

1998-1999-2000

THE PARLIAMENT OF THE COMMONWEALTH OF AUSTRALIA

HOUSE OF REPRESENTATIVES

## VOTES AND PROCEEDINGS

No. 98

WEDNESDAY, 15 MARCH 2000

1 The House met, at 9.30 a.m., pursuant to adjournment. The Speaker (the Honourable Neil Andrew) took the Chair, and read Prayers.

2 **TAXATION LAWS AMENDMENT BILL (NO. 5) 2000**

The order of the day having been read for the resumption of the debate on the question—That the Bill be now read a second time—*And on the amendment moved thereto by Mr K. J. Thomson, viz.*—That all words after “That” be omitted with a view to substituting the following words:

“whilst not declining to give the Bill a second reading, the House:

- (1) expresses its concern with the fundamental unfairness of the Government’s approach to taxation generally and the fundamental unfairness of a goods and services tax, including the heavy compliance burden on small business, and in particular the Government’s decision to tax health items including, for the first time in fifty years, taxing tampons and sanitary pads; and
- (2) calls on the Treasurer to amend the GST legislation or the Minister for Health to honour the Government’s pre-election promise that health products would be GST-free by including tampons and sanitary pads in the Minister’s determination”—

Debate continued.

Question—That the words proposed to be omitted stand part of the question—put.

The House divided (the Deputy Speaker, Mr Jenkins, in the Chair)—

## AYES, 73

Mr Abbott	Mr Fahey	Mr Lloyd	Mr Scott
Mr K. J. Andrews	Mr Fischer	Mr McArthur*	Mr Secker
Mr Anthony	Mr Forrest*	Mr I. E. Macfarlane	Mr Slipper
Fran Bailey	Mrs Gallus	Mr McGauran	Dr Southcott
Mr Baird	Ms Gambaro	Mrs May	Dr Stone
Mr Barresi	Mrs Gash	Mr Moore	Mrs Sullivan
Mr Bartlett	Mr Georgiou	Mrs Moylan	Mr C. P. Thompson
Mr Billson	Mr Haase	Mr Nairn	Mr A. P. Thomson
Mrs B. K. Bishop	Mr Hardgrave	Mr Nehl	Mr Truss
Ms J. I. Bishop	Mr Hawker	Dr Nelson	Mr M. A. J. Vaile
Mr Brough	Mr Hockey	Mr Neville	Mrs D. S. Vale
Mr Cadman	Mrs Hull	Mr Nugent	Mr Wakelin
Mr Cameron	Mr Jull	Mr Prosser	Dr Washer
Mr Causley	Mr Katter	Mr Pyne	Mr Williams
Mr Charles	Mrs D. M. Kelly	Mr Reith	Dr Wooldridge
Mr Downer	Dr Kemp	Mr Ronaldson	Ms Worth
Mrs Draper	Mr Lawler	Mr Ruddock	
Mrs Elson	Mr Lieberman	Mr St Clair	
Mr Entsch	Mr Lindsay	Mr Schultz	

## NOES, 64

Mr Adams	Mr Fitzgibbon	Mr McClelland	Mr Ripoll
Mr Albanese	Ms Gerick	Ms J. S. McFarlane	Ms Roxon
Mr Bevis	Mr Gibbons	Ms Macklin	Mr Rudd
Mr Brereton	Ms Gillard	Mr McLeay	Mr Sawford*
Ms Burke	Mr Griffin	Mr McMullan	Mr Sciacca
Mr Byrne	Ms Hall	Mr Martin	Mr Sercombe*
Mr Cox	Ms Hoare	Mr Melham	Mr Sidebottom
Mr Crean	Mr Hollis	Mr Morris	Mr Smith
Mrs Crosio	Mr Horne	Mr Mossfield	Mr Snowdon
Mr Danby	Mrs Irwin	Mr Murphy	Mr Swan
Mr Edwards	Ms Kernot	Ms O'Byrne	Mr Tanner
Ms Ellis	Mr Kerr	Mr O'Connor	Dr Theophanous
Dr Emerson	Mr Latham	Mr O'Keefe	Mr K. J. Thomson
Mr M. J. Evans	Dr Lawrence	Ms Plibersek	Mr Wilkie
Mr L. D. T. Ferguson	Mr Lee	Mr Price	Mr Wilton
Mr M. J. Ferguson	Ms Livermore	Mr Quick	Mr Zahra

\* Tellers

*Pairs*

Mr Howard	Mr Beazley
Jackie Kelly	Mr Hatton

And so it was resolved in the affirmative.

Question—That the Bill be now read a second time—put and passed—Bill read a second time.

Leave granted for third reading to be moved forthwith.

On the motion of Mr Slipper (Parliamentary Secretary to the Minister for Finance and Administration), the Bill was read a third time.

**3 PRIMARY INDUSTRIES (EXCISE) LEVIES (GST CONSEQUENTIAL AMENDMENTS) BILL 2000**

The order of the day having been read for the resumption of the debate on the question—That the Bill be now read a second time—

Debate resumed by Mr O'Connor who moved, as an amendment—That all words after “That” be omitted with a view to substituting the following words: “whilst not declining to give the Bill a second reading, the House expresses its concern at the adverse impact the GST will have on the small business and farm sectors, particularly the compliance burden”.

Debate continued.

Amendment negatived.

Question—That the Bill be now read a second time—put and passed—Bill read a second time.

Leave granted for third reading to be moved forthwith.

On the motion of Mr Truss (Minister for Agriculture, Fisheries and Forestry), the Bill was read a third time.

**4 HEALTH LEGISLATION AMENDMENT (GAP COVER SCHEMES) BILL 2000**

The order of the day having been read for the resumption of the debate on the question—That the Bill be now read a second time—

Debate resumed.

It being 2 p.m., the debate was interrupted in accordance with standing order 101A, and the resumption of the debate made an order of the day for a later hour this day.

**5 QUESTIONS**

Questions without notice being asked—

*Member ordered to withdraw*

At 2.34 p.m. the Member for Hunter (Mr Fitzgibbon) was ordered, under standing order 304A, to withdraw from the House for one hour for continuing to interject after a warning had been given from the Chair, and he accordingly withdrew from the Chamber.

