

1998-99

THE PARLIAMENT OF THE COMMONWEALTH OF AUSTRALIA

HOUSE OF REPRESENTATIVES

**VOTES AND PROCEEDINGS**

No. 26

WEDNESDAY, 10 MARCH 1999

1 The House met, at 9.30 a.m., pursuant to adjournment. The Speaker (the Honourable Neil Andrew) took the Chair, and read Prayers.

**2 MESSAGE FROM THE SENATE—CENTRELINK SERVICE LEVELS**

Message No. 45, 9 March 1999, from the Senate was reported acquainting the House that the Senate had agreed to a resolution concerning Centrelink service levels and requesting the concurrence of the House.

Ordered—That the message be considered at the next sitting.

**3 MESSAGE FROM THE SENATE—JUDICIARY AMENDMENT BILL 1998**

A message from the Senate was reported returning the following Bill with an amendment:

9 March 1999—Message No. 46—Judiciary Amendment 1998.

Ordered—That the amendment be considered at the next sitting.

**4 EXPORT MARKET DEVELOPMENT GRANTS LEGISLATION AMENDMENT BILL 1999**

Mr Fischer (Minister for Trade), pursuant to notice, presented a Bill for an Act to amend legislation relating to export market development grants, and for related purposes.

Bill read a first time.

Mr Fischer moved—That the Bill be now read a second time.

*Paper*

Mr Fischer presented an explanatory memorandum to the Bill.

Debate adjourned (Mr Horne), and the resumption of the debate made an order of the day for the next sitting.

**5 HEALTH LEGISLATION AMENDMENT BILL (NO. 4) 1998**

The order of the day having been read for the resumption of the debate on the question—That the Bill be now read a second time—

Debate resumed.

Question—put and passed—Bill read a second time.

*Consideration in detail*

Schedule 1—

Items 1 to 16, by leave, taken together, and agreed to.

Heading to Part 5 and Items 17 to 22, by leave, taken together, and agreed to, after debate.

Remainder of Schedule, by leave, taken together, and omitted, after debate.

Schedule 2—

Items 1 and 2—

On the motion of Dr Wooldridge (Minister for Health and Aged Care), by leave, Government amendments (2) to (5) were made together, after debate.

Items, as amended, agreed to.

Item 3 debated and agreed to.

Item 4 debated and agreed to.

Items 5 and 6—

On the motion of Dr Wooldridge, by leave, Government amendments (6) and (7) were made together, after debate.

Items, as amended, agreed to.

Item 7—

On the motion of Dr Wooldridge, by leave, Government amendments (8) and (9) were made together, after debate.

Item, as amended, agreed to.

Item 8 debated and agreed to.

Item 9 debated and agreed to.

Schedule 3—

Items 1 to 3, by leave, taken together, and agreed to.

Items 4 and 5, by leave, taken together—

Ms Macklin, by leave, moved Opposition amendments (16) and (17) together.

Debate continued.

Amendments negatived.

Items agreed to.

Items 6 and 7, by leave, taken together, and agreed to.

Items 8 to 18, by leave, taken together—

Debate ensued.

*Paper*

Dr Wooldridge presented a supplementary explanatory memorandum to the Bill.

Debate continued.

Items agreed to.

Remainder of Bill, by leave, taken as whole—

Ms Macklin, by leave, moved Opposition amendments (1) and (2) together.

Debate continued.

Amendments negatived.

Remainder of Bill agreed to.

Consideration in detail concluded.

Mr Slipper (Parliamentary Secretary to the Minister for Finance and Administration), by leave, moved—That the Bill be now read a third time.

Question—put.

