#### 2002-03

#### THE PARLIAMENT OF THE COMMONWEALTH OF AUSTRALIA

#### **HOUSE OF REPRESENTATIVES**

### **VOTES AND PROCEEDINGS**

#### No. 78

# TUESDAY, 4 MARCH 2003

1 The House met, at 2 p.m., pursuant to adjournment. The Speaker (the Honourable Neil Andrew) took the Chair, and read Prayers.

#### 2 QUESTIONS

Questions without notice were asked.

#### **3 AUDITOR-GENERAL'S REPORT**

The Speaker presented the following paper:

Auditor-General—Audit report No. 30 of 2002-2003—Performance audit—Defence ordnance safety and suitability for service: Department of Defence.

Ordered to be printed.

#### 4 PAPERS

The following papers were presented:

Australia-Korea Foundation—Report for 2000-01.

Australian Communications Authority—National Relay Service—Performance report for 2001-02.

Australian Radiation Protection and Nuclear Safety Agency—Quarterly reports of the Chief Executive Officer for periods—

1 April to 30 June 2002.

1 July to 30 September 2002.

Commonwealth Grants Commission—State revenue sharing relativities—2003 update.

CrimTrac Agency—Report for 2001-02—Corrigenda.

Department of Defence—Australia's National Security—A Defence Update 2003.

Migration—Joint Standing Committee—Report—Not the Hilton–Immigration detention centres: Inspection—Government response.

Native Title Act—Native title representative bodies—

Cape York Land Council Aboriginal Corporation-Report for 2001-02.

Central Queensland Land Council Aboriginal Corporation—Report for 2001-02.

North Queensland Land Council Aboriginal Corporation-Report for 2001-02.

Regional Forest Agreements between the Commonwealth and Tasmania-

Inquiry on the progress with the implementation of the Tasmanian Regional Forest Agreement (1997)— Final recommendations report, December 2002.

Tasmanian Government Implementation—Report for 2001.

Treaties-

Bilateral—Text, together with national interest analysis and regulation impact statement—Singapore-Australia Free Trade Agreement done at Singapore on 17 February 2003, and associated Exchange of Notes.

Multilateral—

Text, together with national interest analyses and regulation impact statements-

Annex IV: Regulations for the prevention of pollution by sewage from ships (revised) of the Protocol of 1978 relating to the International Convention for the Prevention of Pollution from Ships, 1973, as Amended (MARPOL 73/78), done at London, 17 February 1978, revised text adopted at London, 13 March 2000.

International Convention on the control of harmful anti-fouling systems on ships, done at London on 18 October 2001.

*Text, together with national interest analysis*—Amendments, done at Santiago in November 2002, to Appendices I and II of the Convention on International Trade in Endangered Species of Wild Fauna and Flora of 3 March 1973.

#### 5 DISCUSSION OF MATTER OF PUBLIC IMPORTANCE-MEDICARE

The House was informed that Mr S. F. Smith had proposed that a definite matter of public importance be submitted to the House for discussion, namely, "The Government's proposal to destroy Medicare by abandoning universal access to bulk-billing for Australian families".

The proposed discussion having received the necessary support-

Mr S. F. Smith addressed the House.

Discussion ensued.

Discussion concluded.

#### **6 SUSPENSION OF STANDING AND SESSIONAL ORDERS MOVED**

Mr Andren moved—That so much of the standing and sessional orders be suspended as would prevent the Member for Calare moving that the House:

- (1) acknowledge that, in rejecting that the question be put, the House voted to continue the debate on the Prime Minister's statement on Iraq and proposed amendments on the last sitting day before the recent break, February 13;
- (2) recognise that this debate has subsequently not been scheduled for further consideration and resolution of the question;
- (3) acknowledge that the US Congress and UK House of Commons have debated and voted on the question of their country's involvement in military action against Iraq;
- (4) acknowledge that it is necessary that this House also vote on the nature of Australian Defence Force involvement in Iraq;
- (5) acknowledge that it is the wish of the Australian people that the House of Representatives vote on this important question; and
- (6) immediately consider government business order of the day No. 49 and that the question be put forthwith.

Closure of Member

Mr Williams (Attorney-General) moved—That the Member be not further heard.

Question-put.