Questions without notice continuing—

---

*Minister for Aged Care—Motion of censure*

Mr Beazley (Leader of the Opposition), by leave, moved—That this House censures the Minister for Aged Care for:

- (1) placing at risk the safety, health and well-being of residents of nursing homes through her inaction, incompetence and inattention in the performance of her ministerial duties;
- (2) not actively overseeing the policing of nursing home standards— notwithstanding the wide range of powers available under the Aged Care Act and subordinate legislation;
- (3) her misleading of the Australian public and Parliament about the nature of her personal intervention into the Riverside Nursing Home.

Debate ensued.

Question—put.

The House divided (the Speaker, Mr J. N. Andrew, in the Chair)—

AYES, 67

Mr Adams	Mr Fitzgibbon	Ms Livermore	Mr Ripoll
Mr Albanese	Ms Gerick	Mr McClelland	Ms Roxon
Mr Beazley	Mr Gibbons	Ms J. S. McFarlane	Mr Rudd
Mr Bevis	Ms Gillard	Ms Macklin	Mr Sawford*
Mr Brereton	Mr Griffin	Mr McLeay	Mr Sciacca
Ms Burke	Ms Hall	Mr McMullan	Mr Sercombe*
Mr Byrne	Mr Hatton	Mr Martin	Mr Sidebottom
Mr Cox	Ms Hoare	Mr Melham	Mr Smith
Mr Crean	Mr Hollis	Mr Morris	Mr Snowdon
Mrs Crosio	Mr Horne	Mr Mossfield	Mr Swan
Mr Danby	Mrs Irwin	Mr Murphy	Mr Tanner
Mr Edwards	Mr Jenkins	Ms O'Byrne	Dr Theophanous
Ms Ellis	Ms Kernot	Mr O'Connor	Mr K. J. Thomson
Dr Emerson	Mr Kerr	Mr O'Keefe	Mr Wilkie
Mr M. J. Evans	Mr Latham	Ms Plibersek	Mr Wilton
Mr L. D. T. Ferguson	Dr Lawrence	Mr Price	Mr Zahra
Mr M. J. Ferguson	Mr Lee	Mr Quick	

## NOES, 76

Mr Abbott	Mrs Elson	Mr Lieberman	Mr St Clair
Mr Anderson	Mr Entsch	Mr Lindsay	Mr Schultz
Mr K. J. Andrews	Mr Fahey	Mr Lloyd	Mr Scott
Mr Anthony	Mr Fischer	Mr McArthur*	Mr Secker
Fran Bailey	Mr Forrest*	Mr I. E. Macfarlane	Mr Slipper
Mr Baird	Mrs Gallus	Mr McGauran	Dr Southcott
Mr Barresi	Ms Gambaro	Mrs May	Dr Stone
Mr Bartlett	Mrs Gash	Mr Moore	Mrs Sullivan
Mr Billson	Mr Haase	Mrs Moylan	Mr C. P. Thompson
Mrs B. K. Bishop	Mr Hardgrave	Mr Nairn	Mr A. P. Thomson
Ms J. I. Bishop	Mr Hawker	Mr Nehl	Mr Truss
Mr Brough	Mr Hockey	Dr Nelson	Mr Tuckey
Mr Cadman	Mr Howard	Mr Neville	Mr M. A. J. Vaile
Mr Cameron	Mrs Hull	Mr Nugent	Mrs D. S. Vale
Mr Causley	Mr Jull	Mr Prosser	Mr Wakelin
Mr Charles	Mr Katter	Mr Pyne	Dr Washer
Mr Costello	Mrs D. M. Kelly	Mr Reith	Mr Williams
Mr Downer	Dr Kemp	Mr Ronaldson	Dr Wooldridge
Mr Draper	Mr Lawler	Mr Ruddock	Ms Worth

\* Tellers

And so it was negatived.

---

Questions without notice concluded.

**6 PAPERS**

The following papers were presented:

Department of Family and Community Services—Review of the measure to extend carer payment eligibility to carers of children with a profound disability—Final report, December 1999.

United Nations—

Convention Against Torture and Other Cruel, Inhuman or Degrading Treatment or Punishment—Communications—

No. 106/1998—Views.

No. 120/1998—Views.

No. 136/1999—Outline.

No. 138/1999—Outline.

No. 139/1999—Outline.

International Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Racial Discrimination—Committee on the Elimination of Racial Discrimination—Communications—

No. 6/1995—Opinion.

No. 8/1996—Opinion.

Optional Protocol to the International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights—  
Human Rights Committee—Communications—  
No. 646/1995—Decisions.  
No. 751/1997—Decisions.  
No. 832/1998—Outline.

Wheat Export Authority—Report for 1 July 1999 to 30 September 1999.

**7 BROADCASTING ARRANGEMENTS—PROPOSED CHANGE—STATEMENT BY SPEAKER**

The Speaker made a statement concerning a change to the rebroadcasting of question time by the Parliamentary News Network on Tuesdays that would commence on 4 April 2000.

**8 PRIVILEGE—STATEMENT BY SPEAKER**

The Speaker referred to the complaint of breach of privilege raised on 15 February 2000 by Mr Kerr to the effect that Mr Wayne Sievers was subject to improper interference within the Australian Federal Police as a consequence of an appearance before the Joint Standing Committee on Foreign Affairs, Defence and Trade.

The Speaker referred to the importance of the protection of witnesses but said that given the statement by the Australian Federal Police Commissioner that issues being pursued with Mr Sievers did not relate to his involvement with the committee, he was not convinced that improper interference had occurred, and that a prima facie case had not been made out. The Speaker said that because of the seriousness of the matter if further evidence came to light he would be prepared to reconsider the matter.

The Speaker presented the following papers:

Foreign Affairs, Defence and Trade—Joint Standing Committee—Possible disciplinary action by the Australian Federal Police for information provided to the committee—Copies of:

Secret defence papers show ‘conspiracy’ at highest level—Article published in the *Canberra Times*, 24 November 1999.

Timor action puts officer in firing line—Article published in the *Sunday Age*, 9 January 2000.

Letter from—

Senator Alan Ferguson, Chairman, Joint Standing Committee on Foreign Affairs, Defence and Trade, to—

The Speaker, 29 February 2000.

Mr Mick Palmer, Commissioner, Australian Federal Police, 22 September 1999 and 12 January 2000.

R. G. Leffers, Acting Chief Operating Officer, Australian Federal Police to Letters Editor, *Sun Herald* and *Sunday Age*, 14 January 2000.

