



**Australian Government**

**Department of the Environment, Water, Heritage and the Arts**



Senator A McEwen  
Chair  
Senate Standing Committee on Environment, Communications and the Arts  
Parliament House  
CANBERRA ACT 2600

Dear Senator McEwen

At the February 2008 Senate Standing Committee on Environment, Communications and the Arts, Additional Budget Estimates 2008-2009, Senator Birmingham asked a question which was taken on notice by the Secretary of the Department, Mr David Borthwick. This question, numbered 13, appears on ECA 52(19 February 2008) of the transcript. A written response to this question has been provided, however since this response further reconciliations of costs have been received and the response must be amended. I attach to this letter an amended response to that question and request that the transcript be corrected accordingly.

Further to this request, two more questions were asked at the May 2008 Senate Standing Committee on Environment, Communications and the Arts, Budget Estimates 2008-2009. Senator Johnson asked a question which was taken on notice by the Secretary of the Department, Mr David Borthwick. Another question was asked in writing by Senator Birmingham. Written responses to both questions have been provided, however further reconciliations of costs have been received and the responses must be amended. I attach amended responses to questions 7 and 22 (28 May 2008) and request that the transcript be corrected accordingly.

Yours sincerely

Malcolm Thompson  
First Assistant Secretary  
Policy Coordination Division  
11 September 2008



**Senate Standing Committee on Environment, Communications and the Arts**

**ANSWERS TO QUESTIONS ON NOTICE**

**Environment, Water, Heritage and the Arts**

Additional Budget Estimates 2008-2009, February 2008

**Outcome:** Question No: 13  
**Division/Agency:** Policy Co-ordination Division  
**Topic:** Visit to Bali by Minister Garrett  
**Hansard Page ECA:** 52(19)

**Senator Birmingham asked:**

- (a) Did Garrett take staff to Bali with him?  
**Mr Borthwick** – Yes he did  
**SENATOR BIRMINGHAM** – How many?  
**SENATOR WONG** – Can we clarify this? Is this departmental staff or personal staff  
**SENATOR BIRMINGHAM** – Personal staff  
**Mr Borthwick** – I would have to check.
- (b) What was the total cost of Mr Garrett's trip to Bali  
**Mr Borthwick** – I would have to take that on notice
- (c) **SENATOR BIRMINGHAM** - and that of his staff as well please?  
**Mr Borthwick** – Okay
- (d) **SENATOR IAN MACDONALD** - Perhaps it would be easier if you just gave us a list of the Australian delegation in total.  
**Mr Borthwick** - But I am happy to take on notice the questions about Mr Garrett and his staff and about what staff that are nominally in my department were involved

**Answers:**

- (a) Apart from Departmental Officers the Minister was accompanied by only one adviser.
- (b) As at 24 July 2008, total costs for the Minister were as follows:
- (i) Travel – \$3 963.20
  - (ii) Accommodation – \$5 090.55
  - (iii) Other expenses – \$5 947.60
- (c) As at 24 July 2008, total costs for the advisor were as follows:
- (i) Travel – \$3 963.20
  - (ii) Accommodation – \$2 085.21
  - (iii) Other Expenses – \$2 352.42
- (d) Concerning officers from the Department: Two officers from the Department of the Environment, Water, Heritage and the Arts attended the conference. The rest of the delegation was made up of officers who are now with the Department of Climate Change.

**Senate Standing Committee on Environment, Communications and the Arts Committee**

Answers to questions on notice

**Environment, Water, Heritage and the Arts portfolio**

Budget Estimates, May 2008

**Outcome:** All **Question No:** 7  
**Output:** -  
**Division/Agency:** PCD  
**Topic:** Bali trip PQ 90  
**Hansard Page ECITA:** 17 (28 May)

