



Parliament of Australia

**Report of the Parliamentary Delegation
to
Germany and the 68th Annual Session of the NATO
Parliamentary Assembly**

Berlin and Madrid, 13-21 November 2022

June 2023

© Commonwealth of Australia 2023
ISBN 978-1-76092-489-8 Printed version
ISBN 978-1-76092-490-4 HTML version

This work is licensed under the Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial-NoDerivs 3.0
Australia License.



The details of this licence are available on the Creative Commons website:
<http://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc-nd/3.0/au/>.

Members of the Delegation

Ms Kate Thwaites MP
Leader of the Delegation

The Hon Mr Keith Pitt MP
Deputy Leader of the Delegation

Joel Bateman
Delegation Secretary

Introduction

The November 2022 delegation to Germany and Spain, including the NATO Parliamentary Assembly in Madrid, was undertaken by Kate Thwaites MP and the Hon Keith Pitt MP.

The bilateral visit to Germany was based on the strong relationship between the two countries, including a shared commitment to democracy and the value of the rules based international order. Germany has increasingly recognised the importance of the Indo-Pacific region as a key player in shaping the rules-based international order and in addressing global challenges, and the role of Australia as a key partner in the region. The visit occurred in the context of the war in Ukraine, which has highlighted challenges to the rules based international order, and Australia's support for Ukraine is strongly appreciated by Germany and other European nations.

The two countries have mutual interest in the resources and technologies necessary for the transition to renewable energy sources. A centrepiece of this is the Australia-Germany Hydrogen Accord, announced in June 2021. The Accord is based around three key initiatives: the HyGate Initiative (delivering projects along the supply chain for hydrogen produced from renewable sources; Hydrogen Hubs (regions where users and exporters are co-located to reduce costs and increase collaboration); and facilitation of green hydrogen trade between the two countries. Shortly after the delegation's visit to Germany, Minister

for Climate Change and Energy the Hon Chris Bowen MP and German counterparts announced funding for a further four projects under the HyGate initiative.

The delegation's visit to Germany came approximately three months after the Australian Deputy Prime Minister and Minister for Defence, the Hon Richard Marles MP, visited Berlin – supporting the defence links between the two nations.

The NATO Parliamentary Assembly, as distinct from other activities of NATO, is primarily a forum for parliamentarians of member nations, along with Regional Partners and Observer Nations (including Australia). Sessions of the NATO PA focus on presentations to and reports of the five committees, along with a plenary session and other activities.

The five committees are:

- Committee on Democracy and Security
- Defence and Security Committee
- Economics and Security Committee
- Political Committee
- Science and Technology Committee

The committees each adopt reports and policy recommendations on a range of issues, which (after being endorsed by the Assembly as a whole) become the Assembly's main policy documents. At the 2022 NATO PA, six resolutions and 16 reports were adopted. (A list of these can be found in the Appendix.)

The 68th Annual Session of the NATO Parliamentary Assembly was held in Madrid, Spain, from 18 to 21 November 2022. Almost 300 parliamentarians attended, from 30 nations. As an Observer Nation, Australia attends NATO PA sessions and is able to participate in discussions but has no voting or other membership rights.

Germany bilateral visit

The delegation's bilateral visit to Germany brought multiple overarching themes. The invasion of Ukraine, and its effects on Europe generally and Germany in particular, was raised in every meeting the delegation had, and with it, their gratitude for Australia's support for Ukraine. In that context, the shared values and close relationship (despite the geographical distance) between the two countries was emphasised. Germany sees Australia as a key relationship, particularly given Australia's place in the Indo-Pacific region. Germany has increasingly recognised the importance of the Indo-Pacific, and a common theme in discussions was the corresponding increased recognition of their relationship with Australia.

The delegation also held meetings on several key areas of interest, including green hydrogen and the energy transition overall, critical minerals and manufacturing, climate change, global security, and issues facing both countries' parliamentary and electoral systems.

Monday 14 November

Meeting with Ambassador

The delegation's first official activity in Berlin was a meeting at the Australian Embassy in Berlin with the Australian Ambassador to Germany, Mr Phillip Green OAM. Mr Green has been the Ambassador to Germany since 2020. The Ambassador and delegation members discussed key issues for Germany and the Australia-German relationship, including:

- The Ukraine conflict, and the German response to it
- The energy crisis impacting Germany, and the implications of the weather in the coming winter months with limited energy resources
- The state of the German parliament and government following the September 2021 election, and the new coalition government formed as a result
- Germany's place within NATO and the European Union
- Growing German interest in the Indo-Pacific region, especially in the context of China's growing role, and the importance of Australia within the region
- Opportunities to continue to build the Australia-Germany bilateral relationship, both in the context of shared values and on trade topics including renewable energy, particularly green hydrogen, and critical minerals

Reichstag tour and meeting with Johannes Vogel MdB

Following the meeting with Ambassador Green, the delegation undertook a tour of the Reichstag building. With the Bundestag not meeting during the delegation's time in Berlin, opportunities to meet with members were limited. However, the delegation was able to meet with Mr Johannes Vogel MdB, Chair of the German-Pacific Friendship Group. With Mr Vogel, the delegation discussed:

- Germany's changing attitudes towards the Indo-Pacific region and China
- The importance of energy security, particularly during this time of transition to renewables
- Climate change and Germany's approach to addressing it
- The current German political situation, with a new coalition government (of which Mr Vogel is a member)
- The significance of public debate, including that facilitated by the media, and the importance of protecting the public square as a site for good-faith discussions

Meeting with the Federation of German Industries (BDI)

The Federation of German Industries (BDI) is the national umbrella organisation for German industry, representing 40 sector organisations and over 100,000 individual firms. The delegation met with the BDI's Senior Manager, Critical Minerals (Anne Laurenroth) and Adviser, Energy and Climate Policies, Cara Bien, along with

a representative of AusTrade's Berlin branch, David Urry.