Peta Murphy, Adviser, Office of Duncan Kerr to Dr John Nation, Chief of Staff, Office of the Minister for Justice and Customs.

John Nation, Chief of Staff, Office of the Minister for Justice and Customs to Ms Peta Murphy, Adviser, Office of Duncan Kerr, 4 February 2000.

Mr Mick Palmer to Senator Alan Ferguson, 24 January 2000.

Wayne Sievers to Mr Kerr, 13 February 2000.

**9 PROPOSED DISCUSSION OF MATTER OF PUBLIC IMPORTANCE—NURSING HOMES STANDARDS OF CARE**

The House having been informed that Mr Swan had proposed that a definite matter of public importance be submitted to the House for discussion, namely, “The failure of the Minister for Aged Care to ensure effective and adequate means of monitoring and enforcing standards of care in Australia’s nursing homes”—

Mr Swan withdrew the matter.

**10 FISHERIES LEGISLATION AMENDMENT BILL (NO. 2) 1999—REPORT FROM MAIN COMMITTEE**

The Speaker reported that the Bill had been fully considered by the Main Committee and agreed to without amendment, and presented a certified copy of the Bill.

Bill agreed to.

On the motion of Mr Reith (Leader of the House), by leave, the Bill was read a third time.

**11 ROAD TRANSPORT CHARGES (AUSTRALIAN CAPITAL TERRITORY) AMENDMENT BILL 2000—REPORT FROM MAIN COMMITTEE**

The Speaker reported that the Bill had been fully considered by the Main Committee and agreed to without amendment, and presented a certified copy of the Bill.

Bill agreed to.

On the motion of Mr Reith (Leader of the House), by leave, the Bill was read a third time.

**12 INTERSTATE ROAD TRANSPORT CHARGE AMENDMENT BILL 2000—REPORT FROM MAIN COMMITTEE**

The Speaker reported that the Bill had been fully considered by the Main Committee and agreed to without amendment, and presented a certified copy of the Bill.

Bill agreed to.

On the motion of Mr Reith (Leader of the House), by leave, the Bill was read a third time.

**13 INTERSTATE ROAD TRANSPORT AMENDMENT BILL 2000—REPORT FROM MAIN COMMITTEE**

The Speaker reported that the Bill had been fully considered by the Main Committee and agreed to without amendment, and presented a certified copy of the Bill.

Bill agreed to.

On the motion of Mr Reith (Leader of the House), by leave, the Bill was read a third time.

**14 TRANSPORT AND TERRITORIES LEGISLATION AMENDMENT BILL 1999—REPORT FROM MAIN COMMITTEE**

The Speaker reported that the Main Committee had resolved that further proceedings on the Bill be conducted in the House, and presented a certified copy of the Bill.

Ordered—That further proceedings on the Bill be made an order of the day for the next sitting.

**15 MESSAGE FROM THE SENATE**

Message No. 324, 15 March 2000, from the Senate was reported transmitting a resolution agreed to by the Senate approving, in accordance with section 5 of the *Parliament Act 1974*, the proposal by the National Capital Authority for capital works within the Parliamentary Zone, being the reconstruction of the Old Parliament House gardens.

**16 MESSAGE FROM THE SENATE—HUMAN RIGHTS (MANDATORY SENTENCING OF JUVENILE OFFENDERS) BILL 1999**

Message No. 323, 15 March 2000, from the Senate was reported transmitting for the concurrence of the House a Bill for an Act to implement Australia's human rights obligations to children under Articles 37(b) and 40(4) of the Convention on the Rights of the Child.

Bill read a first time.

Mr Williams (Attorney-General) moved—That the second reading be made an order of the day for the next sitting.

Mr Beazley (Leader of the Opposition) moving an amendment—

*Closure*

Mr Williams moved—That the question be now put.

Question—That the question be now put—put.

The House divided (the Speaker, Mr J. N. Andrew, in the Chair)—



## AYES, 75

Mr Abbott	Mrs Elson	Mr Lieberman	Mr Schultz
Mr Anderson	Mr Entsch	Mr Lindsay	Mr Scott
Mr K. J. Andrews	Mr Fahey	Mr Lloyd	Mr Secker
Mr Anthony	Mr Fischer	Mr McArthur*	Mr Slipper
Fran Bailey	Mr Forrest*	Mr I. E. Macfarlane	Dr Southcott
Mr Baird	Mrs Gallus	Mr McGauran	Dr Stone
Mr Barresi	Ms Gambaro	Mrs May	Mrs Sullivan
Mr Bartlett	Mrs Gash	Mr Moore	Mr C. P. Thompson
Mr Billson	Mr Haase	Mrs Moylan	Mr A. P. Thomson
Mrs B. K. Bishop	Mr Hardgrave	Mr Nairn	Mr Truss
Ms J. I. Bishop	Mr Hawker	Mr Nehl	Mr Tuckey
Mr Brough	Mr Hockey	Dr Nelson	Mr M. A. J. Vaile
Mr Cadman	Mr Howard	Mr Neville	Mrs D. S. Vale
Mr Cameron	Mrs Hull	Mr Nugent	Mr Wakelin
Mr Causley	Mr Jull	Mr Prosser	Dr Washer
Mr Charles	Mr Katter	Mr Pyne	Mr Williams
Mr Costello	Mrs D. M. Kelly	Mr Reith	Dr Wooldridge
Mr Downer	Dr Kemp	Mr Ronaldson	Ms Worth
Mr Draper	Mr Lawler	Mr Ruddock	

## NOES, 68

Mr Adams	Mr M. J. Ferguson	Mr Lee	Mr Quick
Mr Albanese	Mr Fitzgibbon	Ms Livermore	Mr Ripoll
Mr Andren	Ms Gerick	Mr McClelland	Ms Roxon
Mr Beazley	Mr Gibbons	Ms J. S. McFarlane	Mr Rudd
Mr Bevis	Ms Gillard	Ms Macklin	Mr Sawford*
Mr Brereton	Mr Griffin	Mr McLeay	Mr Sciacca
Ms Burke	Ms Hall	Mr McMullan	Mr Sercombe*
Mr Byrne	Mr Hatton	Mr Martin	Mr Sidebottom
Mr Cox	Ms Hoare	Mr Melham	Mr Smith
Mr Crean	Mr Hollis	Mr Morris	Mr Snowdon
Mrs Crosio	Mr Horne	Mr Mossfield	Mr Swan
Mr Danby	Mrs Irwin	Mr Murphy	Mr Tanner
Mr Edwards	Mr Jenkins	Ms O'Byrne	Dr Theophanous
Ms Ellis	Ms Kernot	Mr O'Connor	Mr K. J. Thomson
Dr Emerson	Mr Kerr	Mr O'Keefe	Mr Wilkie
Mr M. J. Evans	Mr Latham	Ms Plibersek	Mr Wilton
Mr L. D. T. Ferguson	Dr Lawrence	Mr Price	Mr Zahra

\* Tellers

And so it was resolved in the affirmative.

