

Williamstown Contamination Expert Panel Meeting #1

23 September 2015 – 2-3 pm

OCSE, Level 47 – Jumbunna and Eora Room – MLC Centre

19 Martin Place, Sydney

Attendees

- Mary O’Kane, Chair - NSW Chief Scientist and Engineer
- Edward Jansson, Acting Director - Food Science and Strategy (NSW Food Authority)
- Wayne Smith, Director - Environmental Health Branch (NSW Health)
- Doug Ferrell , Director – Fisheries Analysis (DPI – Fisheries)
- Anna Bailey, Acting Director - Groundwater Management (DPI – Water) (phone)
- Adam Gilligan, EPA Manager – Hunter Region (EPA – Regional Office)
- Craig Lamberton, EPA Direction – Hazardous Incidents and Environmental Health (EPA – Contaminated Sites)
- Darren Cleary - Chief Operating Officer (Hunter Water Corporation)
- Klaus Koop – Director Environment Protection Science Branch (Expert in environmental toxicology)
- Matthew James, EPA Acting Head Non-metro Contaminated Sites Unit (Secretary)
- David Durrheim, Director Health Protection, NSW Health
- Chris Armstrong, Director, NSW Government Chief Scientist
- Bill Tatnell, Regional Coordinator Hunter, DPC
- Lauren Spring, Operations Officer, EPA
- Nelma Akhund, Snr Operational Policy Officer, EPA

Note: Alison Jones – Executive Dean, Professor (Expert in clinical toxicology) was not required/attend but was available

Minutes

1. Welcome and Introduction

Welcome by the Expert Panel Chair, Mary O’Kane

Introduction Presentation: Overview of the EPA’s regulation of legacy contamination and issues related to emerging contaminants. (*Attachment 1*)

An overview of PFOS/PFOA as a persistent and emerging contaminant was provided by NSW Health. Limited human health toxicology data for these emerging chemicals. Members noted the primary pathway for human exposure is via drinking water and the consumption of fish. The current precautionary closures are based on preliminary risk assessment screening of information

recently provided and indicates there are pathways to tolerable daily intake exceedances. A precautionary principle has been taken in this context.

2. Terms of Reference and Expert Panel Membership

Members noted the ToR announced by the Government, and the nominated representatives.

Members agreed subcommittees of the Expert Panel are required to complete specialised tasks, consult with independent experts and report recommendations back to the Expert Panel for consideration. Subcommittee membership and a protocol will need to be established as tasks become clearer.

The Panel considered that the participation of Defence and its consultants would be valuable in maintaining clear communication, and whilst not a formal member of the Panel, Defence and AECOM should be invited to attend on an 'as required' basis as observers.

The Panel confirmed Prof Alison Jones as the Clinical Toxicologist, and suggested approaching an Environmental Toxicologist for membership. FASANZ to be invited to contribute on the Panel. The Panel would seek a hydrologist with expertise in groundwater dynamics in the Williamstown region. DPI- Ag should provide a departmental representative.

The TOR and recent correspondence from the NSW Government to Defence in relation to the further investigations required, along with the final minutes of the Expert Panel should be hosted on the EPA website.

ACTION 1: Hunter Water, DPI and EPA to investigate a suitable Hydrologist and report back to the Panel. DPI – Foodsafe to invite FASANZ to contribute. EPA to post required documents on its website. DPI – Ag to provide a representative.

3. Community Consultation

A Community Reference Group (CRG) is being formed to provide a liaison mechanism with the local community. The draft terms of reference for the CRG is currently being finalised (*Attachment 2*). Members noted the first meeting is on the 1st October with a subsequent meeting on the 8th October. There may be an opportunity to have a joint-meeting with the Expert Panel and the CRG on the 8th October.

In order to receive community feedback there should be further investigation into using the 'Have Your Say' webpage or similar. This feedback mechanism would enhance other existing mechanisms such as the Defence Hotline and existing agency call centres.

It was agreed that a "Response Plan" summarising actions being taken by Commonwealth, Council and NSW agencies would be valuable.

ACTION 2: EPA and DPC to investigate the best mechanism to collect community feedback for Williamstown t such as through the 'Have Your Say' web page, and to progress a Response Plan of current actions.

4. Compensation

Members agreed that the “polluter pays” principle should apply and there should be further discussions with the Department of Defence outside of the Panel to expedite their assistance to the affected community.

ACTION 3: DPC, EPA and DPI to investigate compensation issues outside of the Panel.

5. Incoming NSW Sampling Results

a. Biota

Members noted one round of oyster sampling results has been received. Further biota and oyster sampling, including control samples have been collected. It is considered that an appropriate amount of biota and oysters have been sampled, pending results from the external laboratories.

One bore water sample has been received with another sample taken to confirm results.

Defence/AECOM has committed to delivering their draft Sampling Plan (SAQP) to EPA by 2nd October 2015.

Members noted the commercial oyster and fishing industry is affected by the precautionary closures and where possible early advice on the future of the closures is highly desirable.

The first round of oyster sampling results have been received and presented to the Expert Panel by DPI. It was agreed a sub-group of DPI, Foodsafe, NSW Health and Prof Alison Jones would review the results and provide recommendations, (including relevant standards for ecosystem protection and human consumption), back to the Expert Panel for consideration at its next meeting. The sub-group would also develop some commentary around the interpretation of the results, further investigation needs and public messaging of any recommendations.

The oyster depuration study will also contribute to the understanding of the fate of PFCs, and these results should be available in October.

ACTION 4: Oyster Subcommittee to write a report to provide advice in relation to oyster consumption and recommendations in relation to the interim oyster ban. (developed for Friday 25th)

b. Surface Water

Members noted sampling results of surface waters can be highly variable due to influence of local rainfall events and interaction with groundwater. Members agreed an expert hydrologist is required to assess the water movement in the area to assist with contaminant fate and transport modelling. The Stage II URS report has very little data on surface water.

ACTION 5: EPA to work with DPI and HWC in undertaking surface water sampling within the investigation area.

6. Other Business

a. Blood Testing

Members noted that some members of the community had been requesting health assessment and blood tests for PFOS. NSW Health advised that overseas studies had indicated that low levels of PFOS could be found in most of the population and that it considers that blood testing has no diagnostic value and that this is no viable methodology to test for the exposure of PFOS/PFOA in

humans. Prof. Wayne Smith and Prof Alison Jones to prepare a brief paper on this for the next meeting. The FAQs from NSW Health would address this issue.

ACTION 6: NSW Health and Prof Alison Jones to prepare a short paper for the next Panel meeting.

b. NATA Accreditation

Members noted that there may be limitations on the NATA accreditation of laboratories for PFOS. The OEH representative to provide advice on suitable methodology and laboratories for these analyses.

ACTION 7: OEH to investigate NATA accreditation and methodology for the PFC analysis, providing a paper for the next meeting.

c. Regulation

The Panel noted the EPA is considering the legal viability of issuing a Cleanup Notice under the POEO Act to Defence to expedite the implementation of controls to prevent ongoing migration of PFCs from the Williamstown Base. The EPA would be seeking the Panel's input to such decisions.

7. Forward Agenda – next meeting

Next meeting date confirmed for Wednesday 30 September 2015. This will be held in MLC Centre at 9:00 am. The subsequent meeting would be on Friday 2 October at 0900.

