

2002

THE PARLIAMENT OF THE COMMONWEALTH OF AUSTRALIA

HOUSE OF REPRESENTATIVES

VOTES AND PROCEEDINGS

No. 27

TUESDAY, 18 JUNE 2002

1 The House met, at 2 p.m., pursuant to adjournment. The Speaker (the Honourable Neil Andrew) took the Chair, and read Prayers.

2 QUESTIONS

Questions without notice were asked.

3 AUDITOR-GENERAL'S REPORTS

The Speaker presented the following papers:

Auditor-General—Audit reports of 2001-2002—Performance audits—

No. 55—Administration of tobacco excise—Australian Taxation Office.

No. 56—Workforce planning in the Department of Immigration and Multicultural and Indigenous Affairs.

No. 57—Management framework for preventing unlawful entry into Australian Territory—Department of Immigration and Multicultural and Indigenous Affairs.

No. 58—Defence property management—Department of Defence.

Severally ordered to be printed.

4 PAPERS

The following papers were presented:

Department of Communications, Information Technology and the Arts—The future of community television, June 2002.

National Rural Advisory Council—Report, including a report on the Rural Adjustment Scheme, for 2000-01.

Pharmaceutical Benefits Pricing Authority—Report for 2000-01.

Productivity Commission—Report No. 20—Citrus growing and processing, 30 April 2002.

Treaties—

Bilateral—Text, together with national interest analyses—

Agreement between the Government of Australia and the Government of the Cook Islands relating to air services, done at Apia on 18 September 2001.

Agreement between the Government of Australia and the Government of the Republic of Chile relating to air services, done at Santiago on 7 September 2001.

Agreement between the Government of Australia and the Government of the United States of America for the enforcement of maintenance (support) obligations.

Multilateral—Text, together with national interest analyses—

Agreement establishing the International Organisation of Vine and Wine, done at Paris on 3 April 2001.

Amendment, adopted at Geneva on 21 December 2001, to the convention on prohibitions or restrictions on the use of certain conventional weapons which may be deemed to be excessively injurious or to have indiscriminate effects of 10 October 1980.

Australian declaration under paragraph 2 of Article 36 of the Statute of the International Court of Justice 1945, lodged at New York on 22 March 2002.

Australian declarations under Articles 287(1) and 298(1) of the United Nations Convention on the Law of the Sea 1982, lodged at New York on 22 March 2002.

International convention for the suppression of the financing of terrorism, done at New York on 9 December 1999.

5 PAPERS—MOTION TO TAKE NOTE OF PAPERS

Mr Abbott (Leader of the House) moved—That the House take note of the following papers:

Department of Communications, Information Technology and the Arts—The future of community television, June 2002.

Pharmaceutical Benefits Pricing Authority—Report for 2000-01.

Productivity Commission—Report No. 20—Citrus growing and processing, 30 April 2002.

Debate adjourned (Mr Swan), and the resumption of each debate made an order of the day for the next sitting.

6 ADDRESS OF CONGRATULATION TO HER MAJESTY THE QUEEN—GOLDEN JUBILEE—MOTION TO TAKE NOTE OF PAPER

Mr Abbott (Leader of the House) presented the following paper:

Copy of Address of Congratulation for The Queen's Golden Jubilee—

and moved—That the House take note of the paper.

Debate adjourned (Mr Swan), and the resumption of the debate made an order of the day for the next sitting.

7 MATTER REFERRED TO MAIN COMMITTEE

Mr Abbott (Leader of the House), by leave, moved—That the following order of the day be referred to the Main Committee for debate:

Copy of Address of Congratulation for The Queen's Golden Jubilee—Motion to take note of paper: Resumption of debate.

Question—put and passed.

8 DISCUSSION OF MATTER OF PUBLIC IMPORTANCE—FOREIGN POLICY

The House was informed that Mr Rudd had proposed that a definite matter of public importance be submitted to the House for discussion, namely, "The Howard Government's failed management of Australia's foreign policy interests".

The proposed discussion having received the necessary support—

Mr Rudd addressed the House.

Discussion ensued.

Discussion concluded.

9 COMMITTEES—MEMBERSHIP

The House was informed that the Government Whip had nominated Members to be members of certain committees.