And the question—That the second reading be made an order of the day for the next sitting—being accordingly put—

The House divided (the Speaker, Mr J. N. Andrew, in the Chair)—

AYES, 75

Mr Abbott	Mrs Elson	Mr Lieberman	Mr Schultz
Mr Anderson	Mr Entsch	Mr Lindsay	Mr Scott
Mr K. J. Andrews	Mr Fahey	Mr Lloyd	Mr Secker
Mr Anthony	Mr Fischer	Mr McArthur*	Mr Slipper
Fran Bailey	Mr Forrest*	Mr I. E. Macfarlane	Dr Southcott
Mr Baird	Mrs Gallus	Mr McGauran	Dr Stone
Mr Barresi	Ms Gambaro	Mrs May	Mrs Sullivan
Mr Bartlett	Mrs Gash	Mr Moore	Mr C. P. Thompson
Mr Billson	Mr Haase	Mrs Moylan	Mr A. P. Thomson
Mrs B. K. Bishop	Mr Hardgrave	Mr Nairn	Mr Truss
Ms J. I. Bishop	Mr Hawker	Mr Nehl	Mr Tuckey
Mr Brough	Mr Hockey	Dr Nelson	Mr M. A. J. Vaile
Mr Cadman	Mr Howard	Mr Neville	Mrs D. S. Vale
Mr Cameron	Mrs Hull	Mr Nugent	Mr Wakelin
Mr Causley	Mr Jull	Mr Prosser	Dr Washer
Mr Charles	Mr Katter	Mr Pyne	Mr Williams
Mr Costello	Mrs D. M. Kelly	Mr Reith	Dr Wooldridge
Mr Downer	Dr Kemp	Mr Ronaldson	Ms Worth
Mrs Draper	Mr Lawler	Mr Ruddock	

NOES, 68

Mr Adams	Mr M. J. Ferguson	Mr Lee	Mr Quick
Mr Albanese	Mr Fitzgibbon	Ms Livermore	Mr Ripoll
Mr Andren	Ms Gerick	Mr McClelland	Ms Roxon
Mr Beazley	Mr Gibbons	Ms J. S. McFarlane	Mr Rudd
Mr Bevis	Ms Gillard	Ms Macklin	Mr Sawford*
Mr Breerton	Mr Griffin	Mr McLeay	Mr Sciacca
Ms Burke	Ms Hall	Mr McMullan	Mr Sercombe*
Mr Byrne	Mr Hatton	Mr Martin	Mr Sidebottom
Mr Cox	Ms Hoare	Mr Melham	Mr Smith
Mr Crean	Mr Hollis	Mr Morris	Mr Snowdon
Mrs Crosio	Mr Horne	Mr Mossfield	Mr Swan
Mr Danby	Mrs Irwin	Mr Murphy	Mr Tanner
Mr Edwards	Mr Jenkins	Ms O'Byrne	Dr Theophanous
Ms Ellis	Ms Kernot	Mr O'Connor	Mr K. J. Thomson
Dr Emerson	Mr Kerr	Mr O'Keefe	Mr Wilkie
Mr M. J. Evans	Mr Latham	Ms Plibersek	Mr Wilton
Mr L. D. T. Ferguson	Dr Lawrence	Mr Price	Mr Zahra

\* Tellers

And so it was resolved in the affirmative.

**17 SUSPENSION OF STANDING AND SESSIONAL ORDERS MOVED**

Mr Beazley (Leader of the Opposition) moved—That so much of the standing and sessional orders be suspended as would prevent the Leader of the Opposition moving forthwith—That the order of the House that the second reading of the Human Rights (Mandatory Sentencing of Juvenile Offenders) Bill be made an order of the day for the next sitting be rescinded so that the second reading can be moved forthwith.

*Closure of Member*

Mr Hockey (Minister for Financial Services and Regulation) moved—That the Member be not further heard.

Question—put.

The House divided (the Speaker, Mr J. N. Andrew, in the Chair)—

AYES, 75

Mr Abbott	Mrs Elson	Mr Lieberman	Mr Schultz
Mr Anderson	Mr Entsch	Mr Lindsay	Mr Scott
Mr K. J. Andrews	Mr Fahey	Mr Lloyd	Mr Secker
Mr Anthony	Mr Fischer	Mr McArthur*	Mr Slipper
Fran Bailey	Mr Forrest*	Mr I. E. Macfarlane	Dr Southcott
Mr Baird	Mrs Gallus	Mr McGauran	Dr Stone
Mr Barresi	Ms Gambaro	Mrs May	Mrs Sullivan
Mr Bartlett	Mrs Gash	Mr Moore	Mr C. P. Thompson
Mr Billson	Mr Haase	Mrs Moylan	Mr A. P. Thomson
Mrs B. K. Bishop	Mr Hardgrave	Mr Nairn	Mr Truss
Ms J. I. Bishop	Mr Hawker	Mr Nehl	Mr Tuckey
Mr Brough	Mr Hockey	Dr Nelson	Mr M. A. J. Vaile
Mr Cadman	Mr Howard	Mr Neville	Mrs D. S. Vale
Mr Cameron	Mrs Hull	Mr Nugent	Mr Wakelin
Mr Causley	Mr Jull	Mr Prosser	Dr Washer
Mr Charles	Mr Katter	Mr Pyne	Mr Williams
Mr Costello	Mrs D. M. Kelly	Mr Reith	Dr Wooldridge
Mr Downer	Dr Kemp	Mr Ronaldson	Ms Worth
Mrs Draper	Mr Lawler	Mr Ruddock	