WILLIAMTOWN CONTAMINATION EXPERT PANEL MEETING #2

Final – Meeting Minutes/Actions

OSCE, Level 47 – MLC Centre, 19 Martin Place Sydney

30 September 2015, 09:00 – 10:15

Chair: Mary O’Kane (NSW Chief Scientist and Engineer)

Attendees:

Office of the NSW Chief Scientist and Engineer					
Attendee	Present	Attendee	Present	Attendee	Present
Mary O’Kane	√	Chris Armstrong	√	Justin Walker	√
Jacyn Aldenhoven	√				
Environment Protection Authority					
Craig Lamberton	√	Lauren Spring	√	Nelma Akhund	
Adam Gilligan	√	Liza Cassidy		Luke Formosa	√
Matthew James		Laura Wythes	√	Jeremy Hillman	√
Office of Environment and Heritage					
Klaus Koop	√				
Department of Primary Industries					
Doug Ferrell (Fisheries)	√	Bruce Cooper (Water)	√	Anna Bailey	√
NSW Health					
Wayne Smith	√	David Durrheim (HNEH)	√		
Hunter Water					
Darren Cleary	√				
NSW Food Authority					
Edward Jansson	√				
Department of Premier and Cabinet					
Bill Tatnell	√	Jodie Calvert			
University of Wollongong					
Alison Jones	√				
Animal Biosecurity and Welfare					
Ian Roth	√				

1. **Agenda - Confirmation of Actions**

Action Number	Action Item	Responsible for Action
1	<p>Suggestion to appoint a hydrologist to the expert panel.</p> <p>Potential names have been put forward for a proposed hydrology working group of which one person would be the nominated representative on the Expert Panel. A final list of hydrologists is being compiled and will be reviewed with selection finalised for Friday Panel meeting #3.</p>	CSE
2	<p><i>A proposed mechanism to collect community feedback was "Have Your Say" web page was discussed.</i></p> <p>Expert Panel determined that a common email address for community feedback be placed on the CSE, EPA & other relevant agencies' websites.</p> <p>Suggestion to put a feedback mechanism button on Chief Scientist & Engineer website, as another avenue for community to make enquiries. Currently, the community is not satisfied with the Defence enquiry line.</p>	EPA, CSE
2a	<p>All government websites should cross reference with important issues and links available for the community.</p> <p>Response Plan to be drafted with current actions</p> <p>Response Plan will be updated after each expert panel meeting to establish a strategic plan which the community can be update.</p>	
3	<p>Investigate compensation issues with Defence</p> <p>EPA sent a compensation document to Defence to assist them with the process. DPI-F have also been providing input on these matters.</p> <p>Port Stephen Council has raised the issue of Section 149 planning certificates to do with ground contamination from land affected by PFOS/PFOA and PFCs. Local government seeking legal advice on liabilities.</p>	DPC, EPA and DPI
4	<p>Oyster Subcommittee to write a report (Completed)</p> <p>The report has been complete and indicates that PFOS/PFOA levels in oysters are well below screening levels. It was agreed by the Panel that the oysters from the Tilligerry Creek Harvest Area do not present a food safety risk. Potential ongoing oyster monitoring for the next six months was discussed.</p> <p>The primary concern with oysters is to do with the reputation of the oyster industry and not the health effects from consumption, as the PFOS/PFOA levels are negligible.</p>	DPI-F, EPA
4a	<p>Arrange meetings with the Local Port Stephens Oyster Farmers and the NSW Shellfish community to assist in the decision making process regarding ban and suspension issues.</p>	

Action Number	Action Item	Responsible for Action
4b	<p>The Panel endorses the guideline levels of the paper and it was pointed out by Alison Jones that the development of the TDI limit has a safety margin built into the assessment.</p> <p>Paper to be developed that summarises the different standards and guidelines.</p>	
5	<p>EPA to work with DPI and HWC in undertaking surface water sampling within the investigation area (Completed).</p> <p>EPA has deployed the sampling team on the 29 September 2015 to obtain surface water samples and Hunter Water has conducted further sampling and analysis on two groundwater bores. Results to be provided to the Panel.</p>	N/A
6	<p>OEH to investigate NATA accreditation and methodology for the PFC analysis, providing a paper for the next meeting (Completed).</p> <p>Findings from paper.</p> <p>At present, there are no NATA accredited laboratories for testing PFOS/PFOA & PFCs in biota, but there are experienced laboratories using the most up to date techniques and measuring equipment in line with best practice and in the process of achieving NATA accreditation.</p>	N/A
7	<p>Blood testing – Public Statement</p> <p>Information available indicates blood testing of people who may have been exposed to PFOS/PFOA is not an appropriate diagnostic tool. Blood samples for other analytes such as lead is appropriate, but this does not carry over with PFOS/PFOA.</p> <p>This should be validated by an independent health expert and a statement explaining this made public.</p>	NSW Health, Alison Jones
8	<p>Incoming Sampling Results</p> <p>More certainty on the contamination issues with fish is required. Preliminary data suggests contaminant concentrations are higher in the fish samples.</p> <p>More DPI-F samples expected by Friday for the expert panel.</p> <p>The EPA has been collecting the sampling points and is making it available on a map and made available to everyone.</p> <p>The EPA has been assessing other sites which may have similar PFOS/PFOA contamination issues and will obtaining biota samples from Port Botany for analysis.</p>	DPI Food Authority
9	<p>Community meeting taking place 30.09.15 being led by one of the community members. NSW government agencies attending the meeting include EPA, Hunter Water and DPI Fisheries.</p>	All



Action Number	Action Item	Responsible for Action
	The "Williamtown Contamination Investigation Community Reference Group" meeting taking place 01.10.15.	



**WILLIAMTOWN CONTAMINATION
EXPERT PANEL MEETING #3**

Final – Meeting Minutes/Actions

OSCE, Level 47 – MLC Centre, 19 Martin Place Sydney

2 October 2015, 09:00 – 10:30

Chair: Mary O’Kane (NSW Chief Scientist and Engineer)

Attendees:

Office of the NSW Chief Scientist and Engineer					
Attendee	Present	Attendee	Present	Attendee	Present
Mary O’Kane	√	Chris Armstrong	√	Justin Walker	
Jacyn Aldenhoven	√	Troy Deighton	√		
Environment Protection Authority					
Craig Lamberton	√	Lauren Spring	√	Matthew James	
Adam Gilligan	√	Liza Cassidy		Luke Formosa	√
Laura Wythes		Jeremy Hillman	√		√
Office of Environment and Heritage					
Klaus Koop	√				
Department of Primary Industries					
Doug Ferrell (Fisheries)	√	Bruce Cooper (Water)	√	Anna Bailey	
NSW Health					
Wayne Smith	√	David Durrheim (HNEH)	√		
Hunter Water					
Darren Cleary	√				
NSW Food Authority					
Edward Jansson	√				
Department of Premier and Cabinet					
Bill Tatnell	√	Jodie Calvert			
University of Wollongong					
Alison Jones					
Animal Biosecurity and Welfare					
Ian Roth					

1. Agenda - Confirmation of Actions

Minutes of Meeting No. 2 adopted unanimously following minor amendment from the Panel.

