
The Parliament of the Commonwealth of Australia

Report 400

Review of Aviation Security in Australia

Joint Committee of Public Accounts and Audit

June 2004
Canberra

© Commonwealth of Australia 2004

ISBN 0 642 78452 3



Contents

Foreword.....	ix
Membership of the Committee.....	xi
Membership of the Sectional Committee	xii
Duties of the Committee	xiii
Terms of reference.....	xv
List of abbreviations	xvii
List of recommendations.....	xxi

REPORT

1 Introduction	1
Australia's aviation security framework.....	1
Aviation under review	4
The Committee's inquiry	7
Report structure.....	8
2 Current threat environment.....	11
Introduction	11
Australia in the world context.....	12
Categorisation of airports	13
Committee comment	15
Threats facing Australia's aviation industry.....	15
Terrorism threats	16

Passengers with mental health problems.....	23
Passengers in custody	23
Airport rage	28
Comparing Australia’s aviation security with international benchmarks.....	32
Committee conclusion.....	34
3 Security enhancements	37
Introduction.....	37
Booking, ticketing, and check-in.....	37
Scrutiny of documents.....	38
Passenger information.....	39
Use of biometrics	41
Screening of passengers and air cargo	48
Current screening technologies	49
Emerging screening technologies.....	51
In-flight security.....	53
Airspace modelling	54
On-board security devices.....	54
Air Security Officer program.....	59
Whole of government approach.....	61
Limitations of technology	62
Committee comment.....	63
4 Meeting the costs of security enhancements.....	65
Introduction.....	65
Balancing additional costs with potential impacts	66
Costs of increasing security at airports.....	67
Costs at major airports	67
Costs at regional airports	68
Meeting the additional costs for security at airports	70
Major airports.....	70
Regional airports.....	72
Meeting the costs of the Air Security Officer program.....	74
Committee comment.....	74

5	Interactions between aviation participants	77
	Introduction	77
	Interactions between the regulator and the stakeholders	77
	Consultations concerning the legislation	78
	Provision of intelligence, advice, and guidance	80
	Interactions between aviation industry participants	85
	Commonwealth and State police forces	85
	Security committees at airports.....	88
6	Security procedures at airports	93
	Introduction	93
	Legislated requirements	94
	Airport security committees	94
	Airport areas and security zones	96
	Trial of additional security procedures	101
	Committee comment	102
	Security procedures at non-regulated airports	102
	Committee comment	103
7	Training	105
	Introduction	105
	Check-in staff	106
	Screening staff	107
	Private or public sector screening.....	109
	Committee comment	109
	Flight and cabin crew	110
	Airport ground staff	111
	Committee comment	113
8	Auditing performance	115
	Introduction	115
	Audits undertaken by screening service contractors	115
	Audits undertaken by airports and airlines	116
	Committee comment	118

Audits undertaken by the regulator	119
Competency of DoTaRS staff	119
Training of departmental inspectors	120
Types of audit performed	121
Audits of airports and airlines.....	123
Audits of air cargo operations	124
Penalties for breaches.....	125
Committee comment	128
9 Aviation security culture	131
Introduction	131
Security culture at small airports	132
Committee comment	133
Security culture at large airports	134
Security incident at Melbourne Airport—a case study.....	135
Committee comment	135
Engaging the public	138
Committee comment	139
Committee conclusion	140

APPENDICES

A Appendix A—List of Submissions	143
B Appendix B—List of Exhibits	147
C Appendix C — Witnesses appearing at the public hearing	149
Canberra, Thursday 4 September 2003.....	149
Canberra, Friday 5 September 2003	151
Sydney, Thursday 2 October 2003.....	152
Melbourne, Tuesday 12 October 2003.....	154
Brisbane, Wednesday 12 November 2003	155
Canberra, Monday 24 November 2003.....	156

Appendix D—Inspection visits **157**

Tuesday 20 May 2003 **157**

 Inspection and briefing at Kingsford Smith Airport Sydney 157

Wednesday 1 October 2003 **158**

 Inspection and briefing at Tamworth Airport 158

 Inspection and briefing at Coffs Harbour Airport 158



Chairman's foreword

This report presents the Joint Committee of Public Accounts and Audit's review of aviation security in Australia. The review arose from the Committee's statutory obligation to review reports of the Auditor-General, namely *Audit Report No. 26, 2002–2003, Aviation Security in Australia* which was tabled in January 2003.

Australia's aviation industry services approximately 50 million international and domestic passenger movements each year and involves some 70 000 employees who contribute in one way or another to aviation security. The industry is regulated by the Department of Transport and Regional Services.

