#### 2004-05

#### THE PARLIAMENT OF THE COMMONWEALTH OF AUSTRALIA

#### **HOUSE OF REPRESENTATIVES**

# **VOTES AND PROCEEDINGS**

No. 53

# WEDNESDAY, 7 SEPTEMBER 2005

1 The House met, at 9 a.m., pursuant to adjournment. The Speaker (the Honourable David Hawker) took the Chair, and read Prayers.

#### 2 SUSPENSION OF STANDING AND SESSIONAL ORDERS MOVED

Mr Beazley (Leader of the Opposition) moved—That so much of the standing and sessional orders be suspended as would prevent the Leader of the Opposition moving that: This House decline to deal with any bill or proposal about Telstra until after the completion of the Australian Security and Investment Commission's inquiry relating to the Howard Government's cover up of vital information about Telstra's woefully inadequate services, major lack of investment in the nation's future and its financially irresponsible and unsustainable practice of paying dividends from reserves.

Closure of Member

Mr Pearce (Parliamentary Secretary to the Treasurer) moved—That the Member be no longer heard. Question—put.

The House divided (the Speaker, Mr Hawker, in the Chair)—

| Mr Abbott        | Mrs Draper        | Mr Laming     | Mr Ruddock        |
|------------------|-------------------|---------------|-------------------|
| Mr Anderson      | Mrs Elson         | Mrs Ley       | Mr Schultz        |
| Mr Andrews       | Mr Entsch         | Mr Lindsay    | Mr Scott          |
| Fran Bailey      | Mr Farmer         | Mr Lloyd      | Mr Secker         |
| Mr Baird         | Mr Fawcett        | Mr McArthur*  | Mr Slipper        |
| Mr Baker         | Mr M. D. Ferguson | Mr McGauran   | Mr A. D. H. Smith |
| Mr Baldwin       | Mr Forrest*       | Mrs Markus    | Mr Somlyay        |
| Mr Barresi       | Ms Gambaro        | Mrs May       | Dr Southcott      |
| Mr Bartlett      | Mr Georgiou       | Mrs Moylan    | Dr Stone          |
| Mr Billson       | Mr Haase          | Mr Nairn      | Mr Ticehurst      |
| Mrs B. K. Bishop | Mr Hardgrave      | Dr Nelson     | Mr Tollner        |
| Ms J. Bishop     | Mr Hartsuyker     | Mr Neville    | Mr Truss          |
| Mr Broadbent     | Mr Henry          | Ms Panopoulos | Mr Tuckey         |
| Mr Brough        | Mr Hockey         | Mr Pearce     | Mr Turnbull       |
| Mr Cadman        | Dr Jensen         | Mr Prosser    | Mr M. A. J. Vaile |
| Mr Causley       | Mr Johnson        | Mr Pyne       | Mr Vasta          |
| Mr Ciobo         | Mr Keenan         | Mr Randall    | Mr Wakelin        |
| Mr Cobb          | Mrs D. M. Kelly   | Mr Richardson | Dr Washer         |
| Mr Downer        | Jackie Kelly      | Mr Robb       | Mr Wood           |
|                  |                   |               |                   |

| Mr Adams       | Mr Emerson           | Mr Katter         | Mr Ripoll      |
|----------------|----------------------|-------------------|----------------|
| Mr Andren      | Mr L. D. T. Ferguson | Mr Kerr           | Ms Roxon       |
| Mr Beazley     | Mr M. J. Ferguson    | Ms C. King        | Mr Rudd        |
| Mr Bevis       | Mr Fitzgibbon        | Ms Livermore      | Mr Sawford     |
| Ms Bird        | Mr Garrett           | Mr McClelland     | Mr Sercombe    |
| Mr Bowen       | Mr Georganas         | Ms Macklin        | Mr S. F. Smith |
| Ms A. E. Burke | Ms George            | Mr McMullan       | Mr Snowdon     |
| Mr Byrne       | Ms Gillard           | Mr Melham         | Mr Swan        |
| Ms Corcoran    | Ms Grierson          | Mr Murphy         | Mr Tanner      |
| Mr Crean       | Mr Griffin           | Mr B. P. O'Connor | Ms Vamvakinou  |
| Mr Danby*      | Ms Hall*             | Mr G. M. O'Connor | Mr Wilkie      |
| Mr Edwards     | Mr Hayes             | Ms Owens          | Mr Windsor     |
| Mrs Elliot     | Ms Hoare             | Ms Plibersek      |                |
| Ms A. L. Ellis | Mrs Irwin            | Mr Price          |                |
| Ms K. M. Ellis | Mr Jenkins           | Mr Quick          |                |

\* Tellers

And so it was resolved in the affirmative.

Mr S. F. Smith (seconder) addressing the House—

Closure of Member

Mr Pearce moved—That the Member be no longer heard.

Question—put.