2. Actions Arising

Action Number	Action Item	Responsible for Action
1	<p><i>Suggestion to appoint a hydrologist to the expert panel.</i></p> <p>The Panel considered candidates for a proposed hydrology working group and the nomination for the Hydrology representative on the Expert Panel.</p> <p>The EPA to approach the recommended nominees to ascertain their availability to participate.</p> <p>The first meeting of the Water Subcommittee is tentatively scheduled before the Expert Panel meeting on 8 October.</p>	OCSE (Chris), EPA (Lauren)
2	<p><i>A proposed mechanism to collect community feedback was “Have Your Say” web page.</i></p> <p>The feedback mechanism will be developed on the Office of NSW Chief Scientist and Engineer (OCSE) website and linked to the Community Reference Group (CRG) website, with all information to be cross referenced.</p> <p>Communications departments from the EPA and the OCSE to organise implementing this feedback mechanism.</p> <p><i>Response Plan to be updated</i></p> <p>The response plan has been developed and currently awaiting comments from the Panel for finalisation. Where relevant the Response Plan to be updated with new items arising from the recent community meeting and CRG.</p>	EPA (Jeremy), OCSE (Troy)
2a		
3	<p><i>Investigate compensation issues with Defence.</i></p> <p>Awaiting feedback from Defence regarding the compensation framework provided by the EPA.</p>	EPA (Craig)
4	<p><i>Oyster Sampling Program.</i></p> <p>The Panel noted feedback from a meeting between the local Port Stephens Oyster Farmers and the NSW Shellfish Committee.</p> <p>In the light of the Oyster results and feedback from the industry, the Panel recommended that the current harvesting closure not be extended.</p> <p>The Panel further recommended that a sampling program be continued on a monthly basis for six months, with updates being provided by DPI- Fisheries/ NSW Food Authority.</p> <p>The draft monitoring results paper considered at the previous meeting should be updated with advice on standard selection and the agreed outcomes.</p>	EPA, DPI Food Authority

Action Number	Action Item	Responsible for Action
5	<p>Additional information on Blood Testing FAQ sheet.</p> <p>The Panel noted a draft FAQ developed by Alison Jones and NSW Health addressing blood testing for PFOS/PFOA and answers a number of common community concerns.</p> <p>Members noted there are challenges relating to community perceptions of the value of baseline blood testing. These should be addressed in an update response, acknowledging that screening tests are more relevant for some contaminants than others.</p> <p>NSW Health will upload this document on their website and a link provided by the EPA for reference.</p>	NSW Health
6	<p>Fish Sampling Results – Development of a broader fisheries sampling plan</p> <p>Members noted preliminary sampling results for a number of species in Fullerton Cover and Tilligary Creek.</p> <p>Members noted there were some marked interspecies differences, and in the absence of a more complete data, it was recommended that the current precautionary closures remain in place.</p> <p>Members agreed that the fish data be written up into a format similar to Oysters, encompassing discussion on standard selection and future sampling strategy in adjacent and other areas of potential impact.</p> <p>The Panel discussed meeting with the fishery industry and get their input and answer questions.</p>	NSW Food Authority, DPI Fisheries, NSW Health
6a	<p>Hydrology Subcommittee to develop a paper regarding risk assessments for regional water authorities and a broader program for PFOS contamination.</p> <p>The Panel considered that other regional water authorities may consider conducting their own risk assessments regarding PFOS and PFOA in water.</p> <p>The Panel also recommended that a risk-based approach be considered in relation to expanding the focus to other potentially affected catchments.</p> <p>These items should be a consideration by the Hydrology subcommittee for advice to the panel</p>	Hydrology Subcommittee

WILLIAMTOWN CONTAMINATION EXPERT PANEL MEETING #4

Meeting Minutes/Actions

Newcastle Airport Boardroom

8 October 2015, 1230 – 1400

IN ATTENDANCE

Members of the Expert Panel

Professor Mary O’Kane Chair	NSW Chief Scientist and Engineer
Craig Lamberton	Director – Hazardous Incidents and Environmental Health NSW Environment Protection Authority
Wayne Smith	Director – Environmental Health Branch NSW Health
Professor David Durrheim	Director - Health Protection, Hunter New England Health; Conjoint Professor of Public Health Medicine - University of Newcastle
Edward Jansson	Acting Director – Food Science and Strategy NSW Food Authority
Doug Ferrell	Director – Fisheries Analysis Department of Primary Industries – Fisheries
Bruce Cooper	Deputy Commissioner, Water Resource Assessment & Management, Department of Primary Industries
Anna Bailey	Acting Director – Groundwater Management Department of Primary Industries – Water
Adam Gilligan,	Manager – Hunter Region NSW Environment Protection Authority
Derek Elmes	A/Director – Environment Protection Science Branch NSW Office of Environment and Heritage, Representing Klaus Koop, Director – Environment Protection Science Branch
Bill Tatnell	Senior Regional Coordinator NSW Department of Premier and Cabinet
Ian Roth	Chief Veterinary Officer, Department of Primary Industry
Darren Cleary	Chief Operating Officer, Hunter Water Corporation
Brendan Berghout	Hydrologist, Hunter Water Corporation
Therese Manning TBC	Consulting eco-toxicologist, Principal, ENRisks

Secretary to the Expert Panel: **Laura Wythes**, Incident Co-ordinator NSW EPA

By invitation / observers

The Hon. Mark Speakman, SC MP	Minister for the Environment, Minister for Heritage, and Assistant Minister for Planning
Christian Dunk	Policy Advisor, Office of Mark Speakman
Professor Mark Taylor	Department of Environmental Sciences, Macquarie University
Barry Buffier	Chair and Chief Executive NSW Environmental Protection Authority
Chris Armstrong	Director, Office of the Chief Scientist and Engineer
Troy Deighton	Media Liaison, Office of NSW Chief Scientist and Engineer
Michael Norris	Office of NSW Chief Scientist and Engineer
Matt James	Head of Regulation Unit – Non-metropolitan Contaminated Sites, NSW EPA
Jeremy Hillman	Media Liaison, NSW EPA

1. Agenda – Welcome and Confirmation of Actions

Introductions and opening remarks by The Hon. Mark Speakman.

Adoption of Therese Manning with appointment to the Expert Panel as an expert Ecotoxicologist

Adoption of Dr Brendan Berghout as interim Hydrologist on the Expert Panel as a representative from the Water Working Group.

Minutes of Meeting No. 2 and 3 adopted unanimously by the Panel.

2. Actions Arising

Action Number	Action Item	Responsible for Action
1	<p><i>Suggestion to appoint a hydrologist to the expert panel.</i></p> <p>The first meeting of the Water Working Group was conducted on the 8 October. The Terms of Reference for the group and action items have been drafted.</p> <p>A final candidate will be approached shortly to fill the chair of the group and report to the panel as a member.</p>	Completed
2	<p><i>A proposed mechanism to collect community feedback</i></p> <p>The EPA, DPC & OCSE have developed a community feedback form to address community concern and inform the Expert Panel and to coordinate agency responses. Linked to Community Reference Group (CRG) website. These contact sites are on the OCSE and EPA websites.</p>	Completed