The House divided (the Deputy Speaker, Mr Quick, in the Chair)—

AYES, 75

Mr Abbott	Mrs Elson	Mr Lindsay	Mr Schultz
Mr Anderson	Mr Fischer	Mr Lloyd	Mr Scott
Mr Andren	Mr Forrest*	Mr McArthur*	Mr Secker
Mr K. J. Andrews	Mrs Gallus	Mr I. E. Macfarlane	Mr Slipper
Mr Anthony	Ms Gambaro	Mr McGauran	Mr Somlyay
Ms Bailey	Mrs Gash	Mrs May	Dr Southcott
Mr Baird	Mr Georgiou	Mr Moore	Mrs Stone
Mr Barresi	Mr Haase	Mrs Moylan	Mrs Sullivan
Mr Bartlett	Mr Hardgrave	Mr Nairn	Mr C. P. Thompson
Mr Billson	Mr Hawker	Mr Nehl	Mr A. P. Thomson
Mrs B. K. Bishop	Mr Hockey	Dr Nelson	Mr Truss
Ms J. I. Bishop	Mrs Hull	Mr Neville	Mr Tuckey
Mr Brough	Mr Jull	Mr Nugent	Mr M. A. J. Vaile
Mr Cadman	Mr Katter	Mr Prosser	Mrs D. S. Vale
Mr Cameron	Mrs D. M. Kelly	Mr Pyne	Mr Wakelin
Mr Causley	Jackie Kelly	Mr Reith	Dr Washer
Mr Charles	Dr Kemp	Mr Ronaldson	Mr Williams
Mr Downer	Mr Lawler	Mr Ruddock	Ms Worth
Mrs Draper	Mr Lieberman	Mr St Clair	

## NOES, 62

Mr Adams	Mr Gibbons	Mr McClelland	Mr Rudd
Mr Albanese	Ms Gillard	Ms J. S. McFarlane	Mr Sawford*
Mr Brereton	Mr Griffin	Ms Macklin	Mr Sciacca
Ms Burke	Ms Hall	Mr McLeay	Mr Sercombe*
Mr Crean	Mr Hatton	Mr McMullan	Mr Sidebottom
Mrs Crosio	Ms Hoare	Mr Martin	Mr Smith
Mr Danby	Mr Hollis	Mr Melham	Mr Snowdon
Mr Edwards	Mr Horne	Mr Morris	Mr Swan
Ms Ellis	Mrs Irwin	Mr Mossfield	Mr Tanner
Dr Emerson	Mr Jenkins	Mr Murphy	Dr Theophanous
Mr G. J. Evans	Ms Kernot	Ms O'Byrne	Mr K. J. Thomson
Mr M. J. Evans	Mr Kerr	Mr O'Connor	Mr Wilkie
Mr L. D. T. Ferguson	Mr Latham	Ms Plibersek	Mr Wilton
Mr M. J. Ferguson	Dr Lawrence	Mr Price	Mr Zahra
Mr Fitzgibbon	Mr Lee	Mr Ripoll	
Ms Gerick	Ms Livermore	Ms Roxon	

\* Tellers

*Pairs*

Mr Howard                      Mr Beazley

And so it was resolved in the affirmative—Bill read a third time.

**6 BOUNTY (SHIPS) AMENDMENT BILL 1999**

The order of the day having been read for the resumption of the debate on the question—That the Bill be now read a second time—

Debate resumed.

Question—put and passed—Bill read a second time.

Leave granted for third reading to be moved forthwith.

On the motion of Jackie Kelly (Minister for Sport and Tourism), the Bill was read a third time.

**7 TAXATION LAWS AMENDMENT (SOFTWARE DEPRECIATION) BILL 1999**

The order of the day having been read for the resumption of the debate on the question—That the Bill be now read a second time—

Debate having been resumed by Mr K. J. Thomson—

It being 2 p.m., the debate was interrupted in accordance with standing order 101A, and the resumption of the debate made an order of the day for a later hour this day.

**8 QUESTIONS**

Questions without notice being asked—

*Member ordered to withdraw*

At 2.50 p.m. the Member for Bruce (Mr Griffin) was ordered, under standing order 304A, to withdraw from the House for one hour for continuing to interject after a general warning had been given by the Chair, and he accordingly withdrew from the Chamber.

Questions without notice continuing—

*Member ordered to withdraw*

At 3.16 p.m. the Member for the Northern Territory (Mr Snowdon) was ordered, under standing order 304A, to withdraw from the House for one hour for continuing to interject after a general warning had been given by the Chair, and he accordingly withdrew from the Chamber.

Questions without notice continued.

**9 PAPERS**

The following papers were presented:

Aboriginal Land Commissioner—Reports and recommendations to the Minister for Aboriginal and Torres Strait Islander Affairs and to the Administrator of the Northern Territory—

No. 53—Tempe Downs and Middleton Ponds/Luritja land claim no. 147.

No. 54—Central Mount Wedge land claim no. 154.

Australian Securities and Investments Commission—Reports, December 1998—

Investigation into Burns Philp & Company Limited.

Special investigation into Spedley Securities Limited.

Building on land rights for the next generation—Review of the *Aboriginal Land Rights (Northern Territory) Act 1976*—Second edition, August 1998—

Report by John Reeves, Q.C.

