#### 1998-99

#### THE PARLIAMENT OF THE COMMONWEALTH OF AUSTRALIA

## HOUSE OF REPRESENTATIVES

## **VOTES AND PROCEEDINGS**

## No. 23

# THURSDAY, 18 FEBRUARY 1999

1 The House met, at 9.30 a.m., pursuant to adjournment. The Speaker (the Honourable Neil Andrew) took the Chair, and read Prayers.

#### 2 SUSPENSION OF STANDING AND SESSIONAL ORDERS MOVED

Mr Beazley (Leader of the Opposition) moved—That so much of the standing and sessional orders be suspended as would prevent the Leader of the Opposition moving forthwith—That the Minister for Employment, Workplace Relations and Small Business be condemned for concealing a deceptive plan to break undertakings that no worker would be worse off under the Government's industrial relations reforms and for his efforts to destroy the living wage for ordinary Australian families.

Closure of Member

Mr Reith (Leader of the House) moved—That the Member be not further heard.

Question-put.

The House divided (the Speaker, Mr J. N. Andrew, in the Chair)-

		5, 70	
Mr Abbott	Mrs Elson	Mr Lieberman	Mr St Clair
Mr Anderson	Mr Entsch	Mr Lindsay	Mr Schultz
Mr K. J. Andrews	Mr Fahey	Mr Lloyd	Mr Scott
Mr Anthony	Mr Fischer	Mr McArthur*	Mr Secker
Ms Bailey	Mr Forrest*	Mr I. E. Macfarlane	Mr Slipper
Mr Baird	Ms Gambaro	Mr McGauran	Mr Somlyay
Mr Barresi	Mrs Gash	Mrs May	Dr Southcott
Mr Bartlett	Mr Georgiou	Mr Moore	Mrs Stone
Mr Billson	Mr Haase	Mrs Moylan	Mr C. P. Thompson
Mrs B. K. Bishop	Mr Hardgrave	Mr Nairn	Mr A. P. Thomson
Ms J. I. Bishop	Mr Hawker	Mr Nehl	Mr Truss
Mr Brough	Mr Hockey	Dr Nelson	Mr Tuckey
Mr Cadman	Mrs Hull	Mr Neville	Mr M. A. J. Vaile
Mr Cameron	Mr Jull	Mr Nugent	Mrs D. S. Vale
Mr Causley	Mr Katter	Mr Prosser	Mr Wakelin
Mr Charles	Mrs D. M. Kelly	Mr Pyne	Dr Washer
Mr Costello	Jackie Kelly	Mr Reith	Mr Williams
Mr Downer	Dr Kemp	Mr Ronaldson	Dr Wooldridge
Mrs Draper	Mr Lawler	Mr Ruddock	Ms Worth
	NOE	S. 67	
Mr Adams		Ms Livermore	Ma Din ell
Mr Adams Mr Albanese	Mr Fitzgibbon Ms Gerick	Ms Livermore Mr McClelland	Mr Ripoll Ms Roxon
	Mr Gibbons	Mr McClenand Ms J. S. McFarlane	Mr Rudd
Mr Beazley Mr Bevis			1011 110000
	Ms Gillard	Ms Macklin	Mr Sawford* Mr Sciacca
Mr Brereton	Mr Griffin	Mr McLeay	Mr Sciacca Mr Sercombe*
Ms Burke	Ms Hall	Mr McMullan	
Mr Cox Mr Crean	Mr Hatton Ms Hoare	Mr Martin Mr Melham	Mr Sidebottom
	in the from t	1.11 1.101114111	Mr Smith
Mrs Crosio	Mr Hollis	Mr Morris	Mr Snowdon
Mr Danby Mr Edwards	Mr Horne	Mr Mossfield	Mr Swan
	Mrs Irwin	Mr Murphy	Mr Tanner
Ms Ellis	Mr Jenkins	Ms O'Byrne	Dr Theophanous
Dr Emerson	Ms Kernot	Mr O'Connor	Mr K. J. Thomson
Mr G. J. Evans	Mr Kerr	Mr O'Keefe	Mr Wilkie
Mr M. J. Evans	Mr Latham	Ms Plibersek	Mr Wilton
Mr L. D. T. Ferguson	Dr Lawrence	Mr Price	Mr Zahra
Mr M. J. Ferguson	Mr Lee	Mr Quick	

#### AYES, 76

\* Tellers

And so it was resolved in the affirmative.

Mr M. J. Ferguson (seconder) addressing the House-

Closure of Member

Mr Reith moved—That the Member be not further heard.