## NOES, 68

Mr Adams	Mr M. J. Ferguson	Mr Lee	Mr Quick
Mr Albanese	Mr Fitzgibbon	Ms Livermore	Mr Ripoll
Mr Andren	Ms Gerick	Mr McClelland	Ms Roxon
Mr Beazley	Mr Gibbons	Ms J. S. McFarlane	Mr Rudd
Mr Bevis	Ms Gillard	Ms Macklin	Mr Sawford*
Mr Brereton	Mr Griffin	Mr McLeay	Mr Sciacca
Ms Burke	Ms Hall	Mr McMullan	Mr Sercombe*
Mr Byrne	Mr Hatton	Mr Martin	Mr Sidebottom
Mr Cox	Ms Hoare	Mr Melham	Mr Smith
Mr Crean	Mr Hollis	Mr Morris	Mr Snowdon
Mrs Crosio	Mr Horne	Mr Mossfield	Mr Swan
Mr Danby	Mrs Irwin	Mr Murphy	Mr Tanner
Mr Edwards	Mr Jenkins	Ms O'Byrne	Dr Theophanous
Ms Ellis	Ms Kernot	Mr O'Connor	Mr K. J. Thomson
Dr Emerson	Mr Kerr	Mr O'Keefe	Mr Wilkie
Mr M. J. Evans	Mr Latham	Ms Plibersek	Mr Wilton
Mr L. D. T. Ferguson	Dr Lawrence	Mr Price	Mr Zahra

\* Tellers

And so it was resolved in the affirmative.

Mr Andren (seconder) addressing the House—

*Closure of Member*

Mr Hockey moved—That the Member be not further heard.

Question—put.

The House divided (the Speaker, Mr J. N. Andrew, in the Chair)—

## AYES, 75

Mr Abbott	Mrs Elson	Mr Lieberman	Mr Schultz
Mr Anderson	Mr Entsch	Mr Lindsay	Mr Scott
Mr K. J. Andrews	Mr Fahey	Mr Lloyd	Mr Secker
Mr Anthony	Mr Fischer	Mr McArthur*	Mr Slipper
Fran Bailey	Mr Forrest*	Mr I. E. Macfarlane	Dr Southcott
Mr Baird	Mrs Gallus	Mr McGauran	Dr Stone
Mr Barresi	Ms Gambaro	Mrs May	Mrs Sullivan
Mr Bartlett	Mrs Gash	Mr Moore	Mr C. P. Thompson
Mr Billson	Mr Haase	Mrs Moylan	Mr A. P. Thomson
Mrs B. K. Bishop	Mr Hardgrave	Mr Nairn	Mr Truss
Ms J. I. Bishop	Mr Hawker	Mr Nehl	Mr Tuckey
Mr Brough	Mr Hockey	Dr Nelson	Mr M. A. J. Vaile
Mr Cadman	Mr Howard	Mr Neville	Mrs D. S. Vale
Mr Cameron	Mrs Hull	Mr Nugent	Mr Wakelin
Mr Causley	Mr Jull	Mr Prosser	Dr Washer
Mr Charles	Mr Katter	Mr Pyne	Mr Williams
Mr Costello	Mrs D. M. Kelly	Mr Reith	Dr Wooldridge
Mr Downer	Dr Kemp	Mr Ronaldson	Ms Worth
Mr Draper	Mr Lawler	Mr Ruddock	

## NOES, 68

Mr Adams	Mr M. J. Ferguson	Mr Lee	Mr Quick
Mr Albanese	Mr Fitzgibbon	Ms Livermore	Mr Ripoll
Mr Andren	Ms Gerick	Mr McClelland	Ms Roxon
Mr Beazley	Mr Gibbons	Ms J. S. McFarlane	Mr Rudd
Mr Bevis	Ms Gillard	Ms Macklin	Mr Sawford*
Mr Brereton	Mr Griffin	Mr McLeay	Mr Sciacca
Ms Burke	Ms Hall	Mr McMullan	Mr Sercombe*
Mr Byrne	Mr Hatton	Mr Martin	Mr Sidebottom
Mr Cox	Ms Hoare	Mr Melham	Mr Smith
Mr Crean	Mr Hollis	Mr Morris	Mr Snowdon
Mrs Crosio	Mr Horne	Mr Mossfield	Mr Swan
Mr Danby	Mrs Irwin	Mr Murphy	Mr Tanner
Mr Edwards	Mr Jenkins	Ms O'Byrne	Dr Theophanous
Ms Ellis	Ms Kernot	Mr O'Connor	Mr K. J. Thomson
Dr Emerson	Mr Kerr	Mr O'Keefe	Mr Wilkie
Mr M. J. Evans	Mr Latham	Ms Plibersek	Mr Wilton
Mr L. D. T. Ferguson	Dr Lawrence	Mr Price	Mr Zahra

\* Tellers

And so it was resolved in the affirmative.

Mr McMullan rising to address the House—

*Closure*

Mr Hockey moved—That the question be now put.

Question—That the question be now put—put.

The House divided (the Speaker, Mr J. N. Andrew, in the Chair)—

## AYES, 75

Mr Abbott	Mrs Elson	Mr Lieberman	Mr Schultz
Mr Anderson	Mr Entsch	Mr Lindsay	Mr Scott
Mr K. J. Andrews	Mr Fahey	Mr Lloyd	Mr Secker
Mr Anthony	Mr Fischer	Mr McArthur*	Mr Slipper
Fran Bailey	Mr Forrest*	Mr I. E. Macfarlane	Dr Southcott
Mr Baird	Mrs Gallus	Mr McGauran	Dr Stone
Mr Barresi	Ms Gambaro	Mrs May	Mrs Sullivan
Mr Bartlett	Mrs Gash	Mr Moore	Mr C. P. Thompson
Mr Billson	Mr Haase	Mrs Moylan	Mr A. P. Thomson
Mrs B. K. Bishop	Mr Hardgrave	Mr Nairn	Mr Truss
Ms J. I. Bishop	Mr Hawker	Mr Nehl	Mr Tuckey
Mr Brough	Mr Hockey	Dr Nelson	Mr M. A. J. Vaile
Mr Cadman	Mr Howard	Mr Neville	Mrs D. S. Vale
Mr Cameron	Mrs Hull	Mr Nugent	Mr Wakelin
Mr Causley	Mr Jull	Mr Prosser	Dr Washer
Mr Charles	Mr Katter	Mr Pyne	Mr Williams
Mr Costello	Mrs D. M. Kelly	Mr Reith	Dr Wooldridge
Mr Downer	Dr Kemp	Mr Ronaldson	Ms Worth
Mr Draper	Mr Lawler	Mr Ruddock	

