
The Parliament of the Commonwealth of Australia

NUMBERS ON THE RUN

**Review of the ANAO Report No.37 1998-99 on the Management of
Tax File Numbers**

**House of Representatives
Standing Committee on Economics, Finance and Public Administration**

August 2000

Canberra

© Commonwealth of Australia 1999

ISBN 0 642 45115 X



Contents

Foreword.....	vii
Membership of the Committee.....	ix
Terms of reference	xi
List of abbreviations.....	xiii
List of recommendations.....	xv

THE REPORT

1 Introduction.....	1
Background.....	1
ANAO findings	2
Scope and conduct of the inquiry	3
2 ATO data and systems quality	5
Historical context	5
Modernisation.....	7
Management culture.....	8
Data and systems administration.....	9
Data integrity	9
Systems quality	15
Data and systems planning.....	16
Whole-of-government approach.....	18
3 Data matching.....	21
Data matching and privacy protections.....	22

The systemic use of external data bases	23
Extending data matching to additional data sets	24
Improving data quality	24
Reducing fraud	25
Strategies	25
The quality of data received	33
Extending data matching to additional transactions	36
Data matching with the ABN	37
4 Tax File Number registration	39
ATO registration procedures	40
Use of information technology	40
Issuing of TFNs	42
Alternative means of TFN registration	43
School registrations	43
Centrelink registrations.....	45
Department of Immigration and Multicultural Affairs registrations.....	46
5 Tax treatment and work rights of non-residents	49
Tax treatment of non-residents	49
Self assessment	52
Recording and matching visa numbers	53
Harvest labour	55
Fraud	56
Work rights of non-residents	59
<i>Review of Illegal Workers in Australia: Improving immigration compliance in the workplace</i>	60
<i>Harvesting Australia: Report of the National Harvest Trail Working Group</i>	62
6 Identity fraud and Proof of Identity processes	65
Extent of the problem.....	66
Quantifying identity fraud.....	68
Administrative responses	70
ATO internal processes	70
Commonwealth processes	73

A broader response	75
Other Pol techniques.....	78
Legislative responses.....	79
Recognising identity fraud as a crime	79
7 Extending Tax File Number quotation	83
Unique numeric identifiers in the public and private sector.....	84
Other financial transactions.....	85
AUSTRAC transactions.....	86
Real estate transactions.....	89
Business with government.....	91
Mandatory TFN quotation.....	94
Client Service Number	95
8 Implications for the Australian Business Number	99
ABN Registration.....	100
Data and systems quality	101
Privacy.....	102
9 Conclusions	105
Context.....	105
Findings.....	106
Need for action	108

APPENDICES

Appendix A – List of Submissions.....	109
Appendix B – List of Exhibits	111
Appendix C – List of Hearings and Witnesses.....	115



Foreword

The starting point for this inquiry was \$460 million in revenue that the Australian Taxation Office is not collecting.

As part of their audit, the ANAO found a Tax File Number system with:

- 3.2 million more Tax File Numbers than people in Australia at the last census;
- 185 000 potential duplicate tax records for individuals;
- 62 per cent of deceased clients not recorded as deceased in a sample match; and
- 40 per cent of deregistered companies still recorded as active in a sample match.

We considered that these findings were so significant that they warranted closer examination. As part of our inquiry, we investigated administrative, policy and client service issues of TFN management. We also considered a number of broader policy issues, and in particular looked at the growing problems of illegal work by non-residents and identity fraud.

As stated in the report, what we found was an organisation that is reactive rather than proactive; where emphasis is placed on strategies that return a short term financial gain rather than ensuring the long term integrity of the system; and where management philosophies are not well translated through the organisation.

This report adds to 15 years of Auditor-General and parliamentary inquiries that have found shortcomings in the quality of ATO's data and systems.

While in a general sense the tax revenue system is working well, each problem we have uncovered is another instance of sand slipping through the cracks - all of which adds up, and in this case adds up to uncollected revenue well beyond the \$460 million identified by the ANAO. The implications of these problems are even greater when the flow-on effects to other areas of government administration, including the ABN system, are taken into account.

In our report we have made a range of recommendations aimed at ensuring the ongoing quality and coverage of the TFN system. This is important for the administration of taxation, income support, superannuation and employment generally. It is also crucial for ongoing community and government confidence in the TFN system as a system that treats people fairly.

On behalf of the Committee I thank the members of the public and experts who participated in this inquiry by either making submissions or appearing at public hearings. Their input has provided significant depth to this inquiry.

I also thank the ANAO for the significant support that they provided during this inquiry. In particular I note the support provided by Mr Richard Mackey, who provided valuable expert advice and Ms Anna Przybylski, who played a major role during her secondment to the secretariat.

We also appreciate the cooperation that we received from the ATO during the inquiry, especially from Mr Chris Marsden, the ATO contact officer, Ms Gaida Blenkinsop and Ms Cathy Denino.