## Question—put.

The House divided (the Speaker, Mr J. N. Andrew, in the Chair)-

	ATLS, 70			
Mr Abbott	Mrs Elson	Mr Lieberman	Mr St Clair	
Mr Anderson	Mr Entsch	Mr Lindsay	Mr Schultz	
Mr K. J. Andrews	Mr Fahey	Mr Lloyd	Mr Scott	
Mr Anthony	Mr Fischer	Mr McArthur*	Mr Secker	
Ms Bailey	Mr Forrest*	Mr I. E. Macfarlane	Mr Slipper	
Mr Baird	Ms Gambaro	Mr McGauran	Mr Somlyay	
Mr Barresi	Mrs Gash	Mrs May	Dr Southcott	
Mr Bartlett	Mr Georgiou	Mr Moore	Mrs Stone	
Mr Billson	Mr Haase	Mrs Moylan	Mr C. P. Thompson	
Mrs B. K. Bishop	Mr Hardgrave	Mr Nairn	Mr A. P. Thomson	
Ms J. I. Bishop	Mr Hawker	Mr Nehl	Mr Truss	
Mr Brough	Mr Hockey	Dr Nelson	Mr Tuckey	
Mr Cadman	Mrs Hull	Mr Neville	Mr M. A. J. Vaile	
Mr Cameron	Mr Jull	Mr Nugent	Mrs D. S. Vale	
Mr Causley	Mr Katter	Mr Prosser	Mr Wakelin	
Mr Charles	Mrs D. M. Kelly	Mr Pyne	Dr Washer	
Mr Costello	Jackie Kelly	Mr Reith	Mr Williams	
Mr Downer	Dr Kemp	Mr Ronaldson	Dr Wooldridge	
Mrs Draper	Mr Lawler	Mr Ruddock	Ms Worth	
	NOES	8, 67		
Mr Adams	Mr Fitzgibbon	Ms Livermore	Mr Ripoll	
Mr Albanese	Ms Gerick	Mr McClelland	Ms Roxon	
Mr Beazley	Mr Gibbons	Ms J. S. McFarlane	Mr Rudd	
Mr Bevis	Ms Gillard	Ms Macklin	Mr Sawford*	
Mr Brereton	Mr Griffin	Mr McLeay	Mr Sciacca	
Ms Burke	Ms Hall	Mr McMullan	Mr Sercombe*	
Mr Cox	Mr Hatton	Mr Martin	Mr Sidebottom	
Mr Crean	Ms Hoare	Mr Melham	Mr Smith	
Mrs Crosio	Mr Hollis	Mr Morris	Mr Snowdon	
Mr Danby	Mr Horne	Mr Mossfield	Mr Swan	
Mr Edwards	Mrs Irwin	Mr Murphy	Mr Tanner	
Ms Ellis	Mr Jenkins	Ms O'Byrne	Dr Theophanous	
Dr Emerson	Ms Kernot	Mr O'Connor	Mr K. J. Thomson	
Mr G. J. Evans	Mr Kerr	Mr O'Keefe	Mr Wilkie	
Mr M. J. Evans	Mr Latham	Ms Plibersek	Mr Wilton	
Mr L. D. T. Ferguson	Dr Lawrence	Mr Price	Mr Zahra	
Mr M. J. Ferguson	Mr Lee	Mr Quick		

## AYES, 76

\* Tellers

And so it was resolved in the affirmative. Mr McMullan rising to address the HouseClosure

Mr Reith moved—That the question be now put.

Question—That the question be now put—put.

The House divided (the Speaker, Mr J. N. Andrew, in the Chair)-

#### AYES, 76

Mr Abbott	Mrs Elson	Mr Lieberman	Mr St Clair
Mr Anderson	Mr Entsch	Mr Lindsay	Mr Schultz
Mr K. J. Andrews	Mr Fahey	Mr Lloyd	Mr Scott
Mr Anthony	Mr Fischer	Mr McArthur*	Mr Secker
Ms Bailey	Mr Forrest*	Mr I. E. Macfarlane	Mr Slipper
Mr Baird	Ms Gambaro	Mr McGauran	Mr Somlyay
Mr Barresi	Mrs Gash	Mrs May	Dr Southcott
Mr Bartlett	Mr Georgiou	Mr Moore	Mrs Stone
Mr Billson	Mr Haase	Mrs Moylan	Mr C. P. Thompson
Mrs B. K. Bishop	Mr Hardgrave	Mr Nairn	Mr A. P. Thomson
Ms J. I. Bishop	Mr Hawker	Mr Nehl	Mr Truss
Mr Brough	Mr Hockey	Dr Nelson	Mr Tuckey
Mr Cadman	Mrs Hull	Mr Neville	Mr M. A. J. Vaile
Mr Cameron	Mr Jull	Mr Nugent	Mrs D. S. Vale
Mr Causley	Mr Katter	Mr Prosser	Mr Wakelin
Mr Charles	Mrs D. M. Kelly	Mr Pyne	Dr Washer
Mr Costello	Jackie Kelly	Mr Reith	Mr Williams
Mr Downer	Dr Kemp	Mr Ronaldson	Dr Wooldridge
Mrs Draper	Mr Lawler	Mr Ruddock	Ms Worth
	NOES	5, 67	
Mr Adams	Mr Fitzgibbon	Ms Livermore	Mr Ripoll
Mr Albanese	Ms Gerick	Mr McClelland	Ms Roxon
Mr Beazley	Mr Gibbons	Ms J. S. McFarlane	Mr Rudd
Mr Bevis	Ms Gillard	Ms Macklin	Mr Sawford*
Mr Brereton	Mr Griffin	Mr McLeay	Mr Sciacca
Ms Burke	Ms Hall	Mr McMullan	Mr Sercombe*
Mr Cox	Mr Hatton	Mr Martin	Mr Sidebottom
Mr Crean	Ms Hoare	Mr Melham	Mr Smith
Mrs Crosio	Mr Hollis	Mr Morris	Mr Snowdon
Mr Danby	Mr Horne	Mr Mossfield	Mr Swan
Mr Edwards	Mrs Irwin	Mr Murphy	Mr Tanner
Ms Ellis	Mr Jenkins	Ms O'Byrne	Dr Theophanous
Dr Emerson	Ms Kernot	Mr O'Connor	Mr K. J. Thomson
Mr G. J. Evans	Mr Kerr	Mr O'Keefe	Mr Wilkie

Mr G. J. Evans Mr Kerr Mr Latham Mr M. J. Evans Mr L. D. T. Ferguson Dr Lawrence Mr M. J. Ferguson Mr Lee

\* Tellers

Ms Plibersek

Mr Price

Mr Quick

Mr Wilkie Mr Wilton Mr Zahra

And so it was resolved in the affirmative.