The House divided (the Speaker, Mr Hawker, in the Chair)—

| Mr Abbott        | Mrs Elson         | Mr Lindsay    | Mr Scott          |
|------------------|-------------------|---------------|-------------------|
| Mr Anderson      | Mr Entsch         | Mr Lloyd      | Mr Secker         |
| Mr Andrews       | Mr Farmer         | Mr McArthur*  | Mr Slipper        |
| Fran Bailey      | Mr Fawcett        | Mr Macfarlane | Mr A. D. H. Smith |
| Mr Baird         | Mr M. D. Ferguson | Mr McGauran   | Mr Somlyay        |
| Mr Baker         | Mr Forrest*       | Mrs Markus    | Dr Southcott      |
| Mr Baldwin       | Ms Gambaro        | Mrs May       | Dr Stone          |
| Mr Barresi       | Mr Georgiou       | Mrs Moylan    | Mr Ticehurst      |
| Mr Bartlett      | Mr Haase          | Mr Nairn      | Mr Tollner        |
| Mr Billson       | Mr Hardgrave      | Dr Nelson     | Mr Truss          |
| Mrs B. K. Bishop | Mr Hartsuyker     | Mr Neville    | Mr Tuckey         |
| Ms J. Bishop     | Mr Henry          | Ms Panopoulos | Mr Turnbull       |
| Mr Broadbent     | Mr Hockey         | Mr Pearce     | Mr M. A. J. Vaile |
| Mr Brough        | Dr Jensen         | Mr Prosser    | Mr Vasta          |
| Mr Cadman        | Mr Johnson        | Mr Pyne       | Mr Wakelin        |
| Mr Causley       | Mr Keenan         | Mr Randall    | Dr Washer         |
| Mr Ciobo         | Mrs D. M. Kelly   | Mr Richardson | Mr Wood           |
| Mr Cobb          | Jackie Kelly      | Mr Robb       |                   |
| Mr Downer        | Mr Laming         | Mr Ruddock    |                   |
| Mrs Draper       | Mrs Ley           | Mr Schultz    |                   |

| Mr Emerson           | Mr Katter   | Mr Ripoll   |
|----------------------|---|---|
| Mr L. D. T. Ferguson | Mr Kerr   | Ms Roxon  |
| Mr M. J. Ferguson    | Ms C. King  | Mr Rudd   |
| Mr Fitzgibbon        | Ms Livermore  | Mr Sawford  |
| Mr Garrett           | Mr McClelland   | Mr Sercombe   |
| Mr Georganas         | Ms Macklin  | Mr S. F. Smith  |
| Ms George            | Mr McMullan   | Mr Snowdon  |
| Ms Gillard           | Mr Melham   | Mr Swan   |
| Ms Grierson          | Mr Murphy   | Mr Tanner   |
| Mr Griffin           | Mr B. P. O'Connor   | Ms Vamvakinou   |
| Ms Hall*             | Mr G. M. O'Connor   | Mr Wilkie   |
| Mr Hayes             | Ms Owens  | Mr Windsor  |
| Ms Hoare             | Ms Plibersek  |   |
| Mrs Irwin            | Mr Price  |   |
| Mr Jenkins           | Mr Quick  |   |
|                      | Mr L. D. T. Ferguson Mr M. J. Ferguson Mr Fitzgibbon Mr Garrett Mr Georganas Ms George Ms Gillard Ms Grierson Mr Griffin Ms Hall* Mr Hayes Ms Hoare Mrs Irwin | Mr L. D. T. Ferguson Mr Kerr Mr M. J. Ferguson Ms C. King Mr Fitzgibbon Ms Livermore Mr Garrett Mr McClelland Mr Georganas Ms Macklin Ms George Mr McMullan Ms Gillard Mr Melham Ms Grierson Mr Murphy Mr Griffin Mr B. P. O'Connor Ms Hall* Mr G. M. O'Connor Mr Hayes Ms Owens Ms Hoare Ms Plibersek Mrs Irwin Mr Price |

\* Tellers

And so it was resolved in the affirmative.

Question—That the motion for the suspension of standing and sessional orders be agreed to—put. The House divided (the Speaker, Mr Hawker, in the Chair)—

| Mr Adams       | Mr Emerson           | Mr Katter         | Mr Ripoll      |
|----------------|----------------------|-------------------|----------------|
| Mr Andren      | Mr L. D. T. Ferguson | Mr Kerr           | Ms Roxon       |
| Mr Beazley     | Mr M. J. Ferguson    | Ms C. King        | Mr Rudd        |
| Mr Bevis       | Mr Fitzgibbon        | Ms Livermore      | Mr Sawford     |
| Ms Bird        | Mr Garrett           | Mr McClelland     | Mr Sercombe    |
| Mr Bowen       | Mr Georganas         | Ms Macklin        | Mr S. F. Smith |
| Ms A. E. Burke | Ms George            | Mr McMullan       | Mr Snowdon     |
| Mr Byrne       | Ms Gillard           | Mr Melham         | Mr Swan        |
| Ms Corcoran    | Ms Grierson          | Mr Murphy         | Mr Tanner      |
| Mr Crean       | Mr Griffin           | Mr B. P. O'Connor | Ms Vamvakinou  |
| Mr Danby*      | Ms Hall*             | Mr G. M. O'Connor | Mr Wilkie      |
| Mr Edwards     | Mr Hayes             | Ms Owens          | Mr Windsor     |
| Mrs Elliot     | Ms Hoare             | Ms Plibersek      |                |
| Ms A. L. Ellis | Mrs Irwin            | Mr Price          |                |
| Ms K. M. Ellis | Mr Jenkins           | Mr Quick          |                |