The meeting focused on opportunities to deepen the Australia-Germany trade relationship, including through:

- The potential for projects and connections based on raw materials and rare earths
- Green hydrogen export possibilities
- The infrastructure that will be needed to support increased use of green hydrogen
- Challenges to the production and export of green hydrogen and other renewable energy resources

Dinner with Ambassador and Embassy staff

Ambassador Green hosted the delegation, along with Embassy staff, for dinner. The delegation was given an overview of the Embassy's work and key focus areas.

Tuesday 15 November

Meeting with Dr Martin Thuemmel, Envoy for East Asia, South East Asia and Pacific, Federal Foreign Office

With Dr Thuemmel, the delegation discussed some recurring themes, including the European Union's increasing interest in the Indo-Pacific region, especially in relation to global security issues. Ms Thwaites emphasised the importance of the region to Australia and pointed to some of the key elements of Australia's engagement in the Indo-Pacific, including through the Australian Government's commitment to being part of international action to address climate change, development

assistance and emergency responses to natural disasters.

Another topic of discussion was the Australia-EU Free Trade Agreement (FTA). Dr Thuemmel outlined Germany's position on that agreement, including the importance to the EU and Germany in particular of climate targets and sustainability clauses.

Other topics discussed included:

- The Ukraine conflict, and both countries' contributions
- China's influence globally, and especially in the Pacific region
- Key trade opportunities for growth, including in clean energy, critical minerals and rare earths
- International education, and what Germany could learn from Australia's successes in the sector
- Germany's role within the EU and NATO

Berlin Wall memorial

En route to its next meeting, the delegation visited the Berlin Wall Memorial, along with a section of the remaining wall.

MAN Energy Solutions SE Berlin production site visit

Accompanied by Ambassador Green, the delegation met with Dr Markus Röhner, Site Manager Berlin and Head of R&D Engineering, at MAN Energy Solutions' production site. Dr Röhner discussed the challenges and opportunities of the transition to renewable energies, including potential solutions to the difficulties of

transporting hydrogen. Dr Röhner then conducted the delegation on a tour of the factory floor, illustrating the complex process in manufacturing a CO2 compressor.



The delegation members with Ambassador Phillip Green and Dr Markus Röhner.

Indigenous Culinary Journey opening

The delegation's time in Berlin coincided with the launch of an exhibition, *An Aboriginal Culinary Journey*, in the Embassy's exhibition space. The delegation attended the launch and met with representatives of the Australian Embassy in Berlin, along with other officials including members of other countries' German embassies. The exhibition featured both traditional Indigenous utensils and Breville kitchen appliances designed and decorated by First Nations artists.



Coffee Machine Marrapinti – Women’s Ceremonies at Marrapinti by Yukultji (Nolia) Napangati.

Wednesday 16 November

On Wednesday morning, the delegation split to undertake separate sessions organised by the Embassy, according to the members’ interests. Ms Thwaites participated in a roundtable discussion on electoral integrity issues, and Mr Pitt in a session on critical minerals.

Electoral integrity roundtable

In addition to Ms Thwaites (chair of the Joint Standing Committee on Electoral Matters) and Embassy staff, the roundtable consisted of:

- Dr Henner Jörg Boehl - Head, Electoral Law Section, Federal Ministry of the Interior
- Mr Carsten Müller MdB - Member, Bundestag Election Review Committee, CDU/CSU Bundestag Parliamentary Party

- Helena Schwertheim - Senior Digital Policy and Research Manager, Institute for Strategic Dialogue (ISD) Germany

The group considered a range of topics, including:

- Comparisons between the two countries’ electoral systems, including the role of the electoral commission and the practical running of elections; donation laws and disclosures; and advertising rules during campaigns;
- Ms Thwaites provided an overview of the Electoral Matters Committee’s inquiry into the 2022 Australian election;
- The German participants outlined issues in the 2021 German election, including the need for a rerun of the vote in the Berlin area following a review identifying electoral errors;
- The role of media, both traditional and social, and the impacts of misinformation during campaigns;
- Trust in elected officials – the importance of maintaining trust, and the issues in the two countries, including specific issues in Germany as a formerly divided nation

Critical minerals roundtable

Mr Pitt and Embassy staff held a roundtable discussion with:

- Dr Sven Uwe Schulz - Head of Unit Evaluation of Mineral Resources, Federal Institute for Geosciences and Natural Resources BGR

- Professor Jesse Scott - Visiting Research Fellow, German Institute for Economic Research DIW

The group discussed:

- the energy crisis in Europe and the issue of rising gas prices;
- the difficulties around Germany's transition to hydrogen energy, mainly in reducing prices and increasing buy in from government and industry; and
- Germany's over-reliance on critical minerals that come from, or are refined in, China.

Volkswagen factory visit

The delegation undertook a visit to the Volkswagen factory in Wolfsburg, where members were conducted on a guided tour of the production facility. The delegation was impressed by the scale of the facility, one of the biggest manufacturing plants in the world, at which approximately 60 000 people are employed and over 3 000 cars are built every day, and the precision of the process, which sees some components arrive on site less than half an hour before they are incorporated into a vehicle.

Feminist foreign policy meeting

The delegation met with Ms Helga Barth of the Federal Foreign Office to discuss Feminist Foreign Policy. The meeting considered a range of topics on that theme, including the significance of a plan to develop a Feminist Foreign Policy (under that name, in English) being written into the Coalition Agreement between the parties forming government following

the 2021 election. However, potential obstacles continue to exist, including the gender imbalance in the senior levels of the Federal Foreign Office, and sensitivities around posting female ambassadors to some other nations. Ms Thwaites noted that, while the term had not been formally used by the Australian Government, there was a strong focus on women's issues in Australia's foreign policy outlook and the Australian Government was committed to developing a First Nations Foreign Policy.