Action Number	Action Item	Responsible for Action
3	<p>Response Plan to be updated</p> <p>An updated Response Plan has been developed and provided to the panel for ongoing input.</p> <p>Where relevant the Response Plan to be updated with new items arising from the CRG.</p>	<p>All members</p> <p>EPA & DPC</p>
4	<p>Investigate compensation issues with Defence.</p> <p>Defence acknowledged receipt of compensation documentation.</p> <p>No further response has been received. Await feedback from Defence regarding the suggested compensation framework provided by the EPA on behalf of NSW government agencies.</p>	<p>Defence</p>
5	<p>Oyster Sampling Program – Updated Paper</p> <p>The Panel considered an updated monitoring results paper which included a recommended oyster sampling program for the next six months.</p> <p>Panel to provide feedback regarding the updated report prior to finalisation.</p> <p>Additionally, the results of the depuration trials had been received and the data to be compiled for consideration by the Panel.</p>	<p>All members</p> <p>EPA, Food Authority</p>
6	<p>Additional information on Blood Testing FAQ sheet.</p> <p>This documentation has been uploaded by NSW Health on their website and a link provided from the EPA for reference.</p> <p>The updated document to be provided for discussion at the next Community Reference Meeting</p>	<p>DPC</p>
7	<p>Fish Sampling Results – Development of a broader fisheries sampling plan</p> <p>No further sampling results have been received.</p> <p>DPI Fisheries met with the fishing industry and discussed the results and the extension of the suspension.</p> <p>The future sampling strategy is being developed in adjacent and other areas of potential impact.</p>	<p>NSW Food Authority, DPI Fisheries, NSW Health</p>
8	<p>Water Working Group to develop a paper regarding risk assessments for water authorities of potential PFOS/PFOA contamination.</p> <p>The Water Working Group met for the first time on the 8 October 2015.</p> <p>This item was raised with the Water Working Group for advice to be provided to the panel, and will be discussed at subsequent meetings.</p>	<p>Water Working Group</p>
9	<p>Sampling Strategy (AECOM, 2015)</p> <p>A sampling strategy was provided by AECOM on behalf of Defence.</p>	<p>All</p>

Action Number	Action Item	Responsible for Action
	<p>Defence have been invited to the Expert Panel meeting #5 to present their sampling strategy and progress on the HHRA.</p> <p>The Panel agreed that the document requires further review from the Water Working Group and a new subgroup, the Risk Assessment Working Group.</p>	
10	<p>Surface Water Sampling</p> <p>Preliminary surface water sampling results were received on the 8 October and presented to the Panel.</p> <p>The Panel endorsed the decision to extend the investigation boundary based on the results of the surface water sampling results. The map of the investigation area was updated and a draft announcement of this extension was developed by the Panel.</p>	Completed
11	<p>Risk Assessment Working Group</p> <p>The Panel discussed the requirement for a comprehensive risk assessment and considered the Williamstown PFC Human Health Screening Limits report. It was agreed that subject to any further feedback out of session, these criteria will be used for initial assessment work.</p> <p>It was agreed by the Panel that a Risk Assessment Working Group should be set up to consider the requirements regarding an appropriate risk assessment. The Group would be Chaired by NSW Health (Wayne Smith) and Co-Chaired by EPA (Craig Lamberton).</p> <p>This group would initially review the AECOM Sampling Strategy to compile an appropriate response for Defence.</p>	Completed
12	<p>Animal Biosecurity and Welfare – Development of sampling program</p> <p>The Panel discussed development of a program to collect and analyse the eggs and milk within the investigation area and address other foodstuffs raised by the Community.</p> <p>The community raised the issue regarding disposal of the eggs and milk. Consider and update the Q&A's to inform the community.</p>	Completed
13	<p>Community Consultation</p> <p>Feedback from the community suggests that alternative forms of communication should be made available rather than just the website and information page.</p> <p>They support the idea of the local CRG event to provide advice and support to the community.</p> <p>The Response Plan to be updated with consideration to the community issues register.</p>	<p>DPC, EPA, NSW Health</p> <p>Completed</p>



WILLIAMTOWN CONTAMINATION EXPERT PANEL MEETING #5

Meeting Minutes/Actions

EPA Boardroom

14 October 2015, 0930 – 11.15

IN ATTENDANCE

Members of the Expert Panel

Craig Lamberton (Acting Chair)	Director – Hazardous Incidents and Environmental Health NSW Environment Protection Authority
Wayne Smith	Director – Environmental Health Branch, NSW Health Conjoint Professor of Epidemiology, University of Newcastle Honorary Professor of Public Health, University of Sydney
Professor David Durrheim (part attended)	Director - Health Protection, Hunter New England Health Conjoint Professor of Public Health Medicine - University of Newcastle
Dr Tony Merritt (alternate)	Public Health physician, Hunter New England Population Health Representing Professor David Durrheim – Hunter New England Health
Edward Jansson	Acting Director – Food Science and Strategy NSW Food Authority
Professor Alison Jones	Executive Dean - Faculty of Science Medicine and Health, University of Wollongong; Deputy Executive Director of the Illawarra Health and Medical Research Institute
Doug Ferrell	Director – Fisheries Analysis Department of Primary Industries – Fisheries
Anna Bailey	Acting Director – Groundwater Management Department of Primary Industries – Water
Adam Gilligan,	Manager – Hunter Region NSW Environment Protection Authority
Derek Elmes (alternate)	A/Director – Environment Protection Science Branch NSW Office of Environment and Heritage Representing Klaus Koop, Director – Environment Protection Science Branch
Bill Tatnell	Senior Regional Coordinator NSW Department of Premier and Cabinet
Darren Cleary	Chief Operating Officer, Hunter Water Corporation
Therese Manning	Consulting eco-toxicologist, Principal, ENRisks
Dr William Glamore TBC	Principal Research Fellow at the Water Research Laboratory in the School of Civil and Environmental Engineering, University of New South Wales

Secretary to the Expert Panel: **Laura Wythes**, Incident Co-ordinator NSW EPA

Apologies

Professor Mary O’Kane Chair	NSW Chief Scientist and Engineer
Bruce Cooper	Deputy Commissioner, Water Resource Assessment & Management Department of Primary Industries
Ian Roth	Chief Veterinary Officer, Department of Primary Industry
Brendan Berghout	Hydrologist, Hunter Water Corporation

By invitation / observers

Vicki Pearce	Department of Defence
Alison Clifton	Department of Defence
Geoff Tredinnick	Sampling Co-ordination Contaminated Sites, NSW EPA
Kyle Horner	Hydrogeologist, Coal seam Gas Unit, NSW EPA
Chris Armstrong	Director, Office of NSW Chief Scientist and Engineer
Justin Walker	Office of NSW Chief Scientist and Engineer
Matt James	Head of Regulation Unit – Non-metropolitan Contaminated Sites, NSW EPA
Jeremy Hillman	Media Liaison, NSW EPA

1. Agenda – Welcome and Confirmation of Actions

Introduction and opening remarks by acting Chair Craig Lamberton

Adoption of William Glamore, Principal Research Fellow (University of NSW), with appointment to the Expert Panel and Chair of the Water Working Group, as an expert hydrologist

Minutes of meeting no. 4 adopted unanimously by the Expert Panel.