Appendices.

Central Land Council—Report for 1997-98.

Northern Land Council—Report for 1997-98.

Tiwi Land Council—19th report, for 1997-98.

**10 PAPERS—MOTION TO TAKE NOTE OF PAPERS**

Mr Reith (Leader of the House) moved—That the House take note of the following papers:

Australian Securities and Investments Commission—Reports, December 1998—

Investigation into Burns Philp & Company Limited.

Special investigation into Spedley Securities Limited.

Debate adjourned (Mr McMullan), and the resumption of each debate made an order of the day for the next sitting.

**11 DISCUSSION OF MATTER OF PUBLIC IMPORTANCE—EMPLOYMENT AND INDUSTRIAL RELATIONS**

The House was informed that Mr M. J. Ferguson had proposed that a definite matter of public importance be submitted to the House for discussion, namely, “The adverse consequences of the Minister for Employment, Workplace Relations and Small Business’ misleading and partisan approach to employment and industrial relations”.

The proposed discussion having received the necessary support—

Mr M. J. Ferguson addressed the House.

Discussion ensued.

Discussion concluded.

**12 MESSAGE FROM THE SENATE**

Message No. 47, 10 March 1999, from the Senate was reported transmitting a resolution agreed to by the Senate approving, in accordance with section 5 of the *Parliament Act 1974*, the proposal by the Joint House Department for construction of the Western Formal Gardens.

**13 SUSPENSION OF STANDING AND SESSIONAL ORDERS—PRIVATE MEMBERS’ NOTICE**

Mr Fahey (Minister for Finance and Administration), by leave, moved—That so much of the standing and sessional orders be suspended as would prevent notice No. 8, private Members’ business, being called on forthwith.

Question—put and passed.

**14 PUBLIC WORKS COMMITTEE AMENDMENT REGULATIONS—MOTION FOR DISALLOWANCE**

Mr Hollis, pursuant to notice, moved—That the Public Works Committee Amendment Regulations 1998 (No. 1), as contained in Statutory Rules 1998 No. 310, made under the *Public Works Committee Act 1969*, be disallowed.

Debate ensued.

Question—put.

The House divided (the Deputy Speaker, Mrs D. M. Kelly, in the Chair)—

## AYES, 66

Mr Adams	Ms Gerick	Mr McClelland	Ms Roxon
Mr Albanese	Mr Gibbons	Ms J. S. McFarlane	Mr Rudd
Mr Andren	Ms Gillard	Ms Macklin	Mr Sawford*
Mr Bevis	Mr Griffin	Mr McLeay	Mr Sciacca
Mr Breton	Ms Hall	Mr McMullan	Mr Sercombe*
Ms Burke	Mr Hatton	Mr Martin	Mr Sidebottom
Mr Cox	Ms Hoare	Mr Melham	Mr Smith
Mr Crean	Mr Hollis	Mr Morris	Mr Snowdon
Mrs Crosio	Mr Horne	Mr Mossfield	Mr Swan
Mr Danby	Mrs Irwin	Mr Murphy	Mr Tanner
Mr Edwards	Mr Jenkins	Ms O'Byrne	Dr Theophanous
Ms Ellis	Ms Kernot	Mr O'Connor	Mr K. J. Thomson
Dr Emerson	Mr Kerr	Mr O'Keefe	Mr Wilkie
Mr G. J. Evans	Mr Latham	Ms Plibersek	Mr Wilton
Mr L. D. T. Ferguson	Dr Lawrence	Mr Price	Mr Zahra
Mr M. J. Ferguson	Mr Lee	Mr Quick	
Mr Fitzgibbon	Ms Livermore	Mr Ripoll	