The House divided (the Deputy Speaker, Mr Causley, in the Chair)-

		AYES, 73		
Mr Abbott	Mr Downer	Dr Kemp	Mr Secker	
Mr Anderson	Mrs Draper	Mr P. E. King	Mr Slipper	
Mr K. J. Andrews	Mr Entsch	Mrs Ley	Mr A. D. H. Smith	
Mr Anthony	Mr Farmer	Mr Lindsay	Mr Somlyay	
Fran Bailey	Mr Forrest*	Mr McArthur*	Dr Southcott	
Mr Baird	Mrs Gallus	Mr I. E. Macfarlane	Dr Stone	
Mr Baldwin	Ms Gambaro	Mr McGauran	Mr C. P. Thompson	
Mr Barresi	Mrs Gash	Mrs Moylan	Mr Ticehurst	
Mr Bartlett	Mr Georgiou	Mr Nairn	Mr Tollner	
Mr Billson	Mr Haase	Dr Nelson	Mr Truss	
Mrs B. K. Bishop	Mr Hardgrave	Mr Neville	Mr Tuckey	
Ms J. I. Bishop	Mr Hartsuyker	Ms Panopoulos	Mrs D. S. Vale	
Mr Brough	Mr Hawker	Mr Pearce	Mr Wakelin	
Mr Cadman	Mr Hockey	Mr Prosser	Dr Washer	
Mr Cameron	Mrs Hull	Mr Pyne	Mr Williams	
Mr Charles	Mr Hunt	Mr Randall	Ms Worth	
Mr Ciobo	Mr Johnson	Mr Ruddock		
Mr Cobb	Mr Jull	Mr Schultz		
Mr Costello	Mrs D. M. Kelly	Mr Scott		
	NOES, 61			
Mr Adams	Mr M. J. Ferguson	Mr Latham	Mr Rudd	
Mr Albanese	Mr Fitzgibbon	Dr Lawrence	Mr Sawford	
Mr Andren	Ms George	Mr McClelland	Mr Sciacca	
Mr Beazley	Mr Gibbons	Ms J. S. McFarlane	Mr Sercombe	
Mr Bevis	Ms Gillard	Ms Macklin	Mr Sidebottom	
Mr Brereton	Ms Grierson	Mr McLeay	Mr Snowdon	
Ms Burke	Mr Griffin	Mr McMullan	Mr Swan	
Mr Byrne	Ms Hall	Mr Mossfield	Mr Tanner	
Ms Corcoran	Mr Hatton	Mr Murphy	Mr K. J. Thomson	
Mr Cox	Ms Hoare	Ms O'Byrne	Ms Vamvakinou	
Mr Danby*	Mrs Irwin	Mr B. P. O'Connor	Mr Wilkie	
Mr Edwards	Ms Jackson	Mr G. M. O'Connor	Mr Windsor	
Ms Ellis	Mr Jenkins	Mr Organ	Mr Zahra	
Mr Emerson	Mr Katter	Ms Plibersek		
Mr Evans	Mr Kerr	Mr Quick*		
Mr L. D. T. Ferguson	Ms C. F. King	Ms Roxon		

#### AYES, 73

\* Tellers

And so it was resolved in the affirmative.

Mr Windsor (seconder) addressing the House-

Closure of Member

Mr Hardgrave (Minister for Citizenship and Multicultural Affairs) moved—That the Member be not further heard.

Question-put.