## NOES, 68

Mr Adams	Mr M. J. Ferguson	Mr Lee	Mr Quick
Mr Albanese	Mr Fitzgibbon	Ms Livermore	Mr Ripoll
Mr Andren	Ms Gerick	Mr McClelland	Ms Roxon
Mr Beazley	Mr Gibbons	Ms J. S. McFarlane	Mr Rudd
Mr Bevis	Ms Gillard	Ms Macklin	Mr Sawford*
Mr Brereton	Mr Griffin	Mr McLeay	Mr Sciacca
Ms Burke	Ms Hall	Mr McMullan	Mr Sercombe*
Mr Byrne	Mr Hatton	Mr Martin	Mr Sidebottom
Mr Cox	Ms Hoare	Mr Melham	Mr Smith
Mr Crean	Mr Hollis	Mr Morris	Mr Snowdon
Mrs Crosio	Mr Horne	Mr Mossfield	Mr Swan
Mr Danby	Mrs Irwin	Mr Murphy	Mr Tanner
Mr Edwards	Mr Jenkins	Ms O'Byrne	Dr Theophanous
Ms Ellis	Ms Kernot	Mr O'Connor	Mr K. J. Thomson
Dr Emerson	Mr Kerr	Mr O'Keefe	Mr Wilkie
Mr M. J. Evans	Mr Latham	Ms Plibersek	Mr Wilton
Mr L. D. T. Ferguson	Dr Lawrence	Mr Price	Mr Zahra

\* Tellers

And so it was resolved in the affirmative.

And the question—That the motion for the suspension of standing and sessional orders be agreed to—being accordingly put—

The House divided (the Speaker, Mr J. N. Andrew, in the Chair)—

## AYES, 68

Mr Adams	Mr M. J. Ferguson	Mr Lee	Mr Quick
Mr Albanese	Mr Fitzgibbon	Ms Livermore	Mr Ripoll
Mr Andren	Ms Gerick	Mr McClelland	Ms Roxon
Mr Beazley	Mr Gibbons	Ms J. S. McFarlane	Mr Rudd
Mr Bevis	Ms Gillard	Ms Macklin	Mr Sawford*
Mr Brereton	Mr Griffin	Mr McLeay	Mr Sciacca
Ms Burke	Ms Hall	Mr McMullan	Mr Sercombe*
Mr Byrne	Mr Hatton	Mr Martin	Mr Sidebottom
Mr Cox	Ms Hoare	Mr Melham	Mr Smith
Mr Crean	Mr Hollis	Mr Morris	Mr Snowdon
Mrs Crosio	Mr Horne	Mr Mossfield	Mr Swan
Mr Danby	Mrs Irwin	Mr Murphy	Mr Tanner
Mr Edwards	Mr Jenkins	Ms O'Byrne	Dr Theophanous
Ms Ellis	Ms Kernot	Mr O'Connor	Mr K. J. Thomson
Dr Emerson	Mr Kerr	Mr O'Keefe	Mr Wilkie
Mr M. J. Evans	Mr Latham	Ms Plibersek	Mr Wilton
Mr L. D. T. Ferguson	Dr Lawrence	Mr Price	Mr Zahra

## NOES, 75

Mr Abbott	Mrs Elson	Mr Lieberman	Mr Schultz
Mr Anderson	Mr Entsch	Mr Lindsay	Mr Scott
Mr K. J. Andrews	Mr Fahey	Mr Lloyd	Mr Secker
Mr Anthony	Mr Fischer	Mr McArthur*	Mr Slipper
Fran Bailey	Mr Forrest*	Mr I. E. Macfarlane	Dr Southcott
Mr Baird	Mrs Gallus	Mr McGauran	Dr Stone
Mr Barresi	Ms Gambaro	Mrs May	Mrs Sullivan
Mr Bartlett	Mrs Gash	Mr Moore	Mr C. P. Thompson
Mr Billson	Mr Haase	Mrs Moylan	Mr A. P. Thomson
Mrs B. K. Bishop	Mr Hardgrave	Mr Nairn	Mr Truss
Ms J. I. Bishop	Mr Hawker	Mr Nehl	Mr Tuckey
Mr Brough	Mr Hockey	Dr Nelson	Mr M. A. J. Vaile
Mr Cadman	Mr Howard	Mr Neville	Mrs D. S. Vale
Mr Cameron	Mrs Hull	Mr Nugent	Mr Wakelin
Mr Causley	Mr Jull	Mr Prosser	Dr Washer
Mr Charles	Mr Katter	Mr Pyne	Mr Williams
Mr Costello	Mrs D. M. Kelly	Mr Reith	Dr Wooldridge
Mr Downer	Dr Kemp	Mr Ronaldson	Ms Worth
Mr Draper	Mr Lawler	Mr Ruddock	

\* Tellers

And so it was negatived.

### 18 HEALTH LEGISLATION AMENDMENT (GAP COVER SCHEMES) BILL 2000

The order of the day having been read for the resumption of the debate on the question—That the Bill be now read a second time—

Debate resumed.

Ms J. I. Bishop was granted leave to continue her speech when the debate is resumed.

Question—That the debate be adjourned—put.

The House divided (the Deputy Speaker, Mr Hollis, in the Chair)—

## AYES, 69

Mr Abbott	Mr Entsch	Mr Lloyd	Mr Secker
Mr Anderson	Mr Fischer	Mr McArthur*	Mr Slipper
Mr K. J. Andrews	Mr Forrest*	Mr I. E. Macfarlane	Dr Southcott
Mr Anthony	Mrs Gallus	Mrs May	Dr Stone
Fran Bailey	Ms Gambaro	Mr Moore	Mrs Sullivan
Mr Baird	Mrs Gash	Mrs Moylan	Mr C. P. Thompson
Mr Barresi	Mr Haase	Mr Nairn	Mr A. P. Thomson
Mr Bartlett	Mr Hardgrave	Mr Nehl	Mr Truss
Mr Billson	Mr Hawker	Dr Nelson	Mr Tuckey
Mrs B. K. Bishop	Mr Hockey	Mr Neville	Mrs D. S. Vale
Ms J. I. Bishop	Mrs Hull	Mr Nugent	Mr Wakelin
Mr Brough	Mr Jull	Mr Prosser	Dr Washer
Mr Cadman	Mr Katter	Mr Pyne	Mr Williams
Mr Cameron	Mrs D. M. Kelly	Mr Reith	Dr Wooldridge
Mr Causley	Dr Kemp	Mr Ronaldson	Ms Worth
Mr Charles	Mr Lawler	Mr Ruddock	
Mrs Draper	Mr Lieberman	Mr Schultz	
Mrs Elson	Mr Lindsay	Mr Scott	