## NOES, 75

Mr Abbott	Mr Fahey	Mr Lloyd	Mr Scott
Mr Anderson	Mr Fischer	Mr McArthur*	Mr Secker
Mr K. J. Andrews	Mr Forrest*	Mr I. E. Macfarlane	Mr Slipper
Mr Anthony	Mrs Gallus	Mr McGauran	Mr Somlyay
Ms Bailey	Ms Gambaro	Mrs May	Dr Southcott
Mr Baird	Mrs Gash	Mr Moore	Mrs Stone
Mr Barresi	Mr Georgiou	Mrs Moylan	Mrs Sullivan
Mr Bartlett	Mr Haase	Mr Nairn	Mr C. P. Thompson
Mr Billson	Mr Hardgrave	Mr Nehl	Mr A. P. Thomson
Mrs B. K. Bishop	Mr Hawker	Dr Nelson	Mr Truss
Ms J. I. Bishop	Mr Hockey	Mr Neville	Mr Tuckey
Mr Brough	Mrs Hull	Mr Nugent	Mr M. A. J. Vaile
Mr Cadman	Mr Jull	Mr Prosser	Mrs D. S. Vale
Mr Cameron	Mr Katter	Mr Pyne	Mr Wakelin
Mr Causley	Jackie Kelly	Mr Reith	Dr Washer
Mr Charles	Dr Kemp	Mr Ronaldson	Mr Williams
Mr Downer	Mr Lawler	Mr Ruddock	Dr Wooldridge
Mrs Draper	Mr Lieberman	Mr St Clair	Ms Worth
Mrs Elson	Mr Lindsay	Mr Schultz	

\* Tellers

*Pairs*

Mr Howard                      Mr Beazley

And so it was negatived.

**15 TAXATION LAWS AMENDMENT (SOFTWARE DEPRECIATION) BILL 1999**

The order of the day having been read for the resumption of the debate on the question—That the Bill be now read a second time—

Debate resumed.

Debate adjourned (Mr M. A. J. Vaile—Minister for Agriculture, Fisheries and Forestry), and the resumption of the debate made an order of the day for the next sitting.

**16 SUSPENSION OF STANDING AND SESSIONAL ORDERS MOVED**

Mr Beazley (Leader of the Opposition) moved—That so much of the standing and sessional orders be suspended as would prevent the Leader of the Opposition moving forthwith—That the Minister for Employment, Workplace Relations and Small Business:

- (1) be required to attend the House and explain why his views of the agreement between the Democrats in relation to the Youth Wage inquiry was clearly contradicted in a statement today by Democrat spokesman, Senator Andrew Murray, who was present at the meeting. Specifically he should explain why youth wages were not included in the items disagreed where the Government reserved the right to legislate at a later date;
- (2) should explain why his views are at variance with the Democrat understanding that this was a settled matter at least until the Industrial Relations Commission reported in 1999 on the issue of youth wages; and
- (3) should explain why he misled the House on 26 November 1998 when he alleged there was a clear understanding with the Democrats that he would seek a mandate for this legislation at the next election.

*Closure of Member*

Mr M. A. J. Vaile (Minister for Agriculture, Fisheries and Forestry) moved—That the Member be not further heard.

Question—put.

The House divided (the Deputy Speaker, Mr Quick, in the Chair)—



## AYES, 76

Mr Abbott	Mr Fahey	Mr Lindsay	Mr Schultz
Mr Anderson	Mr Fischer	Mr Lloyd	Mr Scott
Mr K. J. Andrews	Mr Forrest*	Mr McArthur*	Mr Secker
Mr Anthony	Mrs Gallus	Mr I. E. Macfarlane	Mr Slipper
Ms Bailey	Ms Gambaro	Mr McGauran	Mr Somlyay
Mr Baird	Mrs Gash	Mrs May	Dr Southcott
Mr Barresi	Mr Georgiou	Mr Moore	Mrs Stone
Mr Bartlett	Mr Haase	Mrs Moylan	Mrs Sullivan
Mr Billson	Mr Hardgrave	Mr Nairn	Mr C. P. Thompson
Mrs B. K. Bishop	Mr Hawker	Mr Nehl	Mr A. P. Thomson
Ms J. I. Bishop	Mr Hockey	Dr Nelson	Mr Truss
Mr Brough	Mrs Hull	Mr Neville	Mr Tuckey
Mr Cadman	Mr Jull	Mr Nugent	Mr M. A. J. Vaile
Mr Cameron	Mr Katter	Mr Prosser	Mrs D. S. Vale
Mr Causley	Mrs D. M. Kelly	Mr Pyne	Mr Wakelin
Mr Charles	Jackie Kelly	Mr Reith	Dr Washer
Mr Downer	Dr Kemp	Mr Ronaldson	Mr Williams
Mrs Draper	Mr Lawler	Mr Ruddock	Dr Wooldridge
Mrs Elson	Mr Lieberman	Mr St Clair	Ms Worth