2. Actions Arising

Action Number	Action Item	Responsible for Action
2	<p><i>A protocol for managing the community feedback forms is required</i></p> <p>Community feedback forms are now available online to address community concern and inform the expert panel. They are linked to OCSE and EPA websites. The Chief Scientist & Engineer’s website also has an email address to receive feedback from the community. The completed forms need a co-ordinated response to ensure that the information is appropriately recorded and acted on. A protocol to ensure this will be developed and presented to the Panel by 21 October 2015.</p>	EPA – Public Affairs

Action Number	Action Item	Responsible for Action
3	<p>Review of the draft response plan</p> <p>The draft plan was reviewed by the Expert Panel and amendments suggested. All Expert Panel members undertook to review the document and incorporate the feedback as required and present to the Expert Panel by 21 October 2015.</p>	EPA / DPC
5	<p>Oyster sampling program – updated paper</p> <p>The final review by the Expert Panel is to be completed by 15 October 2015 with Expert Panel members to provide final comments. The plan is to be finalised by 21 October 2015. The Expert Panel agreed that as a principle when raw data and maps are released they should be accompanied by an executive summary explaining the context to assist stakeholders and the wider community to interpret the maps and data.</p>	NSW Agencies
6	<p>Additional information on blood testing</p> <p>The Expert Panel concluded that greater awareness on the subject would be beneficial. It was agreed that DPC on behalf of NSW Health would distribute the FAQ sheet at the next meeting of the Community Reference Group. The Expert Panel’s clinical toxicology expert, Alison Jones, had supplied an article on the subject to the Newcastle Herald.</p>	NSW Health / DPC
7	<p>Fish sampling results – development of a broader fisheries sampling plan</p> <p>The Expert Panel concluded that the raw data required greater explanation and contextual information however the data release should not be delayed unreasonably. Summary information was to be prepared to accompany the data to ensure the wider community could reasonably assess the information. A protocol would be established to ensure data was presented in a consistent and easy to read format.</p>	DPI – Fisheries / NSW Food Authority
13	<p>Community engagement</p> <p>The Expert Panel acknowledged the importance of openly engaging with the community and the first of several planned informal “drop ins” is scheduled to take place on Friday 16 October at Salt Ash Public School, with more events both formal and informal intended for the coming weeks.</p> <p>A calendar of community engagement activities is being developed for the EPA website</p>	NSW Health / EPA – Hunter Region

Action Number	Action Item	Responsible for Action
14	<p><i>EPA to communicate to residents and businesses affected by the extension of the investigation zone</i></p> <p>It was identified that although local media and informal communications had taken place and Defence had contacted residents in the extended investigation area, this was incomplete so the EPA undertook to publish and distribute information to those living and working in the area by 16 October 2015.</p>	EPA – Hunter Region
15	<p><i>Animal biosecurity and welfare - livestock concerns</i></p> <p>A FAQ sheet on any potential effect on animals (livestock and pets) was to be provided to the Expert Panel by 21 October 2015</p>	DPI – Animal Biosecurity
16	<p><i>Defence to invite NSW Agencies to participate in community consultation taking place in October 2015</i></p> <p>Defence will undertake two community consultations in the week commencing Monday 19 October. The Expert Panel expressed a wish to participate and Defence agreed to invite members of the Expert Panel or their representatives to attend these consultations.</p>	Defence / NSW Agencies
17	<p><i>A protocol for managing ongoing engagement between the Expert Panel and its Working Groups and Defence and their contractors</i></p> <p>Discussion by Defence (Vicki Pearce and Alison Clifton) on the status of its sampling plan, their community engagement strategy and for its engagement between the Expert Panel and its Working Groups and Defence and its contractors. The Expert Panel resolved that it would welcome ongoing dialogue with Defence and would establish a protocol on how to manage this relationship.</p>	OCSE / EPA
18	<p><i>EPA to provide direction to Defence with a response to Defence's proposed sampling plan</i></p> <p>Defence updated the Expert Panel on the status of their plans to be in a position to commence sampling from 23 October and to seek NSW Agency and community input into their plans. The Expert Panel noted that the Health Risk Assessment and Water Working Groups had commenced drafting an outline of a sampling plan that would be necessary to support the Human Health Risk Assessment. The EPA undertook to provide sampling direction from the Working Groups to Defence by 21 October 2015.</p>	Water and Risk Assessment Working Group / EPA



Action Number	Action Item	Responsible for Action
19	<p><i>Expert Panel to invite Defence to present technical updates to the relevant Working Groups</i></p> <p>Defence have contracted with AECOM to provide technical services. The Expert Panel undertook to invite AECOM representatives to provide technical updates to the Water Working Group and the Risk Assessment Working Group by 31 October 2015.</p>	EPA / NSW Agencies

The next meeting was scheduled for Wednesday 21st October 2015 – 9:00am -10:30am, Conference Room Level 15, NSW EPA 59-61 Goulburn Street, Sydney



WILLIAMTOWN CONTAMINATION EXPERT PANEL MEETING #6

Meeting Minutes/Actions

EPA Conference Room, Level 15, 59 Goulburn Street, Sydney

21 October 2015, 9.00 – 11.30am

IN ATTENDANCE

Members of the Expert Panel

Mary O’Kane Chair	NSW Chief Scientist and Engineer
Craig Lamberton	Director – Hazardous Incidents and Environmental Health NSW Environment Protection Authority
Wayne Smith	Director – Environmental Health Branch, NSW Health Conjoint Professor of Epidemiology, University of Newcastle Honorary Professor of Public Health, University of Sydney
David Durrheim	Director - Health Protection, Hunter New England Health Conjoint Professor of Public Health Medicine - University of Newcastle
Edward Jansson	Acting Director – Food Science and Strategy NSW Food Authority
Matt Taylor (alternate)	Senior Research Scientist – Estuarine Fisheries - Department of Primary Industries
Anna Bailey	Acting Director – Groundwater Management Department of Primary Industries – Water
Klaus Koop	Director – Environment Protection Science Branch NSW Office of Environment and Heritage
Darren Cleary	Chief Operating Officer, Hunter Water Corporation
Therese Manning	Consulting eco-toxicologist, Principal, ENRisks
Bruce Cooper	Deputy Commissioner, Water Resource Assessment & Management Department of Primary Industries
William Glamore	Principal Research Fellow at the Water Research Laboratory in the School of Civil and Environmental Engineering, University of New South Wales
Bill Tatnell	Senior Regional Coordinator NSW Department of Premier and Cabinet
Adam Gilligan,	Manager – Hunter Region, NSW Environment Protection Authority

Secretaries to the Expert Panel: **Laura Wythes** Incident Co-ordinator & **Phil Rigby**, Snr Project Officer NSW EPA



Apologies

Alison Jones	Executive Dean - Faculty of Science Medicine and Health, University of Wollongong; Deputy Executive Director of the Illawarra Health and Medical Research Institute
Ian Roth	Chief Veterinary Officer, Department of Primary Industry
Brendan Berghout	Hydrologist, Hunter Water Corporation

1. Agenda – Welcome and Confirmation of Actions

Introduction and opening remarks by Chair Mary O’Kane

Minutes of meeting no. 5 adopted unanimously by the Expert Panel.

2. Decisions

Item number	Record of Decision
2	<i>A protocol for managing the community feedback forms is required</i> Discussed by the Panel. Panel decided that responses to be combined and evaluated and that EPA to provide a link to Office of NSW Chief Scientist & Engineer on EPA website.
3	<i>Review of the draft Response Plan</i> The NSW Government Response Plan was discussed by the Panel. The Panel decided than plan was appropriate for its purpose.
5	<i>Oyster sampling program – updated paper</i> The paper was reviewed by the Panel. The Panel’s decision was that with minor edits the paper should be released.
6	<i>Additional information on blood testing</i> The Panel’s decision was that the information currently available was appropriate but that ongoing attention to community issues should be given.
13	<i>Community engagement</i> The Panel considered recent engagement activities with the community. The Panel’s decision was work should continue on a calendar of community engagement activities for the EPA website.



