



## Minority Report by the Hon. Dr Sharman Stone MP

- 1.1 The Joint Standing Committee on Migration commenced an inquiry into immigration detention options and issues in May 2008.
- 1.2 Unfortunately I joined the committee in 10 November 2008, after most of the evidence and inspections that form the basis of all three reports had been taken. I was not able to question those making submissions, nor visit most of the facilities.
- 1.3 The Committee visited the facilities on Christmas Island prior to the current surge commencing in September 2008, and so, its observations on the functioning of the facility are based on its appearance while empty of detainees, and without community or DIAC feedback on the functioning of the facilities or adequacy of services following the arrival of over 1000 detainees over nearly 12 months.
- 1.4 Unfortunately my several requests to officially visit and inspect the Christmas Island facility since the surge have not been facilitated. I cannot then support any recommendations in relation to the major offshore facility at Christmas Island given the absence of any relevant observation or commentary on the performance of the Island detention facilities in operation.
- 1.5 Nor was the Committee able to obtain a detailed breakdown of the costs associated with the various detention options, except for those on the Christmas Island secure facility. Neither the costs of the transit accommodation available in the capital cities nor the community detention options were provided to the Committee despite requests for the data. This makes a meaningful discussion of the viability, efficiency or alternatives to various facilities impossible.

- 1.6 No data was supplied to the Committee about security breaches, eg escapes from detention facilities, and yet the Committee made recommendations about the appropriateness and adequacy of security infrastructure. Clearly this data about security breaches was essential for a reasoned debate about the adequacy or performance of different physical infrastructure.
- 1.7 Given these data and inquiry/methodology problems I cannot support the Committee's recommendations.

The Hon. Dr Sharman Stone MP