## NOES, 65

Mr Adams	Ms Gerick	Mr McClelland	Mr Rudd
Mr Albanese	Mr Gibbons	Ms J. S. McFarlane	Mr Sawford*
Mr Beazley	Ms Gillard	Ms Macklin	Mr Sciacca
Mr Bevis	Mr Griffin	Mr McLeay	Mr Sercombe*
Mr Brereton	Ms Hall	Mr McMullan	Mr Sidebottom
Ms Burke	Mr Hatton	Mr Martin	Mr Smith
Mr Cox	Ms Hoare	Mr Melham	Mr Snowdon
Mr Crean	Mr Hollis	Mr Morris	Mr Swan
Mrs Crosio	Mr Horne	Mr Mossfield	Mr Tanner
Mr Danby	Mrs Irwin	Mr Murphy	Dr Theophanous
Mr Edwards	Mr Jenkins	Ms O'Byrne	Mr K. J. Thomson
Ms Ellis	Ms Kernot	Mr O'Connor	Mr Wilkie
Dr Emerson	Mr Kerr	Mr O'Keefe	Mr Wilton
Mr G. J. Evans	Mr Latham	Ms Plibersek	Mr Zahra
Mr L. D. T. Ferguson	Dr Lawrence	Mr Price	
Mr M. J. Ferguson	Mr Lee	Mr Ripoll	
Mr Fitzgibbon	Ms Livermore	Ms Roxon	

\* Tellers

And so it was resolved in the affirmative.

Mr Bevis (seconder) addressing the House—

*Closure of Member*

Mr M. A. J. Vaile moved—That the Member be not further heard.

Question—put.

The House divided (the Deputy Speaker, Mr Quick, in the Chair)—

AYES, 76

Mr Abbott	Mr Fahey	Mr Lindsay	Mr Schultz
Mr Anderson	Mr Fischer	Mr Lloyd	Mr Scott
Mr K. J. Andrews	Mr Forrest*	Mr McArthur*	Mr Secker
Mr Anthony	Mrs Gallus	Mr I. E. Macfarlane	Mr Slipper
Ms Bailey	Ms Gambaro	Mr McGauran	Mr Somlyay
Mr Baird	Mrs Gash	Mrs May	Dr Southcott
Mr Barresi	Mr Georgiou	Mr Moore	Mrs Stone
Mr Bartlett	Mr Haase	Mrs Moylan	Mrs Sullivan
Mr Billson	Mr Hardgrave	Mr Nairn	Mr C. P. Thompson
Mrs B. K. Bishop	Mr Hawker	Mr Nehl	Mr A. P. Thomson
Ms J. I. Bishop	Mr Hockey	Dr Nelson	Mr Truss
Mr Brough	Mrs Hull	Mr Neville	Mr Tuckey
Mr Cadman	Mr Jull	Mr Nugent	Mr M. A. J. Vaile
Mr Cameron	Mr Katter	Mr Prosser	Mrs D. S. Vale
Mr Causley	Mrs D. M. Kelly	Mr Pyne	Mr Wakelin
Mr Charles	Jackie Kelly	Mr Reith	Dr Washer
Mr Downer	Dr Kemp	Mr Ronaldson	Mr Williams
Mrs Draper	Mr Lawler	Mr Ruddock	Dr Wooldridge
Mrs Elson	Mr Lieberman	Mr St Clair	Ms Worth

NOES, 65

Mr Adams	Ms Gerick	Mr McClelland	Mr Rudd
Mr Albanese	Mr Gibbons	Ms J. S. McFarlane	Mr Sawford*
Mr Beazley	Ms Gillard	Ms Macklin	Mr Sciacca
Mr Bevis	Mr Griffin	Mr McLeay	Mr Sercombe*
Mr Breerton	Ms Hall	Mr McMullan	Mr Sidebottom
Ms Burke	Mr Hatton	Mr Martin	Mr Smith
Mr Cox	Ms Hoare	Mr Melham	Mr Snowdon
Mr Crean	Mr Hollis	Mr Morris	Mr Swan
Mrs Crosio	Mr Horne	Mr Mossfield	Mr Tanner
Mr Danby	Mrs Irwin	Mr Murphy	Dr Theophanous
Mr Edwards	Mr Jenkins	Ms O'Byrne	Mr K. J. Thomson
Ms Ellis	Ms Kernot	Mr O'Connor	Mr Wilkie
Dr Emerson	Mr Kerr	Mr O'Keefe	Mr Wilton
Mr G. J. Evans	Mr Latham	Ms Plibersek	Mr Zahra
Mr L. D. T. Ferguson	Dr Lawrence	Mr Price	
Mr M. J. Ferguson	Mr Lee	Mr Ripoll	
Mr Fitzgibbon	Ms Livermore	Ms Roxon	

\* Tellers

And so it was resolved in the affirmative.

