Papers on Parliament No. 34
December 1999

Representation and Institutional Change

50 Years of Proportional Representation in the Senate

Edited by

Marian Sawer and Sarah Miskin

Papers from a conference arranged by
The Political Science Program, Research School of Social Sciences,
Australian National University
and
The Department of the Senate

Published and printed by the Department of the Senate, 1999

Papers on Parliament is managed by the Research Section,
Department of the Senate.

All inquiries should be made to:

The Director of Research
Procedure Office
Department of the Senate
Parliament House
CANBERRA ACT 2600

Telephone: (02) 6277 3078

ISSN 1031–976X

ISBN 0 642 71061 9

This edition revised for Internet publication, February 2000

Contents

1 Overview: Institutional Design and the Role of the Senate 1
Marian Sawer

2 Why We Chose Proportional Representation 13
John Uhr

3 The Senate and Representative Democracy 43
Elaine Thompson

4 Australian Democracy: Modifying Majoritarianism?..... 57
Arend Lijphart

5 Accountability Versus Government Control: the Effect of Proportional Representation 73
Harry Evans

6 Can the Senate Claim a Mandate? 81
Murray Goot

7 Dilemmas of Representation 97
Marian Sawer

8 'Survival of the Fittest': Future Directions of the Senate 107
Helen Coonan

9 A Squeeze on the Balance of Power: Using Senate 'Reform' to Dilute Democracy 113
Andrew Bartlett

10 A Labor Perspective on Senate Reform 121
John Faulkner

11 Should Parliament be Abolished? 133
Fred Chaney

12 The Contribution of The Greens (WA)..... 145 to the Australian Senate
Dee Margetts

13 The Representation of Small Parties and Independents 151
Campbell Sharman

14 Reporting the Senate: Three Perspectives 161
Paul Bongiorno
Michelle Grattan
Melissa Langerman

15 Lobbying the Senate: Two Perspectives 173
Peter Sekuless
Francis Sullivan

16 Personalities versus Structure: the Fragmentation of the Senate Committee System 181
Anne Lynch

17 Opening Up the Policy Process 189
Ian Marsh

18 Cyberdemocracy and the Future of the Australian Senate 201
Kate Lundy

19 The Senate and Proportional Representation: Some Concluding Observations 209
Geoffrey Brennan

Contents of previous issues of Papers on Parliament 213

List of Senate Briefs 219

Order form for Papers on Parliament and Senate Briefs 220

Tables, Figures and Illustrations

p. 3	**Table 1.1**	Milestones in Senate history since 1949
p. 4	**Table 1.2**	Milestones in Senate reform since 1949
p. 7	**Illustration**	Tanner cartoon, *Age* (Melbourne), 6 November 1992, with permission from Les Tanner
p. 47	**Table 3.1**	Senate party composition since 1949
p. 49	**Table 3.2**	Executive and party leadership in the Australian Parliament—positions first achieved by women senators
p. 61	**Table 4.1**	Average electoral disproportionality and type of electoral system in 36 democracies, 1945–1996
p. 67	**Table 4.2**	Bivariate regression analyses of the effect of electoral proportionality on 16 macro-economic performance variable
p. 69	**Table 4.3**	Bivariate regression analyses of the effect of electoral proportionality on 10 indicators of the quality of democracy
p. 103	**Table 7.1**	Meanings of political representation
p. 125	**Illustration**	*National Times,* October 27–November 1, 1975, p. 2, State Library of New South Wales
p. 147	**Illustration**	Jenny Coopes cartoon, with permission from Jenny Coopes
p. 158	**Graph**	Senate, minor party and independent vote, 1949–1998
p. 172	**Illustration**	Pryor cartoon, *Canberra Times,* 27 June 1992, p. 4, with permission from Geoff Pryor

Contributors

John Uhr is a Reader in Public Policy at the Australian National University. He is the author of *Deliberative Democracy in Australia* (1998) and the editor of *The Australian Republic: the Case for Yes* (1999).

Elaine Thompson is Associate Professor of Politics at the University of NSW. Her books include *Fair Enough: Egalitarianism in Australia* (1994).

Arend Lijphart is Research Professor in Political Science, University of California, San Diego. His books include *Electoral Systems and Party Systems* (1994) and *Patterns of Democracy: Government Forms and Performance in Thirty–Six Countries* (1999).

Harry Evans has been Clerk of the Senate since 1988. His publications include *Constitutionalism and Party Government in Australia* (1988) and *Odgers' Australian Senate Practice* (7^{th}, 8^{th} and 9^{th} editions).

Murray Goot is Professor of Politics at Macquarie University, and author of many works on voting and opinion polls.