Mr Williams (Attorney-General), by leave, moved—That:

(1) Mrs May be discharged from the Standing Committee on Communications, Information Technology and the Arts and that, in her place, Mr Ticehurst be appointed a member of the committee; and

(2) Mr Pyne be discharged from the Standing Committee on Economics, Finance and Public Administration and that, in his place, Mr P. E. King be appointed a member of the committee.

Question—put and passed.

10 SELECTION COMMITTEE—REPORT

Mr Causley (Chair) presented the following paper:

Selection Committee—Report relating to the consideration of committee and delegation reports and private Members' business on Monday, 24 June 2002.

11 NATIONAL HEALTH AMENDMENT (PHARMACEUTICAL BENEFITS—BUDGET MEASURES) BILL 2002

The order of the day having been read for the resumption of the debate on the question—That the Bill be now read a second time—

Debate resumed by Mr S. F. Smith who moved, as an amendment—That all words after “That” be omitted with a view to substituting the following words:

“the House rejects this bill for the following reasons:

- (1) it will necessitate an increase by nearly 30% in the cost of essential medicines hitting the sickest and poorest in our society;
- (2) the true rationale for the bill is to restore the budget bottom line;
- (3) in terms of health outcomes it will be negative, causing sick and elderly people to be deprived of pharmaceuticals and thus increasing pressure on the nursing homes and hospital sectors, despite growing evidence that \$1 spent on pharmaceuticals saves \$3–\$4 on later health services;
- (4) there are other, more effective, means by which the long term viability of the pharmaceutical benefits scheme could be assured, means which, by proper planning, would put appropriate responsibility on the pharmaceutical industry and the medical profession, rather than on those least able to bear the burden; and
- (5) the disingenuous way in which the Government has both told one story about the pharmaceutical benefits scheme before the election and a different story after the election and has used the intergenerational report to pretend that this is a measure designed to ensure the long term viability of the pharmaceutical benefits scheme”.

Debate continued.

Question—That the words proposed to be omitted stand part of the question—put.

The House divided (the Deputy Speaker, Mr Barresi, in the Chair)—

AYES, 77

Mr Abbott	Mrs Draper	Mr P. E. King	Mr Secker
Mr Anderson	Mr Dutton	Mrs Ley	Mr Slipper
Mr K. J. Andrews	Mrs Elson	Mr Lindsay	Mr A. D. H. Smith
Mr Anthony	Mr Entsch	Mr Lloyd	Mr Somlyay
Fran Bailey	Mr Farmer	Mr McArthur*	Dr Southcott
Mr Baird	Mr Forrest*	Mr I. E. Macfarlane	Dr Stone
Mr Baldwin	Mrs Gallus	Mr McGauran	Mr C. P. Thompson
Mr Bartlett	Mrs Gash	Mrs May	Mr Tollner
Mr Billson	Mr Georgiou	Mrs Moylan	Mr Truss
Mrs B. K. Bishop	Mr Haase	Mr Nairn	Mr Tuckey
Ms J. I. Bishop	Mr Hardgrave	Dr Nelson	Mr M. A. J. Vaile
Mr Brough	Mr Hartsuyker	Mr Neville	Mrs D. S. Vale
Mr Cadman	Mr Hawker	Ms Panopoulos	Mr Wakelin
Mr Cameron	Mr Hockey	Mr Pearce	Dr Washer
Mr Causley	Mrs Hull	Mr Prosser	Mr Williams
Mr Charles	Mr Hunt	Mr Pyne	Mr Windsor
Mr Ciobo	Mr Johnson	Mr Randall	Ms Worth
Mr Cobb	Mr Jull	Mr Ruddock	
Mr Costello	Mrs D. M. Kelly	Mr Schultz	
Mr Downer	Dr Kemp	Mr Scott	