Finally I thank all of the members of the Economics, Finance and Public Administration Committee for their contributions to this inquiry.

David Hawker MP
Chair



Membership of the Committee

Chair Mr D P M Hawker MP

Deputy Chair Mr G S Wilton MP (until 14/6/00)

Ms A E Burke MP (from 29/6/00)

Members Mr A N Albanese MP

Ms T Gambaro MP

Mrs K E Hull MP

Mr M W Latham MP

Mr C M Pyne MP

Hon A M Somlyay MP

Dr A J Southcott MP

Committee Secretariat

Secretary Ms B Forbes

Inquiry Secretary Ms M Stutsel

Inquiry Staff Ms A Pryzbylski

Ms L McIntyre

Ms S Rogers



Terms of reference

The House of Representatives Standing Committee on Economics, Finance and Public Administration will investigate administrative, policy and client service issues of TFN management, as recently reported by the Australian National Audit Office in Audit Report No. 37 1998-99. The Committee will also inquire into other aspects of the TFN system in Australia.

The Committee will pursue its investigation under House Standing Orders (324b), which states that the reports of the Auditor-General stand referred to the relevant committee for any inquiry the committee may wish to make.



List of abbreviations

ABA	Australian Bankers' Association
ABN	Australian Business Number
ABS	Australian Bureau of Statistics
AEC	Australian Electoral Commission
AFP	Australian Federal Police
AGP	Assessable Government Payment
AIC	Australian Institute of Criminology
AIR	Annual Investment Income Report
ANAO	Australian National Audit Office
ATO	Australian Taxation Office
AUSTRAC	Australian Transaction Reports and Analysis Centre
CCCR	Commonwealth Childcare Cash Rebates
CDMP	Corporate Data Management Plan
CGT	Capital Gains Tax
CSA	Child Support Agency
CSN	Client Service Number
CUSCAL	Credit Union Services Corporation (Australia) Ltd

DETYA	Department of Education, Training and Youth Affairs
DHAC	Department of Health and Aged Care
DIMA	Department of Immigration and Multicultural Affairs
DoFA	Department of Finance and Administration
DVA	Department of Veterans' Affairs
EDF	Employment Declaration Form
FaCS	Department of Family and Community Services
FTR	Financial Transactions Reports
GST	Goods and Services Tax
HECS	Higher Education Contribution Scheme
HIC	Health Insurance Commission
IRW	Investment, Royalties and Withholding
NCA	National Crime Authority
OECD	Organisation for Economic Cooperation and Development
PAYE	Pay As You Earn
PoI	Proof of Identity
PPS	Prescribed Payments System
RPS	Reportable Payments System
SEP	Schools Education Program
TIA	Taxation Institute of Australia
TFN	Tax File Number
TFNIP	Tax File Number Improvement Project



List of recommendations

1 Introduction

2 ATO data and systems quality

Recommendation 1

That the ATO place a higher priority on having the strategic capacity to ensure the long term integrity of the Tax File Number system, including through:

- proactively managing the Tax File Number system and its interrelationships with other systems within the Australian Taxation Office and across government; and
- ensuring that management philosophies and planning are put into practice throughout the organisation. (para 2.15)

Recommendation 2

That the Australian Taxation Office act as a matter of priority to improve the significant shortcomings with its data integrity. This should include addressing the issue of excess and duplicate Tax File Numbers and archiving of redundant Tax File Numbers. (para 2.46)

Recommendation 3

That the Australian Taxation Office take all necessary steps to improve Tax File Number systems quality to more properly reflect the importance of the Tax File Number system within the Australian Taxation Office and across government. (para 2.50)

Recommendation 4

That the Australian Taxation Office review its current planning mechanisms in relation to the Tax File Number system, with a view to properly upgrading data management practices at both the agency and business line level. (para 2.57)

Recommendation 5

That the Department of Finance and Administration and the Australian Taxation Office review the Australian Taxation Office Pricing Agreement to ensure that it reflects the whole-of-government requirements in relation to the Tax File Number system. (para 2.64)

3 Data matching

Recommendation 6

That the Australian Taxation Office or an appropriately qualified consultant review the databases and information sources the ATO currently has access to in order to determine the value of systemic data matching against this information. (para 3.14)

Recommendation 7

That the Australian Taxation Office implement data matching strategies aimed at improving Australian Taxation Office data quality and reducing tax fraud, including in the areas of:

- Data cleansing;
- Fact of Death data matching;
- Department of Immigration and Multicultural Affairs movements records data matching; and
- Investigating the reintroduction of Health Insurance Commission data matching for purposes of compliance with Tax File Number identification. (para 3.60)

Recommendation 8

That the Australian Taxation Office focus on steps to improve the quality of data it receives in order to improve its data matching capabilities, including through working with other agencies and organisations. A first priority for the Australian Taxation Office in this regard should be to review and improve reporting in Annual Investment Income Reports by financial institutions. (para 3.70)