And the question—That the motion for the suspension of standing and sessional orders be agreed to—being accordingly put—

The House divided (the Speaker, Mr J. N. Andrew, in the Chair)-

#### **AYES**, 67

	711 E	5, 67	
Mr Adams	Mr Fitzgibbon	Ms Livermore	Mr Ripoll
Mr Albanese	Ms Gerick	Mr McClelland	Ms Roxon
Mr Beazley	Mr Gibbons	Ms J. S. McFarlane	Mr Rudd
Mr Bevis	Ms Gillard	Ms Macklin	Mr Sawford*
Mr Brereton	Mr Griffin	Mr McLeay	Mr Sciacca
Ms Burke	Ms Hall	Mr McMullan	Mr Sercombe*
Mr Cox	Mr Hatton	Mr Martin	Mr Sidebottom
Mr Crean	Ms Hoare	Mr Melham	Mr Smith
Mrs Crosio	Mr Hollis	Mr Morris	Mr Snowdon
Mr Danby	Mr Horne	Mr Mossfield	Mr Swan
Mr Edwards	Mrs Irwin	Mr Murphy	Mr Tanner
Ms Ellis	Mr Jenkins	Ms O'Byrne	Dr Theophanous
Dr Emerson	Ms Kernot	Mr O'Connor	Mr K. J. Thomson
Mr G. J. Evans	Mr Kerr	Mr O'Keefe	Mr Wilkie
Mr M. J. Evans	Mr Latham	Ms Plibersek	Mr Wilton
Mr L. D. T. Ferguson	Dr Lawrence	Mr Price	Mr Zahra
Mr M. J. Ferguson	Mr Lee	Mr Quick	
	NOE	S, 76	
Mr Abbott	Mrs Elson	Mr Lieberman	Mr St Clair
Mr Anderson	Mr Entsch	Mr Lindsay	Mr Schultz
Mr K. J. Andrews	Mr Fahey	Mr Lloyd	Mr Scott
Mr Anthony	Mr Fischer	Mr McArthur*	Mr Secker
Ms Bailey	Mr Forrest*	Mr I. E. Macfarlane	Mr Slipper
Mr Baird	Ms Gambaro	Mr McGauran	Mr Somlyay
Mr Barresi	Mrs Gash	Mrs May	Dr Southcott
Mr Bartlett	Mr Georgiou	Mr Moore	Mrs Stone
Mr Billson	Mr Haase	Mrs Moylan	Mr C. P. Thompson
Mrs B. K. Bishop	Mr Hardgrave	Mr Nairn	Mr A. P. Thomson
Ms J. I. Bishop	Mr Hawker	Mr Nehl	Mr Truss
Mr Brough	Mr Hockey	Dr Nelson	Mr Tuckey
Mr Cadman	Mrs Hull	Mr Neville	Mr M. A. J. Vaile
Mr Cameron	Mr Jull	Mr Nugent	Mrs D. S. Vale
Mr Causley	Mr Katter	Mr Prosser	Mr Wakelin
Mr Charles	Mrs D. M. Kelly	Mr Pyne	Dr Washer
Mr Costello	Jackie Kelly	Mr Reith	Mr Williams
Mr Downer	Dr Kemp	Mr Ronaldson	Dr Wooldridge
	•		c

\* Tellers

Mr Ruddock

Ms Worth

And so it was negatived.

Mr Lawler

Mrs Draper

### **3 RADIOCOMMUNICATIONS LEGISLATION AMENDMENT BILL 1999**

Mr McGauran (Minister representing the Minister for Communications, Information Technology and the Arts) presented a Bill for an Act to amend the law relating to radiocommunications, and for related purposes.

Bill read a first time.

Mr McGauran moved—That the Bill be now read a second time.

Paper

Mr McGauran presented an explanatory memorandum to the following Bills:

Radiocommunications Legislation Amendment 1999;

Radiocommunications (Receiver Licence Tax) Amendment 1999; and

Radiocommunications (Transmitter Licence Tax) Amendment 1999.

Debate adjourned (Mr Smith), and the resumption of the debate made an order of the day for the next sitting.

## **4 RADIOCOMMUNICATIONS (RECEIVER LICENCE TAX) AMENDMENT BILL** 1999

Mr McGauran (Minister representing the Minister for Communications, Information Technology and the Arts) presented a Bill for an Act to amend the *Radiocommunications (Receiver Licence Tax) Act 1983*, and for related purposes.

Bill read a first time.

Mr McGauran moved—That the Bill be now read a second time.

Debate adjourned (Mr Smith), and the resumption of the debate made an order of the day for the next sitting.

## 5 RADIOCOMMUNICATIONS (TRANSMITTER LICENCE TAX) AMENDMENT BILL 1999

Mr McGauran (Minister representing the Minister for Communications, Information Technology and the Arts) presented a Bill for an Act to amend the *Radiocommunications (Transmitter Licence Tax) Act 1983*, and for related purposes.

Bill read a first time.

Mr McGauran moved—That the Bill be now read a second time.

Debate adjourned (Mr Smith), and the resumption of the debate made an order of the day for the next sitting.

## 6 A NEW TAX SYSTEM (TRADE PRACTICES AMENDMENT) BILL 1998

The order of the day having been read for the resumption of the debate on the question—That the Bill be now read a second time—

Debate resumed by Mr Crean (Deputy Leader of the Opposition) who moved, as an amendment—That all words after "That" be omitted with a view to substituting the following words: "the House, while noting that price monitoring will be necessary to avoid confusion and exploitation during the implementation of the Government's New Tax System:

- (1) condemns the Government for seeking to introduce a GST which is an unfair, job destroying new tax;
- (2) condemns the Government for its failure to provide adequate resources to the ACCC for its new role and for the limited scope and time period of application of the monitoring; and
- (3) condemns the Government for misleading the Australian people prior to the 1998 federal election with its assumption that the inflationary effect of the New Tax System will be only 1.9%, given that this is based on a 100% pass-through of savings which the limited pass-through monitoring mechanism contained in this Bill is unlikely to ensure".

Debate continued.

Question—That the words proposed to be omitted stand part of the question—put.