| Mr Abbott        | Mrs Elson         | Mr Lindsay    | Mr Scott          |
|------------------|-------------------|---------------|-------------------|
| Mr Anderson      | Mr Entsch         | Mr Lloyd      | Mr Secker         |
| Mr Andrews       | Mr Farmer         | Mr McArthur*  | Mr Slipper        |
| Fran Bailey      | Mr Fawcett        | Mr Macfarlane | Mr A. D. H. Smith |
| Mr Baird         | Mr M. D. Ferguson | Mr McGauran   | Mr Somlyay        |
| Mr Baker         | Mr Forrest*       | Mrs Markus    | Dr Southcott      |
| Mr Baldwin       | Ms Gambaro        | Mrs May       | Dr Stone          |
| Mr Barresi       | Mr Georgiou       | Mrs Moylan    | Mr Ticehurst      |
| Mr Bartlett      | Mr Haase          | Mr Nairn      | Mr Tollner        |
| Mr Billson       | Mr Hardgrave      | Dr Nelson     | Mr Truss          |
| Mrs B. K. Bishop | Mr Hartsuyker     | Mr Neville    | Mr Tuckey         |
| Ms J. Bishop     | Mr Henry          | Ms Panopoulos | Mr Turnbull       |
| Mr Broadbent     | Mr Hockey         | Mr Pearce     | Mr M. A. J. Vaile |
| Mr Brough        | Dr Jensen         | Mr Prosser    | Mr Vasta          |
| Mr Cadman        | Mr Johnson        | Mr Pyne       | Mr Wakelin        |
| Mr Causley       | Mr Keenan         | Mr Randall    | Dr Washer         |
| Mr Ciobo         | Mrs D. M. Kelly   | Mr Richardson | Mr Wood           |
| Mr Cobb          | Jackie Kelly      | Mr Robb       |                   |
| Mr Downer        | Mr Laming         | Mr Ruddock    |                   |
| Mrs Draper       | Mrs Ley           | Mr Schultz    |                   |
|                  |                   |               |                   |

\* Tellers

And so it was negatived.

#### 3 STUDENT ASSISTANCE LEGISLATION AMENDMENT BILL 2005

Dr Nelson (Minister for Education, Science and Training), pursuant to notice, presented a Bill for an Act to amend legislation relating to assistance for students, and for related purposes.

Bill read a first time.

Dr Nelson moved—That the bill be now read a second time.

Document

Dr Nelson presented an explanatory memorandum to the bill.

Debate adjourned (Mr Crean), and the resumption of the debate made an order of the day for the next sitting.

# 4 TELECOMMUNICATIONS LEGISLATION AMENDMENT (FUTURE PROOFING AND OTHER MEASURES) BILL 2005

Mr McGauran (Minister representing the Minister for Communications, Information Technology and the Arts), pursuant to notice, presented a Bill for an Act to amend the law relating to telecommunications, and for other purposes.

Bill read a first time.

Mr McGauran moved—That the bill be now read a second time.

Document

Mr McGauran presented an explanatory memorandum to the bill.

Debate adjourned (Mr Crean), and the resumption of the debate, by leave, made an order of the day for a later hour this day.

# 5 TELECOMMUNICATIONS (CARRIER LICENCE CHARGES) AMENDMENT (INDUSTRY PLANS AND CONSUMER CODES) BILL 2005

Mr McGauran (Minister representing the Minister for Communications, Information Technology and the Arts) presented a Bill for an Act to amend the *Telecommunications (Carrier Licence Charges) Act 1997*, and for other purposes.

Bill read a first time.

Mr McGauran moved—That the bill be now read a second time.

Document

Mr McGauran presented an explanatory memorandum to the bill.

Debate adjourned (Mr Crean), and the resumption of the debate, by leave, made an order of the day for a later hour this day.

# 6 MESSAGE FROM THE GOVERNOR-GENERAL—APPROPRIATION (REGIONAL TELECOMMUNICATIONS SERVICES) BILL 2005-2006

Message No. 101, 6 September 2005, from His Excellency the Governor-General was announced recommending an appropriation for the purposes of the bill.

Mr McGauran (Minister representing the Minister for Communications, Information Technology and the Arts) presented a Bill for an Act to appropriate money out of the Consolidated Revenue Fund for the ordinary annual services of the Government in relation to regional telecommunications services, and for related purposes.

Bill read a first time.

Mr McGauran moved—That the bill be now read a second time.

Debate adjourned (Mr Crean), and the resumption of the debate, by leave, made an order of the day for a later hour this day.

#### 7 SUSPENSION OF STANDING AND SESSIONAL ORDERS MOVED

Mr Windsor moved—That so much of the standing and sessional orders be suspended as would prevent the Member for New England from moving the following motion immediately: That this House:

- (1) bring forward the debate on the Private Members' bill—Fuel Quality Standards (Ethanol content) Amendment Bill 2005;
- (2) acknowledges the skyrocketing fuel prices across the nation;
- (3) recognises the lowest fuel price in Australia is at Mount Warren Park which has 85% of its petrol sales being E10;
- (4) acknowledges the health issues being impacted on by current makeup of petrol in Australia and recognises the Australian Medical Association's call for a 10% ethanol mandate for health and environmental purposes;
- (5) acknowledges the value of mandating ethanol in petrol to alleviating some of these health and environmental problems;
- (6) acknowledges the cost of investment opportunity lost through the continued delay in the process of giving security and direction to proponents of the ethanol industry;
- (7) acknowledges the value of the development of the ethanol industry to the economies of rural and regional communities as well as the national economy;
- (8) acknowledges the time being eaten into the excise exemption period granted by this place to encourage investors in new ethanol projects;
- (9) acknowledges that the Federal Government already mandates the makeup of petrol through its removal of lead from petrol and the reduction of sulphur in diesel and therefore can mandate the inclusion of ethanol in petrol;
- (10) acknowledges that through the scaling up of the inclusion of ethanol in petrol the developing ethanol industry will be able to supply the Australian domestic market needs without the need for importing ethanol from overseas; and
- (11) recognises that the Renewable Energy Target put in place by the Government in 2001 has not and will not be achieved by voluntary renewable energy targets.