Recommendation 9

That the Australian Taxation Office evaluate and act on data matching opportunities provided by new Australian Business Number arrangements, including putting in place mechanisms to ensure that relevant data is captured and able to be used for data matching purposes. (para 3.80)

4 Tax File Number registration**Recommendation 10**

That the Australian Taxation Office review its Tax File Number registration processes, including automating checks for duplicate Tax File Numbers, making better use of available software, and improving the format and content of Tax File Number advice supplied to Tax File Number applicants. (para 4.19)

Recommendation 11

That the Australian Taxation Office take steps to improve the coverage of the Schools Education Program, including through working with the Department of Education, Training and Youth Affairs in approaching peak school organisations in order to seek their support for this program. (para 4.34)

Recommendation 12

That Centrelink be able to accept Tax File Number applications from any applicant and not just Centrelink customers as an option for those with limited access to alternatives, and that a system for electronically transferring this information to the Australian Taxation Office be introduced. (para 4.42)

Recommendation 13

That the Department of Immigration and Multicultural Affairs and the Australian Taxation Office introduce automated Tax File Number registration for new arrivals into Australia. (para 4.50)

5 Tax treatment and work rights of non-residents

Recommendation 14

That the Australian Taxation Office introduce systematic data matching against Department of Immigration and Multicultural Affairs visa data in order to identify illegal workers. As part of this process, the Australian Taxation Office has to improve its data quality and data recording processes. (para 5.27)

Recommendation 15

That the Department of Immigration and Multicultural Affairs and the Australian Taxation Office investigate options for addressing taxation and work rights issues in relation to harvest labour, including in relation to known areas of fraud and without overly burdening employers in this industry. (para 5.34)

Recommendation 16

That the Australian Taxation Office:

- identify the extent of tax fraud being committed by non-residents;
- review potential vulnerabilities with the current tax treatment of non-residents;
- propose ways to address this issue, particularly focussing on options within existing laws; and
- seek to implement these proposals as soon as practicable. (para 5.47)

Recommendation 17

That the Australian Taxation Office more actively work with the Department of Immigration and Multicultural Affairs to implement reforms in the area of work rights for non-residents, including full consideration of possible Australian Taxation Office delivered solutions. (para 5.61)

6 Identity fraud and Proof of Identity processes

Recommendation 18

That the Commonwealth Government work with other levels of government and industry to develop national statistics on the extent and cost of identity fraud in Australia. (para 6.20)

Recommendation 19

That the Australian Taxation Office improve its internal processes for establishing identity and preventing identity fraud. This should include investigation of the extent of the problem within the Australian Taxation Office, including a trial of the New South Wales Registry of Births, Deaths and Marriages' Certificate Validation Service. (para 6.31)

Recommendation 20

That the Commonwealth Government instigate a formal process for assessing Proof of Identity risks and reform across the Commonwealth, drawing on relevant policy and administrative departments and agencies. (para 6.41)

Recommendation 21

That the Commonwealth Government formalise a process for working with other levels of government and industry to develop options for reducing and preventing identity fraud. This should include investigation and development of a national electronic gateway for document verification. (para 6.57)

7 Extending Tax File Number quotation**Recommendation 22**

That the Australian Transaction Reports and Analysis Centre and the Australian Taxation Office:

- analyse the revenue at risk from Australian Transaction Reports and Analysis Centre transactions being outside Tax File Number quotation arrangements;
- consider the proportion of Australian Transaction Reports and Analysis Centre transactions to which a Tax File Number may be able to be attached; and
- undertake a consultation process with industry to develop a detailed option for attaching Tax File Numbers to Australian Transaction Reports and Analysis Centre reported transactions. (para 7.27)

Recommendation 23

That, after the proposed business tax reforms have been introduced, the Australian Taxation Office investigate the remaining risk to revenue from real estate transactions being outside Tax File Number withholding arrangements and take appropriate steps to address this risk. (para 7.36)

Recommendation 24

That the Treasury investigate extending Tax File Number quotation and withholding arrangements to include business with the Commonwealth Government, particularly in the case of Assessable Government Payments. (para 7.51)

8 Implications for the Australian Business Number**Recommendation 25**

That the Auditor-General conduct a performance audit of the Australian Taxation Office's administration of the Australian Business Number system, and that this audit include, but not be limited to, the examination of the following issues:

- registration and issue of Australian Business Numbers;
- data quality/integrity;
- data matching; and
- privacy implications. (para 8.23)

9 Conclusions**Recommendation 26**

That the Auditor-General conduct a follow-up performance audit of the Australian Taxation Office's management of the Tax File Number system, and that this audit include, but not be limited to, progress by the Australian Taxation Office against recommendations for improving the Tax File Number system made by the Australian National Audit Office and this Committee. (para 9.20)