The House divided (the Deputy Speaker, Mrs Gash, in the Chair)-

Mr Abbott	Mrs Elson	Mr Lindsay	Mr Schultz
Mr Anderson	Mr Entsch	Mr Lloyd	Mr Scott
Mr K. J. Andrews	Mr Fahey	Mr McArthur*	Mr Secker
Mr Anthony	Mr Fischer	Mr I. E. Macfarlane	Mr Slipper
Ms Bailey	Mr Forrest*	Mr McGauran	Mr Somlyay
Mr Baird	Ms Gambaro	Mrs May	Dr Southcott
Mr Barresi	Mr Georgiou	Mr Moore	Mrs Stone
Mr Bartlett	Mr Haase	Mrs Moylan	Mr C. P. Thompson
Mr Billson	Mr Hardgrave	Mr Nairn	Mr A. P. Thomson
Mrs B. K. Bishop	Mr Hawker	Mr Nehl	Mr Truss
Ms J. I. Bishop	Mr Hockey	Dr Nelson	Mr Tuckey
Mr Brough	Mrs Hull	Mr Neville	Mr M. A. J. Vaile
Mr Cadman	Mr Jull	Mr Nugent	Mrs D. S. Vale
Mr Cameron	Mr Katter	Mr Prosser	Mr Wakelin
Mr Causley	Mrs D. M. Kelly	Mr Pyne	Dr Washer
Mr Charles	Jackie Kelly	Mr Reith	Mr Williams
Mr Costello	Dr Kemp	Mr Ronaldson	Dr Wooldridge
Mr Downer	Mr Lawler	Mr Ruddock	Ms Worth
Mrs Draper	Mr Lieberman	Mr St Clair	

#### AYES, 75

Mr Adams	Mr Gibbons	Mr McClelland	Ms Roxon
Mr Albanese	Ms Gillard	Ms J. S. McFarlane	Mr Rudd
Mr Bevis	Mr Griffin	Ms Macklin	Mr Sawford*
Ms Burke	Ms Hall	Mr McLeay	Mr Sciacca
Mr Cox	Mr Hatton	Mr McMullan	Mr Sercombe*
Mr Crean	Ms Hoare	Mr Melham	Mr Sidebottom
Mrs Crosio	Mr Hollis	Mr Morris	Mr Smith
Mr Danby	Mr Horne	Mr Mossfield	Mr Snowdon
Mr Edwards	Mrs Irwin	Mr Murphy	Mr Swan
Ms Ellis	Mr Jenkins	Ms O'Byrne	Mr Tanner
Dr Emerson	Ms Kernot	Mr O'Connor	Dr Theophanous
Mr G. J. Evans	Mr Kerr	Mr O'Keefe	Mr K. J. Thomson
Mr M. J. Evans	Mr Latham	Ms Plibersek	Mr Wilkie
Mr L. D. T. Ferguson	Dr Lawrence	Mr Price	Mr Wilton
Mr Fitzgibbon	Mr Lee	Mr Quick	Mr Zahra
Ms Gerick	Ms Livermore	Mr Ripoll	

#### NOES, 63

\* Tellers

And so it was resolved in the affirmative.

Question—That the Bill be now read a second time—put and passed—Bill read a second time.

Consideration in detail

Bill, by leave, taken as a whole.

Mr K. J. Thomson, by leave, moved Opposition amendments (1) to (4) as circulated, together.

Debate continued.

Question—That the amendments be agreed to—put.

The House divided (the Deputy Speaker, Mr Nehl, in the Chair)-

AYES, 65

		-,	
Mr Adams	Mr Gibbons	Ms J. S. McFarlane	Mr Rudd
Mr Albanese	Ms Gillard	Ms Macklin	Mr Sawford*
Mr Bevis	Mr Griffin	Mr McLeay	Mr Sciacca
Mr Brereton	Ms Hall	Mr McMullan	Mr Sercombe*
Ms Burke	Mr Hatton	Mr Martin	Mr Sidebottom
Mr Cox	Ms Hoare	Mr Melham	Mr Smith
Mr Crean	Mr Hollis	Mr Morris	Mr Snowdon
Mrs Crosio	Mr Horne	Mr Mossfield	Mr Swan
Mr Danby	Mrs Irwin	Mr Murphy	Mr Tanner
Mr Edwards	Mr Jenkins	Ms O'Byrne	Dr Theophanous
Ms Ellis	Ms Kernot	Mr O'Connor	Mr K. J. Thomson
Dr Emerson	Mr Kerr	Mr O'Keefe	Mr Wilkie
Mr G. J. Evans	Mr Latham	Ms Plibersek	Mr Wilton
Mr M. J. Evans	Dr Lawrence	Mr Price	Mr Zahra
Mr L. D. T. Ferguson	Mr Lee	Mr Quick	
Mr Fitzgibbon	Ms Livermore	Mr Ripoll	
Ms Gerick	Mr McClelland	Ms Roxon	
	NOE	S, 74	
Mr Abbott	Mr Entsch	Mr Lindsay	Mr Scott
Mr Anderson	Mr Fahey	Mr Lloyd	Mr Secker
Mr K. J. Andrews	Mr Fischer	Mr McArthur*	Mr Slipper
Mr Anthony	Mr Forrest*	Mr I. E. Macfarlane	Mr Somlyay
Ms Bailey	Ms Gambaro	Mr McGauran	Dr Southcott
Mr Baird	Mrs Gash	Mrs May	Mrs Stone
Mr Barresi	Mr Georgiou	Mr Moore	Mr C. P. Thompson
Mr Bartlett	Mr Haase	Mrs Moylan	Mr A. P. Thompson
Mr Billson	Mr Hardgrave	Mr Nairn	Mr Truss
Mrs B. K. Bishop	Mr Hawker	Dr Nelson	Mr Tuckey
Ms J. I. Bishop	Mr Hockey	Mr Neville	Mr M. A. J. Vaile
Mr Brough	Mrs Hull	Mr Nugent	Mrs D. S. Vale
Mr Cadman	Mr Jull	Mr Prosser	Mr Wakelin
Mr Cameron	Mr Katter	Mr Pyne	Dr Washer
Mr Causley	Mrs D. M. Kelly	Mr Reith	Mr Williams
Mr Charles	Jackie Kelly	Mr Ronaldson	Dr Wooldridge
Mr Downer	Dr Kemp	Mr Ruddock	Ms Worth
Mrs Draper	Mr Lawler	Mr St Clair	····
Mrs Elson	Mr Lieberman	Mr Schultz	

#### \* Tellers

And so it was negatived.

Mr Hockey (Minister for Financial Services and Regulation), by leave, moved Government amendments (1) and (2) as circulated, together.