The Committee has reviewed the current threat environment within which Australia's aviation industry operates, the opportunities and costs of security enhancements, the aviation security framework, and the human aspects of security, including the culture of security.

In summary, the security measures under which aviation security operates in Australia are appropriate to the current level of threat, there is flexibility to adjust the framework to meet changing threats, and the culture of security is positive.

The Committee has identified the security culture as being one of the more important aspects of security and is pleased with the attitude of employees at the interface between the aviation industry and the travelling public. The Committee has drawn on its own experiences of airline travel in Australia and overseas and notes the friendly, yet firm and professional attitude of the personnel involved in aviation security.

This security attitude in Australia contrasts markedly with the attitudes of security personnel, particularly screeners, in some other countries. The alternative—belligerence, heavy handedness, and arrogance—will not engage the public and will hinder security outcomes.

The Committee has made five recommendations aimed at:

- clarifying the interaction between the newly created Australian Government airport security committees and existing airport security committees;
- strengthening the regulations by the inclusion in them of the non-negotiable aspects of the security framework;
- improving the procedures for the return of expired aviation security identification cards;
- broadening security awareness training to cover everyone who has access to security-controlled areas at airports; and
- maintaining the positive security culture through the introduction of educational measures aimed at promoting a robust security culture.

Overall, the Committee is satisfied that the standard of security at Australia's airports and on aircraft is sufficient to meet the current threat environment. From time to time there will be security incidents triggered by circumstances at various layers in the system. Sometimes an incident which may appear trivial to the casual observer will cause major disruption. The Committee believes this shows aviation participants are taking their security responsibilities seriously.

I regard this report as being a positive report card for aviation security in Australia at this point in time.

Mr Bob Charles MP
Chairman



Membership of the Committee

40th Parliament

Chairman Mr Bob Charles MP

Deputy Chair Ms Tanya Plibersek MP

Members	Senator Stephen Conroy (until 10/09/03)	Mr Steven Ciobo MP
	Senator John Hogg (until 5/02/03, from 10/09/03)	Mr John Cobb MP
	Senator Gary Humphries (from 10/09/03)	Mr Petro Georgiou MP
	Senator Kate Lundy (until 01/04/04)	Ms Sharon Grierson MP
	Senator Claire Moore (from 01/04/04)	Mr Alan Griffin MP
	Senator Andrew Murray	Ms Catherine King MP
	Senator Nigel Scullion	Mr Peter King MP
	Senator John Watson	The Hon Alex Somlyay MP



Membership of the Sectional Committee

Chairman Mr Bob Charles MP

Deputy Chair Ms Tanya Plibersek MP

Members Senator John Hogg
 Senator John Watson

Mr Steven Ciobo MP

Mr John Cobb MP

Ms Sharon Grierson MP

Ms Catherine King MP

The Hon Alex Somlyay MP

Committee Secretariat

Alg Secretary Mr James Catchpole

Inquiry Secretary Dr John Carter

Research Officer Ms MaryEllen Miller

Administrative Officer Ms Maria Miniutti

Ms Jessica Butler



Duties of the Committee

The Joint Committee of Public Accounts and Audit is a statutory committee of the Australian Parliament, established by the *Public Accounts and Audit Committee Act 1951*.

Section 8(1) of the Act describes the Committee's duties as being to:

- (a) examine the accounts of the receipts and expenditure of the Commonwealth, including the financial statements given to the Auditor-General under subsections 49(1) and 55(2) of the *Financial Management and Accountability Act 1997*;
- (b) examine the financial affairs of authorities of the Commonwealth to which this Act applies and of intergovernmental bodies to which this Act applies;
- (c) examine all reports of the Auditor-General (including reports of the results of performance audits) that are tabled in each House of the Parliament;
- (d) report to both Houses of the Parliament, with any comment it thinks fit, on any items or matters in those accounts, statements and reports, or any circumstances connected with them, that the Committee thinks should be drawn to the attention of the Parliament;
- (e) report to both Houses of the Parliament any alteration that the Committee thinks desirable in:
 - (i) the form of the public accounts or in the method of keeping them; or
 - (ii) the mode of receipt, control, issue or payment of public moneys;