Item number	Record of Decision
14	<p><i>A protocol for managing ongoing engagement between the Expert Panel and its Working Groups and Defence and their contractors</i></p> <p>The Panel decided that the most appropriate interaction with Defence and its contractors would be through the working groups (Risk Assessment WG and Water WG). The Panel noted that its remit was to advise the EPA and the EPA's efforts to interact with Defence.</p>
15	<p><i>Expert Panel to provide direction to EPA with a response to Defence's proposed sampling plan</i></p> <p>The Panel decision was that the Working Groups reports on water and risk assessment would be forwarded to the EPA to assist in its response to the investigation. The EPA needed to be able to provide further direction to Defence in writing by the week commencing 25th October 2015.</p>
16	<p><i>Expert Panel to invite Defence to present technical updates to the relevant Working Groups</i></p> <p>The Panel's decision was that the Working Group Chairs would be issuing invitations before the end of October 2015 to the technical expert representatives of Defence.</p>



WILLIAMTOWN CONTAMINATION EXPERT PANEL MEETING #7

Meeting Minutes/Actions

Lachlan Room, Level 21, 59 Goulburn Street, Sydney

22 October 2015, 01.15pm – 2.30pm

IN ATTENDANCE

Members of the Expert Panel

Mary O’Kane Chair	NSW Chief Scientist and Engineer
Craig Lamberton	Director – Hazardous Incidents and Environmental Health NSW Environment Protection Authority
Wayne Smith	Director – Environmental Health Branch, NSW Health Conjoint Professor of Epidemiology, University of Newcastle Honorary Professor of Public Health, University of Sydney
David Durrheim	Director - Health Protection, Hunter New England Health Conjoint Professor of Public Health Medicine - University of Newcastle
Edward Jansson	Acting Director – Food Science and Strategy NSW Food Authority
Matt Taylor (alternate)	Senior Research Scientist – Estuarine Fisheries - Department of Primary Industries
Anna Bailey	Acting Director – Groundwater Management Department of Primary Industries – Water
Klaus Koop	Director – Environment Protection Science Branch NSW Office of Environment and Heritage
Darren Cleary	Chief Operating Officer, Hunter Water Corporation
Therese Manning	Consulting eco-toxicologist, Principal, ENRisks
Bruce Cooper	Deputy Commissioner, Water Resource Assessment & Management Department of Primary Industries
William Glamore	Principal Research Fellow at the Water Research Laboratory in the School of Civil and Environmental Engineering, University of New South Wales
Alison Jones	Executive Dean - Faculty of Science Medicine and Health, University of Wollongong; Deputy Executive Director of the Illawarra Health and Medical Research Institute
Adam Gilligan,	Manager – Hunter Region NSW Environment Protection Authority
Bill Tatnell	Senior Regional Coordinator NSW Department of Premier and Cabinet

Secretaries to the Expert Panel: **Laura Wythes** Incident Co-ordinator & **Phil Rigby**, Snr Project Officer NSW EPA



Apologies

Ian Roth	Chief Veterinary Officer, Department of Primary Industry
Brendan Berghout	Hydrologist, Hunter Water Corporation

1. Agenda – Welcome and Confirmation of Actions

Introduction and opening remarks by Chair Mary O’Kane

2. Decisions

Item number	Record of Decision
22	<p><i>Review of the current suspension of commercial and recreational fishing</i></p> <p>The Panel considered the issues surrounding the temporary prohibition which currently expires on 31 October 2015. A decision to either allow the prohibition to lapse or to extend the prohibition is required. Consideration was also given to the duration of any potential extension to the prohibition. The Panel decided to defer the decision and take further advice on the matter and reconvene.</p>

The next meeting was scheduled for Monday 26th October 2015; time and location to be advised.



WILLIAMTOWN CONTAMINATION EXPERT PANEL MEETING #8

Meeting Minutes/Actions

Jumbunna room, Level 47, MLC Centre, 19 Martin Place, Sydney

26 October 2015, 5.00 – 6.30pm

IN ATTENDANCE

Members of the Expert Panel

Mary O’Kane Chair	NSW Chief Scientist and Engineer
Craig Lamberton	Director – Hazardous Incidents and Environmental Health NSW Environment Protection Authority
Wayne Smith	Director – Environmental Health Branch, NSW Health Conjoint Professor of Epidemiology, University of Newcastle Honorary Professor of Public Health, University of Sydney
David Durrheim	Director - Health Protection, Hunter New England Health Conjoint Professor of Public Health Medicine - University of Newcastle
Edward Jansson	Acting Director – Food Science and Strategy NSW Food Authority
Anna Bailey	Acting Director – Groundwater Management Department of Primary Industries – Water
Klaus Koop	Director – Environment Protection Science Branch NSW Office of Environment and Heritage
Darren Cleary	Chief Operating Officer, Hunter Water Corporation
Therese Manning	Consulting eco-toxicologist, Principal, ENRisks
Bruce Cooper	Deputy Commissioner, Water Resource Assessment & Management Department of Primary Industries
William Glamore	Principal Research Fellow at the Water Research Laboratory in the School of Civil and Environmental Engineering, University of New South Wales
Alison Jones	Executive Dean - Faculty of Science Medicine and Health, University of Wollongong; Deputy Executive Director of the Illawarra Health and Medical Research Institute
Adam Gilligan,	Manager – Hunter Region NSW Environment Protection Authority
Bill Tatnell	Senior Regional Coordinator NSW Department of Premier and Cabinet

Secretaries to the Expert Panel: **Laura Wythes** Incident Co-ordinator & **Phil Rigby**, Snr Project Officer, NSW EPA



Apologies

Ian Roth	Chief Veterinary Officer, Department of Primary Industry
Brendan Berghout	Hydrologist, Hunter Water Corporation
Matt Taylor (alternate)	Senior Research Scientist – Estuarine Fisheries - Department of Primary Industries

1. Agenda – Welcome and Confirmation of Actions

Introduction and opening remarks by Chair Mary O’Kane.

The Chair welcomed Dr Geoff Allan, Deputy Director General NSW Department of Primary Industries – Fisheries, and Dr Lisa Szabo, CEO Food Authority to the meeting.

2. Decisions

Item number	Record of Decision
22	<p><i>Review of the current suspension of commercial and recreational fishing</i></p> <p>The Panel further considered the issues surrounding the temporary prohibition which currently expires on 31 October 2015. The Panel’s decision was to advise the NSW EPA that the local fishing closure should be extended by eight months while a Human Health Risk Assessment is completed by Defence.</p>

The next meeting was scheduled for Wednesday 4th November 2015; time and location to be advised.