Closure of Member

Mr Pearce (Parliamentary Secretary to the Treasurer) moved—That the Member be no longer heard.

Question—put

The House divided (the Deputy Speaker, Mr Jenkins, in the Chair)—

# AYES, 77

| Mr Abbott        | Mrs Elson         | Mrs Ley       | Mr Scott          |
|------------------|-------------------|---------------|-------------------|
| Mr Anderson      | Mr Entsch         | Mr Lindsay    | Mr Secker         |
| Mr Andrews       | Mr Farmer         | Mr Lloyd      | Mr Slipper        |
| Fran Bailey      | Mr Fawcett        | Mr McArthur*  | Mr A. D. H. Smith |
| Mr Baird         | Mr M. D. Ferguson | Mr Macfarlane | Mr Somlyay        |
| Mr Baker         | Mr Forrest*       | Mr McGauran   | Dr Southcott      |
| Mr Baldwin       | Ms Gambaro        | Mrs Markus    | Dr Stone          |
| Mr Barresi       | Mr Georgiou       | Mrs May       | Mr Ticehurst      |
| Mr Bartlett      | Mr Haase          | Mrs Moylan    | Mr Tollner        |
| Mr Billson       | Mr Hardgrave      | Mr Nairn      | Mr Truss          |
| Mrs B. K. Bishop | Mr Hartsuyker     | Mr Neville    | Mr Tuckey         |
| Ms J. Bishop     | Mr Henry          | Ms Panopoulos | Mr Turnbull       |
| Mr Broadbent     | Mr Hockey         | Mr Pearce     | Mr M. A. J. Vaile |
| Mr Brough        | Mrs Hull          | Mr Prosser    | Mr Vasta          |
| Mr Cadman        | Dr Jensen         | Mr Pyne       | Mr Wakelin        |
| Mr Causley       | Mr Johnson        | Mr Randall    | Dr Washer         |
| Mr Ciobo         | Mr Keenan         | Mr Richardson | Mr Wood           |
| Mr Cobb          | Mrs D. M. Kelly   | Mr Robb       |                   |
| Mr Downer        | Jackie Kelly      | Mr Ruddock    |                   |
| Mrs Draper       | Mr Laming         | Mr Schultz    |                   |

#### NOES, 53

| Mr Adams       | Ms K. M. Ellis       | Mrs Irwin         | Ms Plibersek  |
|----------------|----------------------|-------------------|---------------|
| Mr Andren      | Mr Emerson           | Mr Katter         | Mr Price      |
| Mr Beazley     | Mr L. D. T. Ferguson | Mr Kerr           | Mr Quick      |
| Mr Bevis       | Mr M. J. Ferguson    | Ms C. King        | Mr Ripoll     |
| Ms Bird        | Mr Fitzgibbon        | Dr Lawrence       | Ms Roxon      |
| Mr Bowen       | Mr Garrett           | Ms Livermore      | Mr Rudd       |
| Ms A. E. Burke | Mr Georganas         | Mr McClelland     | Mr Sawford    |
| Mr Byrne       | Ms George            | Ms Macklin        | Mr Snowdon    |
| Ms Corcoran    | Ms Grierson          | Mr McMullan       | Ms Vamvakinou |
| Mr Crean       | Mr Griffin           | Mr Melham         | Mr Wilkie     |
| Mr Danby*      | Ms Hall*             | Mr Murphy         | Mr Windsor    |
| Mr Edwards     | Mr Hatton            | Mr B. P. O'Connor |               |
| Mrs Elliot     | Mr Hayes             | Mr G. M. O'Connor |               |
| Ms A. L. Ellis | Ms Hoare             | Ms Owens          |               |
|                |                      |                   |               |

\* Tellers

And so it was resolved in the affirmative.

Mr Katter (seconder) addressing the House—

Closure of Member

Mr Pearce moved—That the Member be no longer heard.

Question—put.

