the reason why, the cost and what magazines. What is the estimated cost for 2011-12? What is the cost for this financial year to date?</p>	Written Question 22 February 2012
AI-241	Corporate	Bushby	Travel Costs	<p>For the financial year to date, please detail all travel (itemised separately,) undertaken by your portfolio Minister and Parliamentary Secretaries. Include details of what the travel was for, what cost was spent on travel (including travel type – i.e. business airfare), accommodation, security, food, beverages (alcohol listed separately), gifts, entertainment, and all other expenses.</p> <p>For the financial year to date, please provide the same information (itemised separately) for any Minister and Parliamentary staff that accompanied the Minister and Parliamentary Secretary on their travel and include a similar breakdown of the costs incurred by or on behalf of those staff.</p> <p>For the financial year to date, please provide the same information (itemised separately) for Departmental officers that accompanied the Minister and Parliamentary Secretary on their travel and include a similar breakdown of the costs incurred by or on behalf of those staff.</p> <p>For the financial year to date, please detail all travel (itemised separately) undertaken by employees of each department and agency within each portfolio. Include details of what the travel was for, what cost was spent on travel (including travel type – i.e. business airfare), accommodation, security, food, beverages (alcohol listed separately), gifts, entertainment, and all other expenses.</p> <p>Are employees taking the most direct route when travelling? If not, please</p>	Written Question 22 February 2012

2012 SENATE ECONOMICS LEGISLATION COMMITTEE
QUESTIONS ON NOTICE – ADDITIONAL ESTIMATES – 15 FEBRUARY 2012
INDUSTRY, INNOVATION, SCIENCE, RESEARCH AND TERTIARY EDUCATION PORTFOLIO

				<p>explain why.</p> <p>Are lounge memberships provided to any employees? If yes, what lounge memberships, to how many employees and their classification, the reason for the provision of lounge membership and the cost per employee.</p> <p>When SES employees travel, do any support or administrative staff (such as their Executive Assistant) travel with them? If yes, provide details of why such a staff member is needed and the costs of the support staff travel.</p>	
AI-242	Corporate	Bushby	Legal costs	<p>What sum did each portfolio department and agency spend on legal services for this financial year to date within the department/agency? Please provide a list of each service and costs.</p> <p>What sum did each portfolio department and agency spend on legal services this financial year to date from the Australian Government Solicitor? Please provide a list of each service and costs.</p> <p>What sum did each portfolio department and agency spend on legal services this financial year to date from private firms? Please provide a list of each service and costs.</p> <p>What sum did each portfolio department and agency spend on legal services this financial year to date from other sources? Please provide a list of each service and costs.</p>	Written Question 22 February 2012
AI-243	Corporate	Bushby	Education expenses	<p>For this financial year to date, detail all education expenses (i.e. in house courses and tertiary studies) for each portfolio department and agency. Include what type of course, the total cost, cost per participant, how many participants and the amount of study leave granted to each participant. Also include the reason for the study.</p>	Written Question 22 February 2012
AI-244	Corporate	Bushby	Executive Coaching and Leadership Training	<p>In relation to executive coaching and/or other leadership training services purchased by each department/agency, please provide the following information for this financial year to date:</p> <p>Total spending on these services</p> <p>The number of employees offered these services and their employment classification</p> <p>The number of employees who have utilised these services, their employment classification and how much study leave each employee was granted</p> <p>The names of all service providers engaged</p> <p>For each service purchased form a provider listed under (4), please provide:</p> <p>The name and nature of the service purchased</p> <p>Whether the service is one-on-one or group based</p> <p>The number of employees who received the service and their employment</p>	Written Question 22 February 2012

2012 SENATE ECONOMICS LEGISLATION COMMITTEE
QUESTIONS ON NOTICE – ADDITIONAL ESTIMATES – 15 FEBRUARY 2012
INDUSTRY, INNOVATION, SCIENCE, RESEARCH AND TERTIARY EDUCATION PORTFOLIO

				<p>classification</p> <p>The total number of hours involved for all employees</p> <p>The total amount spent on the service</p> <p>A description of the fees charged (i.e. per hour, complete package)</p> <p>Where a service was provided at any location other than the department or agency's own premises, please provide:</p> <p>The location used</p> <p>The number of employees who took part on each occasion</p> <p>The total number of hours involved for all employees who took part</p> <p>Any costs the department or agency's incurred to use the location</p>	
AI-245	Corporate	Bushby	Media Training	<p>In relation to media training services purchased by each department/agency, please provide the following information for this financial year to date:</p> <p>Total spending on these services</p> <p>The number of employees offered these services and their employment classification</p> <p>The number of employees who have utilised these services, their employment classification and how much study leave each employee was granted</p> <p>The names of all service providers engaged</p> <p>For each service purchased from a provider listed under (4), please provide:</p> <p>The name and nature of the service purchased</p> <p>Whether the service is one-on-one or group based</p> <p>The number of employees who received the service and their employment classification</p> <p>The total number of hours involved for all employees</p> <p>The total amount spent on the service</p> <p>A description of the fees charged (i.e. per hour, complete package)</p> <p>Where a service was provided at any location other than the department or agency's own premises, please provide:</p> <p>The location used</p> <p>The number of employees who took part on each occasion</p> <p>The total number of hours involved for all employees who took part</p> <p>Any costs the department or agency's incurred to use the location.</p>	Written Question 22 February 2012
AI-246	Corporate	Bushby	Paid Parental Leave	<p>Please list how many staff in each portfolio department and agency are eligible to receive payments under the Government's Paid Parental Leave scheme?</p> <p>For this financial year to date list which department/agency is providing its employees with payments under the Government's Paid Parental Leave scheme?</p>	Written Question 22 February 2012

