APPENDIX F

The Indian Ocean Region: Security, Stability and Sustainability in the 21st Century

Edited by Dennis Rumley
Professor of Indian Ocean Studies
University of Western Australia

Principal contributors: David Brewster, Sanjay Chaturvedi, Timothy Doyle, Amitabh Mattoo, Dennis Rumley, Swaran Singh, Ric Smith and Siddarth Varadarajan

Australia India Institute
Task Force on Indian Ocean Security
October 2012

The views, findings and recommendations of this Report are the edited product of the collective deliberation of an independent group of analysts and policy-makers constituting the Indian Ocean Task Force at a Roundtable held in Fremantle, Western Australia, on 4th and 5th May 2012. The Report does not necessarily represent the views of the Australia-India Institute, its Faculty or its Administration. Nor does it represent the views of any one of the individuals or institutions with which those involved are affiliated. All statements of fact, expressions of opinion as well as recommendations contained in the Report are to be read bearing in mind that all contributors do not necessarily agree on every detail.

CONTENTS

I. Task Force Aims 4

II. Executive summary of the report 6

III. The changing security dynamics of the Indian Ocean region 14
1. Security as a multidimensional concept 14
The emergence of a new security agenda 15
Constructing security 18
Geopolitically-constructed security threats 18
Threats and legitimate interests 20

2. The changing geopolitical significance of the Indian Ocean region 22
The Indian Ocean as a routeway 22
The Indian Ocean as the neglected ocean 23
21st century reassessment of the Indian Ocean region 25
The changing geopolitical environment 26
Current regional security arrangements and forums 27

3. Regional options for Indian Ocean security 30
Competing regional security constructions 30
The Indian Ocean region 31
The Eastern Indian Ocean 33
The Indo-Pacific region 34
The United States and the Indo-Pacific 35
Towards a more inclusive regional security construction 37
Conclusion and implications 37

IV. Security challenges in the Indian Ocean region 39
1. Traditional security and military conflict 39
Traditional military security 39
Regional nuclear proliferation 42
State "success" 43
Contested spaces in the Indian Ocean region 46

2. Human security 48
Freedom and democracy in the Indian Ocean region 49
Democratisation and state stability 51
Displaced persons and asylum seekers in the Indian Ocean region 54
People trafficking 55

3. Economic and resources security 57
The global South 57
Energy security and insecurity in the Indian Ocean region 59
Resources competition and energy security 62
Economic insecurity and civil strife 63

4. Maritime security 66
Indian Ocean energy chokepoints 67
The stability of the Indian Ocean region as an energy routeway 68
The Indian Ocean as a nuclear ocean 70
Attacks on energy shipping in the Indian Ocean 71
Maritime jurisdiction and maritime boundary disputes 73
Unresolved maritime and terrestrial boundaries 74
Resolving maritime boundary disputes 75
Approaches to maritime security policy 77
Towards a cooperative maritime security policy framework 78
5. Environmental security 81
Food 83

Water 86
Nuclear waste 88
Climate change 91
Fisheries 92

V. India and Australia in Indo-Pacific security 96
The shifting balance of power in the Indo-Pacific 96
Developing the Australia-India security relationship 98
Australia's challenge in navigating relations with India and China in the Indo-Pacific 112
The idea of the Indo-Pacific region: its impact on Australia and India 114
Conclusion 118

VI. Conclusions: policy and research implications 120
Overview 120
A regional security regime 121
Geopolitical significance of the Indian Ocean region 122
Multidimensional nature of security 122
Traditional security and military conflict 122
Human security 125
Economic and resources security 126
Towards a new Indo-Pacific maritime security regime 127
Environmental security 128
Conclusion: a 21st century regional security paradigm for the Indian Ocean 130

Acknowledgment 131

Appendix – Fremantle roundtable participants 132

Bibliography 133

LIST OF FIGURES

Figure 1 The Indian Ocean regional sub-systems
Figure 2 Essential elements of multidimensional security
Figure 3 Some contradictory impacts of globalization on security
Figure 4 Indian Ocean regional security arrangements
Figure 5 Comparison among three competing regional constructions
Figure 6 The 51 states of the Indian Ocean Region
Figure 7 The USPACOM
Figure 8 Conflicts within and between states 1945-2005
Figure 9 Traditional security indicators in the Indian Ocean Region
Figure 10 The failed state index: Indian Ocean states 2008
Figure 11 Indian Ocean pearls, diamonds and nuggets
Figure 12 The freedom rating 2009: the Indian Ocean Region
Figure 13 Democracy and stability in Arab Spring states
Figure 14 Indian Ocean states: total refugees by country of origin
Figure 15 Indian Ocean states: total refugees, returned IDPs, stateless persons and population of concern end-2010

I. Task force aims

In May 2011, the Australia India Institute (AII) of the University of Melbourne set up a Task Force on Indian Ocean Security to bring together experts from Australia and India to debate and report on policy directions that both states might consider for the future enhancement of regional security. Apart from regular communication among Task Force members, preliminary meetings were also held in Melbourne and Kolkata in 2011. This report represents the edited outcome of the final Task Force meeting held in Fremantle, Western Australia in May 2012.

The AII Task Force on Indian Ocean Security had four principal aims:

1. To discuss the geopolitics of the Indian Ocean region (IOR), its changing significance, the various perspectives of regional states and the IOR's relationships with other regions as part of a broad context for an analysis of security issues.
2. To analyse the numerous security challenges of the IOR, including major non-traditional security issues such as fishing and food security; global warming and environmental issues, population and migration; access to undersea energy resources; and differences and similarities in Indian and Australian perspectives. Furthermore, to discuss issues related to sea lanes of communication (SLOCs) security along the long Indo-Pacific littoral, with particular focus on Indian and Australian perspectives on SLOC security between the Red Sea and the South China Sea.
3. To consider the roles of India and Australia in Indo-Pacific security, including a discussion of Indian and Australian perspectives on their future roles in Indo-Pacific security.
4. To evaluate various policy and research implications and options, including a

consideration of common security interests; alternative regional security structures for the IOR and/or the Indo-Pacific (for example, expansion of IOR-ARC, concerts of powers;, single issues coalitions etc); and the degree to which these would fit with Indian and Australian strategic perspectives.