The House divided (the Deputy Speaker, Mr Jenkins, in the Chair)—

#### AYES, 77

| Mr Abbott        | Mrs Elson         | Mrs Ley       | Mr Scott          |
|------------------|-------------------|---------------|-------------------|
| Mr Anderson      | Mr Entsch         | Mr Lindsay    | Mr Secker         |
| Mr Andrews       | Mr Farmer         | Mr Lloyd      | Mr Slipper        |
| Fran Bailey      | Mr Fawcett        | Mr McArthur*  | Mr A. D. H. Smith |
| Mr Baird         | Mr M. D. Ferguson | Mr Macfarlane | Mr Somlyay        |
| Mr Baker         | Mr Forrest*       | Mr McGauran   | Dr Southcott      |
| Mr Baldwin       | Ms Gambaro        | Mrs Markus    | Dr Stone          |
| Mr Barresi       | Mr Georgiou       | Mrs May       | Mr Ticehurst      |
| Mr Bartlett      | Mr Haase          | Mrs Moylan    | Mr Tollner        |
| Mr Billson       | Mr Hardgrave      | Mr Nairn      | Mr Truss          |
| Mrs B. K. Bishop | Mr Hartsuyker     | Mr Neville    | Mr Tuckey         |
| Ms J. Bishop     | Mr Henry          | Ms Panopoulos | Mr Turnbull       |
| Mr Broadbent     | Mr Hockey         | Mr Pearce     | Mr M. A. J. Vaile |
| Mr Brough        | Mrs Hull          | Mr Prosser    | Mr Vasta          |
| Mr Cadman        | Dr Jensen         | Mr Pyne       | Mr Wakelin        |
| Mr Causley       | Mr Johnson        | Mr Randall    | Dr Washer         |
| Mr Ciobo         | Mr Keenan         | Mr Richardson | Mr Wood           |
| Mr Cobb          | Mrs D. M. Kelly   | Mr Robb       |                   |
| Mr Downer        | Jackie Kelly      | Mr Ruddock    |                   |
| Mrs Draper       | Mr Laming         | Mr Schultz    |                   |
|                  |                   |               |                   |

# NOES, 53

| Mr Adams       | Ms K. M. Ellis       | Mrs Irwin         | Ms Plibersek  |
|----------------|----------------------|-------------------|---------------|
| Mr Andren      | Mr Emerson           | Mr Katter         | Mr Price      |
| Mr Beazley     | Mr L. D. T. Ferguson | Mr Kerr           | Mr Quick      |
| Mr Bevis       | Mr M. J. Ferguson    | Ms C. King        | Mr Ripoll     |
| Ms Bird        | Mr Fitzgibbon        | Dr Lawrence       | Ms Roxon      |
| Mr Bowen       | Mr Garrett           | Ms Livermore      | Mr Rudd       |
| Ms A. E. Burke | Mr Georganas         | Mr McClelland     | Mr Sawford    |
| Mr Byrne       | Ms George            | Ms Macklin        | Mr Snowdon    |
| Ms Corcoran    | Ms Grierson          | Mr McMullan       | Ms Vamvakinou |
| Mr Crean       | Mr Griffin           | Mr Melham         | Mr Wilkie     |
| Mr Danby*      | Ms Hall*             | Mr Murphy         | Mr Windsor    |
| Mr Edwards     | Mr Hatton            | Mr B. P. O'Connor |               |
| Mrs Elliot     | Mr Hayes             | Mr G. M. O'Connor |               |
| Ms A. L. Ellis | Ms Hoare             | Ms Owens          |               |

\* Tellers

And so it was resolved in the affirmative.

Question—That the motion for the suspension of standing and sessional orders be agreed to—put.

The House divided (the Deputy Speaker, Mr Jenkins, in the Chair)—

#### AYES, 53

| Mr Adams       | Ms K. M. Ellis       | Mrs Irwin         | Ms Plibersek  |
|----------------|----------------------|-------------------|---------------|
| Mr Andren      | Mr Emerson           | Mr Katter         | Mr Price      |
| Mr Beazley     | Mr L. D. T. Ferguson | Mr Kerr           | Mr Quick      |
| Mr Bevis       | Mr M. J. Ferguson    | Ms C. King        | Mr Ripoll     |
| Ms Bird        | Mr Fitzgibbon        | Dr Lawrence       | Ms Roxon      |
| Mr Bowen       | Mr Garrett           | Ms Livermore      | Mr Rudd       |
| Ms A. E. Burke | Mr Georganas         | Mr McClelland     | Mr Sawford    |
| Mr Byrne       | Ms George            | Ms Macklin        | Mr Snowdon    |
| Ms Corcoran    | Ms Grierson          | Mr McMullan       | Ms Vamvakinou |
| Mr Crean       | Mr Griffin           | Mr Melham         | Mr Wilkie     |
| Mr Danby*      | Ms Hall*             | Mr Murphy         | Mr Windsor    |
| Mr Edwards     | Mr Hatton            | Mr B. P. O'Connor |               |
| Mrs Elliot     | Mr Hayes             | Mr G. M. O'Connor |               |
| Ms A. L. Ellis | Ms Hoare             | Ms Owens          |               |

#### **NOES**, 78

| Mr Abbott        | Mrs Elson         | Mrs Ley       | Mr Schultz        |
|------------------|-------------------|---------------|-------------------|
| Mr Anderson      | Mr Entsch         | Mr Lindsay    | Mr Scott          |
| Mr Andrews       | Mr Farmer         | Mr Lloyd      | Mr Secker         |
| Fran Bailey      | Mr Fawcett        | Mr McArthur*  | Mr Slipper        |
| Mr Baird         | Mr M. D. Ferguson | Mr Macfarlane | Mr A. D. H. Smith |
| Mr Baker         | Mr Forrest*       | Mr McGauran   | Mr Somlyay        |
| Mr Baldwin       | Ms Gambaro        | Mrs Markus    | Dr Southcott      |
| Mr Barresi       | Mr Georgiou       | Mrs May       | Dr Stone          |
| Mr Bartlett      | Mr Haase          | Mrs Moylan    | Mr Ticehurst      |
| Mr Billson       | Mr Hardgrave      | Mr Nairn      | Mr Tollner        |
| Mrs B. K. Bishop | Mr Hartsuyker     | Dr Nelson     | Mr Truss          |
| Ms J. Bishop     | Mr Henry          | Mr Neville    | Mr Tuckey         |
| Mr Broadbent     | Mr Hockey         | Ms Panopoulos | Mr Turnbull       |
| Mr Brough        | Mrs Hull          | Mr Pearce     | Mr M. A. J. Vaile |
| Mr Cadman        | Dr Jensen         | Mr Prosser    | Mr Vasta          |
| Mr Causley       | Mr Johnson        | Mr Pyne       | Mr Wakelin        |
| Mr Ciobo         | Mr Keenan         | Mr Randall    | Dr Washer         |
| Mr Cobb          | Mrs D. M. Kelly   | Mr Richardson | Mr Wood           |
| Mr Downer        | Jackie Kelly      | Mr Robb       |                   |
| Mrs Draper       | Mr Laming         | Mr Ruddock    |                   |