NOES, 60

Mr Adams	Mr M. J. Ferguson	Dr Lawrence	Mr Quick*
Mr Albanese	Mr Fitzgibbon	Ms Livermore	Mr Ripoll
Mr Beazley	Ms George	Mr McClelland	Ms Roxon
Mr Bevis	Mr Gibbons	Ms J. S. McFarlane	Mr Rudd
Mr Brereton	Ms Gillard	Ms Macklin	Mr Sciacca
Mr Byrne	Ms Grierson	Mr McLeay	Mr Sercombe
Ms Corcoran	Mr Griffin	Dr Martin	Mr Sidebottom
Mr Cox	Ms Hall	Mr Melham	Mr S. F. Smith
Mrs Crosio	Mr Hatton	Mr Mossfield	Mr Snowdon
Mr Danby*	Ms Hoare	Mr Murphy	Mr Swan
Mr Edwards	Mrs Irwin	Ms O'Byrne	Mr Tanner
Ms Ellis	Mr Jenkins	Mr B. P. O'Connor	Mr K. J. Thomson
Mr Emerson	Mr Kerr	Mr G. M. O'Connor	Ms Vamvakinou
Mr Evans	Ms C. F. King	Ms Plibersek	Mr Wilkie
Mr L. D. T. Ferguson	Mr Latham	Mr Price	Mr Zahra

* Tellers

And so it was resolved in the affirmative.

Question—That the Bill be now read a second time—put.

The House divided (the Deputy Speaker, Mr Barresi, in the Chair)—

AYES, 78

Mr Abbott	Mrs Draper	Mr P. E. King	Mr Secker
Mr Anderson	Mr Dutton	Mrs Ley	Mr Slipper
Mr K. J. Andrews	Mrs Elson	Mr Lindsay	Mr A. D. H. Smith
Mr Anthony	Mr Entsch	Mr Lloyd	Mr Somlyay
Fran Bailey	Mr Farmer	Mr McArthur*	Dr Southcott
Mr Baird	Mr Forrest*	Mr I. E. Macfarlane	Dr Stone
Mr Baldwin	Mrs Gallus	Mr McGauran	Mr C. P. Thompson
Mr Bartlett	Mrs Gash	Mrs May	Mr Ticehurst
Mr Billson	Mr Georgiou	Mrs Moylan	Mr Tollner
Mrs B. K. Bishop	Mr Haase	Mr Nairn	Mr Truss
Ms J. I. Bishop	Mr Hardgrave	Dr Nelson	Mr Tuckey
Mr Brough	Mr Hartsuyker	Mr Neville	Mr M. A. J. Vaile
Mr Cadman	Mr Hawker	Ms Panopoulos	Mrs D. S. Vale
Mr Cameron	Mr Hockey	Mr Pearce	Mr Wakelin
Mr Causley	Mrs Hull	Mr Prosser	Dr Washer
Mr Charles	Mr Hunt	Mr Pyne	Mr Williams
Mr Ciobo	Mr Johnson	Mr Randall	Mr Windsor
Mr Cobb	Mr Jull	Mr Ruddock	Ms Worth
Mr Costello	Mrs D. M. Kelly	Mr Schultz	
Mr Downer	Dr Kemp	Mr Scott	

NOES, 60

Mr Adams	Mr M. J. Ferguson	Dr Lawrence	Mr Quick*
Mr Albanese	Mr Fitzgibbon	Ms Livermore	Mr Ripoll
Mr Beazley	Ms George	Mr McClelland	Ms Roxon
Mr Bevis	Mr Gibbons	Ms J. S. McFarlane	Mr Rudd
Mr Brereton	Ms Gillard	Ms Macklin	Mr Sciacca
Mr Byrne	Ms Grierson	Mr McLeay	Mr Sercombe
Ms Corcoran	Mr Griffin	Dr Martin	Mr Sidebottom
Mr Cox	Ms Hall	Mr Melham	Mr S. F. Smith
Mrs Crosio	Mr Hatton	Mr Mossfield	Mr Snowdon
Mr Danby*	Ms Hoare	Mr Murphy	Mr Swan
Mr Edwards	Mrs Irwin	Ms O'Byrne	Mr Tanner
Ms Ellis	Mr Jenkins	Mr B. P. O'Connor	Mr K. J. Thomson
Mr Emerson	Mr Kerr	Mr G. M. O'Connor	Ms Vamvakinou
Mr Evans	Ms C. F. King	Ms Plibersek	Mr Wilkie
Mr L. D. T. Ferguson	Mr Latham	Mr Price	Mr Zahra

* Tellers

And so it was resolved in the affirmative—Bill read a second time.