Spain and NATO Parliamentary Assembly

As the first in-person NATO Parliamentary Assembly meeting since 2019, and in the context of the Russian invasion of Ukraine, there was a strong focus on unity and the alliance of like-minded nations in the November 2022 NATO PA in Madrid. Many speakers noted NATO's reinvigorated role since Russia's act of aggression and highlighted the need for ongoing support for Ukraine. There was a strong emphasis on the importance of NATO as a group of like-minded countries supporting the rules-based international order.

From the perspective of the Australian delegation, and following on from similar sentiments being expressed in Germany, a key theme was NATO's increased interest in Indo-Pacific region, and recognition of Australia's importance within it. In the context of the NATO's role in security affairs, there was also a frequently expressed appreciation of Australia's contributions to, and support of, Ukraine. While the Australian

delegation did not have any formal bilateral meetings as part of the Assembly, the opportunity to attend in person allowed the delegates to meet informally with members of other delegations and build cross-parliamentary relationships. The Australian delegation met with, amongst others, delegates from: Canada, Germany, Japan, Ukraine and the United Kingdom.

Both NATO as an organisation and many individual delegates, from many countries, expressed a strong interest in Australia. NATO officials consulted with the delegation on the potential for an official visit to Australia in the second half of 2023.

Bilateral meetings

With the NATO PA beginning formally on Saturday, the delegation spent Friday focused on the Australia-Spain relationship.

Meeting with Ambassador

The delegation met with the Australian Ambassador to Spain, Ms Sophia McIntyre, and members of the Australian Embassy in Madrid. With Ambassador McIntyre, the delegation discussed the Australia-Spain relationship, as well as issues of importance to Spain, including:

- the focus on technologies and products facilitating clean energy,
- Spain's part in the NATO and EU responses to Russia's invasion of Ukraine,
- Security issues of interest to Spain at the time, especially in

relation to Mongolia and Algeria

- The potential Australia-EU Free Trade Agreement, of which Spain is a supporter
- Critical minerals from Australia and their importance to Spain
- Spanish firms in Australia and Australian firms in Spain

Meeting with Cortes Generales Foreign Relations Committee

The delegation met with members of the Foreign Relations Committee of the Cortes Generales in the Congress building. Ms Thwaites highlighted the shared values Australia and Spain hold, including working in their respective regions for a free and open world, based on an international rules-based order. She highlighted some areas of mutual interest, including the invasion of Ukraine, the Pacific region, the clean energy transition and the EU-Australia FTA. Mr Pitt expressed his appreciation of Spain's role in the EU response to the Ukraine invasion, and noted that Australian parties were in consensus in supporting Ukraine.

Members of the Foreign Relations Committee in turn raised several key points and questions, including:

- Levels of support for Ukraine, both domestically and globally
- Threats to the international order
- Australia's role in providing critical minerals including lithium
- Welfare systems in the two countries
- Economic challenges facing Australia
- Australia's relationship with countries in its region

The delegation responded to the questions, noting Australia's strong focus on its own region, including in climate-related diplomacy. Ms Thwaites emphasised that, while Australia is not on the frontlines of the war in Ukraine, it had felt effects through global supply chain impacts and the rising cost of living, and spoke about some key domestic issues the Australian Government is responding to. Mr Pitt responded on the question of critical minerals, noting the importance of higher level uses and securing supply chains between like-minded countries.



The delegation meeting with members of the Foreign Relations Committee. (Photo provided by Cortes Generales)

Meeting with the President of Cortes Generales

Following the meeting with the Committee, the delegation held a short meeting with the President of the Cortes Generales, Meritxell Batet Lamaña. The President welcomed the delegates to Spain and reiterated the importance of Australia to both Spain and Europe.



The delegation with President of the Cortes Generales, Meritxell Batet Lamaña and Ambassador Sophia McIntyre. (Photo provided by Cortes Generales)

NATO Parliamentary Assembly

During most of the Parliamentary Assembly, Committee meetings were held concurrently, meaning the delegation could attend only some of what was on at any given time. Generally speaking, the Politics Committee was of most relevance to the Australian delegation. However, members of the delegation also attended sessions of the Economics and Security, Democracy and Security, Defence and Security and Science and Technology committees. What follows is not intended as an exhaustive account of the sessions attended by the delegation (official summaries are available on the [NATO PA website](#)), but an overview with an emphasis on the relevance of the sessions to Australia, grouped by committee rather than strictly chronological.

Political Committee

José M. Albares, Priorities for NATO: The Spanish Perspective in the Context of Russia's Invasion of Ukraine and the Challenges on NATO's Southern Flank

José M. Albares is Spain's Minister of Foreign Affairs, European Union and Cooperation. He emphasised NATO's importance to Spain, and the vital role of unity in responding to challenges and defending democracy. He reiterated NATO's, and Spain's, 'absolute support' for the Ukrainian people, and argued that all actions must be taken to achieve peace. Questions to Minister Albares focused on the invasion of Ukraine, including the importance of rebuilding once the invasion is defeated, the treatment of war crimes and criminals. He was also asked about 'war fatigue' amongst the Spanish people as the effects of the war broadened, and his thoughts on why some countries were allying themselves with Russia during their illegal invasion.

Panel on the Indo-Pacific: Regional Geopolitics and Strategy for the Euro-Atlantic Community with a Presentation by Veerle Nouwens, on China after the 20th Party Congress: Policy Outcomes and Implications for Global Affairs and Consideration of the PCNP's Revised Draft Report on NATO and the Indo-Pacific Region

Ms Nouwens, Senior Research Fellow and Head of the Indo-Pacific Programme, Royal United Services Institute (RUSI), discussed the ongoing global implications of China's politics, noting that President Xi Jinping has cemented his position and authority within China. Notably, Ms Nouwens highlighted that China is now placing less emphasis on economic policies, with productivity accordingly slowing. Increasingly, China's focus has been on security policy, with a goal of being a global norm-setter. She noted also that China still needs its relationships,

including in Europe and with NATO nations, and that China's close relationship with Russia remains, but had potentially been weakened by the latter's invasion of Ukraine.