Marian Sawer is convenor of the governance strand of the Reshaping Australian Institutions Project in the Research School of Social Sciences at the ANU. Her books include *Representation: Theory and Practice in Australian Politics*, forthcoming, co-edited with Gianni Zappalà.

Fred Chaney was a member of the Senate from 1974 to 1990 and Leader of the Opposition in the Senate from 1983 to 1990. He was a minister in the Fraser Government.

Helen Coonan is a senator for NSW and Government Deputy Whip in the Senate, a position she has held since November 1998. She is a lawyer by profession.

Andrew Bartlett is a senator for Queensland and Australian Democrats spokesman for Electoral Matters, Immigration, Social Security, Environment, Gay and Lesbian Issues, Veterans' Affairs and Housing. He has been president of the Queensland branch of the Australian Democrats, and was the national campaign manager for the 1998 election.

John Faulkner is a senator for NSW and is Shadow Minister for Public Administration and Government Services and Shadow Minister for Olympic Coordination and the Centenary of Federation. He has been Leader of the Opposition in the Senate since 1996.

Dee Margetts was a Greens senator for Western Australia from 1993 to 1999. She is currently researching for a Master's degree in Economics.

Campbell Sharman is a member of the Political Science Department at the University of Western Australia. He has a longstanding interest in the Australian federal system and the effect of constitutional and electoral rules on the political process.

Paul Bongiorno is Network Ten's political editor and Canberra bureau chief. He has been a journalist for 25 years, and has covered federal politics for the past 11 years. He is currently president of the Parliamentary Press Gallery.

Michelle Grattan is Chief Political Correspondent for the *Sydney Morning Herald*. She is a former editor of the *Canberra Times* and a former Chief Political Correspondent for the *Age*.

Melissa Langerman has worked for the Australian Associated Press since 1987, and was responsible for co-ordinating AAP coverage of the Senate for seven years. AAP is the only media organisation to cover both the House of Representatives and the Senate in detail.

Peter Sekuless founded the government relations firm Canberra Liaison with Jonathan Gaul in 1978, and has been a professional lobbyist for more than 20 years. He has written several books, including two on lobbying.

Francis Sullivan is the executive director of Catholic Health Australia, which represents 60 Catholic private and public hospitals and more than 500 Catholic aged-care services in Australia. Previously, he was a senior adviser to West Australia's Minister of Health.

Anne Lynch is the Deputy Clerk of the Senate and secretary to the Privileges Committee, positions she has held since 1988. She has written several articles dealing with parliamentary topics, especially the accountability of public entities to Parliament.

Ian Marsh is Associate Professor at the Australian Graduate School of Management. His books include *Beyond the Two-Party System: Political Representation, Economic Competitiveness and Australian Politics* (1995).

Kate Lundy is a senator for the ACT, and is Shadow Minister Assisting on New Technology and Shadow Minister for Sport and Youth Affairs. She is a member of several parliamentary committees, including the Senate Legislation and References Committees on Finance and Public Administration as well as the Senate Legislation and References Committees on Environment, Recreation, Communications and the Arts.

Geoffrey Brennan is a former Director of the Research School of Social Sciences, ANU, and is coordinator of the Reshaping Australian Institutions Project.

Acknowledgments

In light of the extent and significance of the institutional changes that have flowed from the adoption of proportional representation, the Political Science Program in the Research School of Social Sciences, Australian National University, in conjunction with the Department of the Senate, organised a conference to mark the jubilee of its first use for the Senate. The conference, from which this volume takes its name, was held in Parliament House, on 5 and 6 August 1999. Present and former senators, political scientists, political observers and enthusiasts for PR gathered in the Main Committee Room to present papers and debate the past, present and future of the Senate. The conference opened with a welcome to Ngunnawal land by Matilda House.

All of the conference papers are published in this volume and three of them (Goot, Lijphart, Sharman) are also being published in the *Australian Journal of Political Science*. The papers have been revised to incorporate the comments offered by conference participants, many of whom themselves made substantive contributions from the floor. One such contribution from the floor has led to an additional paper being included in the volume, Anne Lynch's paper on the growth of partisanship within the Senate committee system.

The Research Section of the Department of the Senate, headed by Wayne Hooper, provided invaluable assistance throughout. The Clerk of the Senate, Harry Evans, was an inspiration in his dedication to the Senate and its history. Professors Geoff Brennan and Frank Castles of the Reshaping Australian Institutions Project at the Research School of Social Sciences also lent every support and Mary Hapel of RAI did most of the day-to-day administration. Professor Arend Lijphart, the leading international authority on the institutional impact of PR, flew from California to be the keynote speaker at the conference. He did much to make the event a success. Our thanks to all of these and Gillian Evans, Ben Miskin and David Sullivan.