## NOES, 64

Mr Adams	Mr Fitzgibbon	Ms Livermore	Mr Quick
Mr Albanese	Ms Gerick	Mr McClelland	Mr Ripoll
Mr Bevis	Mr Gibbons	Ms J. S. McFarlane	Ms Roxon
Mr Brereton	Ms Gillard	Ms Macklin	Mr Rudd
Ms Burke	Mr Griffin	Mr McLeay	Mr Sawford*
Mr Byrne	Ms Hall	Mr McMullan	Mr Sciacca
Mr Cox	Mr Hatton	Mr Martin	Mr Sercombe*
Mr Crean	Ms Hoare	Mr Melham	Mr Sidebottom
Mrs Crosio	Mr Horne	Mr Morris	Mr Snowdon
Mr Danby	Mrs Irwin	Mr Mossfield	Mr Swan
Mr Edwards	Mr Jenkins	Mr Murphy	Mr Tanner
Ms Ellis	Ms Kernot	Ms O'Byrne	Dr Theophanous
Dr Emerson	Mr Kerr	Mr O'Connor	Mr K. J. Thomson
Mr M. J. Evans	Mr Latham	Mr O'Keefe	Mr Wilkie
Mr L. D. T. Ferguson	Dr Lawrence	Ms Plibersek	Mr Wilton
Mr M. J. Ferguson	Mr Lee	Mr Price	Mr Zahra

\* Tellers

And so it was resolved in the affirmative.

Question—That the resumption of the debate be made an order of the day for a later hour this day—put and passed.



**19 CORPORATIONS LAW AMENDMENT (EMPLOYEE ENTITLEMENTS) BILL 2000**

The order of the day having been read for the resumption of the debate on the question—That the Bill be now read a second time—*And on the amendment moved thereto by Mr K. J. Thomson, viz.*—That all words after “That” be omitted with a view to substituting the following words:

“the House is of the opinion that the Bill is a most inadequate measure and condemns the Government for its failure to introduce measures to adequately protect employee entitlements”—

*Closure*

Mr Hockey (Minister for Financial Services and Regulation) moved—That the question be now put.

Question—That the question be now put—put.

The House divided (the Deputy Speaker, Mr Hollis, in the Chair)—

## AYES, 70

Mr Abbott	Mr Entsch	Mr Lloyd	Mr Secker
Mr Anderson	Mr Fischer	Mr McArthur*	Mr Slipper
Mr K. J. Andrews	Mr Forrest*	Mr I. E. Macfarlane	Dr Southcott
Mr Anthony	Mrs Gallus	Mrs May	Dr Stone
Fran Bailey	Ms Gambaro	Mr Moore	Mrs Sullivan
Mr Baird	Mrs Gash	Mrs Moylan	Mr C. P. Thompson
Mr Barresi	Mr Haase	Mr Nairn	Mr A. P. Thomson
Mr Bartlett	Mr Hardgrave	Mr Nehl	Mr Truss
Mr Billson	Mr Hawker	Dr Nelson	Mr Tuckey
Mrs B. K. Bishop	Mr Hockey	Mr Neville	Mr M. A. J. Vaile
Ms J. I. Bishop	Mrs Hull	Mr Nugent	Mrs D. S. Vale
Mr Brough	Mr Jull	Mr Prosser	Mr Wakelin
Mr Cadman	Mr Katter	Mr Pyne	Dr Washer
Mr Cameron	Mrs D. M. Kelly	Mr Reith	Mr Williams
Mr Causley	Dr Kemp	Mr Ronaldson	Dr Wooldridge
Mr Charles	Mr Lawler	Mr Ruddock	Ms Worth
Mrs Draper	Mr Lieberman	Mr Schultz	
Mrs Elson	Mr Lindsay	Mr Scott	

## NOES, 65

Mr Adams	Ms Gerick	Ms J. S. McFarlane	Mr Rudd
Mr Albanese	Mr Gibbons	Ms Macklin	Mr Sawford*
Mr Bevis	Ms Gillard	Mr McLeay	Mr Sciacca
Mr Brereton	Mr Griffin	Mr McMullan	Mr Sercombe*
Ms Burke	Ms Hall	Mr Martin	Mr Sidebottom
Mr Byrne	Mr Hatton	Mr Melham	Mr Smith
Mr Cox	Ms Hoare	Mr Morris	Mr Snowdon
Mr Crean	Mr Horne	Mr Mossfield	Mr Swan
Ms Crosio	Mrs Irwin	Mr Murphy	Mr Tanner
Mr Danby	Mr Jenkins	Ms O'Byrne	Dr Theophanous
Mr Edwards	Ms Kernot	Mr O'Connor	Mr K. J. Thomson
Ms Ellis	Mr Kerr	Mr O'Keefe	Mr Wilkie
Dr Emerson	Mr Latham	Ms Plibersek	Mr Wilton
Mr M. J. Evans	Dr Lawrence	Mr Price	Mr Zahra
Mr L. D. T. Ferguson	Mr Lee	Mr Quick	
Mr M. J. Ferguson	Ms Livermore	Mr Ripoll	
Mr Fitzgibbon	Mr McClelland	Ms Roxon	

\* Tellers

And so it was resolved in the affirmative.