The committee also considered the report into NATO's relationship with the Indo-Pacific region. Discussion focused on NATO's increasing interest in the region, including with countries including Australia who are in the region and also ideologically aligned with NATO in supporting a rules-based international order.

Discussion and questions to the panel were wide-ranging. Ms Thwaites expressed Australia's appreciation for the NATO-Australia relationship, as well as the increased focus on Australia's region, especially in the context of the Ukraine invasion. Other questions included about differences between the United States and EU towards relations with China, whether NATO is moving away from its remit by expanding its focus on the Indo-Pacific, and China's activities in other countries, including through Chinese Police Stations.



Ms Kate Thwaites asking a question during the NATO PA panel session on the Indo-Pacific.

Consideration of the Revised Draft Report of the Sub-Committee on Transatlantic Relations on Developments in Afghanistan: Causes, Consequences and Lessons Learned

Discussion on the draft report focused on the importance of not losing sight of Afghanistan when other events occur. The point was made that Al-Qaeda cannot be considered partners and should not be legitimised by other nations.

Presentation by Andriy Kostin on Russia's Aggression and War Crimes in Ukraine

Mr Kostin, Prosecutor General of Ukraine, spoke via videoconference. He emphasised that a strong and independent Ukraine is vital for Europe, and expressed Ukraine's gratitude for NATO's support against Russia's illegal invasion since their occupation of Crimea. He called for ongoing military support of Ukraine, and highlighted the international community has a moral obligation to hold Russia, and its allies, accountable for their acts of aggression.

In particular, Mr Kostin discussed the importance of holding individuals responsible for international crimes, including instigating, supporting or carrying out war crimes. From Ukraine's perspective, it is crucial to not just win the war against Russia, but to see the masterminds of the aggression held responsible. In that context, he noted that President Putin launching the war was the starting point for all subsequent crimes. Noting that ICC jurisdiction can be limited to acts of genocide and to specific war crimes, Mr Kostin called

for a special prosecution for acts of aggression. He described the level of war crimes committed by Russia as 'brutal and colossal', with over 45,000 individual acts documented in Ukraine as of that day, including over 400 children killed, deliberate killing of civilians and targeting of infrastructure, with the aim of intimidating civilians and paralysing the country.

Mr Kostin emphasised that Ukraine fully supports the mandate of the ICC and called for other countries to do likewise. He called for full reparations for the destruction of Ukraine, and outlined three things Ukraine needs: an end of the war of aggression as soon as possible, the restoration of Ukraine's sovereignty and an end to the impunity of Russia.

He finished by making the point that Ukraine is fighting two wars at once: the first, on the battlefield; the second, an ideological battle on behalf of Ukrainian citizens and the international community who believe that war crimes should not be permitted in the 21st Century. In discussion following Mr Kostin's presentation, Mr Pitt noted Australia's ongoing support for Ukraine and how the Australian delegation was impressed at the level of unity within NATO in support of Ukraine.

Democracy and Security Committee

Dr Alicia Cebada Romero, Preventing and Combatting the Use of Sexual Violence as a Weapon of War

Dr Cebada Romero is Professor of Public International Law and International Relations at Universidad

Carlos III de Madrid. She outlined the difficulties in getting sexual violence recognised as a weapon of war, but noted some recent progress, including the International Criminal Tribunal For Rwanda recognising rape as a means of perpetrating genocide; the International Criminal Tribunal for the former Yugoslavia qualifying rape as a form of torture; and the International Criminal Court convicting a warlord for the crime of sexual slavery during the Second Congo War. Dr Cebada Romero noted that Ukrainian authorities had documented numerous instances of the use of sexual violence by Russian forces against civilians. She called for more specific references to the use of sexual violence in NATO and other international forums, and to avoid conflating it with violence against civilians more generally, and also for NATO nations to allocate more money to the ICC and other legal frameworks to allow more focus on sexual violence crimes. Questions and discussion included the difficulty of collecting evidence given the level of shame among many victims (Dr Cebada Romero noted that many victims were victims twice over: the initial attack itself, and then their treatment by the community if the attack became known), the need for both legal frameworks and humanitarian aid to more specifically address sexual violence in their responses to wars, and the importance of supporting local responses and women's organisations.

Consideration of the Revised Draft Report of the Sub-Committee on Resilience and Civil Security on Acting to Preserve the Humanitarian Space: What Role for the Allies and NATO?

The Democracy and Security Committee considered, and adopted, the draft report. During discussion, several key points were made, including the note that the previous year had seen the highest need for humanitarian aid in decades, even before Russia's invasion of Ukraine. Anti-terrorism legislation in some jurisdictions has placed limitations on some humanitarian aid efforts, including by limiting access to certain areas. Overall, the point was emphasised that humanitarian activities are not just a moral, but a political and legal, responsibility.

Defence and Security Committee

Consideration of the Revised Draft Report on *The Offense-Defence Balance: NATO's Growing Cyber Challenges*

Discussion on the report focused on the challenges of considering cyber issues as part of overall legal mechanisms and the need for shared understanding of terms. Another key point was the power asymmetry in the cyber realm, along with the need for NATO to assist in building capacity in Ukraine (along with other conflicts).

Science and Technology Committee

Consideration of the Draft General Report Strengthening Alliance S&T Resilience

NATO's traditional technology edge has been challenged – non-NATO countries have more quickly adapted and innovated in light of technological developments than the Alliance has. NATO countries have spent decreasing

amounts on Research & Development at the same time that China and other countries have significantly increased their spending.