The House divided (the Deputy Speaker, Mr Causley, in the Chair)-

		AYES, 73		
Mr Abbott	Mr Downer	Dr Kemp	Mr Secker	
Mr Anderson	Mrs Draper	Mr P. E. King	Mr Slipper	
Mr K. J. Andrews	Mr Entsch	Mrs Ley	Mr A. D. H. Smith	
Mr Anthony	Mr Farmer	Mr Lindsay	Mr Somlyay	
Fran Bailey	Mr Forrest*	Mr McArthur*	Dr Southcott	
Mr Baird	Mrs Gallus	Mr I. E. Macfarlane	Dr Stone	
Mr Baldwin	Ms Gambaro	Mr McGauran	Mr C. P. Thompson	
Mr Barresi	Mrs Gash	Mrs Moylan	Mr Ticehurst	
Mr Bartlett	Mr Georgiou	Mr Nairn	Mr Tollner	
Mr Billson	Mr Haase	Dr Nelson	Mr Truss	
Mrs B. K. Bishop	Mr Hardgrave	Mr Neville	Mr Tuckey	
Ms J. I. Bishop	Mr Hartsuyker	Ms Panopoulos	Mrs D. S. Vale	
Mr Brough	Mr Hawker	Mr Pearce	Mr Wakelin	
Mr Cadman	Mr Hockey	Mr Prosser	Dr Washer	
Mr Cameron	Mrs Hull	Mr Pyne	Mr Williams	
Mr Charles	Mr Hunt	Mr Randall	Ms Worth	
Mr Ciobo	Mr Johnson	Mr Ruddock		
Mr Cobb	Mr Jull	Mr Schultz		
Mr Costello	Mrs D. M. Kelly	Mr Scott		
	NOES, 61			
Mr Adams	Mr M. J. Ferguson	Mr Latham	Mr Rudd	
Mr Albanese	Mr Fitzgibbon	Dr Lawrence	Mr Sawford	
Mr Andren	Ms George	Mr McClelland	Mr Sciacca	
Mr Beazley	Mr Gibbons	Ms J. S. McFarlane	Mr Sercombe	
Mr Bevis	Ms Gillard	Ms Macklin	Mr Sidebottom	
Mr Brereton	Ms Grierson	Mr McLeay	Mr Snowdon	
Ms Burke	Mr Griffin	Mr McMullan	Mr Swan	
Mr Byrne	Ms Hall	Mr Mossfield	Mr Tanner	
Ms Corcoran	Mr Hatton	Mr Murphy	Mr K. J. Thomson	
Mr Cox	Ms Hoare	Ms O'Byrne	Ms Vamvakinou	
Mr Danby*	Mrs Irwin	Mr B. P. O'Connor	Mr Wilkie	
Mr Edwards	Ms Jackson	Mr G. M. O'Connor	Mr Windsor	
Ms Ellis	Mr Jenkins	Mr Organ	Mr Zahra	
Mr Emerson	Mr Katter	Ms Plibersek		
Mr Evans	Mr Kerr	Mr Quick*		
Mr L. D. T. Ferguson	Ms C. F. King	Ms Roxon		

AYES, 73

\* Tellers

And so it was resolved in the affirmative.

Question—That the motion for the suspension of standing and sessional orders be agreed to—put and negatived.

#### 7 MAIN COMMITTEE—DAY OF NEXT MEETING

The Deputy Speaker fixed Wednesday, 5 March 2003, at 9.40 a.m., for the next meeting of the Main Committee.

#### 8 BILLS REFERRED TO MAIN COMMITTEE

Mr McArthur (Acting Chief Government Whip), by leave, moved—That the following Bills be referred to the Main Committee for further consideration:

Dairy Industry Service Reform 2003;

Primary Industries (Excise) Levies Amendment (Dairy) 2003; and

Superannuation Legislation Amendment (Family Law) 2002.

Question-put and passed.

## 9 WORKPLACE RELATIONS AMENDMENT (SECRET BALLOTS FOR PROTECTED ACTION) BILL 2002 [NO. 2]

The order of the day having been read for the resumption of the debate on the question—That the Bill be now read a second time—

Debate resumed.

Question-put.