*Closure*

Mr M. A. J. Vaile moved—That the question be now put.

Question—That the question be now put—put.

The House divided (the Deputy Speaker, Mr Quick, in the Chair)—

## AYES, 76

Mr Abbott	Mr Fahey	Mr Lindsay	Mr Schultz
Mr Anderson	Mr Fischer	Mr Lloyd	Mr Scott
Mr K. J. Andrews	Mr Forrest*	Mr McArthur*	Mr Secker
Mr Anthony	Mrs Gallus	Mr I. E. Macfarlane	Mr Slipper
Ms Bailey	Ms Gambaro	Mr McGauran	Mr Somlyay
Mr Baird	Mrs Gash	Mrs May	Dr Southcott
Mr Barresi	Mr Georgiou	Mr Moore	Mrs Stone
Mr Bartlett	Mr Haase	Mrs Moylan	Mrs Sullivan
Mr Billson	Mr Hardgrave	Mr Nairn	Mr C. P. Thompson
Mrs B. K. Bishop	Mr Hawker	Mr Nehl	Mr A. P. Thomson
Ms J. I. Bishop	Mr Hockey	Dr Nelson	Mr Truss
Mr Brough	Mrs Hull	Mr Neville	Mr Tuckey
Mr Cadman	Mr Jull	Mr Nugent	Mr M. A. J. Vaile
Mr Cameron	Mr Katter	Mr Prosser	Mrs D. S. Vale
Mr Causley	Mrs D. M. Kelly	Mr Pyne	Mr Wakelin
Mr Charles	Jackie Kelly	Mr Reith	Dr Washer
Mr Downer	Dr Kemp	Mr Ronaldson	Mr Williams
Mrs Draper	Mr Lawler	Mr Ruddock	Dr Wooldridge
Mrs Elson	Mr Lieberman	Mr St Clair	Ms Worth

## NOES, 65

Mr Adams	Ms Gerick	Mr McClelland	Mr Rudd
Mr Albanese	Mr Gibbons	Ms J. S. McFarlane	Mr Sawford*
Mr Beazley	Ms Gillard	Ms Macklin	Mr Sciacca
Mr Bevis	Mr Griffin	Mr McLeay	Mr Sercombe*
Mr Brereton	Ms Hall	Mr McMullan	Mr Sidebottom
Ms Burke	Mr Hatton	Mr Martin	Mr Smith
Mr Cox	Ms Hoare	Mr Melham	Mr Snowdon
Mr Crean	Mr Hollis	Mr Morris	Mr Swan
Mrs Crosio	Mr Horne	Mr Mossfield	Mr Tanner
Mr Danby	Mrs Irwin	Mr Murphy	Dr Theophanous
Mr Edwards	Mr Jenkins	Ms O'Byrne	Mr K. J. Thomson
Ms Ellis	Ms Kernot	Mr O'Connor	Mr Wilkie
Dr Emerson	Mr Kerr	Mr O'Keefe	Mr Wilton
Mr G. J. Evans	Mr Latham	Ms Plibersek	Mr Zahra
Mr L. D. T. Ferguson	Dr Lawrence	Mr Price	
Mr M. J. Ferguson	Mr Lee	Mr Ripoll	
Mr Fitzgibbon	Ms Livermore	Ms Roxon	

\* Tellers

And so it was resolved in the affirmative.

And the question—That the motion for the suspension of standing and sessional orders be agreed to—being accordingly put—