2012 SENATE ECONOMICS LEGISLATION COMMITTEE
QUESTIONS ON NOTICE – ADDITIONAL ESTIMATES – 15 FEBRUARY 2012
INDUSTRY, INNOVATION, SCIENCE, RESEARCH AND TERTIARY EDUCATION PORTFOLIO

				Please list how many staff are in receipt of these payments.	
AI-247	Corporate	Bushby	Training for Portfolio Minister and Parliamentary Secretaries	For this financial year to date, how much has been spent on training for Ministers and Parliamentary Secretaries in your portfolio? Itemise each training, cost and for which Minister and/or Parliamentary Secretary the training was for. For this financial year to date, how much has been spent on training for designed to better suit the needs of Ministers and Parliamentary Secretaries in your portfolio? Itemise each training, cost and for which Minister and/or Parliamentary Secretary the training was for, and how many employees attended and their classification.	Written Question 22 February 2012
AI-248	Corporate	Bushby	Corporate Cars	How many cars are owned by each department and agency in your portfolio? Where is the car/s located? What is the car/s used for? What is the cost of each car for this financial year to date? How far did each car travel this financial year to date?	Written Question 22 February 2012
AI-249	Corporate	Bushby	Taxi Costs	How much did each department/agency spend on taxis in 2007-08, 2008-09, 2009-10 and 2010-11? Provide a breakdown of each business group in each department/agency. How much did each department/agency spend on taxis this financial year to date? Provide a breakdown of each business group in each department/agency.	Written Question 22 February 2012
AI-250	Corporate	Bushby	Credit Cards	How many staff in each department and agency have a corporate credit card? What is their classification? What action is taken if the corporate credit card is misused? How is corporate credit card use monitored? What happens if misuse of a corporate credit card is discovered? Have any instances of corporate credit card misuse have been discovered? List staff classification and what the misuse was, and the action taken. What action is taken to prevent corporate credit card misuse?	Written Question 22 February 2012
AI-251	Corporate	Bushby	Climate Change	Are there climate change sections or areas that work on climate change in your department/agency? If yes, list details.	Written Question 22 February 2012
AI-252	Corporate	Bushby	Printing of Documents	Does the department/agency print any hard copies of reports/statements/papers they produce? If yes, please list how many copies, where they are delivered and the cost.	Written Question 22 February 2012
AI-253	Skills Group	Waters	Fly in, fly out	What research has the Government done on the impact of the mining industry's 'fly in, fly out' workforce on the families of the workers and on the remote communities into which they fly?	Written Question 24 February 2012

2012 SENATE ECONOMICS LEGISLATION COMMITTEE
QUESTIONS ON NOTICE – ADDITIONAL ESTIMATES – 15 FEBRUARY 2012
INDUSTRY, INNOVATION, SCIENCE, RESEARCH AND TERTIARY EDUCATION PORTFOLIO

AI-254	Skills Australia	Nash	Clarius Skills Index	<p>The latest Clarius Skills Index http://www.clarius.com.au/PDF/Clarius%20Group%20News%20Release%20-%20Major%20employment%20sectors%20to%20be%20hit%20by%20skills%20shortfalls%20071111.pdf, released in November, found a serious shortage of professionals in the health, education and engineering sectors and will be substantially hit by a skills gap in the next decade.</p> <p>In education, it states that based on current trends there will be only 73 qualified people available to fill every 107 health professionals who retire.</p> <p>In engineering, 18 per cent of those professional employed are just a few years from retirement.</p> <p>In health, for every 110 health professionals who retire, including GPs, nurses, pharmacists, vets and dietitians, there will only be 84 qualified people to replace them.</p> <p>What is the dept's response to the findings What is being done to address this skills gap?</p>	Written Question 23 February 2012
AI-255	Manufacturing	Milne	Green Design Undertakings	<p>What specific green design undertakings were made by any car manufacturer in Australia in order to secure Commonwealth funding in 2012, over and above existing subsidies in the 2011-12 budget?</p>	Written Question – Transferred from Infrastructure