The House divided (the Deputy Speaker, Mr Jenkins, in the Chair)-

#### AYES, 78

		,	
Mr Abbott	Mr Costello	Dr Kemp	Mr Secker
Mr Anderson	Mr Downer	Mr P. E. King	Mr Slipper
Mr Andren	Mrs Draper	Mrs Ley	Mr A. D. H. Smith
Mr K. J. Andrews	Mr Entsch	Mr Lindsay	Mr Somlyay
Mr Anthony	Mr Farmer	Mr McArthur*	Dr Southcott
Fran Bailey	Mr Forrest*	Mr I. E. Macfarlane	Dr Stone
Mr Baird	Ms Gambaro	Mr McGauran	Mr C. P. Thompson
Mr Baldwin	Mrs Gash	Mrs May	Mr Ticehurst
Mr Barresi	Mr Georgiou	Mrs Moylan	Mr Tollner
Mr Bartlett	Mr Haase	Mr Nairn	Mr Truss
Mr Billson	Mr Hardgrave	Dr Nelson	Mr Tuckey
Mrs B. K. Bishop	Mr Hartsuyker	Mr Neville	Mr M. A. J. Vaile
Ms J. I. Bishop	Mr Hawker	Ms Panopoulos	Mrs D. S. Vale
Mr Brough	Mr Hockey	Mr Pearce	Mr Wakelin
Mr Cadman	Mrs Hull	Mr Prosser	Dr Washer
Mr Cameron	Mr Hunt	Mr Pyne	Mr Williams
Mr Causley	Mr Johnson	Mr Randall	Mr Windsor
Mr Charles	Mr Jull	Mr Ruddock	Ms Worth
Mr Ciobo	Mr Katter	Mr Schultz	
Mr Cobb	Mrs D. M. Kelly	Mr Scott	
		NOES, 61	
Mr Adams	Mr M. J. Ferguson	Mr McClelland	Mr Rudd
Mr Albanese	Mr Fitzgibbon	Ms J. S. McFarlane	Mr Sawford
Mr Beazley	Ms George	Ms Macklin	Mr Sciacca
Mr Bevis	Mr Gibbons	Mr McLeay	Mr Sercombe
Mr Brereton	Ms Gillard	Mr McMullan	Mr Sidebottom
Ms Burke	Ms Grierson	Mr Melham	Mr S. F. Smith
Mr Byrne	Mr Griffin	Mr Mossfield	Mr Snowdon
Ms Corcoran	Ms Hall	Mr Murphy	Mr Swan
Mr Cox	Mr Hatton	Ms O'Byrne	Mr Tanner
Mr Crean	Ms Hoare	Mr B. P. O'Connor	Mr K. J. Thomson
Mr Danby*	Mrs Irwin	Mr G. M. O'Connor	Ms Vamvakinou
Mr Edwards	Ms Jackson	Mr Organ	Mr Wilkie
Ms Ellis	Mr Kerr	Ms Plibersek	Mr Zahra
Mr Emerson	Ms C. F. King	Mr Price	
Mr Evans	Mr Latham	Mr Quick*	
N I D T F			
Mr L. D. T. Ferguson	Dr Lawrence	Ms Roxon	

\* Tellers

And so it was resolved in the affirmative—Bill read a second time.

Leave granted for third reading to be moved forthwith.

On the motion of Mr Abbott (Minister for Employment and Workplace Relations), the Bill was read a third time.

#### 10 APPROPRIATION BILL (NO. 3) 2002-2003

The order of the day having been read for the resumption of the debate on the question—That the Bill be now read a second time—*And on the amendment moved thereto by Mr McMullan, viz.*—That all words after "That" be omitted with a view to substituting the following words: "whilst not declining to give the Bill a second reading, the House condemns the Government for its failures in economic management, and in particular its failings in relation to both income and expenditure policies because:

- (1) it is the highest taxing Government in Australian history, and:
  - (a) has imposed the highest level ever of income tax;
  - (b) is responsible for introducing the biggest new tax in our history; and
  - (c) is addicted to imposing ever more taxes and special levies;
- (2) it has failed to deliver on its basic responsibilities to the Australian people, for example:
  - (a) bulk billing has collapsed;
  - (b) there is chronic under-investment in our public schools, TAFE colleges and universities;
  - (c) the struggle to balance work and family life continues to get harder; and
  - (d) entry level housing is becoming even less affordable for struggling Australian families; and
- (3) despite the record tax take, and in spite of declining Government services, the Government has failed to keep the Budget in surplus after nearly a decade of strong economic growth, in that:
  - (a) it broke its unequivocal promise to keep the Budget in surplus in 2001-02;
  - (b) future surpluses are dependent on the additional revenue provided by bracket creep;
  - (c) it has presided over enormous waste and mismanagement including billions of dollars of foreign exchange losses and defence procurement losses; and

Debate resumed.

Mr Murphy addressing the House-

#### **11 ADJOURNMENT**

It being 9 p.m.—The question was proposed—That the House do now adjourn.

Debate ensued.

Question-put and passed.

And then the House, at 9.29 p.m., adjourned until tomorrow at 9 a.m.

#### PAPERS

The following papers were deemed to have been presented on 4 March 2003:

Australian Capital Territory (Planning and Land Management) Act—National Capital Plan— Amendment No. 41—Gungahlin Drive Extension.

Australian Meat and Live-stock Industry Act—Order—2003 Australian Meat and Live-stock Industry (High quality beef export to the European Union).

Taxation Administration Act-

Determinations—2003 Nos GSTD 1, TD 2. Rulings—2003 Nos CR 12, CR 13, GSTR 1, GSTR 2.

#### ATTENDANCE

All Members attended (at some time during the sitting) except Mrs Crosio\*, Mrs Elson, Jackie Kelly, Ms Livermore\*, Mr Lloyd\* and Mr Ripoll.

\* On leave

I. C. HARRIS Clerk of the House of Representatives