WILLIAMTOWN CONTAMINATION EXPERT PANEL MEETING #9

Meeting Minutes/Decisions

Hawkesbury Meeting Room, Level 17, 59 Goulburn Street, Sydney

4 November 2015, 10.00am – 12.00pm

IN ATTENDANCE

Members of the Expert Panel

Professor Mary O’Kane Chair	NSW Chief Scientist & Engineer
Craig Lamberton	Director – Hazardous Incidents and Environmental Health NSW Environment Protection Authority
Wayne Smith	Director – Environmental Health Branch, NSW Health Conjoint Professor of Epidemiology, University of Newcastle Honorary Professor of Public Health, University of Sydney
Professor David Durrheim	Director - Health Protection, Hunter New England Health Conjoint Professor of Public Health Medicine - University of Newcastle
Edward Jansson	Acting Director – Food Science and Strategy NSW Food Authority
Matt Taylor (alternate)	Senior Research Scientist – Estuarine Fisheries - Department of Primary Industries
Anna Bailey	Acting Director – Groundwater Management Department of Primary Industries – Water
Klaus Koop	Director – Environment Protection Science Branch NSW Office of Environment and Heritage
Darren Cleary	Chief Operating Officer, Hunter Water Corporation
Therese Manning	Consulting eco-toxicologist, Principal, ENRisks
Dr William Glamore	Principal Research Fellow at the Water Research Laboratory in the School of Civil and Environmental Engineering, University of New South Wales
Jodie Calvert	Assistant Regional Coordinator NSW Department of Premier and Cabinet
Adam Gilligan,	Manager – Hunter Region, NSW Environment Protection Authority
Professor Alison Jones	Executive Dean - Faculty of Science Medicine and Health, University of Wollongong; Deputy Executive Director of the Illawarra Health and Medical Research Institute
Tony Merritt	Public Health Physician Hunter New England LHD
Ian Roth	Chief Veterinary Officer, Department of Primary Industry

Secretaries to the Expert Panel: **Laura Wythes** Incident Co-ordinator & **Phil Rigby**, Snr Project Officer NSW EPA

Apologies

Bruce Cooper	Deputy Commissioner, Water Resource Assessment & Management Department of Primary Industries
---------------------	---

	Reference number
Agenda – Welcome and Confirmation of Actions	
The agenda was confirmed.	
Minutes of meeting	
Minutes of meeting nos. 6, 7 and 8 were adopted unanimously	
Updates – sampling results	
The Panel noted that due to time constraints the ground and surface water sampling and strategy being recommended by the Water Working Group is appropriate to inform the Health Risk Assessment in the first instance. The Panel recommended that the Water Working Group identify focus areas to assist in developing the terrestrial sampling regime within the HHRA and that DPI Biosecurity and the NSW Food Authority provide input into this additional advice for communication to Defence.	18
Updates – sampling results	
The Chair requested a summary paper from OEH, to be reviewed by the Working Groups, for the Expert Panel to inform the advice to the EPA on the issues of chain-of-custody, screening, sampling and testing standards and protocols before next Expert Panel meeting.	19
Updates – sign-off on Seafood Paper	
The Panel endorsed for release the Preliminary Dietary Exposure Assessment – Seafood – Tilligerry Creek and Fullerton Cove, Williamtown NSW Report via posting on the EPA website. The Panel requested it be accompanied by a caveat on the implications of evolving scientific understanding on the derivation of TDI levels. Further the Panel suggested that Food and DPI Fisheries would prepare a separate summary document for distribution to the local fishing industry.	21
Updates – Agencies	
After hearing the EPA’s summary of the advice from the Privacy Commissioner, the Panel decided to recommend to the EPA to release the Ground and Surface Water sampling result paper once the results had been communicated to the individuals or organisations involved.	22
Updates - Sampling results	
The Panel decided to recommend to the EPA that it would be beneficial to engage closely with the Commonwealth Department of Environment (DoE) on screening and sampling issues. The EPA undertook to continue its discussions with the DoE.	24

	Reference number
Updates - Defence response	
The Panel decided to engage with the Commonwealth Public Accounts Committee (PAC) reviewing Defence construction works at the Williamstown RAAF base.	25
Updates – Sampling results	
The Panel will review the results of the additional DPI Fisheries sampling and testing of prawns in the Hunter when the results are made available.	27
Updates – Community consultation issues arising	
The Panel noted that an excerpt from Section 5 of the Human Health Risk Assessment Scoping and Advice document will be provided at the next Community Reference Group (CRG) for getting information from the community on pathways for ingestion of PFOS/PFOA. The full document will be provided to the CRG at a following meeting, after Defence had an appropriate time to consider its response.	28
Working Groups reports – Water	
The Panel requested the Water Working Group to liaise with OEH about the implications of the proposed drain cleaning in the Williamstown area.	29
Expert Panel future work	
The Panel formed a subcommittee chaired by the Chair and include the Chairs of the Working Groups and any other Panel members who wish to participate to discuss what expert background papers should be commissioned to inform the work of the Panel going forward.	30
The Panel also discussed whether encouragement should be given more Australian research relevant to managing PFOS/PFOA contaminants.	
Other issues	
The Panel decided to adopt a common platform, Govdex, to share information between Members, relevant NSW Government Agencies, Working Groups and Secretariat services. Defence has indicated it will set up its own platform due to security issues.	26
Other issues	
The Panel discussed a request as to whether testing for the surfactant agent Methylene Blue Active Substances (MBAS) as well as PFOA and PFOS should be undertaken. The Panel sought a short paper on the issue.	31



WILLIAMTOWN CONTAMINATION EXPERT PANEL MEETING #10

Meeting Minutes/Decisions

Hawkesbury Meeting Room, Level 17, 59 Goulburn Street, Sydney

13 November 2015, 9.00am – 11.00am

IN ATTENDANCE

Members of the Expert Panel

Mary O’Kane Chair	NSW Chief Scientist & Engineer
Craig Lamberton	Director – Hazardous Incidents and Environmental Health NSW Environment Protection Authority
Wayne Smith	Director – Environmental Health Branch, NSW Health Conjoint Professor of Epidemiology, University of Newcastle Honorary Professor of Public Health, University of Sydney
Edward Jansson	Acting Director – Food Science and Strategy NSW Food Authority
Matt Taylor (alternate for Doug Ferrell)	Senior Research Scientist – Estuarine Fisheries - Department of Primary Industries
Anna Bailey	Acting Director – Groundwater Management Department of Primary Industries – Water
Klaus Koop	Director – Environment Protection Science Branch NSW Office of Environment and Heritage
Darren Cleary	Chief Operating Officer, Hunter Water Corporation
Jodie Calvert	Assistant Regional Coordinator NSW Department of Premier and Cabinet
Adam Gilligan	Manager – Hunter Region, NSW Environment Protection Authority
Alison Jones	Executive Dean - Faculty of Science Medicine and Health, University of Wollongong; Deputy Executive Director of the Illawarra Health and Medical Research Institute
Tony Merritt (alternate David Durrheim)	Public Health Physician Hunter New England LHD
Ian Roth	Chief Veterinary Officer, Department of Primary Industry
Bruce Cooper	Deputy Commissioner, Water Resource Assessment & Management Department of Primary Industries

Secretaries to the Expert Panel: **Laura Wythes** Incident Co-ordinator & **Phil Rigby**, Snr Project Officer NSW EPA

Apologies

Therese Manning	Consulting eco-toxicologist, Principal, ENRisks
William Glamore	Principal Research Fellow at the Water Research Laboratory in the School of Civil and Environmental Engineering, University of New South Wales
Doug Ferrell	Director – Fisheries Analysis, Department of Primary Industries
David Durrheim	Director - Health Protection, Hunter New England Health Conjoint Professor of Public Health Medicine - University of Newcastle