\* Tellers

And so it was negatived.

#### 8 TAX LAWS AMENDMENT (2005 MEASURES NO. 5) BILL 2005

The order of the day having been read for the resumption of the debate on the question—That the bill be now read a second time—

Debate resumed by Mr Fitzgibbon who moved, as an amendment—That all words after "That" be omitted with a view to substituting the following words: "whilst not declining to give the bill a second reading, the House condemns the Government for:

- (1) the mismanagement of the legislative program by continuing to introduce tax bills with significant errors and anomalies requiring costly and cumbersome legislative correction;
- (2) creating uncertainty for the small business sector by again changing debt equity provisions; and
- (3) failing to bring forward a cognate bill to deal with all necessary changes to the consolidation regime".

Debate continued.

Amendment negatived.

Question—That the bill be now read a second time—put and passed—bill read a second time.

Message from the Governor-General

Message No. 102, 18 August 2005, from His Excellency the Governor-General was announced recommending an appropriation for the purposes of the bill.

Consideration in detail

Bill, by leave, taken as a whole, and agreed to, after debate.

Consideration in detail concluded.

On the motion of Mr Brough (Minister for Revenue and Assistant Treasurer), by leave, the bill was read a third time.

#### 9 WORKPLACE RELATIONS AMENDMENT (BETTER BARGAINING) BILL 2005

The order of the day having been read for the resumption of the debate on the question—That the bill be now read a second time—

Debate resumed.

Question—put and passed—bill read a second time.

Consideration in detail

Bill, by leave, taken as a whole.

Document

Mr Andrews (Minister for Employment and Workplace Relations) presented a supplementary explanatory memorandum to the bill.

On the motion of Mr Andrews, by leave, Government amendments (1) to (4) were made together, after debate.

Question—That the bill, as amended, be agreed to—put.

The House divided (the Deputy Speaker, Mr Wilkie, in the Chair)—

|                  |                   | *             |                   |
|------------------|-------------------|---------------|-------------------|
| Mr Abbott        | Mrs Elson         | Mrs Ley       | Mr Scott          |
| Mr Anderson      | Mr Entsch         | Mr Lindsay    | Mr Secker         |
| Mr Andrews       | Mr Farmer         | Mr Lloyd      | Mr Slipper        |
| Fran Bailey      | Mr Fawcett        | Mr McArthur*  | Mr A. D. H. Smith |
| Mr Baird         | Mr M. D. Ferguson | Mr Macfarlane | Mr Somlyay        |
| Mr Baker         | Mr Forrest*       | Mr McGauran   | Dr Southcott      |
| Mr Baldwin       | Ms Gambaro        | Mrs Markus    | Dr Stone          |
| Mr Barresi       | Mr Georgiou       | Mrs May       | Mr Ticehurst      |
| Mr Bartlett      | Mr Haase          | Mrs Moylan    | Mr Tollner        |
| Mr Billson       | Mr Hardgrave      | Mr Nairn      | Mr Truss          |
| Mrs B. K. Bishop | Mr Hartsuyker     | Dr Nelson     | Mr Tuckey         |
| Ms J. Bishop     | Mr Henry          | Mr Neville    | Mr Turnbull       |
| Mr Broadbent     | Mr Hockey         | Ms Panopoulos | Mr M. A. J. Vaile |
| Mr Brough        | Mrs Hull          | Mr Pearce     | Mr Vasta          |
| Mr Cadman        | Mr Hunt           | Mr Prosser    | Mr Wakelin        |
| Mr Causley       | Dr Jensen         | Mr Pyne       | Dr Washer         |
| Mr Ciobo         | Mr Johnson        | Mr Randall    | Mr Windsor        |
| Mr Cobb          | Mr Keenan         | Mr Richardson | Mr Wood           |
| Mr Downer        | Mrs D. M. Kelly   | Mr Robb       |                   |
| Mrs Draper       | Jackie Kelly      | Mr Ruddock    |                   |
| Mr Dutton        | Mr Laming         | Mr Schultz    |                   |
|                  |                   |               |                   |