The cybersecurity environment is going through a significant shift, and digital authoritarianism (the use by states of technology to control citizens) is a rising threat. The report also notes that China, in particular, has access to critical rare earths that NATO countries have to compete for. NATO countries should therefore invest more into projects that will reduce their dependence on those minerals.

Reception at Royal Palace

The delegation joined the official NATO PA reception at the Royal Palace, hosted by Their Majesties King Felipe VI and Queen Letizia. The reception allowed the delegates to meet in less structured ways with colleagues from other parliaments, as well as presenters at the PA.

Plenary session

The final day of the PA was devoted to the plenary session. In addition to administrative elements including the election of Officers of the Assembly, presentation of the NATO PA Budget and final votes on draft resolutions from each Committee, the session included presentations from the President of NATO PA, the Secretary-General of NATO, the Speakers of the Congress and the Senate of Spain, the President of Spain and, via a pre-recorded address, the President of Ukraine.

Address by the President of the NATO Parliamentary Assembly

Gerard E. Connolly, President of the NATO Parliamentary Assembly and member of the US House of Representatives, addressed the Assembly for the final time in his capacity as President. He described his two-year term as happening during a ‘consequential’ time with numerous challenges, including the COVID-19 pandemic, the fall of Kabul in Afghanistan, the ‘violent insurrection’ in the US Congress and Russia’s ‘brutal, depraved, criminal invasion of Ukraine’, which in turn led to energy, economic and refugee crises that affected the entire world.

Mr Connolly emphasised that NATO stands ready to welcome two new member nations – Sweden and Finland, and discussed the NATO Strategic Concept, adopted by the NATO Summit in June 2022.

However, the main theme of Mr Connolly’s speech was the important role NATO can and should play in defending democracy and democratic institutions, including through the creation of a Centre for Democratic Resilience with NATO itself.

Mr Connolly also expressed NATO’s ongoing commitment to not only supporting Ukraine against Russia’s invasion, but ensuring that Russia faces consequences for its actions:

So during this session, we recommit to holding Russia accountable for its crimes, including through the creation of a special tribunal to prosecute the crime of aggression. All of Russia’s actions must be investigated, including all war crimes, crimes against humanity and possible acts of

genocide. Peace cannot be built on impunity.

Address by the President of the Senate of Spain

His Excellency Mr Ander Gil, President of the Senate of Spain, noted the significance of 2022 to Spain, with the year marking 40 years since Spain joined NATO, and thus the importance of Madrid hosting both the Summit in June and the Parliamentary Assembly in November. He argued that NATO members must always defend the alliance's values, including the unity of purpose that brought them together. In the context of the Parliamentary Assembly, President Gil emphasised the importance of parliamentarians. Democracy is the best defence for peace. He pointed out that threats have no borders, especially emerging threats such as cyber-based ones and misinformation. Noting the many challenges facing the world and the alliance, he argued that now is not the time to be less ambitious about NATO and its purpose.

Address by the Speaker of the Congress of Spain

Her Excellency Ms Meritxell Batet, Speaker of the Congress of Deputies of Spain, argued that unity and solidarity are necessary to defeat authoritarianism, and that while Spain does not share a physical border with Ukraine, Spain considers that they do. She noted that NATO and the EU are both dealing with the challenges of the times in their own ways, and highlighted that NATO is not merely a military alliance, but a community of values. Ms Batet particularly welcomed the observer nations

present at the PA, including Australia, for helping NATO members to understand the entire world and the global context of NATO's work.

Address by the President of Spain

His Excellency Mr Pedro Sánchez, President of Spain, outlined how NATO has strengthened itself in response to Russia's invasion of Ukraine, and committed to supporting Ukraine until Russia withdraws. He emphasised that NATO is not against the Russian people, but against the autocratic government of Putin. Indeed, the people of Russia are also suffering because of Putin's actions. President Sánchez outlined Spain's contributions to Ukraine, including military and humanitarian assistance, and welcoming refugees. However, he noted that the world will live in uncertainty until the war ends.

Address by Secretary-General of NATO

His Excellency Mr Jens Stoltenberg, Secretary-General of NATO, focused on the importance of ongoing unity in support of Ukraine. He called on all parliamentarians to work towards this goal. Mr Stoltenberg highlighted the importance of NATO nations finding better supply chains, including for rare earths, that would work to reduce their dependence on less-friendly nations. He also emphasised that it is time for Finland and Sweden to join NATO and called on the remaining countries to finalise the accession process for that to occur.

The Secretary-General finished by describing NATO as the 'most successful alliance in history'.

Address by the President of Ukraine

Joining via pre-recorded video address, President Volodymyr Zelenskyy of Ukraine thanked NATO for its support of Ukraine against the Russian invasion, and called for his country to become a full member of both the European Union and NATO as soon as possible. He encouraged all parliaments to take responsibility for bringing about peace in Ukraine. President Zelenskyy called on all nations to recognise Russia as a terrorist state and described it as the most anti-European country in the world.

2022 'Women for Peace and Security Award'

The 2022 Women for Peace and Security Award was presented to Ms Ohla Stefanishyna, Deputy Prime Minister for European and Euro-Atlantic Integration of Ukraine. Ms Stefanishyna, speaking via video address, thanked the Assembly for the honour and accepted the award on behalf of all the women of Ukraine. She highlighted that women's full equal and meaningful participation in public life is the cornerstone of the values Ukraine is fighting for. She argued that Ukraine needed not only to survive, but to win, and that Russia's war is a war against the entire civilised world. She highlighted the importance of Ukraine being involved in all decisions flowing from the war, and reiterated President Zelenskyy call for Ukraine to become a full member of NATO.

Conclusion

The delegation's bilateral visit to Germany and attendance at the 68th Annual Session of the NATO Parliamentary Assembly were successful in building links between Australia and some key global partners, as well as continuing to emphasise the importance Australia places on its relationship with NATO. Australian parliamentarians have attended the NATO PA since 2009, and at the 2022 meeting the delegation received strong support and interest, particularly in light of the Australian support for Ukraine since Russia's invasion. The ability for the NATO PA to meet in person allowed for numerous informal contacts between the members of the Australian delegation and those from parliaments across the world – a benefit which cannot be overstated.