## Paper

Mr Hockey presented a supplementary explanatory memorandum to the Bill.

Debate continued.

Amendments agreed to.

Bill, as amended, agreed to.

Consideration in detail concluded.

On the motion of Mr Hockey, by leave, the Bill was read a third time.

## 7 QUESTIONS

Questions without notice were asked.

## 8 PAPER

Mr Anderson (Minister for Transport and Regional Services), by indulgence, added to an answer given during question time and presented the following paper:

South Pacific Seaplanes: Serious deficiency summary—Copy of letter from Stephen Skehill, Special Counsel, Civil Aviation Safety Authority to Mr M. Toller, Director of Aviation Safety, Civil Aviation Safety Authority, 3 February 1999.

## 9 PRIME MINISTER—MOTION OF CENSURE

Mr Beazley (Leader of the Opposition), by leave, moved—That this House censures the Prime Minister:

- (1) for his instruction to the Minister for Employment, Workplace Relations and Small Business to develop a secret plan which would break the Government's undertaking that no worker would be worse off under its workplace reforms and undermine the living wage for ordinary Australian families; and
- (2) for his undermining of Australians' desire for high-wage, high-skill, secure jobs and not low-wage, low-skill and transient jobs.

Debate ensued.

Mr Reith (Minister for Employment, Workplace Relations and Small Business) moved, as an amendment—That all words after "That" be omitted with a view to substituting the following words: "this House condemns the Leader of the Opposition for his:

- (a) failure to support the employment creation policies of the Coalition Government which were endorsed by the Australian people at the last election, including Labor's direct rejection of the Government's unfair dismissal laws and regulations which has denied up to 50 000 people a job;
- (b) failure to support the preservation of junior rates of pay which could result in up to 240 000 young people losing their jobs; and
- (c) failure to detail to the Australian people any meaningful policies which would lead to a reduction in unemployment in this country".

Debate continued.

350

## Closure

Mr Abbott (Minister for Employment Services) moved—That the question be now put.

Question—That the question be now put—put.

The House divided (the Speaker, Mr J. N. Andrew, in the Chair)-

## AYES, 75

Mr Abbott	Mr Entsch	Mr Lindsay	Mr Schultz
Mr Anderson	Mr Fahey	Mr Lloyd	Mr Scott
Mr K. J. Andrews	Mr Fischer	Mr McArthur*	Mr Secker
Mr Anthony	Mr Forrest*	Mr I. E. Macfarlane	Mr Slipper
Ms Bailey	Ms Gambaro	Mr McGauran	Mr Somlyay
Mr Baird	Mrs Gash	Mrs May	Dr Southcott
Mr Barresi	Mr Georgiou	Mr Moore	Mrs Stone
Mr Bartlett	Mr Haase	Mrs Moylan	Mr C. P. Thompson
Mr Billson	Mr Hardgrave	Mr Nairn	Mr A. P. Thomson
Mrs B. K. Bishop	Mr Hawker	Mr Nehl	Mr Truss
Ms J. I. Bishop	Mr Hockey	Dr Nelson	Mr Tuckey
Mr Brough	Mrs Hull	Mr Neville	Mr M. A. J. Vaile
Mr Cadman	Mr Jull	Mr Nugent	Mrs D. S. Vale
Mr Cameron	Mr Katter	Mr Prosser	Mr Wakelin
Mr Causley	Mrs D. M. Kelly	Mr Pyne	Dr Washer
Mr Charles	Jackie Kelly	Mr Reith	Mr Williams
Mr Downer	Dr Kemp	Mr Ronaldson	Dr Wooldridge
Mrs Draper	Mr Lawler	Mr Ruddock	Ms Worth
Mrs Elson	Mr Lieberman	Mr St Clair	
	NOES	5, 67	
Mr Adams	Mr Fitzgibbon	Ms Livermore	Mr Ripoll
Mr Albanese	Ms Gerick	Mr McClelland	Ms Roxon
Mr Beazley	Mr Gibbons	Ms J. S. McFarlane	Mr Rudd
Mr Bevis	Ms Gillard	Ms Macklin	Mr Sawford*
Mr Brereton	Mr Griffin	Mr McLeay	Mr Sciacca
Ms Burke	Ms Hall	Mr McMullan	Mr Sercombe*
Mr Cox	Mr Hatton	Mr Martin	Mr Sidebottom
Mr Crean	Ms Hoare	Mr Melham	Mr Smith
Mrs Crosio	Mr Hollis	Mr Morris	Mr Snowdon
Mr Danby	Mr Horne	Mr Mossfield	Mr Swan
Mr Edwards	Mrs Irwin	Mr Murphy	Mr Tanner
Ms Ellis	Mr Jenkins	Ms O'Byrne	Dr Theophanous
Dr Emerson	Ms Kernot	Mr O'Connor	Mr K. J. Thomson
Mr G. J. Evans	Mr Kerr	Mr O'Keefe	Mr Wilkie
Mr M. J. Evans	Mr Latham	Ms Plibersek	Mr Wilton
Mr L. D. T. Ferguson	Dr Lawrence	Mr Price	Mr Zahra
Mr M. J. Ferguson	Mr Lee	Mr Quick	

\* Tellers

And so it was resolved in the affirmative.