**Senator Johnston asked:**

- (a) **Senator JOHNSTON**—Mr Borthwick, in answer to question No. 90, the actual minister responded and said that to get to Bali he incurred travel expenses of \$5,502. Was that with Qantas, and which other destination was it via to get there? Was it first class, business class, economy class?  
**Mr Borthwick**—... I will have to take that on notice.  
...**Senator JOHNSTON**—Could you tell me which airline it was?
- (b) ...**Senator JOHNSTON**—Mr Garrett had accommodation for the five nights that he stayed in Denpasar and the expenses were \$5,832, which tells me that that was over \$1,000 per night. Could you explain that to us, please?  
...**Senator JOHNSTON**—Could you have a good look at that, and please take on notice that I would like a full and complete explanation as to who arranged your minister's accommodation in Bali? I take it was at Nusa Dua or somewhere like that.  
**Mr Borthwick**—It would have been negotiated through the Department of Foreign Affairs and Trade.  
**Senator JOHNSTON**—... I would like to know why he had accommodation in excess of \$1,000 per night in Bali, and I would like a detailed breakdown of that \$5,832... He had other expenses on top of that of \$7,206. I would like to know what that accounts for too...these expenses were probably remitted back to your department, were they not?  
**Mr Borthwick**—I do not know who met those expenses, but I will take it on notice and give to you the detail that you have requested...  
**Mr Borthwick**—There were some functions which Australia hosted...  
**Senator JOHNSTON**—I would like the details of all of that, thank you...
- (c) ...**Senator JOHNSTON**—With respect, Mr Borthwick, the minister was accompanied by one adviser. His travel costs were \$3,005. This is, again, question No. 90. The accommodation for that person was \$2,366 and he had other expenses of \$1,578, with expenses still to be acquitted when this question was received on 16 May. Could you advise me the full details of each of those pieces of expenditure, as to which airline was travelled, what class, via which destination, where the accommodation was had, what nightly rate was incurred and what precisely the other expenses entailed, including the sum yet to be acquitted to that. I understand that it might be some \$3,000 outstanding in addition to that.



Senate Standing Committee on Environment, Communications and the Arts Committee

Answers to questions on notice

Environment, Water, Heritage and the Arts portfolio

Budget Estimates, May 2008

**Senator Wong**—I am not sure where you get that information. The answer to the question on notice says that other expenses are still to be acquitted.

- (d) **Senator JOHNSTON**—...Also, Mr Borthwick, with respect, two other officers of the Department of the Environment, Water, Heritage and the Arts attended the conference. ... One officer attended the conference from the 9th to the 16th. The other officer attended the conference from the 9th to the 15th. The total travel cost for these officers was \$5,537. I would like to know exactly which airline, what class and which destination they went via. Their accommodation was \$9,195. I would like to know the nightly rate and what other expenses were incurred in that nightly accommodation. They also incurred additional expenses of \$5,412. I would like to know precisely what that entailed.

**Mr Borthwick**—I will take that on notice too.

**Answers:**

- (a) The amount of *air travel expenses* has since been reconciled by the Department of Finance and Deregulation to \$3,963.20.

Minister Garrett's itinerary indicates he was confirmed to fly direct from Sydney to Denpasar in business class with Jetstar and to return flying business class with Malaysian Airlines from Denpasar to Kuala Lumpur. From Kuala Lumpur his itinerary indicates he was confirmed to fly first class with Malaysian airlines from Kuala Lumpur to Sydney.

- (b) (i) The amount of *other expenses* provided in answer to question 90 has since been fully reconciled to \$5,947.60. The breakdown of this amount is as follows:

Travel Allowance	\$441
Meals	\$321.07
Ground Transport	\$813.87
Laundry	\$5.54
Incidentals	\$93.01
Security Personnel	\$1 998.71
Security Accommodation	\$1 814.31
Phone Charges	\$460.09

(ii) The amount for *accommodation expenses* provided in answer to question 90 has since been fully reconciled by the Department of Finance and Deregulation to be \$5,090.55. Exact nightly rates are unavailable but for six nights accommodation this can be calculated to be an average rate of \$848.43 per night. Accommodation for the Minister was arranged by the Department of Foreign Affairs and Trade. It was at the Laguna Resort and Spa in Nusa Dua.

**Senate Standing Committee on Environment, Communications and the Arts Committee**

Answers to questions on notice

**Environment, Water, Heritage and the Arts portfolio**

Budget Estimates, May 2008

(iii) These expenses were paid for by the Department of Finance and Deregulation, the Department of Climate Change and the Department of the Environment, Water, Heritage and the Arts.

- (c) (i) Amount of other expenses for the Minister's advisor provided in answer to question 90 has since been further reconciled by the Department of Finance and Deregulation and amended to \$2,352.42. The breakdown of this amount is as follows:

Travel Allowance	\$546.36
Fax rental	\$1578.35
Meals	\$169.70
Laundry	\$39.17
Incidentals	\$18.84

(ii) The amount of *air travel expenses* has since been reconciled by the Department of Finance and Deregulation to \$3,963.20. According to his travel itinerary, the Minister's advisor was confirmed to fly direct to Bali in Business Class with Jetstar from Sydney to Denpasar. His travel itinerary indicates he was waitlisted to return flying business class with Malaysian Airlines from Denpasar to Kuala Lumpur and first class with Malaysian airlines from Kuala Lumpur to Sydney.