In Germany, the delegation's meetings with a wide range of contacts illustrated the multi-faceted nature of the Australia-Germany relationship. For Australia, Germany is a key relationship in Europe, and Australia is a valued relationship for Germany in the Indo-Pacific. As many meetings highlighted, the two countries share a commitment to democracy and the rules-based international order. Both countries are also focused on the challenges of decarbonising their economies and it is likely the opportunities for Australia and Germany to co-operate on this will continue to grow.

The delegation would like to thank the Australian embassies in Berlin and Madrid for their high level of support for the visit, and also acknowledge the

organisational work undertaken by the NATO PA secretariat for their efforts in planning and overseeing the NATO PA Session.

Ms Kate Thwaites MP
Delegation Leader

13 June 2023

Appendix A: Germany program, 14-17 November 2022

Monday, 14 November

- 10:00-10:30 Briefing with **H.E. Philip Green, Australian Ambassador to Germany**
Venue: Ambassador's office
- 10:40 Transfer to the German Reichstag
Address: Southern Entrance of Paul-Löbe-House, Paul-Löbe-Allee, Berlin
- 11:00-12:15 Guided tour of the German Reichstag (seat of the national parliament)
- 12:30-13:30 Lunch at the Bedienrestaurant, Jakob-Kaiser-House
- 13:30-14:30 Meeting with **Mr Johannes Vogel MdB, Chair, German-Pacific Friendship Group**
Venue: Jakob-Kaiser-House, Raum 1.235
Joined by Ambassador Green
- 15:00-16:00 Meeting with **Ms Anne Lauenroth, Senior Manager, Critical Minerals, and Ms Cara Bien, Adviser, Energy and Climate Policies, Federation of German Industries (BDI)**
Joined by David Urry, Investment Manager, Austrade
- 16:00 Return to hotel and time for Australia-based business
- 18:30 Dinner hosted by Ambassador Green with Embassy staff

Tuesday, 15 November

- 09:30-11:00 Meeting with **Dr Martin Thuemmel, Envoy for East Asia, South East Asia and Pacific, Federal Foreign Office**
- 13:00-15:00 Visit to **MAN Energy Solutions SE Berlin production site** (compressors for CO2 separation)

Visit lead:
Dr. Markus Röhner, Site Manager Berlin and Head of R&D Engineering Integral Geared Compressors

Joined by Ambassador Green
- 15:00 Return to hotel and time for Australia-based business
- 18:00-20:00 Attend opening of "An Aboriginal Culinary Journey" exhibition
Venue: Australian Embassy Berlin

Wednesday, 16 November

Ms Thwaites

10:00-11:00 **Roundtable discussion on electoral systems and integrity in Germany**
Venue: Boardroom, Australian Embassy Berlin

Attendees:

Dr Henner Jörg Boehl
Head, Electoral Law Section, Federal Ministry of the Interior

Mr Carsten Müller MdB (via webex)
Member, Bundestag Election Review Committee, CDU/CSU Bundestag Parliamentary Party

Helena Schwertheim
Senior Digital Policy and Research Manager, Institute for Strategic Dialogue (ISD) Germany

John Kidd
Political Officer, Australian Embassy Berlin

Mr Pitt

10:00-11:00 **Roundtable discussion on critical minerals**
Venue: Third Floor Conference Room, Australian Embassy Berlin

Attendees:

Dr Sven Uwe Schulz
Head of Unit Evaluation of Mineral Resources
Federal Institute for Geosciences and Natural Resources BGR

Professor Jesse Scott
Visiting Research Fellow
German Institute for Economic Research DIW

Embassy attendees

Kate Luxford
Deputy Ambassador, Australian Embassy Berlin

13:05 Welcome by **Mrs Christiane Miethe**, Regional Responsibility for Latin America, Australia & Oceania; International & European Politics, Volkswagen,

followed by guided tour of production facilities by **Mr Torsten Cramm**, Guest Relations, Volkswagen AG, starting at "Werkforum", sector 16, Südstraße

17:00-18:00 Meeting with **Ms Helga Barth, Envoy for Human Rights, International Development, Health and Social Affairs, Coordinator for Sustainable Development, Federal Foreign Office**

Thursday, 17 November

08:00 Depart for Berlin Brandenburg Airport

09:00 Arrive Berlin Brandenburg Airport

11:45 Depart Berlin Brandenburg Airport

Appendix B: Complete program for NATO Parliamentary Assembly, Madrid, 18-21 November 2022

Political Committee

1. Opening remarks by Brendan Francis BOYLE (United States), Chairperson

2. Priorities for NATO: The Spanish Perspective in the Context of Russia's Invasion of Ukraine and the Challenges on NATO's Southern Flank

José Manuel ALBARES, Minister of Foreign Affairs, European Union, and Cooperation of Spain

3. Panel on Priorities for NATO after the Madrid Summit

- **Keeping NATO Fit for Purpose in the New Strategic Environment**

Javier COLOMINA, Deputy Assistant Secretary General for Political Affairs and Security Policy and NATO Secretary General's Special Representative for the Caucasus and Central Asia

- **NATO's Political and Security Adaptation in Response to Russia's War: Assessing the New Strategic Concept and Implementation of the Madrid Summit Decisions**

Draft General Report

Tomas VALASEK (Slovakia), Acting General Rapporteur

4. Panel on the Indo-Pacific: Regional Geopolitics and Strategy for the Euro-Atlantic Community

- **China after the 20th Party Congress: Policy Outcomes and Implications for Global Affairs**

Veerle NOUWENS, Senior Research Fellow and Head of the Indo-Pacific Programme, Royal United Services Institute (RUSI)