The House divided (the Deputy Speaker, Mr Quick, in the Chair)—

AYES, 65

Mr Adams	Ms Gerick	Mr McClelland	Mr Rudd
Mr Albanese	Mr Gibbons	Ms J. S. McFarlane	Mr Sawford*
Mr Beazley	Ms Gillard	Ms Macklin	Mr Sciacca
Mr Bevis	Mr Griffin	Mr McLeay	Mr Sercombe*
Mr Brereton	Ms Hall	Mr McMullan	Mr Sidebottom
Ms Burke	Mr Hatton	Mr Martin	Mr Smith
Mr Cox	Ms Hoare	Mr Melham	Mr Snowdon
Mr Crean	Mr Hollis	Mr Morris	Mr Swan
Mrs Crosio	Mr Horne	Mr Mossfield	Mr Tanner
Mr Danby	Mrs Irwin	Mr Murphy	Dr Theophanous
Mr Edwards	Mr Jenkins	Ms O'Byrne	Mr K. J. Thomson
Ms Ellis	Ms Kernot	Mr O'Connor	Mr Wilkie
Dr Emerson	Mr Kerr	Mr O'Keefe	Mr Wilton
Mr G. J. Evans	Mr Latham	Ms Plibersek	Mr Zahra
Mr L. D. T. Ferguson	Dr Lawrence	Mr Price	
Mr M. J. Ferguson	Mr Lee	Mr Ripoll	
Mr Fitzgibbon	Ms Livermore	Ms Roxon	

NOES, 76

Mr Abbott	Mr Fahey	Mr Lindsay	Mr Schultz
Mr Anderson	Mr Fischer	Mr Lloyd	Mr Scott
Mr K. J. Andrews	Mr Forrest*	Mr McArthur*	Mr Secker
Mr Anthony	Mrs Gallus	Mr I. E. Macfarlane	Mr Slipper
Ms Bailey	Ms Gambaro	Mr McGauran	Mr Somlyay
Mr Baird	Mrs Gash	Mrs May	Dr Southcott
Mr Barresi	Mr Georgiou	Mr Moore	Mrs Stone
Mr Bartlett	Mr Haase	Mrs Moylan	Mrs Sullivan
Mr Billson	Mr Hardgrave	Mr Nairn	Mr C. P. Thompson
Mrs B. K. Bishop	Mr Hawker	Mr Nehl	Mr A. P. Thomson
Ms J. I. Bishop	Mr Hockey	Dr Nelson	Mr Truss
Mr Brough	Mrs Hull	Mr Neville	Mr Tuckey
Mr Cadman	Mr Jull	Mr Nugent	Mr M. A. J. Vaile
Mr Cameron	Mr Katter	Mr Prosser	Mrs D. S. Vale
Mr Causley	Mrs D. M. Kelly	Mr Pyne	Mr Wakelin
Mr Charles	Jackie Kelly	Mr Reith	Dr Washer
Mr Downer	Dr Kemp	Mr Ronaldson	Mr Williams
Mrs Draper	Mr Lawler	Mr Ruddock	Dr Wooldridge
Mrs Elson	Mr Lieberman	Mr St Clair	Ms Worth

\* Tellers

And so it was negatived.

**17 HUMAN RIGHTS LEGISLATION AMENDMENT BILL 1998**

The order of the day having been read for the resumption of the debate on the question—That the Bill be now read a second time—

Debate resumed.

Mr Snowdon addressing the House—

---

**18 ADJOURNMENT**

It being 7.30 p.m.—The question was proposed—That the House do now adjourn.

Debate ensued.

The House continuing to sit until 8 p.m.—The Speaker adjourned the House until tomorrow at 9.30 a.m.

---

---

**PAPER**

The following paper was deemed to have been presented on 10 March 1999:  
Customs Act—Regulations—Statutory Rules 1999 No. 35.

---

---

**ATTENDANCE**

All Members attended (at some time during the sitting) except Mr Entsch.

---

---

**I. C. HARRIS**

Clerk of the House of Representatives

1998-99

**HOUSE OF REPRESENTATIVES**  
**SUPPLEMENT TO VOTES AND PROCEEDINGS**

No. 26

**MAIN COMMITTEE**

**MINUTES OF PROCEEDINGS**

WEDNESDAY, 10 MARCH 1999

---

1 The Main Committee met at 10 a.m.

2 **APPROPRIATION BILL (NO. 3) 1998-99**

The order of the day having been read for the resumption of the debate on the question—That the Bill be now read a second time—

Debate resumed.

---

*Suspension of sitting*

At 12.15 p.m., a division having been called in the House, the proceedings were suspended.

*Resumption of sitting*

At 12.26 p.m., the proceedings were resumed.

---

Debate continued.

Ms Hall was granted leave to continue her speech when the debate is resumed.

Debate adjourned, and the resumption of the debate made an order of the day for the next sitting.

3 **ADJOURNMENT**

On the motion of Mr Neville, the Main Committee adjourned at 1.02 p.m.

The Deputy Speaker fixed tomorrow at 9.40 a.m. for the next meeting of the Main Committee.

---

**B. C. WRIGHT**  
Clerk of the Main Committee