And the question—That the amendment be agreed to—being accordingly put— The House divided (the Speaker, Mr J. N. Andrew, in the Chair)—

#### AYES, 75

Mr Abbott	Mr Entsch	Mr Lindsay	Mr Schultz
Mr Anderson	Mr Fahey	Mr Lloyd	Mr Scott
Mr K. J. Andrews	Mr Fischer	Mr McArthur*	Mr Secker
Mr Anthony	Mr Forrest*	Mr I. E. Macfarlane	Mr Slipper
Ms Bailey	Ms Gambaro	Mr McGauran	Mr Somlyay
Mr Baird	Mrs Gash	Mrs May	Dr Southcott
Mr Barresi	Mr Georgiou	Mr Moore	Mrs Stone
Mr Bartlett	Mr Haase	Mrs Moylan	Mr C. P. Thompson
Mr Billson	Mr Hardgrave	Mr Nairn	Mr A. P. Thomson
Mrs B. K. Bishop	Mr Hawker	Mr Nehl	Mr Truss
Ms J. I. Bishop	Mr Hockey	Dr Nelson	Mr Tuckey
Mr Brough	Mrs Hull	Mr Neville	Mr M. A. J. Vaile
Mr Cadman	Mr Jull	Mr Nugent	Mrs D. S. Vale
Mr Cameron	Mr Katter	Mr Prosser	Mr Wakelin
Mr Causley	Mrs D. M. Kelly	Mr Pyne	Dr Washer
Mr Charles	Jackie Kelly	Mr Reith	Mr Williams
Mr Downer	Dr Kemp	Mr Ronaldson	Dr Wooldridge
Mrs Draper	Mr Lawler	Mr Ruddock	Ms Worth
Mrs Elson	Mr Lieberman	Mr St Clair	
	NOES	8, 67	
Mr Adams	Mr Fitzgibbon	Ms Livermore	Mr Ripoll
Mr Albanese	Ms Gerick	Mr McClelland	Ms Roxon
Mr Beazley	Mr Gibbons	Ms J. S. McFarlane	Mr Rudd
Mr Bevis	Ms Gillard	Ms Macklin	Mr Sawford*
Mr Brereton	Mr Griffin	Mr McLeay	Mr Sciacca
Ms Burke	Ms Hall	Mr McMullan	Mr Sercombe*
Mr Cox	Mr Hatton	Mr Martin	Mr Sidebottom
Mr Crean	Ms Hoare	Mr Melham	Mr Smith
Mrs Crosio	Mr Hollis	Mr Morris	Mr Snowdon
Mr Danby	Mr Horne	Mr Mossfield	Mr Swan
Mr Edwards	Mrs Irwin	Mr Murphy	Mr Tanner
Ms Ellis	Mr Jenkins	Ms O'Byrne	Dr Theophanous
Dr Emerson	Ms Kernot	Mr O'Connor	Mr K. J. Thomson
Mr G. J. Evans	Mr Kerr	Mr O'Keefe	Mr Wilkie
Mr M. J. Evans	Mr Latham	Ms Plibersek	Mr Wilton
Mr L. D. T. Ferguson	Dr Lawrence	Mr Price	Mr Zahra
Mr M. J. Ferguson	Mr Lee	Mr Quick	

\* Tellers

And so it was resolved in the affirmative.

Question—That the motion, as amended, be agreed to—put. The House divided (the Speaker, Mr J. N. Andrew, in the Chair)—

		*	
Mr Abbott	Mr Entsch	Mr Lieberman	Mr St Clair
Mr Anderson	Mr Fahey	Mr Lindsay	Mr Schultz
Mr K. J. Andrews	Mr Fischer	Mr Lloyd	Mr Scott
Mr Anthony	Mr Forrest*	Mr McArthur*	Mr Secker
Ms Bailey	Ms Gambaro	Mr I. E. Macfarlane	Mr Slipper
Mr Baird	Mrs Gash	Mr McGauran	Mr Somlyay
Mr Barresi	Mr Georgiou	Mrs May	Dr Southcott
Mr Bartlett	Mr Haase	Mr Moore	Mrs Stone
Mr Billson	Mr Hardgrave	Mrs Moylan	Mr C. P. Thompson
Mrs B. K. Bishop	Mr Hawker	Mr Nairn	Mr A. P. Thomson
Ms J. I. Bishop	Mr Hockey	Mr Nehl	Mr Truss
Mr Brough	Mr Howard	Dr Nelson	Mr Tuckey
Mr Cadman	Mrs Hull	Mr Neville	Mr M. A. J. Vaile
Mr Cameron	Mr Jull	Mr Nugent	Mrs D. S. Vale
Mr Causley	Mr Katter	Mr Prosser	Mr Wakelin
Mr Charles	Mrs D. M. Kelly	Mr Pyne	Dr Washer
Mr Downer	Jackie Kelly	Mr Reith	Mr Williams
Mrs Draper	Dr Kemp	Mr Ronaldson	Dr Wooldridge
Mrs Elson	Mr Lawler	Mr Ruddock	Ms Worth
	NOES	5, 67	
Mr Adams	Mr Fitzgibbon	Ms Livermore	Mr Ripoll
Mr Albanese	Ms Gerick	Mr McClelland	Ms Roxon
Mr Beazley	Mr Gibbons	Ms J. S. McFarlane	Mr Rudd
Mr Bevis	Ms Gillard	Ms Macklin	Mr Sawford*
Mr Brereton	Mr Griffin	Mr McLeay	Mr Sciacca
Ms Burke	Ms Hall	Mr McMullan	Mr Sercombe*
Mr Cox	Mr Hatton	Mr Martin	Mr Sidebottom
Mr Crean	Ms Hoare	Mr Melham	Mr Smith
Mrs Crosio	Mr Hollis	Mr Morris	Mr Snowdon
Mr Danby	Mr Horne	Mr Mossfield	Mr Swan
Mr Edwards	Mrs Irwin	Mr Murphy	Mr Tanner
Ms Ellis	Mr Jenkins	Ms O'Byrne	Dr Theophanous
Dr Emerson	Ms Kernot	Mr O'Connor	Mr K. J. Thomson
Mr G. J. Evans	Mr Kerr	Mr O'Keefe	Mr Wilkie
Mr M. J. Evans	Mr Latham	Ms Plibersek	Mr Wilton
Mr L. D. T. Ferguson	Dr Lawrence	Mr Price	Mr Zahra
Mr M. J. Ferguson	Mr Lee	Mr Quick	

AYES, 76

\* Tellers

And so it was resolved in the affirmative.

## 10 AUDITOR-GENERAL'S REPORTS

The Speaker presented the following papers:

Auditor-General—Audit reports of 1998-99—

No. 21-Financial control and administration audit-Costing of services.

No. 31—Performance Audit—The management of performance information for special purpose payments—The state of play.

Severally ordered to be printed.