(iii) The amount for *accommodation expenses* provided in answer to question 90 has since been fully reconciled by the Department of Finance and Deregulation to be \$2085.21. Exact nightly rates are unavailable but for six nights accommodation this can be calculated to be an average rate of \$347.54 per night. Accommodation was at the Laguna Resort and Spa in Nusa Dua.

- (d) (i) The amount of *air travel expenses* has since been reconciled to be \$11 000.09.

According to her travel itinerary, one Departmental officer was confirmed to fly business class with Jetstar direct to Bali. From Bali to Sydney her itinerary indicates she was confirmed to fly business class with Malaysian Airlines via Kuala Lumpur.

According to his travel itinerary, the second Departmental Officer was confirmed to travel to and from Bali with Singapore Airlines, flying first class between Sydney and Singapore and business class between Singapore and Bali, on the way there and on return to Australia.

(ii) Invoices from the Department of Foreign Affairs and Trade have provided the full cost of accommodation but not the nightly rate. Accommodation for the first departmental officer was invoiced as \$4,579.44. For nine nights accommodation this works out to be an average of \$508.82 per night. The second

**Senate Standing Committee on Environment, Communications and the Arts Committee**

Answers to questions on notice

**Environment, Water, Heritage and the Arts portfolio**

Budget Estimates, May 2008

departmental officer's total accommodation cost was \$4,614.95. For seven nights accommodation this works out to be an average of \$659.28 per night.

(iii) The amount of \$5,412 has since been amended to \$2,489.40. The breakdown of this amount is as follows:

Meals	\$1144.25
Incidentals	\$381.22
Taxi fares	\$47.36
Departure tax	\$37.38
Additional airfare	\$504.43
Visa for Indonesia	\$60.00
Basic equipment allowance	\$243.00
Internet charges	\$71.76

In addition, the Department of the Environment, Water, Heritage and the Arts' part of shared Australian Government expenses is \$2,673.26 broken down as follows:

Delegation office	\$2445.88
Stationary	\$86.60
Delegation transport	\$140.78

**Senate Standing Committee on Environment, Communications and the Arts Committee**

Answers to questions on notice

**Environment, Water, Heritage and the Arts portfolio**

Budget Estimates, May 2008

<b>Outcome:</b>	All	<b>Question No:</b>	22
<b>Output:</b>	-		
<b>Division/Agency:</b>	PCD		
<b>Topic:</b>	Ministers travel costs/DLOs		
<b>Hansard Page ECITA:</b>	Written Question on Notice		

**Senator Birmingham asked:**

- (a) Has the Minister travelled overseas on official business since appointment?
- (b) If so, where was the travel and what was the duration?
- (c) What was the total cost of:
  - (i) travel?
  - (ii) accommodation?
  - (iii) any other expenses?
- (d) How many Ministerial staff or family accompanied the Minister?
- (e) For these staff and/or family, what was the cost of:
  - (i) travel?
  - (ii) accommodation?
  - (iii) any other expenses?
- (f) How many officers from the Department accompanied the Minister?
- (g) In relation to these Departmental officers, what was the total cost of:
  - (i) travel?
  - (ii) accommodation?
  - (iii) any other expenses?
- (h) How many Departmental Liaison Officers have been allocated to the Minister?
- (i) What was the cost of the Minister's travel and expenses for the three Community Cabinet meetings that have been held?
- (j) How many Ministerial Staff and Departmental officers travelled with the Minister for the Cabinet meetings?
- (k) What was the total cost of this travel?



**Senate Standing Committee on Environment, Communications and the Arts Committee**

Answers to questions on notice

**Environment, Water, Heritage and the Arts portfolio**

Budget Estimates, May 2008

**Answers:**

(a) (i) Minister Wong has not travelled overseas on official business for the Environment, Water, Heritage and the Arts portfolio since her appointment.

(ii) Minister Garrett has travelled overseas on official business since his appointment.

(b) Minister Garrett has undertaken the following travel:

- Indonesia from 9 – 15 December 2007;
- Papua New Guinea from 22 – 24 April 2008;
- Europe from 25 April – 2 May 2008; and
- Chile and the United States of America from 22 June – 2 July 2008.

(c) The Department of Finance and Deregulation and the Department of the Environment, Water, Heritage and the Arts paid the following costs for Minister Garrett's travel to Indonesia:

- (i) Travel – \$3 963.20
- (ii) Accommodation – \$5 090.55
- (iii) Other Expenses – \$5 947.60

Minister Garrett's travel costs for his trips to Papua New Guinea, Europe, Chile and the United States of America are still to be acquitted by the Department of Finance and Deregulation.