| Ms K. M. Ellis       | Ms Hoare   | Mr G. M. O'Connor  |
|----------------------|--|--|
| Mr Emerson           | Mrs Irwin  | Ms Owens   |
| Mr L. D. T. Ferguson | Mr Jenkins   | Ms Plibersek   |
| Mr M. J. Ferguson    | Mr Katter  | Mr Price   |
| Mr Fitzgibbon        | Mr Kerr  | Mr Quick   |
| Mr Garrett           | Ms C. King   | Mr Ripoll  |
| Mr Georganas         | Dr Lawrence  | Ms Roxon   |
| Ms George            | Ms Livermore   | Mr Rudd  |
| Ms Gillard           | Mr McClelland  | Mr Sawford   |
| Ms Grierson          | Ms Macklin   | Mr Sercombe  |
| Mr Griffin           | Mr McMullan  | Mr S. F. Smith   |
| Ms Hall*             | Mr Melham  | Mr Snowdon   |
| Mr Hatton            | Mr Murphy  | Mr Tanner  |
| Mr Hayes             | Mr B. P. O'Connor  | Ms Vamvakinou  |
|                      | Mr Emerson Mr L. D. T. Ferguson Mr M. J. Ferguson Mr Fitzgibbon Mr Garrett Mr Georganas Ms George Ms Gillard Ms Grierson Mr Griffin Ms Hall* Mr Hatton | Mr Emerson Mrs Irwin Mr L. D. T. Ferguson Mr Jenkins Mr M. J. Ferguson Mr Katter Mr Fitzgibbon Mr Kerr Mr Garrett Ms C. King Mr Georganas Dr Lawrence Ms George Ms Livermore Ms Gillard Mr McClelland Ms Grierson Ms Macklin Mr Griffin Mr McMullan Ms Hall* Mr Melham Mr Hatton Mr Murphy |

\* Tellers

And so it was resolved in the affirmative.

Consideration in detail concluded.

On the motion of Mr Andrews, by leave, the bill was read a third time.

#### 10 HEALTH INSURANCE AMENDMENT (MEDICARE SAFETY-NETS) BILL 2005

The order of the day having been read for the resumption of the debate on the question—That the bill be now read a second time—

Debate resumed.

It being 2 p.m., the debate was interrupted in accordance with standing order 97, and the resumption of the debate made an order of the day for a later hour this day.

#### 11 QUESTIONS

Questions without notice being asked—

Suspension of standing and sessional orders moved

Mr Beazley (Leader of the Opposition) moved—That so much of the standing and sessional orders be suspended as would prevent the Leader of the Opposition moving forthwith—That this House censure the Howard Government for failing to ensure that Telstra shareholders and the Australian community were properly informed that:

- (1) Telstra's services have seriously declined;
- (2) Telstra's investment in new technology has been totally inadequate;
- (3) share buy backs and special dividend payments have bled Telstra's investment program of \$3.65 billion; and
- (4) Telstra has been using reserves to pay dividends;

despite being made aware of these matters by the company.

Debate ensued.

Member directed to leave

At 3.05 p.m. the Member for Oxley (Mr Ripoll) was directed, under standing order 94, to leave the Chamber for one hour for continuing to interject after a general warning had been given from the Chair, and he accordingly left the Chamber.

Debate continued.

The time allowed by standing order 1 for debate on the motion having expired—

Question—put.

The House divided (the Speaker, Mr Hawker, in the Chair)—

#### AYES, 59

| Mr Adams       | Ms K. M. Ellis       | Mrs Irwin         | Ms Plibersek   |
|----------------|----------------------|-------------------|----------------|
| Mr Albanese    | Mr Emerson           | Mr Jenkins        | Mr Price       |
| Mr Andren      | Mr L. D. T. Ferguson | Mr Katter         | Mr Quick       |
| Mr Beazley     | Mr M. J. Ferguson    | Mr Kerr           | Ms Roxon       |
| Mr Bevis       | Mr Fitzgibbon        | Ms C. King        | Mr Rudd        |
| Ms Bird        | Mr Garrett           | Dr Lawrence       | Mr Sawford     |
| Mr Bowen       | Mr Georganas         | Ms Livermore      | Mr Sercombe    |
| Ms A. E. Burke | Ms George            | Mr McClelland     | Mr S. F. Smith |
| Mr Byrne       | Ms Gillard           | Ms Macklin        | Mr Snowdon     |
| Ms Corcoran    | Ms Grierson          | Mr McMullan       | Mr Swan        |
| Mr Crean       | Mr Griffin           | Mr Melham         | Mr Tanner      |
| Mr Danby*      | Ms Hall*             | Mr Murphy         | Ms Vamvakinou  |
| Mr Edwards     | Mr Hatton            | Mr B. P. O'Connor | Mr Wilkie      |
| Mrs Elliot     | Mr Hayes             | Mr G. M. O'Connor | Mr Windsor     |
| Ms A. L. Ellis | Ms Hoare             | Ms Owens          |                |
|                |                      |                   |                |