And the question—That the words proposed to be omitted stand part of the question—being accordingly put—

The House divided (the Deputy Speaker, Mr Hollis, in the Chair)—

## AYES, 71

Mr Abbott	Mrs Elson	Mr Lindsay	Mr Scott
Mr Anderson	Mr Entsch	Mr Lloyd	Mr Secker
Mr K. J. Andrews	Mr Fischer	Mr McArthur*	Mr Slipper
Mr Anthony	Mr Forrest*	Mr I. E. Macfarlane	Dr Southcott
Fran Bailey	Mrs Gallus	Mrs May	Dr Stone
Mr Baird	Ms Gambaro	Mr Moore	Mrs Sullivan
Mr Barresi	Mrs Gash	Mrs Moylan	Mr C. P. Thompson
Mr Bartlett	Mr Haase	Mr Nairn	Mr A. P. Thomson
Mr Billson	Mr Hardgrave	Mr Nehl	Mr Truss
Mrs B. K. Bishop	Mr Hawker	Dr Nelson	Mr Tuckey
Ms J. I. Bishop	Mr Hockey	Mr Neville	Mr M. A. J. Vaile
Mr Brough	Mrs Hull	Mr Nugent	Mrs D. S. Vale
Mr Cadman	Mr Jull	Mr Prosser	Mr Wakelin
Mr Cameron	Mr Katter	Mr Pyne	Dr Washer
Mr Causley	Mrs D. M. Kelly	Mr Reith	Mr Williams
Mr Charles	Dr Kemp	Mr Ronaldson	Dr Wooldridge
Mr Downer	Mr Lawler	Mr Ruddock	Ms Worth
Mr Draper	Mr Lieberman	Mr Schultz	

## NOES, 65

Mr Adams	Ms Gerick	Ms J. S. McFarlane	Mr Rudd
Mr Albanese	Mr Gibbons	Ms Macklin	Mr Sawford*
Mr Bevis	Ms Gillard	Mr McLeay	Mr Sciacca
Mr Brereton	Mr Griffin	Mr McMullan	Mr Sercombe*
Ms Burke	Ms Hall	Mr Martin	Mr Sidebottom
Mr Byrne	Mr Hatton	Mr Melham	Mr Smith
Mr Cox	Ms Hoare	Mr Morris	Mr Snowdon
Mr Crean	Mr Horne	Mr Mossfield	Mr Swan
Mrs Crosio	Mrs Irwin	Mr Murphy	Mr Tanner
Mr Danby	Mr Jenkins	Ms O'Byrne	Dr Theophanous
Mr Edwards	Ms Kernot	Mr O'Connor	Mr K. J. Thomson
Ms Ellis	Mr Kerr	Mr O'Keefe	Mr Wilkie
Dr Emerson	Mr Latham	Ms Plibersek	Mr Wilton
Mr M. J. Evans	Dr Lawrence	Mr Price	Mr Zahra
Mr L. D. T. Ferguson	Mr Lee	Mr Quick	
Mr M. J. Ferguson	Ms Livermore	Mr Ripoll	
Mr Fitzgibbon	Mr McClelland	Ms Roxon	

\* Tellers

And so it was resolved in the affirmative.

Question—That the Bill be now read a second time—put and passed—Bill read a second time.

*Consideration in detail*

Bill, by leave, taken as a whole.

Mr Adams rising to address the House—

*Closure of Member moved*

Mr Hockey moved—That the Member be not further heard.

Question—put.

The House proceeding to a division—

Motion—That the Member be not further heard—withdrawn, by leave, and division not further proceeded with.

Debate continued.

Bill agreed to.

Consideration in detail concluded.

On the motion of Mr Hockey, by leave, the Bill was read a third time.

## 20 ADJOURNMENT

It being 7.30 p.m.—The question was proposed—That the House do now adjourn.

Debate ensued.

*Debate extended*

It being 8 p.m., the debate was interrupted.

Mr Abbott (Minister for Employment Services) required the debate to be extended.

The debate continuing until 8.07 p.m., the Speaker adjourned the House until tomorrow at 9.30 a.m.

---

---

**PAPERS**

The following papers were deemed to have been presented on 15 March 2000:

Customs Act—Instruments of approval 2000 Nos CEO 2, CEO 3.

Financial Management and Accountability Act—Determinations to establish a special account—2000 No. 2.

Higher Education Funding Act—Determinations 2000 No. T7.

---

---

**ATTENDANCE**

All Members attended (at some time during the sitting) except Jackie Kelly\* and Mr Somlyay.

\* On leave

---

---

**I. C. HARRIS**  
Clerk of the House of Representatives

1998-1999-2000

**HOUSE OF REPRESENTATIVES**  
**SUPPLEMENT TO VOTES AND PROCEEDINGS**

No. 98

**MAIN COMMITTEE**

**MINUTES OF PROCEEDINGS**

**WEDNESDAY, 15 MARCH 2000**

---

---

1 The Main Committee met at 9.40 a.m.

**2 MEMBERS' STATEMENTS**

Members' statements were made.

**3 FISHERIES LEGISLATION AMENDMENT BILL (NO. 2) 1999**

The order of the day having been read for the resumption of the debate on the question—That the Bill be now read a second time—

Debate resumed.

Question—put and passed—Bill read a second time.

Leave granted for the question on the report to be put forthwith.

Question—That the Bill be reported to the House without amendment—put and passed.

**4 ROAD TRANSPORT CHARGES (AUSTRALIAN CAPITAL TERRITORY) AMENDMENT BILL 2000**

The order of the day having been read for the resumption of the debate on the question—That the Bill be now read a second time—

Debate resumed.

---

*Suspension of sitting*

At 10.38 a.m., a division having been called in the House, the proceedings were suspended.

*Resumption of sitting*

At 10.49 a.m., the proceedings were resumed.

---

Debate continued.

Question—put and passed—Bill read a second time.

Leave granted for the question on the report to be put forthwith.

Question—That the Bill be reported to the House without amendment—put and passed.

**5 INTERSTATE ROAD TRANSPORT CHARGE AMENDMENT BILL 2000**

The order of the day having been read for the resumption of the debate on the question—That the Bill be now read a second time—

Question—put and passed—Bill read a second time.

Leave granted for the question on the report to be put forthwith.

Question—That the Bill be reported to the House without amendment—put and passed.

**6 INTERSTATE ROAD TRANSPORT AMENDMENT BILL 2000**

The order of the day having been read for the resumption of the debate on the question—That the Bill be now read a second time—

Question—put and passed—Bill read a second time.

Leave granted for the question on the report to be put forthwith.

Question—That the Bill be reported to the House without amendment—put and passed.

**7 TRANSPORT AND TERRITORIES LEGISLATION AMENDMENT BILL 1999**

The order of the day having been read for the resumption of the debate on the question—That the Bill be now read a second time—

Mr Neville moved—That further proceedings on the Bill be conducted in the House.

Question—put and passed—Bill to be returned to the House.

**8 ADJOURNMENT**

On the motion of Mr Neville, the Main Committee adjourned at 12.05 p.m.

The Deputy Speaker fixed tomorrow at 9.40 a.m. for the next meeting of the Main Committee.



**B. C. WRIGHT**  
Clerk of the Main Committee