### 11 **PAPERS**

The following papers were presented:

Australian Hearing Services—Report for 1997-98.

Australian Trade Commission (AUSTRADE)—Report for 1997-98—Erratum.

Bureau of Air Safety Investigation—Air Safety Report—Investigation report 9802830—Cessna 185E Floatplane, VH-HTS, Calabash Bay, NSW, 26 July 1998.

Department of Transport and Regional Development—Review of the regulation by the Civil Aviation Safety Authority of Aquatic Air Pty Ltd trading as South Pacific Seaplanes—

CASA actions arising from the Skehill report, 1 February 1999. Report by Mr Stephen Skehill, October 1998.

Family and Community Affairs—Standing Committee—Report on concession card availability and eligibility for concessions, October 1997—Government response, December 1998.

Petition not in accord with standing and sessional orders of the House—East Timor (Mr L. D. T. Ferguson, 374 petitioners).

Public Accounts—Joint Committee—Report 355—Aboriginal Councils and Torres Strait Island Councils: Review of financial accountability requirements, November 1997—Government response, June 1998.

## 12 PAPERS—MOTION TO TAKE NOTE OF PAPERS

Mr Reith (Leader of the House) moved—That the House take note of the following papers:

Australian Hearing Services—Report for 1997-98.

Bureau of Air Safety Investigation—Air Safety Report—Investigation report 9802830—Cessna 185E Floatplane, VH-HTS, Calabash Bay, NSW, 26 July 1998.

Department of Transport and Regional Development—Review of the regulation by the Civil Aviation Safety Authority of Aquatic Air Pty Ltd trading as South Pacific Seaplanes—

CASA actions arising from the Skehill report, 1 February 1999.

Report by Mr Stephen Skehill, October 1998.

Debate adjourned (Mr McMullan), and the resumption of each debate made an order of the day for the next sitting.

354

#### 13 FAMILY AND COMMUNITY AFFAIRS—STANDING COMMITTEE

Mr Reith (Leader of the House), by leave, moved—That Mr Nugent and Mr Jenkins be appointed supplementary members of the Standing Committee on Family and Community Affairs for the purpose of the committee's inquiry into indigenous health.

Question—put and passed.

### 14 PROPOSED DISCUSSION OF MATTER OF PUBLIC IMPORTANCE— GOVERNMENT'S EMPLOYMENT STRATEGY

The House was informed that Mr M. J. Ferguson had proposed that a definite matter of public importance be submitted to the House for discussion, namely, "The Government's employment strategy which will result in a low wage, low skill economy for Australia".

The proposed discussion having received the necessary support-

Mr M. J. Ferguson rising to address the House-

Mr Reith (Leader of the House) moved—That the business of the day be called on.

Question—put and passed.

## 15 MEMBERS' INTERESTS COMMITTEE—REPORT

Mr Somlyay (Chair) presented the following report:

Committee of Members' Interests—Report on the operations of the committee for 1998, 17 February 1999.

Ordered to be printed.

#### 16 PUBLICATIONS COMMITTEE—2ND REPORT

Mr Lieberman (Chair) presented the following paper:

### PUBLICATIONS COMMITTEE 2ND REPORT

The Publications Committee reports that it has met in conference with the Publications Committee of the Senate.

The Committee, having considered documents presented to Parliament since 10 December 1998, recommends that the following be printed:

Administrative Review Council—Reports to the Attorney-General—No. 43— Administrative review of patents decisions.

Albury-Wodonga Development Corporation—Report for 1997-98.

Anti-Dumping Authority—Report for 1997-98.

Australian Antarctic Foundation—Report for 1997-98.

Australian Dried Fruits Board-Report for 1997-98 [7th].

Australian Industry Development Corporation-Report for 1997-98.

Australian Landcare Council—Report for 1997-98.

Australian Science, Technology and Engineering Council—Report for 1997-98.

Christmas Island Casino Surveillance Authority and Casino Controller—Report for 1997-98.

Commissioner of Taxation—Data-matching program—Reports—ATO's interaction with the program 1995-96, 1996-97 and 1997-98.

Commonwealth Services Delivery Agency (Centrelink)—Data-matching program—Report on progress 1995-98.

Companies Auditors and Liquidators Disciplinary Board—Report for 1997-98.

Council for Aboriginal Reconciliation—Report for 1997-98.

Federal Court of Australia—Report for 1997-98.

Forest and Wood Products Research and Development Corporation—Report for 1997-98.

Freedom of Information Act—Report for 1997-98.

Members of Parliament (Staff) Act—Reports on consultants engaged under section 4—1997-98.

National Crime Authority—Report for 1997-98.

National Environment Protection Council-Report for 1997-98.

Nuclear Safety Bureau—Report for 1997-98.

Pooled Development Funds Registration Board—Report for 1997-98.

Productivity Commission—Reports—No. 1—The Australian Black Coal Industry—

Volume 1.

Volume 2.

States Grants (Primary and Secondary Education Assistance) Act—Reports on financial assistance granted to each State in respect of—1997.

Telecommunications (Interception) Act—Report for 1997-98.

Tobacco Research and Development Corporation—Report for 1997-98.

Australian Law Reform Commission—Reports—No. 85—Australia's federal record: A review of Archives Act 1983.

Bankruptcy Act—Report for 1997-98—Errata.

Finance—Budget 1998-99—Science and Technology Budget Statement—1998-99.

LOU LIEBERMAN

Chair

18 February 1999

Mr Lieberman, by leave, moved—That the report be agreed to.

Question—put and passed.

### 17 AUSTRALIAN SPORTS DRUG AGENCY AMENDMENT BILL 1998—REPORT FROM MAIN COMMITTEE

The Speaker reported that the Bill had been fully considered by the Main Committee and agreed to without amendment, and presented a certified copy of the Bill.

Bill agreed to.

On the motion of Mr Reith (Leader of the House), by leave, the Bill was read a third time.