- (f) inquire into any question connected with the public accounts which is referred to the Committee by either House of the Parliament, and to report to that House on that question;
- (g) consider:
 - (i) the operations of the Audit Office;
 - (ii) the resources of the Audit Office, including funding, staff and information technology;
 - (iii) reports of the Independent Auditor on operations of the Audit Office;
- (h) report to both Houses of the Parliament on any matter arising out of the Committee's consideration of the matters listed in paragraph (g), or on any other matter relating to the Auditor-General's functions and powers, that the Committee considers should be drawn to the attention of the Parliament;
- (i) report to both Houses of the Parliament on the performance of the Audit Office at any time;
- (j) consider draft estimates for the Audit Office submitted under section 53 of the *Auditor-General Act 1997*;
- (k) consider the level of fees determined by the Auditor-General under subsection 14(1) of the *Auditor-General Act 1997*;
- (l) make recommendations to both Houses of Parliament, and to the Minister who administers the *Auditor-General Act 1997*, on draft estimates referred to in paragraph (j);
- (m) determine the audit priorities of the Parliament and to advise the Auditor-General of those priorities;
- (n) determine the audit priorities of the Parliament for audits of the Audit Office and to advise the Independent Auditor of those priorities; and
- (o) undertake any other duties given to the Committee by this Act, by any other law or by Joint Standing Orders approved by both Houses of the Parliament.



Terms of reference

As part of its statutory responsibility to examine reports from the Auditor-General, the Joint Committee of Public Accounts and Audit is expanding its review of *Audit Report No. 26, 2002-2003, Aviation Security in Australia, Department of Transport and Regional Services* to inquire and report on:

- a) regulation of aviation security by the Commonwealth Department of Transport and Regional Services;
- b) compliance with Commonwealth security requirements by airport operators at major and regional airports;
- c) compliance with Commonwealth security requirements by airlines;
- d) the impact of overseas security requirements on Australian aviation security;
- e) cost imposts of security upgrades, particularly for regional airports;
- f) privacy implications of greater security measures; and
- g) opportunities to enhance security measures presented by current and emerging technologies.



List of abbreviations

ABS	Australian Bureau of Statistics
AEC	Australian Electoral Commissioner
AFP	Australian Federal Police
AISA	Australian Identity Security Alliance
ANAO	Australian National Audit Office
APAM	Australian Pacific Airports Corporation (Melbourne)
APP	Advance Passenger Processing
APS	Australian Protective Service
ASC	Airport Security Committee
ASIC	Aviation Security Identification Card
ASIO	Australian Security Intelligence Organisation
ASMs	Additional security measures
ASOs	Air security officers
ASU	Australian Services Union
BAA	British Airport Authority
BAC	Brisbane Airport Corporation

BARA	Board of Airline Representatives of Australia Inc
CTFR	Counter-terrorism first response
CSIRO	Commonwealth Scientific and Industrial Research Organisation
DAL	Document Alert List
DFAT	Department of Foreign Affairs and Trade
DIMIA	Department of Immigration and Multicultural and Indigenous Affairs
DITR	Department of Industry, Tourism and Resources
DoTaRS	Department of Transport and Regional Services
DoTRD	Department of Transport and Regional Development
FAAA	Flight Attendants' Association of Australia
HLGAS	High Level Group on Aviation Security
ICAO	International Civil Aviation Organisation
ICM	Industry Consultative Meeting
L-3	L-3 Communications Security and Detection Systems
LHMU	Australian Liquor, Hospitality and Miscellaneous Workers Union
MAL	Movement Alert List
MANPADS	Man portable air defence systems
NAL	Newcastle Airport Ltd
OVD	Optical Variable Device
PICs	Persons In Custody
PKI	Public Key Infrastructure
PNR	Passenger Name Record
SACL	Sydney Airport Corporation Ltd

SARS Severe Acute Respiratory Syndrome

SQUIDS Superconducting Quantum Interference Devices

TIPs Threat Image Projection System

List of recommendations

Recommendation 1

- 5.63 When an Australian Government security agency committee is established at a particular airport, the Department of Transport and Regional Services should be responsible for establishing a memorandum of understanding between the Government security agency committee and the corresponding airport security committee.

Recommendation 2

- 6.15 The requirement for airport security committees and other essential requirements for aviation security programs should be defined in the Aviation Transport Security Regulations 2004.

Recommendation 3

- 6.33 The Department of Transport and Regional Services should set a performance standard for the return of expired aviation security identification cards (ASICs) for each card issuing body. If this standard is not met, the department should review the mechanisms for ASIC return in the issuing body's ASIC program and require change if considered necessary.

Recommendation 4

- 7.41 The Department of Transport and Regional Services should require aviation participants to include in their transport security programs compulsory initial and ongoing security awareness training for airport security identification card holders who have not received security training as part of their normal duties.

Recommendation 5

- 9.51 The Department of Transport and Regional Services should ensure that the security programs of aviation industry participants include educational instruments designed to promote an appropriate attitude to security and, through this, a robust security culture.