Leave granted for third reading to be moved forthwith.

Mr K. J. Andrews (Minister for Ageing) moved—That the Bill be now read a third time.

Question—put.

The House divided (the Deputy Speaker, Mr Barresi, in the Chair)—

AYES, 78

Mr Abbott	Mrs Draper	Mr P. E. King	Mr Secker
Mr Anderson	Mr Dutton	Mrs Ley	Mr Slipper
Mr K. J. Andrews	Mrs Elson	Mr Lindsay	Mr A. D. H. Smith
Mr Anthony	Mr Entsch	Mr Lloyd	Mr Somlyay
Fran Bailey	Mr Farmer	Mr McArthur*	Dr Southcott
Mr Baird	Mr Forrest*	Mr I. E. Macfarlane	Dr Stone
Mr Baldwin	Mrs Gallus	Mr McGauran	Mr C. P. Thompson
Mr Bartlett	Mrs Gash	Mrs May	Mr Ticehurst
Mr Billson	Mr Georgiou	Mrs Moylan	Mr Tollner
Mrs B. K. Bishop	Mr Haase	Mr Nairn	Mr Truss
Ms J. I. Bishop	Mr Hardgrave	Dr Nelson	Mr Tuckey
Mr Brough	Mr Hartsuyker	Mr Neville	Mr M. A. J. Vaile
Mr Cadman	Mr Hawker	Ms Panopoulos	Mrs D. S. Vale
Mr Cameron	Mr Hockey	Mr Pearce	Mr Wakelin
Mr Causley	Mrs Hull	Mr Prosser	Dr Washer
Mr Charles	Mr Hunt	Mr Pyne	Mr Williams
Mr Ciobo	Mr Johnson	Mr Randall	Mr Windsor
Mr Cobb	Mr Jull	Mr Ruddock	Ms Worth
Mr Costello	Mrs D. M. Kelly	Mr Schultz	
Mr Downer	Dr Kemp	Mr Scott	

NOES, 61

Mr Adams	Mr M. J. Ferguson	Ms Livermore	Ms Roxon
Mr Albanese	Mr Fitzgibbon	Mr McClelland	Mr Rudd
Mr Andren	Ms George	Ms J. S. McFarlane	Mr Sciacca
Mr Beazley	Mr Gibbons	Ms Macklin	Mr Sercombe
Mr Bevis	Ms Gillard	Mr McLeay	Mr Sidebottom
Mr Brereton	Ms Grierson	Dr Martin	Mr S. F. Smith
Mr Byrne	Mr Griffin	Mr Melham	Mr Snowdon
Ms Corcoran	Ms Hall	Mr Mossfield	Mr Swan
Mr Cox	Mr Hatton	Mr Murphy	Mr Tanner
Mrs Crosio	Ms Hoare	Ms O'Byrne	Mr K. J. Thomson
Mr Danby*	Mrs Irwin	Mr B. P. O'Connor	Ms Vamvakinou
Mr Edwards	Mr Jenkins	Mr G. M. O'Connor	Mr Wilkie
Ms Ellis	Mr Kerr	Ms Plibersek	Mr Zahra
Mr Emerson	Ms C. F. King	Mr Price	
Mr Evans	Mr Latham	Mr Quick*	
Mr L. D. T. Ferguson	Dr Lawrence	Mr Ripoll	

* Tellers

And so it was resolved in the affirmative—Bill read a third time.

12 TAXATION LAWS AMENDMENT BILL (NO. 4) 2002

The order of the day having been read for the resumption of the debate on the question—That the Bill be now read a second time—

Debate having been resumed by Mr Latham—

13 ADJOURNMENT

It being 10.30 p.m.—The question was proposed—That the House do now adjourn.

Debate ensued.

Question—put and passed.

And then the House, at 10.58 p.m., adjourned until tomorrow at 9.30 a.m.

PAPERS

The following papers were deemed to have been presented on 18 June 2002:

Air Navigation Act—Regulations—Statutory Rules 2002 No. 123.

Australia New Zealand Food Authority Act—Regulations—Statutory Rules 2002 No. 119.