#### 18 AGRICULTURE, FISHERIES AND FORESTRY LEGISLATION AMENDMENT BILL (NO. 2) 1998—REPORT FROM MAIN COMMITTEE

The Speaker reported that the Bill had been fully considered by the Main Committee and agreed to without amendment, and presented a certified copy of the Bill.

Bill agreed to.

On the motion of Mr Reith (Leader of the House), by leave, the Bill was read a third time.

## 19 MOTOR VEHICLE STANDARDS AMENDMENT BILL 1998—REPORT FROM MAIN COMMITTEE

The Speaker reported that the Bill had been fully considered by the Main Committee and agreed to without amendment, and presented a certified copy of the Bill.

Bill agreed to.

On the motion of Mr McGauran (Minister for the Arts and the Centenary of Federation), by leave, the Bill was read a third time.

## 20 MESSAGE FROM THE SENATE—YEAR 2000 INFORMATION DISCLOSURE BILL 1999

A message from the Senate was reported returning the following Bill with amendments:

18 February 1999—Message No. 41—Year 2000 Information Disclosure 1999.

Ordered—That the amendments be considered forthwith.

Mr McGauran (Minister representing the Minister for Communications, Information Technology and the Arts) moved—That the amendments be agreed to.

Papers

Mr McGauran, by leave, presented the following papers:

Year 2000 Information Disclosure Bill 1999—Copies of—

Government increases level of Y2K disclosure—Media release by Senator Alston, Minister for Communications, Information Technology and the Arts, 17 February 1999.

Letters (2) from Senator Alston to Senator Lundy, 17 February 1999.

Question—put and passed.

## 21 MESSAGE FROM THE SENATE—ELECTORAL AND REFERENDUM AMENDMENT BILL (NO. 2) 1998

A message from the Senate was reported returning the following Bill with amendments:

18 February 1999—Message No. 42—Electoral and Referendum Amendment (No. 2) 1998.

Ordered—That the amendments be considered at the next sitting.

## 22 MESSAGE FROM THE SENATE—WILDLIFE PROTECTION (REGULATION OF EXPORTS AND IMPORTS) AMENDMENT BILL 1998

Message No. 44, 18 February 1999, from the Senate was reported transmitting for the concurrence of the House a Bill for an Act to amend the *Wildlife Protection (Regulation of Exports and Imports) Act 1982*, and for related purposes.

Bill read a first time.

Ordered—That the second reading be made an order of the day for the next sitting.

#### 23 MESSAGE FROM THE SENATE

A message from the Senate was reported returning the following Bill without amendment:

18 February 1999—Message No. 43—Aboriginal Land Rights (Northern Territory) Amendment (No. 1) 1998.

#### 24 paper

Mr Anderson (Minister for Transport and Regional Services) presented the following paper:

South Pacific Seaplanes—Copy of letter from Stephen Skehill to Mr Anderson, 18 February 1999.

#### 25 APPROPRIATION BILL (NO. 3) 1998-99

The order of the day having been read for the resumption of the debate on the question—That the Bill be now read a second time—

Debate resumed.

Mr Sciacca addressing the House—

#### **26 ADJOURNMENT**

It being 5.30 p.m.—The question was proposed—That the House do now adjourn.

Debate ensued.

The House continuing to sit until 6 p.m.—The Speaker adjourned the House until Monday, 8 March 1999, at 12.30 p.m..

### PAPERS

The following papers were deemed to have been presented on 18 February 1999:

Defence Act—Determination under section 58B 1999 No. 6.

Film Licensed Investment Company Act—Determination 1998 Film Licensed Investment Company (Reporting Requirements).

Insurance (Agents and Brokers) Act—Form approved for the purposes of section 9C 11 February 1999.

Statutory Rules Publication Act—Statement relating to the unavailability of the Film Licensed Investment Company (Reporting Requirements) Determination 1998.

Taxation Administration Act—Rulings 1999 Nos. PR 5, PR 6.

## ATTENDANCE

All Members attended (at some time during the sitting) except Mrs Gallus and Mrs Sullivan.

\_\_\_\_\_

I. C. HARRIS Clerk of the House of Representatives 1998-99

## HOUSE OF REPRESENTATIVES

## SUPPLEMENT TO VOTES AND PROCEEDINGS

## No. 23

## MAIN COMMITTEE

## MINUTES OF PROCEEDINGS

# THURSDAY, 18 FEBRUARY 1999

1 Due to a division having been called in the House the Main Committee met at 9.55 a.m.

### 2 MEMBERS' STATEMENTS

Members' statements were made.

#### **3 AUSTRALIAN SPORTS DRUG AGENCY AMENDMENT BILL 1998**

The order of the day having been read for the resumption of the debate on the question—That the Bill be now read a second time—

Debate resumed.

Question—put and passed—Bill read a second time.

Leave granted for the question on the report to be put forthwith.

Question—That the Bill be reported to the House without amendment—put and passed.

### 4 AGRICULTURE, FISHERIES AND FORESTRY LEGISLATION AMENDMENT BILL (NO. 2) 1998

The order of the day having been read for the resumption of the debate on the question—That the Bill be now read a second time—

Debate resumed.

Question-put and passed-Bill read a second time.

Leave granted for the question on the report to be put forthwith.

Question—That the Bill be reported to the House without amendment—put and passed.

#### 5 MOTOR VEHICLE STANDARDS AMENDMENT BILL 1998

The order of the day having been read for the resumption of the debate on the question—That the Bill be now read a second time—

Debate resumed.

Question—put and passed—Bill read a second time.

Leave granted for the question on the report to be put forthwith.

Question—That the Bill be reported to the House without amendment—put and passed.

## 6 INDUSTRY RESEARCH AND DEVELOPMENT AMENDMENT BILL 1998

The order of the day having been read for the resumption of the debate on the question—That the Bill be now read a second time—

Debate having been resumed by Mr McMullan-

## 7 ADJOURNMENT

It being 12.30 p.m.—The question was proposed—That the Main Committee do now adjourn.

.

Debate ensued.

At 1 p.m. the Deputy Speaker adjourned the Main Committee.

**B. C. WRIGHT** Clerk of the Main Committee