One Ministerial staff member accompanied Minister Garrett on his overseas travel to Indonesia, Papua New Guinea, Europe and the United States of America. Two Ministerial staff members accompanied the Minister to Chile.

No family members accompanied the Minister on any of his trips.

(d) The Department of Finance and Deregulation and the Department of the Environment, Water, Heritage and the Arts paid the following costs for Minister's advisor to accompany the Minister to Indonesia:

- (i) Travel – \$3 963.20
- (ii) Accommodation – \$2 085.21
- (iii) Other Expenses – \$2 352.42

The travel costs of Ministerial staff accompanying Minister Garrett on his trips to Papua New Guinea, Europe, Chile and the United States of America are still to be acquitted by the Department of Finance and Deregulation.



**Senate Standing Committee on Environment, Communications and the Arts Committee**

Answers to questions on notice

**Environment, Water, Heritage and the Arts portfolio**

Budget Estimates, May 2008

- (f) (i) Indonesia – Two Departmental officers were a part of the Minister’s delegation.  
(ii) Papua New Guinea – Two Departmental officers were a part of the Minister’s delegation.  
(iii) Europe – One Departmental officer was a part of the Minister’s delegation.  
(iv) Chile – Seven Departmental officers were a part of the Minister’s delegation.  
(v) United States of America – One Departmental officer accompanied the Minister and an additional Departmental officer accompanied the Minister for one day.

- (g) The cost of the first Departmental Officer’s travel to Indonesia was:

- (i) Travel – \$7 750.33
- (ii) Accommodation – \$4 614.95
- (iii) Other Expenses – \$1 635.30

The cost of the second Departmental Officer’s travel to Indonesia was:

- (i) Travel – \$3 249.76
- (ii) Accommodation – \$4 579.44
- (iii) Other Expenses – \$854.10

The cost of the first Departmental Officer’s travel to Papua New Guinea was:

- (i) Travel – \$4 664.78
- (ii) Accommodation – \$2 036.08
- (iii) Other Expenses – \$872.21

The cost of the second Departmental Officer’s travel to Papua New Guinea was:

- (i) Travel – \$3 999.58
- (ii) Accommodation – \$1 794.46
- (iii) Other Expenses – \$962.27

The cost of the first Departmental Officer’s travel to Europe was:

- (i) Travel – \$11 101.68
- (ii) Accommodation – \$4 159.92
- (iii) Other Expenses – \$2 349.63

The travel costs of Departmental officers accompanying Minister Garrett on his trip to Chile and the United States of America have not yet been acquitted.

- (h) (i) The Environment, Water, Heritage and Arts Portfolio provides one Departmental Liaison Officer to Minister Wong.
- (ii) Minister Garrett has been allocated two Departmental Liaison Officers.

**Senate Standing Committee on Environment, Communications and the Arts Committee**

Answers to questions on notice

**Environment, Water, Heritage and the Arts portfolio**

Budget Estimates, May 2008

- (i) (i) As of 21 July 2008, the Department of Finance and Deregulation paid the following costs for Minister Wong's travel to Community Cabinet meetings:
- Perth Community Cabinet Meeting on 21 January 2008:  
- Travel – \$2 082.73  
- Other Expenses – \$353.00
- Brisbane Community Cabinet Meeting on 2 March 2008:  
- Travel – \$2 426.12  
- Other Expenses – \$356.00
- Sydney Community Cabinet Meeting on 15 April 2008:  
- Travel – \$914.07  
- Other Expenses – \$0.00.
- (ii) As of 21 July 2008, the Department of Finance and Deregulation paid the following costs for Minister Garrett's travel to Community Cabinet meetings:
- Perth Community Cabinet Meeting on 21 January 2008:  
- Travel – \$1 179.02  
- Other Expenses – \$0.00
- Brisbane Community Cabinet Meeting on 2 March 2008:  
- Travel – \$1 015.26  
- Other Expenses – \$0.00.
- Minister Garrett did not incur any costs for travel or expenses for the third Community Cabinet meeting.
- (j) (i) Minister Wong was accompanied by one Ministerial Staff member to the first Community Cabinet meeting, two to the second meeting and third meetings.
- (ii) Minister Garrett was accompanied by one Ministerial Staff member to the first Community Cabinet meeting, two to the second meeting and one to the third.
- (iii) Two Departmental officers from DEWHA attended each of the first three Community Cabinet meetings to support the Minister for the Environment, Heritage and the Arts and the Minister for Climate Change and Water.
- (k) The total cost of travel for Ministers Wong and Garrett's Ministerial Staff and accompanying Departmental officers to attend the first three Community Cabinet meetings was \$23 318.29.