	Reference number
1. Agenda – Welcome and Confirmation of Actions	
The agenda was confirmed unanimously.	
2. Minutes of meeting	
Minutes of meeting no. 9 were adopted unanimously with a minor edit.	
3. Actions arising	
The EPA undertook on the advice of the Panel to compile a summary of locations in NSW where foam firefighting drills are known to have been used regularly, including Fire and Rescue NSW, Air Services Australia, the NSW Rural Fire Service and the Department of Defence (DoD).	32
3. Actions arising	
Blood testing requests remained an issue with NMI now receiving requests from members of the public to test blood and other materials. The Panel suggested NSW Health contact NMI and provide advice on NSW Health's position on the value of testing for PFOS and PFOA in human blood and other matter.	6
4. Updates – Community Reference Group issues arising	
Dewatering at the RAAF Williamstown base was concerning residents. No response yet from DoD on construction Environmental Management Plan or onsite access for inspection.	33
4. Updates – Community Reference Group issues arising	
The Panel noted that the Chair and other members of Panel would attend the next drop in event at Salt Ash School on Thursday 19th November	2
4. Updates – Agencies	
The EPA has begun to release the Groundwater sampling results now that they have been communicated to the individuals or organisations involved.	4

	Reference number
4. Updates - Defence response	
The Panel noted that there was a financial package for fishers but that the rest of the community, particularly small businesses, were getting no assistance from DoD. The Panel recommended the EPA encourage the Small Business Office and its Commissioner to engage with the Williamstown community.	3
4. Updates – Community consultation issues arising	
The Panel decided that the full Human Health Risk Assessment Scoping and Advice document would be provided to the CRG at its next meeting.	28
5. Working Groups reports – Risk Assessment	
The Panel discussed the Methylene Blue Active Substances (MBAS) paper developed by Therese Manning. The Panel concluded that testing for MBAS was a good method for initial screening and identifying if more analysis was needed but had little value as a diagnostic tool.	31
5. Working Groups reports – Risk Assessment	
It was noted that DoD had not been able to bring its experts to a meeting of the subcommittee yet. It was noted that NSW Health will be hosting an enHealth forum on the 11 December 2015 to discuss developments in the assessment of PFOS & PFOA and to look at establishing a national process for identifying human health issues relating to them. The Working Group will make its recommendations on appropriate health standards including tolerable daily intakes (TDIs) to the Panel following the enHealth meeting. The HRA by Air Services Australia was to be forwarded to the RA Working Group for review and any further actions.	34
6. Expert Panel future work	
The Commissioned Papers Subcommittee subgroup met on Thursday 12 November 2015. It was noted that a water treatment paper would be commissioned immediately and an expert had been identified. Decisions on other papers to be commissioned would follow.	30
7. Date, time and location of next meeting	
The Panel agreed that the next meeting should be held on Wednesday 25th at Level 51 MLC Building, Martin Place at 9:00 am.	

**WILLIAMTOWN CONTAMINATION
EXPERT PANEL MEETING #11**

Meeting Minutes

Board Room, Level 51, 19 Martin Place, Sydney

25 November 2015, 9.00am – 11.00am

IN ATTENDANCE

Members of the Expert Panel

Mary O’Kane Chair	NSW Chief Scientist & Engineer
Craig Lamberton	Director – Hazardous Incidents and Environmental Health NSW Environment Protection Authority
Wayne Smith	Director – Environmental Health Branch, NSW Health
Edward Jansson	Acting Director – Food Science and Strategy NSW Food Authority
Klaus Koop	Director – Environment Protection Science Branch NSW Office of Environment and Heritage
Adam Gilligan	Manager – Hunter Region, NSW Environment Protection Authority
Tony Merritt (alternate David Durrheim)	Public Health Physician Hunter New England LHD
Bruce Cooper	Deputy Commissioner, Water Resource Assessment & Management Department of Primary Industries
Therese Manning	Consulting eco-toxicologist, Principal, ENRisks
William Glamore	Principal Research Fellow at the Water Research Laboratory in the School of Civil and Environmental Engineering, University of New South Wales
Doug Ferrell	Director – Fisheries Analysis, Department of Primary Industries

Secretaries to the Expert Panel: **Laura Wythes** Incident Co-ordinator & **Phil Rigby**, Snr Project Officer NSW EPA

Apologies

David Durrheim	Director - Health Protection, Hunter New England Health Conjoint Professor of Public Health Medicine - University of Newcastle
Alison Jones	Executive Dean - Faculty of Science Medicine and Health, University of Wollongong
Ian Roth	Chief Veterinary Officer, Department of Primary Industry
Darren Cleary	Chief Operating Officer, Hunter Water Corporation
Anna Bailey	Acting Director – Groundwater Management Department of Primary Industries – Water
Jodie Calvert	Assistant Regional Coordinator NSW Department of Premier and Cabinet

	Reference number
1. Agenda – Welcome and Confirmation of Actions	
The agenda was confirmed unanimously.	
2. Minutes of meeting	
Minutes of meeting no.10 were adopted unanimously with a minor edit.	
3. Actions arising	
NSW Health advised that they had updated their advice to the community to reflect that NMI could perform an analysis of blood for PFOS, but these are not recommended because they don't predict the level of health risk.	3
4. Updates – Prawning sampling results update arising	
DPI Fisheries advised they would meet with commercial fishers to discuss preliminary results from prawn testing in Fullerton Cove and the Hunter River and provide feedback to the Panel.	6
4. Updates – Community Reference Group issues arising	
Dewatering and construction work at the RAAF Williamstown base was continuing to concern residents. No response yet from DoD on access to their Construction & Environmental Management Plans or onsite access for inspection. EPA to follow up again with DoD.	33
4. Updates – Community Reference Group issues arising	
The Chair and other members of the Panel attended the drop in event at Salt Ash School on Thursday 19th November. The community were eager to talk and generally appreciated the responsiveness of the Panel members and NSW Agencies. The Community's preference for a single point of contact was noted and would be followed up by the EPA.	2

	Reference number
4. Updates – Community Reference Group issues arising	
The Panel noted the full Human Health Risk Assessment Scoping and Advice document would be provided to the CRG at its next meeting.	28
NSW Health to investigate capacity of mental health support services to support the community.	
The EPA will convey to DoD the need to engage with the Community in developing their Sampling Analysis Quality Plan.	37
4. Updates – Agencies	
DPI - Fisheries advised they would meet with commercial fishers to discuss preliminary results from prawn testing in Fullerton Cove and the Hunter River and provide feedback to the Panel.	4
4. Updates - Defence response	
The panel is aware that the community is not getting the answers they are seeking from Defence. The Panel recommends EPA again take this up with Defence.	3
5. Working Groups reports – Risk Assessment	
The Panel's Health Risk Assessment Working Group is meeting on 27 November 2015 with DoD officials and their Site Auditor, Toxicology Expert and Golder Associates to discuss the differences in the scope and design of the sampling plan. AECOM which develops and will perform the site investigation on behalf of DoD is not attending.	34
The Air Services HRA to be reviewed to see if any further action are required.	
5. Working Groups reports – Risk Assessment	
The Panel requested an assessment of the capability of laboratories other than NMI to perform testing and analysis of samples to expedite the Human Health Risk Assessment.	35
5. Working Groups reports – Water	
The Water Working Group to provide input to the Guidance and Scoping document prepared by the Health Risk Assessment Working Group	36
7. Date, time and location of next meeting	
The Panel discussed possible times in light of developments with the prawn results.	