- **NATO and the Indo-Pacific Region**

Draft Report of the Sub-Committee on NATO Partnerships

Marcos PERESTRELLO DE VASCONCELLOS (Portugal), Acting Rapporteur

5. Russian War against Ukraine: Military and Political Aspects

Clint REACH, International Defence Researcher, RAND Corporation

6. Developments in Afghanistan: Causes, Consequences and Lessons Learned

Draft Report of the Sub-Committee on Transatlantic Relations

Ahmet YILDIZ (Türkiye), Rapporteur

7. Russia's Aggression and War Crimes in Ukraine

Andriy KOSTIN, Prosecutor General of Ukraine (by videoconference)

8. The Evolving Political and Security Landscape in the Maghreb

Haizam AMIRAH-FERNÁNDEZ, Senior Analyst, Mediterranean and Arab World, Elcano Royal Institute

9. NATO post-Madrid Summit: Fit for Purpose in the new Strategic Era

Draft Resolution

Tomas VALASEK (Slovakia), Acting General Rapporteur

Defence and Security Committee

1. Opening remarks by Utku CAKIROZER (Türkiye), Acting Chairperson

2. Spain: A Strong Commitment to the Alliance

Margarita ROBLES, Minister of Defence of Spain

3. The Present and Future Contribution of the Spanish Armed Forces to the Alliance

Admiral General Teodoro E. LÓPEZ CALDERÓN, Chief of the Defence Staff of Spain

4. Russia's Invasion of Ukraine: Implications for Allied Collective Defence and Imperatives for the New Strategic Concept

Revised Draft General Report

Cédric PERRIN (France), General Rapporteur

5. Political Origins of Russia's War on Ukraine

Clint REACH, International Defence Researcher, RAND Corporation

6. The Evolving Threat of Terrorism: Adapting the Allied Response

Revised Draft Report of the Sub-Committee on Transatlantic Defence and Security Cooperation

Jean-Charles LARSONNEUR (France), Rapporteur

7. Offense-Defence: NATO's Cyber Challenge

Revised Draft Report of the Sub-Committee on Future Security and Defence Capabilities

Presented by Andreas LOVERDOS (Greece), Vice-Chairperson

8. The Growing Cyber Challenge and Implications for the Alliance

Marina RODRIGUEZ, Head of the Cybersecurity and Fight Against Disinformation Unit, Office of the Prime Minister of Spain

9. NATO's Role in Counterterrorism – Background, Status, and Future

Gabriele CASCONI, Head of Counter-Terrorism Section, Emerging Security Challenges Division, NATO

10. Ukraine's Fight for Freedom and Allied & Global Response to Russia's War

Revised Draft Special Report

Rick LARSEN (United States), Special Rapporteur

11. Supporting NATO's Post-Madrid Summit Deterrence and Defence Initiatives

Draft Resolution

Cédric PERRIN (France), General Rapporteur

12. Developments in Afghanistan: Causes, Consequences and Lessons Learned

Draft Report of the Sub-Committee on Transatlantic Relations

Ahmet YILDIZ (Türkiye), Rapporteur

13. Russia's Aggression and War Crimes in Ukraine

Andriy KOSTIN, Prosecutor General of Ukraine (by videoconference)

14. The Evolving Political and Security Landscape in the Maghreb

Haizam AMIRAH-FERNÁNDEZ, Senior Analyst, Mediterranean and Arab World, Elcano Royal Institute

15. NATO post-Madrid Summit: Fit for Purpose in the new Strategic Era

Draft Resolution

Tomas VALASEK (Slovakia), Acting General Rapporteur

Committee on Democracy and Security

1. Opening remarks by Rodrigue DEMEUSE (Belgium), Acting Chairperson

2. Security through Societal Cohesion: The Indispensable Fight Against Exclusion, Discrimination, and Inequality

Felix BOLAÑOS, Minister for the Presidency, Parliamentary Relations and Democratic Memory of Spain

3. Determinants of Violent Radicalization Leading to Terrorism: Evidence Relevant for NATO Countries Prof. Fernando REINARES, Director of the Violent Radicalisation and Global Terrorism Programme, Elcano Royal Institute

4. Preventing and Combatting the Use of Sexual Violence as a Weapon of War

Dr. Alicia CEBADA ROMERO, Professor in Public International Law and International Relations, Universidad Carlos III de Madrid

5. Strengthening the Protection of Critical Infrastructure against Cyber Threats Revised Draft Report

Joëlle GARRIAUD-MAYLAM (France), General Rapporteur

6. Acting to Preserve the Humanitarian Space: What Role for the Allies and for NATO?

Revised Draft Report of the Sub-Committee on Resilience and Civil Security

Rodrigue DEMEUSE (Belgium), Acting Rapporteur

7. Understanding, Adapting to, and Limiting the Impact of Climate Change on Allied Civil Society

Revised Draft Special Report

Linda SANCHEZ (United States), Special Rapporteur

8. Strengthening the Cyber Resilience of Allied Societies Draft Resolution

Joëlle GARRIAUD-MAYLAM (France), General Rapporteur

Economics and Security Committee

1. Opening remarks by Philippe FOLLIOU (France), Chairperson

2. Spain's Response to the Twin Shocks of COVID-19 and the War in Ukraine

Nadia CALVIÑO, First Vice-President of the Government and Minister for the Economy and Digital Transformation of Spain

3. "High Intensity" and "Hybrid" Warfare in Ukraine: Geopolitical and Geoeconomic Implications for Allies

Emmanuel DUPUY, President of the Institute Prospective et Sécurité en Europe (IPSE)