#### **NOES**, 77

| Mr Abbott        | Mr Dutton         | Mr Laming     | Mr Schultz        |
|------------------|-------------------|---------------|-------------------|
| Mr Anderson      | Mrs Elson         | Mrs Ley       | Mr Scott          |
| Mr Andrews       | Mr Entsch         | Mr Lindsay    | Mr Secker         |
| Fran Bailey      | Mr Farmer         | Mr Lloyd      | Mr Slipper        |
| Mr Baird         | Mr Fawcett        | Mr McArthur*  | Mr A. D. H. Smith |
| Mr Baker         | Mr M. D. Ferguson | Mr Macfarlane | Mr Somlyay        |
| Mr Baldwin       | Mr Forrest*       | Mr McGauran   | Dr Southcott      |
| Mr Barresi       | Ms Gambaro        | Mrs Markus    | Dr Stone          |
| Mr Bartlett      | Mr Georgiou       | Mrs May       | Mr Ticehurst      |
| Mr Billson       | Mr Haase          | Mrs Moylan    | Mr Tollner        |
| Mrs B. K. Bishop | Mr Hardgrave      | Mr Nairn      | Mr Truss          |
| Ms J. Bishop     | Mr Hartsuyker     | Dr Nelson     | Mr Tuckey         |
| Mr Broadbent     | Mr Henry          | Mr Neville    | Mr M. A. J. Vaile |
| Mr Brough        | Mr Hockey         | Ms Panopoulos | Mr Vasta          |
| Mr Cadman        | Mr Howard         | Mr Pearce     | Mr Wakelin        |
| Mr Causley       | Mr Hunt           | Mr Prosser    | Dr Washer         |
| Mr Ciobo         | Dr Jensen         | Mr Pyne       | Mr Wood           |
| Mr Cobb          | Mr Johnson        | Mr Randall    |                   |
| Mr Downer        | Mr Keenan         | Mr Robb       |                   |
| Mrs Draper       | Mrs D. M. Kelly   | Mr Ruddock    |                   |

\* Tellers

And so it was negatived.

Questions without notice concluded.

#### 12 DOCUMENT

The following document was presented:

ASC Pty Ltd—Statement of corporate intent 2005-2008.

# 13 DISCUSSION OF MATTER OF PUBLIC IMPORTANCE—TELSTRA

The House was informed that Mr Beazley (Leader of the Opposition) had proposed that a definite matter of public importance be submitted to the House for discussion, namely, "The failure of the Government to accurately inform the Australian people of the true state of Telstra".

The proposed discussion having received the necessary support—

Mr Beazley addressed the House.

Discussion ensued.

Discussion concluded.

#### 14 MESSAGE FROM THE GOVERNOR-GENERAL—ASSENT TO BILL

A message from His Excellency the Governor-General was announced informing the House that His Excellency, in the name of Her Majesty, had assented to the following bill:

6 September 2005—Message No. 103—Human Services Legislation Amendment 2005.

# 15 MESSAGES FROM THE SENATE

Messages from the Senate, 7 September 2005, were reported returning the following bills without amendment:

Message-

No. 188—Building and Construction Industry Improvement 2005.

No. 189—Building and Construction Industry Improvement (Consequential and Transitional) 2005.

#### 16 MAIN COMMITTEE—DAY OF NEXT MEETING

The Deputy Speaker reported that Thursday, 8 September 2005, at 9.30 a.m., had been fixed for the next meeting of the Main Committee.

# 17 TELECOMMUNICATIONS LEGISLATION AMENDMENT (FUTURE PROOFING AND OTHER MEASURES) BILL 2005

The order of the day having been read for the resumption of the debate on the question—That the bill be now read a second time—

Debate resumed.

Mr Forrest addressing the House—

18 ADJOURNMENT

It being 7.30 p.m.—The question was proposed—That the House do now adjourn.

Debate ensued.

Question—put and passed.

And then the House, at 8 p.m., adjourned until 9 a.m. tomorrow.

#### **DOCUMENTS**

The following documents were deemed to have been presented on 7 September 2005:

Broadcasting Services Act—Notice—2005 Reservation of capacity for national radio broadcasting services (No. 1) [F2005L02491].

Civil Aviation Act—Civil Aviation Safety Regulations—Airworthiness Directives—Part 39-105—2005 2 (2) September [F2005L02508], [F2005L02510].

Customs Act—Instruments of approval—2005 Nos CEO 45, CEO 46, CEO 48 [F2005L02490], [F2005L02496], [F2005L02498].

Social Security Act—Determinations—2005—

Family and community services (Tasmanian Motor Accidents Insurance Board 'future care payments') [F2005L02463].

Family and community services (Victorian Transport Accident Commission 'attendant care service' and 'post acute support') [F2005L02464].

Social security (Tasmanian Motor Accidents Insurance Board 'future care payments' exemption) (DEWR) [F2005L02460].

Social security (Victorian Transport Accident Commission 'attendant care service' and 'post acute support' exemption) (DEWR) [F2005L02456].

# ATTENDANCE

All Members attended (at some time during the sitting) except Mr T. S. Burke, Mr Costello, Mrs Gash, Mr Gibbons, Mr Jull\*, Mr C. P. Thompson, Mr K. J. Thomson and Mrs D. S. Vale.

\* On leave

**B. C. WRIGHT** Acting Clerk of the House of Representatives

2004-05

# HOUSE OF REPRESENTATIVES SUPPLEMENT TO VOTES AND PROCEEDINGS

No. 53

# MAIN COMMITTEE

# MINUTES OF PROCEEDINGS

WEDNESDAY, 7 SEPTEMBER 2005

| The Main Committee met at 9.30 a.m.   |
|---|
| MEMBERS' STATEMENTS   |
| Members' statements were made.  |
| <del></del> -   |
| Suspension of sitting   |
| At 9.48 a.m., a division having been called in the House, the proceedings were suspended. |
| Resumption of sitting   |
| At 10.06 a.m., the proceedings were resumed.  |
|   |
| Absence of quorum   |
| At 10.07 a.m., the Deputy Speaker suspended the sitting due to the lack of a quorum.      |
| ' <u></u>   |
| D I M CI EVI AND  |
|   |

**R. J. McCLELLAND**Clerk of the Main Committee