Australian Securities and Investments Commission Act—Regulations—Statutory Rules 2002 No. 124.

Banking Act—Regulations—Statutory Rules 2002 No. 125.

Commonwealth Electoral Act and Referendum (Machinery Provisions) Act—Regulations—Statutory Rules 2002 No. 117.

Corporations Act—Regulations—Statutory Rules 2002 No. 126.

Currency Act—Currency (Perth Mint) Determination 2001 (No. 2) Amendment Determination 2002 (No. 1).

Federal Court of Australia Act—Rules of Court—Statutory Rules 2002 No. 130.

Financial Management and Accountability Act—Determinations to establish a special account—2002—CSS Special Account.

PSS Special Account.

Financial Management Legislation Amendment Act, Financial Management and Accountability Act—Determination to establish a special account—2002 Comsuper Special Account.

Fisheries Management Act—Regulations—Statutory Rules 2002 No. 115.
Fuel Quality Standards Act—Regulations—Statutory Rules 2002 No. 116.
Immigration (Education) Act—Regulations—Statutory Rules 2002 No. 120.
Insurance Act and General Insurance Reform Act—Regulations—Statutory Rules 2002 No. 127.
Migration Act—Regulations—Statutory Rules 2002 No. 121.
Ombudsman Act—Regulations—Statutory Rules 2002 No. 122.
Passports Act—Regulations—Statutory Rules 2002 No. 118.
Taxation Administration Act—
Regulations—Statutory Rules 2002 No. 128.
Rulings—2002 Nos CR 32, CR 33, PR 34 (Addendum), PR 84, PR 85, PR 86, PR 87, PR 88, PR 89.

ATTENDANCE

All Members attended (at some time during the sitting) except Ms Burke*, Ms Gambaro, Jackie Kelly* and Mr Sawford.

* On leave

I. C. HARRIS
Clerk of the House of Representatives

2002

HOUSE OF REPRESENTATIVES
SUPPLEMENT TO VOTES AND PROCEEDINGS

No. 27

MAIN COMMITTEE

MINUTES OF PROCEEDINGS

TUESDAY, 18 JUNE 2002

1 The Main Committee met at 4 p.m.

2 APPROPRIATION BILL (NO. 1) 2002-2003—BUDGET DEBATE

The order of the day having been read for the resumption of the debate on the question—That the Bill be now read a second time—*And on the amendment moved thereto by Ms Macklin (Deputy Leader of the Opposition), viz.*—That all words after “That” be omitted with a view to substituting the following words: “whilst not declining to give the bill a second reading, the House condemns the Government for:

- (1) its failure to deliver a budget surplus in 2001-02 after a decade of growth;
- (2) its failure to deliver a budget surplus in 2002-03 without breaking previous commitments on defence, roads and working credits;
- (3) imposing the cost of a pre-election spending spree on families via higher interest rates and cuts in health and welfare spending;
- (4) falsely claiming that cuts to health and welfare payments are needed to fund the war against terrorism and border protection;
- (5) wasting \$5 billion of taxpayers money by gambling in foreign currency markets through cross currency derivatives;
- (6) wasting almost \$3.5 billion by failing to manage currency risk on defence spending despite warnings from the Auditor-General;
- (7) wasting \$31 million on maintenance services for 40 year old helicopters that are years overdue despite a \$800 million downpayment;
- (8) its failure to recognise the GST as a Commonwealth tax and this Government as the highest taxing of all time;
- (9) its failure to consider the fairer options put forward by the Opposition to offset the harsh measures it intends to impose on families, the sick and disabled; and
- (10) the failure of its Intergenerational Report to recognise that investment in education, research and development is critical to our future prosperity and our capacity to generate the revenue and wealth required to support an ageing population”—

Debate resumed.

Ms C. F. King was granted leave to continue her speech when the debate is resumed.

Debate adjourned, and the resumption of the debate made an order of the day for the next sitting.

3 ADJOURNMENT

The Deputy Speaker adjourned the Main Committee at 10.28 p.m. and fixed tomorrow at 9.40 a.m. for the next meeting of the Main Committee.

=====

B. C. WRIGHT
Clerk of the Main Committee