4. Strategic Trade Challenges: Securing Essential Industries and Supply Chains

Draft Report of the Sub-Committee on Transatlantic Economic Relations

Faik OZTRAK (Türkiye), Rapporteur

5. The Western Balkans: Russia's War on Ukraine and the Region's Enduring Challenges

Draft Report of the Sub-Committee on Transition and Development

Michał SZCZERBA (Poland), Rapporteur

6. Towards the Reconstruction of Ukraine

Jacob KIRKEGAARD, Senior Fellow, the German Marshall Fund of the United States (GMF) and the Peterson Institute for International Economics (PIIE)

7. Strategic and Economic Challenges Posed by Corruption

Draft General Report

Harriett BALDWIN (United Kingdom), General Rapporteur

8. The Corruption - Security Nexus

Draft resolution

Harriett BALDWIN (United Kingdom), General Rapporteur

9. Russia's War on Ukraine: Economic Consequences and Responses

Draft resolution

Harriett BALDWIN (United Kingdom), General Rapporteur

Science and Technology Committee

1. Opening remarks by Kevan JONES (United Kingdom), Chairperson

2. Spain's Innovation Policy: Challenges and Opportunities

Diana MORANT, Minister for Science and Innovation, Spain

3. Strengthening Alliance S&T Resilience

Draft General Report [[023 STC 22 E rev. 1](#)]

Sven CLEMENT (Luxembourg), Acting General Rapporteur

4. The Priorities of the Spanish Innovation Policy in Defence

Major General José L. MURGA, Deputy Director for Planning, Research and Technology, Spanish Representative on the NATO Science and Technology Board

5. Technological Innovation for Future Warfare

Draft Report of the Sub-Committee on Technology Trends and Security

Njall Trausti FRIDBERTSSON (Iceland), Sub-Committee Rapporteur

6. Climate Change Mitigation and Adaptation: The Role of Technology

Draft Special Report

Sven CLEMENT (Luxembourg), Special Rapporteur

7. Climate Change and International Security – NATO's Agenda

Draft Resolution

Sven CLEMENT (Luxembourg), Special Rapporteur

Plenary Sitting

1. Address by Hon. Gerald E. CONNOLLY, President of the NATO Parliamentary Assembly
2. Address by H.E. Ms Meritxell BATET, Speaker of the Congress of Deputies of Spain
3. Address by H.E. Mr Ander GIL, Speaker of the Senate of Spain
4. Address by H.E. Mr Pedro SÁNCHEZ, President of the Government of Spain
5. Address by H.E. Mr Jens STOLTENBERG, Secretary General of NATO and Chairman of the North Atlantic Council, followed by a question and answer period
6. 2022 “Women for Peace and Security” award ceremony for Ms Olha STEFANISHYNA, Deputy Prime Minister for European and Euro-Atlantic Integration of Ukraine
7. Address by H.E. Mr Volodymyr ZELENSKY, President of Ukraine
8. Debate and Vote on the draft Committee Resolutions
9. Election of Officers of the Assembly
10. Presentation by Mr Wolfgang HELLMICH, NATO PA Treasurer, and vote on the 2023 Draft Budget

Appendix C: Resolutions and reports adopted at the 68th Session NATO Parliamentary Assembly

Resolutions adopted

- RESOLUTION 475 - ENHANCING THE CYBER RESILIENCE OF ALLIED SOCIETIES
- RESOLUTION 476 - SUPPORTING NATO'S POST-SUMMIT DETERRENCE AND DEFENCE INITIATIVES
- RESOLUTION 477 - THE CORRUPTION-SECURITY NEXUS
- RESOLUTION 478 - RUSSIA'S WAR ON UKRAINE: ECONOMIC CONSEQUENCES AND RESPONSES
- RESOLUTION 479 - NATO POST MADRID
- RESOLUTION 480 - CLIMATE CHANGE AND INTERNATIONAL SECURITY: NATO'S AGENDA

Reports adopted

- THE OFFENCE-DEFENCE BALANCE: NATO'S GROWING CYBER CHALLENGE
- THE WESTERN BALKANS: RUSSIA'S WAR ON UKRAINE AND THE REGION'S ENDURING CHALLENGES
- STRATEGIC AND ECONOMIC CHALLENGES POSED BY CORRUPTION
- THE EVOLVING TERRORIST THREAT: ADAPTING THE ALLIED RESPONSE
- RUSSIA'S INVASION OF UKRAINE: IMPLICATIONS FOR ALLIED COLLECTIVE DEFENCE AND IMPERATIVES FOR THE NEW STRATEGIC CONCEPT
- STRATEGIC TRADE CHALLENGES: SECURING ESSENTIAL INDUSTRIES AND SUPPLY CHAINS
- NATO'S POLITICAL AND SECURITY ADAPTATION IN RESPONSE TO RUSSIA'S WAR: ASSESSING THE NEW STRATEGIC CONCEPT AND IMPLEMENTATION OF THE MADRID SUMMIT DECISIONS
- NATO AND THE INDO-PACIFIC REGION
- UKRAINE'S FIGHT FOR FREEDOM & ALLIED AND GLOBAL RESPONSE TO RUSSIA'S WAR
- UNDERSTANDING, ADAPTING TO, AND LIMITING THE IMPACT OF CLIMATE CHANGE ON ALLIED CIVIL SECURITY
- STRENGTHENING ALLIANCE S&T RESILIENCE
- TECHNOLOGICAL INNOVATION FOR FUTURE WARFARE
- CLIMATE CHANGE MITIGATION AND ADAPTATION: THE ROLE OF TECHNOLOGY
- DEVELOPMENTS IN AFGHANISTAN: CAUSES, CONSEQUENCES, AND LESSONS LEARNED
- STRENGTHENING THE PROTECTION OF CRITICAL INFRASTRUCTURE AGAINST CYBER THREATS
- ACTING TO PRESERVE THE HUMANITARIAN SPACE: WHAT ROLE FOR THE ALLIES AND FOR NATO?
- SHARED MIGRATION CHALLENGES: THE TRANSATLANTIC COMMUNITY AND THE MENA REGION